3rd Languages and Translation Conference & Exhibition on Translation and Arabization in Saudi Arabia

Book of Papers

11 - 13 Muharram 1431
28 - 30 December 2009
| cDČ - ccČ | ﻋﺪしていました.Č |
| cEE - cDD | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.ċ |
| cEd - cEē | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.D |
| Ĉď - ĈEE | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.d’ |
| Ĉď’ - ĈEē | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.Đ |
| ĉďD - ĉDĐ | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.d |
| Dďđ - Čđđ | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.E |
| DDD - DžE | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.ē |
| ĐEE - Đđ’d | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.É |
| ĐđE - ĐđĒ | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.ČČ |
| ĐEE - Đēč | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.CC |
| dďď - Đđżē | ﻧ ﺲ ﻦ.ČC |
| dĎG dčD | ﷽ ﺲ ﻦ.CD |
| dĐĐ dđč | ﻧ ﺲ ﻦ.Cd’ |
| dĎE - dĐď | ﻧ ﺲ ﻦ.CD |
| ĐĐĐ - đĎē | ﻧ ﺲ ﻦ.Cd |
Thematic Progression in the Translation of Narrative Text From Arabic into English

By
Ebtisam N. Al-Rajhi
Assistant Professor of linguistics
Department of English Language and Literature

1. Introduction
The present study focuses on Thematic Progression in narrative texts translated from Arabic into English. The goal is to analyze and compare thematic progression in Arabic narrative texts and their translation into English.

The patterning of theme through a text is one means of structuring the text as a message, so that the addressee is aware of what the addressee is trying to communicate. The most influential thematic patterning is associated with (Danes 1974) who belongs to the Prague tradition. Thematic progression (TP) is defined as “the choice and ordering of utterance themes, their mutual concatenation and hierarchy, as well as their relationships to the hypertheme of the superior text units (such as paragraph, chapter...) to the whole of the text, and to the situation.” (P.114)

The definition of a sentence theme is presented in Halliday’s 1967-68 article “Notes on Transitivity and theme in English.” Later Fries (1981) explained that the individual sentence themes collectively may form noticeable patterns that play a text-structuring role, and Fries (!981) is often cited by Halliday (1985) as a model of explaining the function of theme. The interaction of theme and cohesion is discussed
in 'Cohesion and Texture' (Martin 2001) and in 'Discourse and Information Structure' (Ward and Birner 2001).

The application of TP patterns on argumentative text is a study conducted by Crompton (2004); Crompton criticizes Halliday's definition of theme and Fries's hypothesis of 'method of development', but he identifies TP patterns in argumentative texts.

The importance of TP in translation is emphasized by Hatim and Mason (1994) as they elaborate:

When theme and rheme analysis remains restricted to the boundaries of the sentence, it is naturally unable to bring out the functions of these elements within texts. Yet, if theme-rheme analysis is to have any relevance to translators, it must provide an account of thematic progression in the service of particular rhetorical purpose. (P.217)

Rorvik (2004) stated that "when studying thematic progression in translated texts one may also gain insights about the translation process." (149) The process of translation is also important for (a) the translator who examines communicative cues present in the SL text, because SL text makes up the input of the process of translation which connects one language / culture system with another, and (b) the researcher interested in the application of the analysis of text and discourse to translation.

The research attempts to answer the following questions:

1. 1-What are the TP patterns identified in the source text and the translated text?
2. 2-To what extent do the TP patterns found in the translated text reflect the TP Patterns of the source text?
3. 3- If there are changes in translation, what are the strategies employed in the translation and how do they affect thematic progression?
2. Methodology and Data

Tomlin et al. (1997) suggests that “there are three methodological strategies employed in the analysis of text and discourse: (1) introspection-based analysis, (2) text counting methods and (3) experimental and quasi-experimental methods”. According to this typology, the writer of this research uses the introspection-based analysis that depends on the documentation of examples.

The clause and its relation with other clauses in the sentence is considered as the basis for the analysis of theme and thematic progression in the SL and TL. The clause is customarily employed in most linguistic analysis that underlie translation theories as expressed in the following quotation:

Since texts are realized through clauses, it is inevitable that such knowledge should form the basis of skilled actions which create discourse. It is equally clear that knowledge of this kind - and in two languages - must not only form a major part of ‘translator competence’... but the clause itself must be the major focus of the process of translation itself (Bell 1991, 227).

The material used in this study has been taken from two novels written in Standard Arabic and their translation into English as follows:


The analysis of thematic progression in two novels by different writers and their translations by different translators is useful in that it allows the analysis of TP patterns regardless of individual style of one writer or translator.
3. Hypotheses

The hypotheses of the study include the following:

1. There will be identifiable TP patterns in the source text and in the translated text.
2. There will be differences between the TP patterns found in the translated text and the TP patterns found in source text.
3. The changes in the translated text are not expected to affect the intended meaning of the original text.

4. Definition of Theme

The present study uses Halliday’s (1967) definition of theme; the theme is what the message is about. Every clause has a theme. The element occurring in the first position is the natural theme of the clause; everything else in the clause is the rheme. (Halliday: 212) the function of thematization serves to establish a starting point for the clause or a perspective from which the development of the clause proceeds. The system’s domain is the current clause. The system introduces the structure of an upcoming message; the theme is what the message is about. Every clause has a theme. The element occurring in the first position is the natural theme of the clause, everything else in the clause is the rheme (212).

In English, the unmarked theme in the declarative clause is the subject. In the non-declarative moods, the theme consists of the noncognitive ‘key signature’(223) that identifies the mood. The mood itself is marked, although ‘the key signature’, as a theme, is unmarked, part of the notion of theme is that it is the point of departure for the message. With the WH-interrogative, for example the over-riding message is there is something I do not know and that I want you to tell me about. “The rest of the message is explanatory comment about this demand”(213).
Since the unmarked theme is either the subject of the declarative clause or, in the case of the marked mood, the ‘key signature’ of the mood, the marked theme may be realized in English by a variety of constructions which Halliday summarizes under the headings of adjunct, conjunction, complement, predicator. The adjunct as a theme which establishes a cognitive setting of time, place, manner, or cause is quiet frequent. For example:

(1) Yesterday John saw the play.

Halliday recognizes that more than one adjunct can appear in thematic position. “The function of theme, restricted elsewhere to single clause elements, can in the case of adjunct extend over two or more”(219).

The same reasoning holds for conjunctions which by their initial position serve as a marked theme; subordinating conjunction which must occur in initial position “permit at least some thematic variation in the clause”(220). Halliday considers that there is a predictable patterning of conjunctions and adjuncts in English within the system of thematization and he has proposed order classes of theme types for English (222).

Another form of marked theme in English is the complement. Halliday examines the interrelation between the transitivity system\(^1\) and the fronting of non-subject nominals. When the addressee wishes to foreground an element in the clause by marking it, by dissociating it from the subject, he brings the element to the front as in the following example\(^2\):

(2) These houses my grandfather sold.

It can be noted that the above fronting of the object can be achieved by the use of the passive construction *these houses were sold by my grandfather*, but Halliday explains “that marking for voice is, in modern English, a way of avoiding marking for theme, to the extent
that the combination of marked voice with marked theme might perhaps be excluded as ungrammatical” (218).

Finally, there are predicators or verbs, as themes:

(3) (And) resign he did!
such constructions are considered to be relatively rare in English.

4.1 Identification

Identification is an optional subsystem within the textual level. It assigns an identifier-identified structure to a clause. Any clause can be organized into the equative form \( x \text{ equals } y \) through the nominalization of one set of its elements.

The basic identifying clause is an asymmetrical equative clause with the meaning \( x \) is to be identified as \( y \) (223). A non identifying clause (one that is not in the \( x \text{ is } y \) form) is made into an identifying clause by assigning the functions ‘thing to be identified’ and ‘identifier’ to its structure. The identified is known and the identifier is unknown (244). In English the identified is a nominalization introduced by either a WH-word or a substitute noun form:

(4) What John saw was the play.
(5) The one who painted the shed was John.
(6) The thing that John painted was the shed.

This construction is referred to by transformationalists as pseudo cleft structure or WH-cleft. The theme is always the whole of what is on the left side of the equation, regardless of whether it is the identified or the identifier i.e. regardless of whether or not it is the nominalization (226). Hence the theme can be the identifier:

(7) John is the one who painted the shed.
(8) Watney’s is what we want.
By use of the equative, identification confers uniqueness on the identified. Thus when the identified is in theme position, it is highlighted in a special way. For example we say:

(9) **We want Wateny’s.**
in order to state that Wateny’s belongs to the universe of the things we want, whereas:

(10) **What we want is Wateny’s.**
narrows the universe to one: there is nothing else that we want but Wateny’s.

Unlike thematization which is essential for making the text, identification is optional in its application. The rhetorical value of its application is to highlight the theme.

Predication (236-239), which is a structure associated with the theme, can only be applied to cognitive themes. The predication clause is the construction more commonly known as *It-cleft*:

(11) **It was John who painted the shed.**

Any cognitive theme can be predicated, but the most likely candidate is the marked theme (237). For Halliday such a clause has two themes, the identifier *it* and the identified *John*.

**5. Theme in Arabic**

The purpose of this section is to identify theme in Arabic and to examine its translation into English. Since thematization in Arabic has not been fully investigated by traditional grammarians or modern Arab linguists, the identification of theme categories will be based on:

- (a) Halliday’s description of theme;
- (b) Bratton’s (1967) identification of theme categories in Arabic;
- (c) Jurjaanii’s theory of Nazam explained by Sweity (1992).

According to Halliday (1994) the theme extends from the beginning of the clause up to the first element that has a function in transitivity such
as a participant, circumstance or process (53). Arabic is a VSO language and the subject-verb agreement is clear in the verb formation; that is Arabic allows the verb and the subject that occupy the initial position to become themes for example:

(12) katabtu addarsa
   lit. wrote I the lesson
   "I wrote the lesson"

In the above declarative clause /katabtu/ is unmarked theme. In Arabic the unmarked theme in the declarative clause is the musnad (henceforth M) in the verbal sentence and the musnad ilayhi (hencefort MI) in the nominal sentence. In the non-declarative mood the theme consists of the non-cognitive ‘key signatures’ man, mataa, ḥayna, ḥayyaana, maa, and maaða. Like Halliday, Jurjaanii uses the general rule of placing special importance on any word that comes in the beginning of the sentence (Sweity 1992, 142). VSO is the unmarked word order in Arabic, and the case of fronted object can have the rhetorical value of drawing the attention of the listener to the object (159). For example to say:

(13) maa darabtu zaydan
   (lit.) not hit-I zayd
   “I did not hit Zayd”

means that you negate your hitting Zayd and that you did not negate or affirm anything else, whereas

(14) maa zaydan darabt
   (lit.) not zayd hit-I
   “It wasn’t Zayd I hit”

means that the act of hitting has befallen on someone other than Zayd; the object Zayd was fronted to emphasize that he wasn’t the receiver of the act (157-158).

In his treatment of preposing and postposing, Jurjaanii never stated explicitly the concept of theme and rheme; however, it is implied in his analysis. According to Jurjaanii, the first constituent serves as a starting point or a perspective from which the development of the
clause proceeds. In his treatment of yes-no questions by means of the question particle hamza⁴, he places special significance on the initial position immediately after the hamza. The interrogative particle can be followed by a noun (the subject or the object) or by a verb. For example to say:

(15) abanayta ddaar ?
   (lit.) hamza-built the house
   “Have you built the house?”

is to inquire about the occurrence or non-occurrence of the action but to say:

(16) ?aʔanta banayta ddaar ?
   (lit.) hamza-you built the house
   “Was it you who built the house?”

is to inquire about the identity of the subject who performed the action (144). In other words, the hamza marks the mood of the clause and thematizes the word that immediately comes after it.

5.1 Marked Theme in MI-M sentence structure

The marked theme may be realized in a variety of constructions. The M in the nominal sentence can take the form of prepositional phrase or an adverb (adjunct). When M is one of these forms and preposed to the position of MI, it is considered a marked theme:

(17) lahu lʔasmaaʔu lʔusnaa (Quran 20:8)
   (lit.) for him the names the beautiful
   “To him belong the most beautiful names” (Ali 79)

(18) wa mina nnaasi man yaquulu aamanna (Quran 2:8)
   (lit.) and of the people who say believe we
   “Of the people there are some who say we believe” (Ali 18)

(19) wa fi ndahu m qaaširaatu šarfi ?atraab (Quran 38:50)
   (lit.) and beside them restraining glance companion
   “And beside them will be chaste women restraining their Glances (companions) of equal age”. (Ali 1229)
(20) **wa fawqa kulli ġii ǧilmin ġaliiim (Quran 12:76)**
Over all possessor knowledge knowledgeable
“But over all endued with knowledge is one the all-knowing”
( Ali 579)

(21) **fii bayruuta rajul**
in Beirut man
“There is a man in Beirut” (Bratton 1967, 117-118)

(22) **wa li kulli qawmin haad** (Quran 13:7)
(lit.) and for every people guide
“and to every people there is a guide” (Al-Hilaali and Khaan 372)

In examples (17-19) the preposing of M (comment) is optional, it is obligatory in examples (20-22) since theme cannot be indefinite, sentences of this sort are ‘existential’ and like their English counterparts do not thematize an indefinite noun. English avoids this by using a dummy subject *there* as in (21). The above examples show the transposition of Arabic themes into English by (a) the use of prepositional phrase adjunct themes as in (17, 18, , 22), (b) the use of adjunct of place theme as in (19),(c) the use of conjunction as in (20), and (d) the use of *there* as in (21).

According to Bratton(1967) the particle *ʔinna* in Arabic marks thematization of the governed MI that follows *ʔinna* (114) such as :

(23) *ʔinnaa haa hunaa qaaʁiduun (Quran 5:24)*
(lit.) part. we right here sitting
“We are sitting right here” (Al-Hilaali and Khaan 171)

(24) *ʔinna llaha ʔistafa aadama wa nuʔhan (Quran 3:33)*
(lit.) part. Allah chose Adam and Noah
“Allah chose Adam, Noah...” (Al-Hilaali and Khaan 83)

(25) *ʔinna llaha laa yastahii ?an yadrība maʔalan (Quran 2:26)*
(lit.) part. Allah not ashamed to set forth parable
“Verily, Allah is not ashamed to set forth a parable...”
(Al-Hilaali and Khaan 7)
(26) ِînna ِîbaadî laysa laka ِîlayhim ُîultaan (Quran 17:65)  
(lit.) part. slaves not for-you over them authority  
“Verily, my slaves, you have no authority over them”  
(Al-Hilaali and Khaan 437)  

Moreover, the particle ِînna marks thematization of the governed MI especially when the proclitic la- is prefixed to M (Bratton 1967, 114):  
(27) wa ِînna ِîllaha la maŷa l muhsiniin (Quran 29:69)  
(lit.) And part. God part. with the well-doers  
“Verily God is with those who do right” (Ali 1048)  

(28) wa ِînnaa ِîn ِjaaʔa ِîllahu la muhtaduun  
(Quran 2:70)  
(lit.) And part. we part. will Allah rightly guided  
“We wish indeed for guidance, if God wills” (Ali 35)  

The Arabic themes in (23, 24), and (28) are translated into English as subject themes ِwe, ِAllah, and ِwe. In (25, 26, and 27) as verily + the subjects ِAllah, my slaves and God. ِîn called al muxaffafa “the lightened” usually without government (Wright 2, 284) thematizes MI with lammaa preceding M:  
(29) ِîn kullu nafsin lammaa ِîlayha ḥaafið (Quran 86:3)  
(lit.) part. every soul but on it protector  
“There is no soul but has a protector” (Ali 1719)  

(30) ِîn kullun lammaa jamiiʔun ladaynaa muhdaruun  
(Quran 36:32)  
part. Everyone but all before us will be brought  
“But each one of them all will be brought before us”  
(Ali 1177)  

In the above example ِîn is a synonym of maa “not” the negative particle, where lammaa denotes “but” in the sense of “except” (Al-Ofii 1983, 661). This construction is similar to maa...illa. To my knowledge, it is peculiar to the Quran.
The restrictive ïnnaa “only” (Wright 1975, 2: 285) which “may be interpreted as involving constituent focus, in which case the focused constituent is placed in final position” (Moutaoukil 1989, 29). Thus ïnnaa thematizes the first constituent and focuses the final one as rheme or new information:

(31) ïnnaa nahnu muṣlihuun (Quran 2:11)

part.-only we peace-makers
“We only want to make peace” (Ali 19)

(32) ïnnaa anta munūr (Quran 13:7)
(lit.) part-only you warner
“You are only a warner” (Al Hilaali and Khaan 372)

The particle ëmma marks the word that comes after it as the theme and focuses the part of the message that follows the proclitic fa- (Bratton 1967, 115). ëmma is always followed by a pronoun or a noun as follows:

(33) fa ëmma ḥadīna ?aamanū fa yaqulūnūna (Quran 2:26)
(lit.) and as for those believers part.-know-they
?annahu l ḥaqqyu min rabbihim
(lit.) part.-it the truth from lord their
wa ëmma llaḍiina kafaruu fa yaquluuna...
(lit.) and but those disbelieve part.-say-they
“And as for those who believe, they know that it is the truth from their lord but those who disbelieve, they say...”
(Al-Hilaali and Khaan 7)

(34) wa ëmma man xaafa maqaama rabbih (Quran 79:40-41).
(lit.) and as for who feared-he standing before God-his
fa ënna l jannata hiya l maʔwaa
(lit.) verily the paradise it the abode
“But as for him who feared standing before his lord”
(Al-Hilaali and Khaan 40)
The above examples show that the theme expressed by \( \text{\textit{ammaa}} \) + pronoun is translated into English as: (a) \textit{As for...} , (b) the conjunction \textit{but} as in (33) and (c) the conjunction \textit{but} followed by \textit{as for...} in (34).

### 5.2. Identification Theme

\( \text{\textit{\textit{inna}}} \) and \( \text{\textit{\textit{innamaa}}} \) thematize the constituent they introduce, especially when the particle \textit{la-} which co-occurs with some of them is attached to the M constituents of the sentence, it is to this constituent that rheme is assigned:

\begin{displaymath}
\text{(35) } \text{\textit{\textit{inna}}} \text{\textit{\textit{\textit{inna}}} \text{\textit{\textit{awwala baytin wudif\textit{\textit{a} li nnaasi lalla\textit{\textit{di} bibakka}}}}} \\
\text{(Quran 3:96)}
\end{displaymath}

(lit.) part. first house was put for people that at Bakka

“The first house of (worship) appointed for men was that at Bakka” (Ali 147)

The theme in the above example is a clause of an equative structure with the meaning of \( x \) is to be identified as \( y \). The identified theme confers a special uniqueness of limiting the existence of any house of worship prior to the identifier house of Bakka. The identified can also be a demonstrative pronoun:

\begin{displaymath}
\text{(36) } \text{\textit{\textit{inna}}} \text{\textit{\textit{ha\textit{\textit{aani} la saahir\textit{\textit{aan}}}}} \text{\textit{\textit{(Quran 20:63)}}} \\
\text{(lit.) part. those-two part. magicians}
\end{displaymath}

“These two are certainly (expert) magicians”

(Ali 802)

or a pseudo-cleft construction:

\begin{displaymath}
\text{(37) } \text{\textit{\textit{inna}}} \text{\textit{\textit{\textit{maa}} tuu\textit{\textit{\textit{aduuna}}} li nnaasi lalla\textit{\textit{a\textit{\textit{di} bibakka}}}}} \\
\text{(lit.) part.-which promised- you part. true}
\end{displaymath}

“Verily that which you are promised is surely true”

\begin{displaymath}
\text{(38) } \text{\textit{\textit{inna}}} \text{\textit{\textit{\textit{maa}} sa\textit{\textit{\textit{a\textit{\textit{a}}}} kaydu saahir\textit{\textit{in}}} \text{\textit{\textit{(Quran 20:69)}}} \\
\text{(lit.) part.-which made-they trick magician}
\end{displaymath}

“That which they have made is only a magician trick”

(Ali 484)
(39) ʔinna-maa ʔinda llahi huwa xayrun lakum
(lit.) part.-what with Allah it better for you-pl.
“Verily! What is with Allah is better for you” (Ali 418)

The compound ʔinna + maa in (37), (38) and (39) consists of the particle ʔinna and the relative pronoun maa “which or what”. ʔinna-maa introduced an identified theme clause which is modified by the identifier saadiq “true” in (37), kaydu saahirin “a magician trick” in (38) and huwa xayrun lakum “is better for you” in (39).

5.3. Predication
In predication, the theme is the identifier rather than the identified, and this gives explicit prominence to the theme by exclusion as the following examples illustrate:

(40) huwa llaðii ja’ala lakum nnujuumma... (Quran 6:97)
(lit.) he who set for you the stars (Ali 214)

(41) huwa llaðii anʃaʔakum min nafsin waaʔida (Quran 6:98)
(lit.) he who created you from person one
“It is He who has created you from a single person” (Ali 98)

(42) huwa llaðii anzala mina ssamaaʔan maaʔan (Quran 6:99)
(lit.) he who send from the sky rain
“It is He who sends down rain from the sky” (Ali 215)

(43) huwa llaðii xalaqa lakum maa fi lʔard (Quran 2:29)
(lit.) he who created for you that in earth
“It is He who hath created for you all things that are on earth” (Ali 23)

Examples 40-43 show that predication or the construction of it cleft is the construction employed to translate huwa llaðii which gives prominence to the identifier God.
5.4 Marked Theme in M-MI sentence structure

In M-MI sentence structure, M is marked as a theme when it is preceded by ًলَوْنَة, ًلََّدَيْنَا, and ٌذَٰلِكْما. For example:

(44) َلَوْنَةَ َكَانَتْ َلَكِبْرَاتُ ْلَا ِاللَّهِ ُهَذَا ُهَالَِّمْ (السَّمَٰعَةِ ٢:١٤٣)
(lit.) and part. was-it part. great except for those guided Allah
“Indeed, it was great (heavy) except for those whom Allah guided” (Ali 33)

(45) َلَوْنَةَ َكُنْتَمْ َمَنْ َقَبْلَهُ ْلَا ِهِمْ ُهُذَا ُمُدْعِيِّينَ (السَّمَٰعَةِ ٢:٩٨)
(lit.) and part. were-you before-him part. of astraying-ones
“And verily, you were, before, of those who were astray” (Ali 48)

(46) َلَوْنَةَ َنَّعُونُكَا ْلَا ِهِمْ ُهُذَا ُكَاذِبِيِّنَ (السَّمَٰعَةِ ٢٦:١٨٦)
(lit.) and part. think you part. from the liars
“And verily, we think that you are one of the liars” (Ali 579)

ًلَوْنَةَ that marks the M َكَانَةَ, َكُنْتَمْ and َنَّعُونُكَا as themes, has been translated into English as indeed, verily and verily in (44), (45) and (46). Moreover, ًلََّدَيْنَا has been translated into indeed as in (47) below:

(47) ًلََّدَيْنَا َلَهُ َذِلَّةَ َمَنْ َذَا ِذَا ُذِلَّةَ (السَّمَٰعَةِ ٥٨:١)
(lit.) part. heard Allah statement that disputes
“Indeed, Allah has heared the statement of her that disputes with you” (Al-Hilaali and Khaan 852)

The cognitive theme ٌذَٰلِكْما is frequently used with M-MI construction:
(48) **rubbamaa yawaddu llaðiina kafaruu law  kaanuu muslimiin**  
(Quran 15:2)  
(lit.) perhaps wish those disbelieve-they that were- they Muslims  
“Perhaps (often) will those who disbelieve wish that they were Muslims” (Al-Hilaali and Khaan 373)

**rubbamaa** has been translated as “perhaps”. According to Halliday, **perhaps** is a non-cognitive modal adjunct marked theme (1967 222).

In M-MI sentence structure, the complement, which is normally located after the verb, can be moved before the verb or to clause initial position of theme.

(49) **wa kullan wa'ada  llahu l husnaa**  
(Quran 4:95)  
(lit.) and each promised Allah the good  
“Unto each, Allah has promised good (Paradise)”  
(Al-Hilaali and Khaan 145)

(50) **wa ?arsalnaa ?ilayhim rusulan kullama jaa?ahum**  
(Quran 58:70)  
(lit.) and sent we to them messengers whenever came them  
"…and sent them messengers. Whenever there came to them"  
rasuulun bi maa laa tahwa ?anfusuhum  
(lit.) messenger with what not desired themselves  
" a messenger with what they themselves desired not"  
fariiqan ka0ðabuu wa fariiqan yaqtuluun  
(lit.) group called liars-they and group killed-they  
“A group of them they called liars, and others among them they killed” (Al-Hilaali and Khaan 183)

(51) **wa 1 mu?tafikata ahwaa**  
(Quran 53:53)  
(lit.) and the mu'tafika destroyed-he  
“And he destroyed the overthrown cities”  
(of Sodom to which prophet Lot was sent)  
(Al-Hilaali and Khaan 827)
In (49), (50) and (51) kullan, fariqan and al mu’tafikata originate the position of complement after the verbs wašada, ka‰abuu, and ahwa; in (49) and (51) the subject is Allah which is implied in (51), whereas in (50) the subject is the pronoun uu “they” attached to the verb ka‰ab.

The examination of the contexts in which these ‘preverbally preposed’ constituents occur show that they are really rhemes which are picked up as marked themes in the subsequent discourse. “In marked thematic structures, theme position is associated with local prominence at the level of the clause. Rheme, on the other hand, is prominent on an overall discourse level” (Baker 1992, 131). In addition, Halliday explains the meaning of marked theme as “what is focal is ‘new’ not in the sense that it cannot have been previously mentioned” (1967, 204). The following section examines patterns of thematic progression.

6. Thematic Progression

‘Thematic progression’ is the term used “to refer to the way subsequent discourse re-uses previous themes or rhemes according to an overall text plan” (Hatim and Mason 1990, 217). Danes(1974:118) outlines three main patterns as follows:

1. 1-Constant Theme: The same theme stays constant over sentences
2. 2-Simple Linear: The rheme becomes the theme of the next sentences
3. 3-Derived Theme: the themes of successive sentences are derived from a hypertheme.

The preceding Arabic text of the above examples (49), (50) and (51) is supplied for the illustration of each TP pattern. The first is simple
linear TP, as in Figure (1), where the rheme of sentence 1 becomes the theme of sentence 2, and so on:

- T: theme = re-uses
- R: rheme = re-uses indirectly

\[ T_1 (\text{fadázala}) \rightarrow R_1 (l \text{mujaahidiina bi amwaalihim wa ?anfusihim ?ala lqaa\’diin...}) \]

\[ T_2 (=R_1) (\text{wa kullan}) \rightarrow (\text{wa\’ada llahu l husnaa}) \]

\[ T_1 (\text{wa ?arsalnaa}) \rightarrow R_1 (\text{?ilayhim rusulan}) \]
\[ T_2 (\text{kullama}) jaa?ahum \rightarrow R_2 (\text{rasuulun bi maa laa tahwa ?anfusuhum}) \]
\[ T_3 (=R_1=R_2) (\text{fariiqan}) \rightarrow R_3 (\text{ka\‘dabuu}) \]

**Figure 1:** Simple linear TP as in example (49) and (50).

The second pattern is TP with constant theme. This is illustrated in figure (2) where the theme of sentence 1 is also the theme of several subsequent sentences.

\[ T_1 \text{ alla\‘iina hum} \rightarrow R_1 (\text{li amaanaatihim wa ?ahdihim raa\‘uuun}) \]
\[ T_2 \text{ wa lla\‘iina hum} \rightarrow R_2 (\text{bi ?a\‘aadatihim qaa\‘imuun}) \]
\[ T_3 \text{ wa lla\‘iina hum} \rightarrow R_3 (\text{?alaal salaatihim yuhaafi\‘uun}) \]

**Figure 2:** Constant TP as in example (52), (53) and (54).

Examples of constant TP are numerous in Quran. The analysis of the translated text of the above examples shows that the same patterns of theme have been kept in the translation as follows:
The third TP of derived themes are examples where the topic of a paragraph is alluded to by means of several themes that are directly or indirectly related to their common reference to the paragraph's topic. There are two identifiable patterns of derived theme movement that have been classified by Danes (1970) and quoted by Enkvist (120) as:

(a) The Progression of derived themes (there is one Hypertheme and several hyponymic theme) as diagrammed in figure (3) (example 59-61).

(b) The development of split rheme in figure (4) (examples 51-54).

![Figure 3 derived theme of one Hypertheme and several hyponymic themes](image)

In (59) wa mina nnaasi is the hypertheme in the sense that the subsequent themes ?ulaa?ika and summun, bukkumun, ?ummun in
(60) and (61) refer to the more specific kind of *wa mina nnaasi* “of the people”. The translated text by Hilaali and Khaan preserved the original thematic progression in (55) and (56), but not in (57) as follows:

(55) *wa mina nnaasi man yaquulu aamanaa wa maa hum bimu?miniin* (Quran 2:8)

“And of mankind, there are some (hypocrites) who say: “We believe in Allah and the Last Day” while in fact they believe not.”

Al-Hilaali and Khaan (40)

(56) *?ulaaika allaðiina ðtaraw ððalaalata bi l hudaa fa maa rabihat tiJaaratuhum wa maa kaanuu muhtadiin* (Quran 2:16)

“These are they who have purchased error for guidance, so their commerce was profitless. And they were not guided.”

(57) *summun bukkumun ?ummun fa hum laa yarji?uu* (Quran 2:18)

“They are deaf, dumb, and blind, so they return not (to the Right Path).” (Al-Hilaali and Khaan (5)

Another translation by Alí exhibits the pragmatic equivalence of the thematic progression even in (57) as follows:

“Deaf, dumb, and blind, they will not return (to the path).”( Alí (20)

The second pattern of derived theme is the development of split rheme where T2, T3 and T4 are instances of re-using the co-members of the concept object that formed R1 (figure 4). The relation between themes and rhemes may not be explicit and their identities may not be the same because “the association is often perceived on cognitive grounds as part of text comprehension” (Hatim and Mason 1990,218); in addition to the rhetorical purpose that is achieved through thematic progression.
T1 (wa ?annahu)  ——— R1 (ahlaka ?aadan l ?uulaa)
T2 (=R1)(wa qamuda) ——— R2 (fa maa ?abqaa)
T3 (=R1)(wa qawma nuu?in) ——— R3 (innahum kaanuu...)
T4 (=R1) (wa l mu?tafikata) ——— R4 (ahwaa)

Figure 4: Thematic pattern of split rhyme example (58),(59) and (60)

The above figure shows that part of R1 is ?aadan l ?uulaa which is the direct object of the verb ?ahlaka. T1 is Allah who destroyed ?aadan, the rheme. The theme of successive sentences are co-members of a concept forming the rhyme of the initial sentence (Enkvist 1973, 120-1). The concept of the object that has been destroyed in the rhyme of the first sentence has been split to include qamuda, qawma nuu?in and l mu?tafikata themes of the successive sentences.

The translation of the text in figure (4) shows that equivalence of thematic progression has been preserved whenever possible in verse 58, 59, 60 but not in 61 as follows:

   “And that it is He (Allah) who destroyed the former ‘Ad (people)”

(59) wa qamuda fa maa abqaa (Quran 53:51)
   “And Thamûd people. He spared none of them”

(60) wa qawma nuu?in min qabli ?innahum kanuu hum ?a?lama wa ?at?yaa (Quran 53:52)
   “And the people of Noah aforetime, verily, they were more unjust and more rebellious”

(61) wa l mu?tafikata ?ahwaa (Quran 53:53)
   “And he destroyed the overthrown cities”(Al-Hilaali and Khaan 826-827)
The application of the patterns of thematic progression to the analysis of the above examples and their translation indicates that “the text is not to be viewed as a linear arrangement of components running sequentially in something akin to numerical order” (Hatim 1989, 140).

But as de Beaugrande (1978, 32) illustrates that information “is redistributed among components for the purpose of comprehension...which requires the reader to move forwards and backwards in the text, and to regroup components around informational clusters”. That is thematization redistributes information in a way that fulfills the expectations of the writer and the reader which in turn reduces the amount of time and effort needed for comprehension.

7. Thematic Progression in the translation of Narrative

The examination of the following extract from Tawfiq Al-Hakiim’s novel The Return of The Spirit and its translation by Hutchins (1990) shows the TP pattern in the SL text the corresponding TP pattern found in the TL text. Themes in clauses are underlined in both Arabic and English texts as follows:

(62) [wa lam yanbus l jundiyu bi kalimatin baʔda iðin]$_1$ [bal_
tanaawala
hablan matiinan min bayni l ʔamtiʕati wa ʔahaba ila l biʔiri
shaamitan]$_2$
[wa rabafa ʔarafahu ilaa hajarin ʔaqiilin wa adlaa bi ʔarafihi l
aaxara fi
l biʔiri]$_3$ [ʔumma ʔaaha bi l jamiiʕi an ibtaʕiduu wa ixtabiʔuu
bayna l
adʕaali l qariiba]$_4$ (1: 219)

(63) [The soldier did not utter a word after that]$_1$
[He took a sturdy rope
out of the supplies and went silently to the well]$_2$ [He fastened
one end of it to a heavy stone and let the other end down the
well]. \(s_3\)

[At that he shouted to everyone to get away and to hide in the
nearby bushes]. \(s_4\) (144)

The above example represents the common TP patterns found in the
novel and in the translation which is TP with constant theme.

The analysis of the translation shows that the period is used to mark
the division between the clauses in the restructured TL text, whereas
in the SL text the initial particles \(wa\) and \(bal\) are not conjunctions
which combine sentences but are in fact markers which separate
sentences (very similar to periods). In this connection, Nida (1964)
cites the presence of similar particles in another Semitic language:
“In Hebrew the clause initial \(WA\) is often merely a signal of a clause
beginning, and does not really link the clause in any coordinating way
to the previous clause” (210). Similarly \(WA\) and \(ball\) in Arabic mark
the syntactic units by separating clauses from each other. This type of
structure is called prostactic (210).

The texts in the novel the \(Begger\) by Naguib Mahfouz reveales that
the most common pattern of TP in the source text is of constant theme
patterns, as follows:
\(\text{؟انثا} \text{راجول} \text{ناجيج} \text{حيث} \text{ناسبتا} \text{الماشي} \text{تاككول} \text{فاصير} \text{اتشااما} \text{والرابع} \text{الأعرة} \text{الкаяدة} \text{والترحيق} \text{نفسكبا} \text{بالمال} \text{ياما} \text{والديماة} \text{وكانا} \text{عذة} \text{أنا} (10)\)

The same constant theme pattern is reserved in the target text
translation as follows:

\(\text{You} \text{are} \text{a} \text{successful} \text{wealthy} \text{man.} \text{You} \text{have} \text{virtually} \text{forgotten} \text{how} \text{to}
\text{walk.} \text{You} \text{eat} \text{the} \text{best} \text{food,} \text{drink} \text{good} \text{wine,} \text{and} \text{have}
\text{overburdened} \text{yourself} \text{with} \text{work} \text{to} \text{the} \text{point} \text{of} \text{exhaustion} \text{.} \text{Your} \text{mind} \text{is}
\text{preoccupied} \text{with} \text{your} \text{clients's} \text{cases.} \text{(Henry} \text{and} \text{Alwarraki} \text{13)}\)
8. Summary and Conclusion

The main objective of the study was to identify and analyse the TP patterns found in Arabic narrative text and their translation into English texts, to examine whether the translators preserved the thematic structure of the source text. The analysis of thematic patterning was based on (Danes 1974) definition of three main TP patterns. The study required the definition of theme in English and Arabic; in English theme definition was based on Halliday's 1967-1968 theme categories. Since thematization in Arabic has not been fully investigated by traditional grammarians or modern Arab linguists, the identification of theme categories were based on: (a) Halliday’s description of theme; (b) Bratton’s (1967) identification of theme categories in Arabic; and (c) Jurjaanii’s theory of Nazam explained by Sweity (1992).

The conclusion of the study could be drawn from the answers of the research questions stated above.

First, there were thematic progression patterns of constant theme identified in the narrative texts of the two Arabic novels. Second, the thematic progression of consonant theme patterns are generally preserved in the translated text. That is the translators of the two novels reconstructed SL thematic progression into the translated text. This is in line with the findings of Rorvic (2004) as he stated that "translators generally try to stick to the patterns of thematic progression found in the source text" (159). Third, the strategies employed in the translation were more of clarification of the SL text and explanations that is used by most translators as mentioned in Bakir (1993, 243). The overall conclusion is that the preservation of the SL thematic progression is important for the content of message to be conveyed in the translation. The process of explicitation and the preservation of thematic progression increase the readability of the translated text.
Notes

1. Transitivity systems are concerned with the type of processes expressed in the clause with participants in the process animate or in animate (Halliday 1968, 38).

2. According to Halliday the meaning of the choice is to show "a marked informationally prominent theme, and not a contrastive focus on the process" (1967, 217). That is, the theme has its prominence within the clause. Halliday stresses that the system of information and theme are not to be conflated: "The two are independently variable" (205). One of the chief differences is that the status of new is relative to the discourse that precedes the current clause, whereas the theme, in Halliday's sense, has its status with respect to the current clause. Nevertheless, he recognizes the frequent congruence between the two patterns, as he did between the information unit and the clause when they are unmarked.

3. The subject is called by Arab grammarian musnad ilayhi (henceforth MI) and the predicate musnad (henceforth M); the relation between M and MI is termed isnaad (Wright 1975, 2: 250).

The concepts of M and MI are very important for they make up the basic sentence structure in Arabic (Al-Waer 1983, 23). Every sentence which begins with M is called verbal and the sentence that begins with MI is called nominal.

In the nominal sentence MI (initial constituent or topic) is followed by M (comment). M may be an adjective or a sentence:

\[
\text{MI} \quad \begin{array}{c}
\text{arrabi\textsuperscript{w}u} \\
\text{the spring}
\end{array} \quad \text{M} \quad \begin{array}{c}
jamiilun \\
\text{beautiful}
\end{array}
\]

"Spring is beautiful"

(Cantarino 1974, 9)
Sentence (1) is characterized by the absence of the copula verb which appears in the translation as the main verb *is*. This type of sentence is called ‘equational sentence’ (Wright 1975, 251).

While M in the nominal sentence can be occupied by different syntactic categories, M in the verbal sentence can only be occupied by a verb. The structure M-MI represents the unmarked structure of the verbal sentence such as:

```
M                          MI
(2)            kataba       Taliyyun
(lit.)         wrote         Ali

"Ali wrote"
```

The sentence may include elements other than M and MI; these elements are called *fadla* (i.e. syntactic complement or adjunct). The relation of *isnaad* would hold among M, MI and *fadla* (Al-Fadhli 1988, 19) as shown in (12) and (13).

```
S
  
|     Isnaad
|    M  |  MI  |  fadlah
| (3) adalla | fir'awnu | qawmahu
| (lit.) misled | Pharaoh | people his

"Pharaoh led his people astray" (Ali 850)
```

In (3) the *fadla* is *qawmahu* which functions as the object of the verb; (the *fadla* can be a place adjunct or an object of the verb). M, MI and *fadla* are dominated by *isnaad* which is dominated by the sentence.

4. Hamza is a particle that may be considered a "key signature" since it thematize the category that comes immediately after
the hamza in yes-no questions and rhetorical questions which are marked for mood but not for theme.

5. Prostactic structure shows the separation of sentences from each other while paratactic and hypotactic structures shows the relation of clauses within the sentence.

Quirk (1985) has classified the English sentence into three types:

1. a simple sentence consists of a single independent clause;
2. a compound sentence consists of two or more coordinated clauses; the clauses of a compound sentence provide classic instances of a paratactic relationship; that is, they have an equivalent function
3. a complex sentence consists of one main clause and one or more subordinate clauses functioning as an element of the sentence; the sentence and its subordinate clauses are in a hypotactic relationship, that is they form a hierarchy in which the subordinate clause is a constituent of the sentence as a whole (987).

BIBLIOGRAPHY

• University of Indiana.


المراجع العربية

- عبدالهادي الفضلي "النحو" جدة. دار الشروق، 1988م
- معيض العموفي "قضايا الجملة الحبرية" في كتب أعراب القرآن ومعانيه. رسالة دكتوراه، القاهرة، 1983م
The Translation of Qur'anic Ambiguity: A Linguistic Contrastive Study

Iman El-Zeiny
Lecturer in Linguistics and Translation
University of Al-Azhar, Egypt

Introduction

This paper discusses different approaches to the translation of Qur'anic ambiguity as one of the semantic problematic areas in translating the Qur'an. An attempt has been made to analyze and compare four different approaches to the translation of the Qur'an with a view to recommending the most adequate approach. The four selected translations are those of Sale (1734), Arberry (1955), Dawood (1956) and Khatib (1986). They represent different orientations in translating the Muslim's holy Book. Moreover, their translations are regularly reprinted, which attest to their wide appeal. This paper deals with translating a linguistic phenomenon prominent in the Qur'an, namely, ambiguity. Hence, a discussion of the nature of the Qur'anic text is provided. The analysis will be restricted to some representative ambiguities of Surat-al-Baqarah (the Heifer).

Theoretical framework

Many definitions of translation have been attempted by linguists throughout the ages. The definitions have differed according to the theories of translation the linguists adopt. The cornerstone of all these theories of translation is to communicate the 'meaning' or 'the message', bearing in mind that the concept of meaning is differently approached and defined by linguists. Newmark expounds the characteristics of a good translation as follows:
A good translation fulfills its intention; in an informative text, it conveys the facts acceptably; in a vocative text, its success is measurable, at least in theory, and therefore the effectiveness of an advertising agency translator can be shown by results; in an authoritative or an expressive text, [my emphasis], form is almost important as content... therefore, a merely 'adequate' translation may be useful to explain what the text is about...but a good translation has to be 'distinguished' and the translator exceptionally sensitive (1988,192).

These functions of language; i.e. the informative, the expressive and the vocative, have corresponding meanings, as Nida (1975) states. They have been differently defined and termed by linguists. Eclectically, the terms and definitions adopted in this paper will be based on Nida (1975), Newmark (1988) and Wales (1989). The "informative" function relates to the total context of what is said. This is the "referential" or "denotative" function. The "expressive" function is centered on the speaker. It is marked by idiolectal features of idiom and figures of speech. The "vocative" function, which is also called the "conative" or the "pragmatic" is primarily directive; that is, it is designed to influence the behaviour of the receptors. The connotative function is thus classified under it. The aesthetic or poetic function refers to the language designed to please the senses, firstly through its sound, and secondly through its metaphors. It involves the formal structure of the text.

An ideal translation, Leech (1974) recommends, would bring about all the levels of meaning in the TT. Yet, this is impossible, because there is often a conflict between these levels in the TT leading to sacrificing one of them for the sake of the others (see Newmark, 1988, 42). Preferences should be based on text-type and the purpose of translation. This paper deals with translating the Qur'anic text, strictly speaking, the Qur'anic ambiguity. Hence, a discussion of the nature of the text with which this paper is concerned; namely, the Qur'an, is needed if we want to assess the different approaches to translating
ambiguity, being one of the most problematic linguistic phenomena translation wise.

The Nature of the Qur'anic Text

The language of the Qur'an is surrounded by a unique mental and moral climate; it has a distinct style supported by a value-laden idiom, a multi-dimensional phrase structure, sequential interrelatedness and powerful expression. The language reflects the values which relate to concepts and ideals. All these go to make up an organic whole, a unique literary culture, with a self-sustaining spiritual and cultural personality.

The Qur'an is a genre of its own. According to James, "a genre is a structured and standardized communicative event. Societies give genre names to types of communicative events that they recognize as recurring" (1989, 32). The Qur'an is not a recurring text-type, neither is it a standardized communicative event. It declares itself to be the very word of Allah revealed to the Prophet Muhammad through the Angel Gabriel (26,192 - 195).

"Verily this is a Revelation from the Lord of the Worlds. With it came down the Truthful Spirit to thy heart that you mayest admonish. In the perspicuous Arabic tongue." (Ali's translation).
The Qur'an is a unique genre, hence cannot be classified under the above mentioned three broad categories of texts given by Newmark. In other words, the three functions; the informative, the expressive and the vocative, are so predominant in Arabic that the text defies labelling under one of them. In addition, the format has a meaning. As Nida points out, "in written communication even the format may carry meaning" (1985, 119). The layout of the Qur'an is indicative of its uniqueness and individuality.

Such a text-type has genre-specific features, which do not render themselves easily to translation. The language of the Book is not, unlike other sacred Books, only a means for carrying a Message. It is a means and an end simultaneously. This is because the Qur'an is the very miracle of Islam-- a linguistic miracle. Arberry rightly declares, "if Arabic could and can never again be spoken as it was spoken in the Qur'an, certainly the Arabic of the Qur'an defies adequate translation" (1953, 28). According to Irving, Ahsan and Ahmady, "the key to understand the Qur'an lies in appreciating its uniqueness" (1979, 29).

One of the most outstanding linguistic unique features, which tend to make the Qur'an 'untranslatable' is its extensive usage of ambiguity. Different approaches and procedures have been adopted by translators in translating the Qur'an in general and the Qur'anic ambiguity in particular. Following is a definition of ambiguity and a discussion of its purpose with a special reference to Qur'anic ambiguity.

**Ambiguity Definition**

According to Leech, the word ambiguity in linguistics is used in a narrower sense than that which is used in literary studies. "In linguistics", he argues, ambiguity is used to mean having "more than one cognitive meaning for the same piece of language" (1969, 205).

In literary studies, it is used in a broader sense presented by Empson as follows: "any verbal nuance, however slight, which gives room for
alternative reactions to the same piece of language" (1953, 1). In this paper, ambiguity will be used in the linguistic sense.
Types of Ambiguity

Ambiguity could be intentional or unintentional. Unintentional ambiguity may be considered as a characteristic inherent in language which is described by Newmark as "the inadequate and loose dress of thought" (1988, 219). Unintentional ambiguity may also be attributed to poor writing. In most cases, the context points to a certain meaning otherwise ambiguity is considered a weakness of style, especially if it is an informative piece of writing (Newmark, 1988, 218-19).

The Purpose of Ambiguity

In literary texts, ambiguities are intentionally presented for artistic purposes. As Leech points out:

If an ambiguity comes to our attention in some ordinary functional use of language, we generally consider it a distraction from the message and defect of style. But if it occurs in a literary text, we tend to give the writer the benefit of the doubt and assume that a peaceful co-existence of other relative meanings is intended (1969, 205).

Ambiguity and Translation

As for unintentional ambiguity, linguists (such as Larson, 1984; Newmark, 1988) suggest that the translator should not reproduce it in the translated text. However, intentional ambiguity should be reproduced in the translation as it is part of the artistic craft of the original writer, especially in poetic texts. Moreover, reproducing intentional ambiguity is the duty of the translator in order to be faithful to the original writer and text (see Newmark, 1982, 25). Newmark advises the translator to reproduce the intentional ambiguity whenever possible. When reproducing it is impossible, the translator may translate the most probable sense and footnote the less probable if he believes it to be important (1988, 220).
As Newmark (1988, 218) and Leech (1969, 206) point out, ambiguity may result from polysemy (several meanings of a word) or homonymy (having the same form but different meanings). In Arabic, it is polysemy that is the cause of ambiguity not homonymy because the root of an Arabic word covers all the derivatives and gives no room for any other root having the same shape. This paper is mainly concerned with lexical ambiguity which directly affects the semantic level of language.

By lexical ambiguity I mean ambiguity related to lexemes. A lexeme, as Hoffman defines, is "a meaningful linguistic unit, usually a vocabulary item in a language but sometimes a morpheme" (1989, 209). Hence, it is the semantic content of linguistic items which is in focus; i.e., any linguistic item which represents a semantic unit (even containing more than one word, such as idioms) may be considered as a lexeme (see Crystal, 1987, 104).

**Approaches to the Translation of Qur'anic ambiguity**

All Qur'anic ambiguities are intentional. The purposes of Qur'anic ambiguity are richness of style, giving a full load of information and ever newly born meanings. The four studied translators have approached Qur'anic lexical ambiguities differently. The following examples, quoted from Surat-al-Baqarah, illustrate the different approaches adopted by the selected translators in translating Qur'anic ambiguity.

**Practical framework**

To compare and assess the different procedures adopted by the different translators the SL examples of ambiguity will be semantically analyzed and compared to their TL 'equivalents'. The most adequate approach(es) will be recommended and a blueprint for translating Qur'anic ambiguity will be developed. At this semantic level of comparison adequacy is measured according to faithfulness to
the denotative meaning in addition to reproducing as many levels of meaning as possible in the translation. Faithfulness is measured in terms of 'semantic deviation', 'overtranslation' and 'undertranslation'. 'Semantic deviation' refers to giving the wrong denotative meaning. 'Overtranslation', according to Newmark, is defined as "a translation that gives more details than its corresponding TL unit, often a more specific word". 'Undertranslation', in contrast, is defined as a translation that "gives less detail and is more general than the original" (1988, 284-285). The less the translator involves in semantic deviation, needless 'undertranslation' and/or 'overtranslation' the more faithful and adequate his approach is.

Example 1:

Faja-`alnaahaa nakaalal-limaa bayna yadayhaa wamaa khal-fahaa

The verse refers to the punishment of metamorphosis befallen the community of the Children of Israel who transgressed the Sabbath. The verse has three ambiguities: the reference of the pronoun حَلَفَā, the word حَلَفَā nakaalan and the idiom حَلَفَā bayna yadayha. It is rendered as follows:

Sale: And we made them an example unto those who were contemporary with and unto those who came after them.
Arberry: We made it a punishment exemplary for all the former times and for the latter.
Dawood: We made their fate an example to their own generation and to those who followed them.
Khatib: Thus, we made it an exemplary punishment to those of their days and those who descent thereafter.
As for the first ambiguity, the pronoun \( \text{haa} \), as stated in al-'Aluusy (1985), it may refer to the punishment or to the town where the fishing took place. Al-Ṭabary adds another interpretation, according to which \( \text{haa} \) refers to the community which transgressed the Sabbath. This ambiguity is the cause of the difference between the translations, as seen above. Each translator approaches ambiguity in his own way.

Sale adopts the opinion according to which "it" refers to the community which transgressed the Sabbath. Although this interpretation is quoted by al-Ṭabary, al-Ṭabary rejects it because there is no evidence supporting this concealed meaning. Therefore, Sale should not have adopted this interpretation.

Arberry and Khatib reproduce the ambiguity, perhaps to echo the original. Dawood refers the pronoun to the punishment befallen the Jews. His choice of the word "fate" is improper because it does not show that this "fate" was a punishment incurred by disobeying God.

The lexeme \( \text{znakaalan} \) presents a second ambiguity. It is the verbal noun of the second verb form \( \text{nakkala} \), which denotes 'to make an example of someone or something' (al-'Aṣfahaany, 1992, 825; Ibn Ṭanẓūr, n.d.).

Thus the noun \( \text{znakaalan} \), means 'an example' or 'punishment' (al-'Aluusy, 1985) or 'an exemplary punishment' (see al-Qurṭuby, n.d; al-Zamakhshary, 1933).

Sale renders this lexeme as "an example", Arberry as "a punishment exemplary for", Dawood as "a lesson" and Khatib as "an exemplary punishment". All the translators disambiguate the word but Arberry's and Khatib's renderings are preferable because "exemplary punishment" combines the three meanings suggested above.
"Exemplary punishment" stresses both the meanings of 'warning' and 'punishment' while both "example" and "lesson" stress the meaning of 'warning' only.

The last ambiguity in the verse is the idiom limaa bayna yadayhaa. It means either 'before it' or 'contemporary with it' (see al-'Aluusy, 1988; al-Rasyy, 1955, 116). Arberry adopts the first meaning whereas Sale, Dawood and Khatib adopt the latter. None of the translators reproduce this ambiguity. The following is another example which may further illustrate the translators' approaches.

Example 2:

khaalidiina fiithaa: Laa yu$kha$ffafu `anhumul-`adhaabu walaa hum yunzaruu$n$

The verse refers to the punishment of the unbelievers. The verb yunzaruu$n$ is ambiguous. The ambiguity results from the fact that this form of the verb might be thought of as derived from any of the following three alternative participles, which denote different meanings. It may denote 'to be delayed' if it is assumed that its participle is ‘in$zaa$r’, literally, 'delay'. The second alternative meaning is 'to be waited for', if it is derived from the participle inti$zaa$r, literally, 'waiting for'. The third alternative meaning is 'to be regarded', if it is supposed to be derived from the participle na$zar$, literally, 'vision' (see Lisan al-'Arab). Thus, the verse has three interpretations: they (the unbelievers) shall remain (accursed) forever; their punishment shall not be lightened, neither shall they be (1) reprieved, (2) waited for to repent or (3) regarded by Allah (see al-
The translators approach this ambiguity as shown below.

Sale: They shall remain under it forever, their punishment shall not be alleviated, neither shall they be regarded.

Footnote: Or, as Jallo'ddin expounds it, God will not wait for their repentance.

Arberry: Therein dwelling forever, the chastisement shall not be lightened for them; no respite shall be given them.

Dawood: Under it they shall remain forever; their punishment shall not be lightened, nor shall they be reprieved.

Khatib: There (in the fire) they shall dwell forever. Their torment will not be lightened, neither will they be reprieved.

Sale gives the third meaning and footnotes the second (see above). Arberry, Dawood and Khatib render the first meaning. However, it is important to note that ambiguity is in many instances the reason for providing different translations. Although all translations may be considered as acceptable, regardless of the loss resulting from disambiguation, none of them could be thought of as equal to the original. The loss here is incurred at the expressive and the informative levels of meaning.

In example 3 below the problem of rendering ambiguity is more complicated because one of the possible meanings is divinely abrogated in a later stage of Islamic legislation, as will be explained. Hereby, rendering such a meaning, without footnotes, mis-instructs the reader.

Example 3:

Wa`alal-ladhiina yuṭiiqunahu fidyatun ṭa`aamu miskiin
The verse refers to God's injunction of fasting and gives rules for people concerning the fasting of Ramadan. Ambiguity lies in the verb يُقَنِّعُahu which is differently interpreted by exegetes, the verb is derived from the participle إطَّاء, which denotes either "ability to do something" OR "managing to do something with great difficulty" (see Lisaan al-`Arab, n.d.). Al-`Aluusy, the commentator, declares that exegetes have differed in opinion as to the interpretation of this verse. Those who believe that the verse (2:184) is abrogated by the following verse:

\[
\text{فَمَنْ شَهَدَ بِنَكُمْ نَهْرَ الْبَقَرَةُ} 185
\]

interpret the verse as (those who are able to fast are at liberty either to fast or not, but if they do not, they must feed a poor man for each day they break, by way of redemption) (see al-`Aluusy, 1985).

The other group of commentators believe that the verse applies only to those who can fast but with great difficulty because of old age or sickness. The verse, to them, means 'those who can hardly fast are allowed to break it but must feed a poor man for each day of Ramadan they break, by way of redemption'. The ambiguity of the word يُقَنِّعُahu results in giving different renditions by translators. Sale and Arberry adopt the first interpretation, whereas Dawood and Khatib adopt the latter. Their translations are listed below:

**Sale:** And those who can keep it, and do not, must redeem their neglect by maintaining of a poor man.

**Arberry:** ...and for those who are able to fast, a redemption by feeding a poor man.

**Dawood:** ...and for those that find it extremely difficult to fast, there is ransom: the feeding of a poor man.

**Khatib:** As for those who can afford with hardship, there is redemption in feeding the indigent.
None of the translators, except for Sale, in a footnote, hints at the ambiguity of the verse. In such a verse, which gives a legal ruling to be followed, it is important to give all the interpretations; especially for those who adopt the abrogated sense, otherwise the directive meaning will be miscommunicated, as shown in Arberry’s translation. The meaning which Arberry’s translation gives is that: ‘people who are able to fast should fast and pay a redemption’, which is a misinterpretation of the original. It may reflect the surface meaning but ignores the real substance. As long as the ambiguity could not be reproduced, footnotes, as Newmark advocates, should be made use of when other relevant meanings are important (see above).

However, Sales' rendering together with his footnote explain the ambiguity. Arberry's rendition of the verse, which obscurely renders the abrogated meaning, is deviant from the informative and vocative meanings. Other information, indispensable to understanding the text, should be supplemented to the translation. As mentioned above, it is important to supplement difficult passages with information that cannot be inserted into the translation but necessary for the readers to understand the text almost as clearly as the original readers do. In this particular case, Arberry's translation, mis-instructs the reader.

Dawood and Khatib disambiguate the verb and render a meaning based on an interpretation different from that adopted by Sale and Arberry. Though they do not hint at the ambiguity by means of any supplementary information, their translations are acceptable, because they do not miscommunicate the meaning by giving an abrogated sense without explaining the fact that it is abrogated. Thereby, unlike Arberry, they correctly render the vocative and informative meanings. In such cases, where proper communication is possible, footnotes could be dispensed with. Reproducing the ambiguity to echo the expressive meaning is impossible in this example because there is no TL ambiguous lexeme to parallel the SL lexeme.
Reproducing ambiguities in the TL is sometimes successful and better than disambiguation, as shown by example 4 below, where there is a peaceful co-existence between more than one meaning. Hence, rendering the ambiguity is more inclusive of meanings.

Example 4:

\[
\text{نَسَأَا عَكَمُ الْهَزْمَل-لا-كُمْ: فَأْتُوْ الْهَزْمَلَكَمْ اِنّا شَيْتَمُ}
\]

The verse refers to the sexual relations between husbands and wives. Because Allah has not made women only for the enjoyment of men, the relationship between them is likened to the relation between a farmer and his field.

In other words, as a farmer goes to his field for cultivation in order to get produce from it, a husband also should go to his wife to 'produce' children (see Mawdudi, 1973, 155). The modifier \(\text{أَنَّاء} \) used in the verse is ambiguous. It may modify manner, place or time (al-'Aluusy, 1985). Thus, the verse could be interpreted as: 'Your wives are your tillage; so come to your tillage (1) in whatever manner you wish or (2) wherever you wish or (3) whenever you wish' (see al-'Aluusy, 1985).

The second interpretation is rejected because the place of tillage is defined by the Shari'ah and no other place is permissible (see al-Qii'y, 1987, 151). Therefore, \(\text{أَنَّاء} \) is capable of bearing two meanings. Sale adopts the first meaning and gives:

\text{Sale}: Your wives are your tillage; go in therefore unto your tillage in what manner ye will.

Khatib, on the other hand, adopts the latter meaning, he has:
Khatib: Your wives are tilth for you, so go in to your tilth whenever you wish.

Arberry and Dawood attempt to reproduce the ambiguity by providing the following translations:

Arberry: Your Women are a tillage; so come unto your tillage as you wish.

Dawood: Women are your fields: go, then, into your fields as you please.

The modifying phrases "as you wish" and "as you please" are more inclusive of meanings and reflect the ambiguity in the translations. They echo the original without mis-instructing the reader, which is preferable to the above translations that disambiguate the verse.

The last example to be discussed is (2:191), which may better illustrate the translators' approaches to ambiguity.

Example 5:

Wal-fitnatu 'ashdu minal-qatl.

The verse states that fitnah which is the ambiguous lexeme in this verse, is more grievous than slaying. The verse is rendered as follows:

Sale: For temptation to idolatry is more grievous than slaughter.
Arberry: persecution is more grievous than slaying.
Dawood: Idolatry is worse than carnage.
Khatib: For sedition is worse than carnage.
The word נינא.fitnah in Arabic has several meanings. As Khatib footnotes: "the Arabic word used for sedition is נינא.fitnah, which may also mean dilution, deviation or idolatry" (1984, 37). Thus, Khatib gives other meanings and selects "sedition" as an equivalent. However, the others do not have the same approach; they are satisfied with rendering only one meaning. The root meaning of the word נינא.fitnah has to do with tests, and hence 'temptation' or 'putting to the truth' (al-'Aṣfahāny, 1992). "When a variety of translations have been volunteered", as Cragg points out, "there remains a feel about the Arabic which eludes a single rendering" (1988, 83).

Conclusion
The above examples show that the translators adopt different approaches to ambiguity. Sale, usually disambiguates the ambiguous lexemes, then provides alternative interpretations(s) in a footnote, as appears in his translation of the word יונְצָּרָעַ나 yunצָּרָעַןahu and יונְצָרָעַנה yunצָּרָעַנה (see above). However, this does not always happen; sometimes he is satisfied with selecting a single meaning to be rendered; e.g. rendering the referentially ambiguous pronoun עֵּמֶל הָא haa in מְעַלִּיתָהּ haa in מְעַלִּיתָהּ faja-אַלְמַא הָא nakaalan as "them" referring it to the community who transgressed the Sabbath. Thereby, he 'overtranslates' the informative and expressive meanings of the original. This 'overtranslation' is acceptable in this particular example because there is no TL ambiguous equivalent. His criteria for providing notes are unclear and inconsistent. For example, he footnotes the ambiguous lexeme יונְצָרָעַנו yunצָּרָעַן but does not footnote נינא.fitnah, though both have different meanings given in the exegeses.

Unlike Sale, Arberry tends to reproduce ambiguities, whenever possible, so as not to involve in needless 'overtranslation' of the
informative and expressive meanings, e.g. (2:223). When disambiguation is the only possible procedure, Arberry either selects a denotative meaning to be rendered and dispenses with other alternatives, e.g. (2:162) or gives two-to-one equivalent, e.g. (2:66). Arberry's predetermined approach of providing no footnotes results, in some cases, in miscommunicating the vocative and informative meanings, e.g. (2:184). When disambiguation is inevitable, giving two-to-one equivalent, as in translating /lāmālī/ /lāf/ /kāf/ /nūn/ nakaalan as "punishment exemplary" (2:66), is a plausible technique because it avoids needless 'undertranslation' of the informative meaning.

Dawood, mostly, does not reproduce the ambiguities. Neither, does he give footnotes to provide alternative meaning(s) when disambiguation occurs. Rendering the referentially ambiguous pronoun /lāf/ /haa/ in /lāmālī/ /lāf/ /kāf/ /nūn/ /lāf/ /haa/ faja`alnahaa nakaalan (2:66) as "we made their fate an example" is but a case in point. Thereby, he lapses into needless 'overtranslation' and 'undertranslation' by needlessly sacrificing the expressive and informative meanings, respectively.

Khatib's approach to ambiguity varies. When reproducing ambiguities is impossible, he disambiguates the ambiguous lexemes as in translating /nūn/ /yā/ /dhal/ /lām/ /lāf/ /lāmālimāq/ /ayn/ /waw/ /lāf/ /nūn/ /waw/ /qāf/ /yā/ /tā-m/ /yā/ (2:183) Wa-`alal-ladhiina yuṭiqunahu: 'As for those who can afford with hardship'. Compensation for the informative meaning by way of footnoting rarely appears; e.g. /lāf/ fitnah in (2:191) is rendered "sedition" and appended with a footnote which reads: "The Arabic word used for sedition is fitnah, which may also mean dilution, deviation or idolatry" (1984, 37). Like Sale, Arberry's criteria for footnoting are unclear. When possible, Khatib, like Arberry, retains the ambiguities in the TL or combines the two meanings of a SL ambiguous word in a phrase in the TL, as in (2:223) and (2:66) respectively. Therefore, there is no needless
'overtranslation' or sacrifice at the expressive level. However, when footnotes are not provided, in case of disambiguation, the informative meaning is 'undertranslated'. Thus, as he declares, his translation or any other one "gives a particular meaning" (1984, vi).

It is shown by the above examples that the translator does not follow a single approach to translation, even in translating a single linguistic phenomenon. Rather, procedures differ according to the context. In other words, there are approaches within approaches. It is also shown that mis-selection of the proper translation procedure leads to less successful translation.

I recommend reproducing ambiguities in the TL if there is a TL lexeme capable of embracing the meanings of the SL ambiguous lexeme. In such a case, footnotes should be made use of to explain the different meanings involved by that lexeme.

Giving a two-to-one equivalent to render an ambiguous lexeme is a procedure that I recommend if reproducing ambiguities is impossible. If selection is inevitable, the translator is advised to choose the denotative meaning which is cited by the commentary or commentaries on which he heavily relies. If the lexeme has different directive meanings, footnotes should be employed to provide alternative meaning(s).

In cases of abrogation, the translator has to avoid selecting the abrogated sense even if he hints at this abrogation in a footnote. This is because some readers tend to dispense with footnotes, thereby; they may get the wrong meaning. This procedure is all the more recommended in translating verses which have directive meanings.

In addition, footnotes and introductions are needed to explain to the non-native speakers of Arabic that the Qur'an is only ONE version, unlike the other sacred books. Yet, the translations are numerous because the Arabic of the Qur'an is so rich that it evades a single
translation. Therefore, the Arabic text should be printed along with the English translation and titles such as "Translation of the Meaning" and "Translation of Meaning" should be avoided because they are misleading to a reader unacquainted with the Qur'an. The definite article the and the definite noun meaning misinform the reader that the Qur'an has only a single definite meaning -- an impression which is far from reality. In fact, the words of the Qur'an are bounteous; their meanings reveal themselves differently for different persons and for the same persons at different times.

Starting the work of translation with such techniques in mind is to lead to consistency in translation in addition to adequacy. No needless loss at any level of meaning would be incurred by the translator. Moreover, no semantic deviation is liable to occur. However, in any translation attempted of the Book, as Cragg emphasizes, "simplification, loss, limitation have all to be risked" (1988, 49). Every fresh attempt, according to Daryabadi, "brings home, in varying degrees, the truth of the old saying that nothing is so unlike the original as its copy" (1943, ix).
References


James, Carl.(1989). "Genre Analysis and the Translator". Target. 29-41.


Appendix

Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>Source Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TT</td>
<td>Target Text</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SL</td>
<td>Source Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TL</td>
<td>Target Language</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key to Transliteration**

The transliterations of the Qur'anic verses provided in this paper are taken from Yusuf Ali's (1990). His symbols are adopted except for the symbols given for, \( \dot{z} = \mathbf{Z}, \, \mathbf{t} = z, \, \mathbf{u} = \mathbf{U} \), and \( \dot{\mathbf{g}} = \mathbf{G} \). I use \( \dot{\mathbf{d}} = \mathbf{D} \), \( \mathbf{t} = \mathbf{t} \), \( \mathbf{a} = \mathbf{a} \), and \( \mathbf{g} = \mathbf{g} \). Names of Arabic authors are quoted as they are written by the authors themselves, for facilitating reference to their books. For example, خليل الخليلي is written as khitib because it is written like that in his rendition of the Qur'an. All transliterations are written in italics except for names. Transliteration is provided whenever the Arabic word(s) appear(s) in the text. Although the system used in this paper for transliterating Arabic long vowels is doubling the vowel in English, the words قرآن, الله, رمضان, إمام, إسلام and جهاد are transferred, respectively, as Qur'an, Allah, Ramadan, Imam, Islam and Jihad with one a for the long vowel “a”. This is because they are loan words introduced to the English language and standardized like that; hence not transliterated. Similarly, the word شريعة and the word شريعة are transferred, respectively, as Surah and Shari`ah, with one u and one i, and not transliterated.
The signs of interrogation, interjection, quotation marks, dashes and capital letters are introduced to the transliteration, as stated by Ali in the 1990 edition, "for clarification of meaning and intonation". Ali also gives symbols for the Qur'anic rules of tajwiid for the sake of proper recitation of the Qur'an. For غَنْنَه (a nasal sound as in uncle) he uses د، as in anaa, except when the sound is doubled as in إن. I use د for ghunna. For مَد (elongation of vowels) he triples the vowel as in يَا. For short and long vowels the following list of symbols are used:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Short</th>
<th>Long</th>
<th>mad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a as in /b/</td>
<td>aa as in /ba/</td>
<td>aaa as in /baa/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i as in /b/</td>
<td>ii as in /bi/</td>
<td>iii as in /bi/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>u as in /bu/</td>
<td>uu as in /bu/</td>
<td>uuu as in /buu/</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For consonants the following list is used:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(hamza)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>/b/</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/t/</td>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/th/</td>
<td>th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/j/</td>
<td>j</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/h/</td>
<td>h</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/k/</td>
<td>kh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/d/</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ز</td>
<td>dh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ر</td>
<td>r</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ز</td>
<td>z</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>س</td>
<td>s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ش</td>
<td>sh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ص</td>
<td>ș</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ض</td>
<td>č</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ط</td>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ظ</td>
<td>z</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ع</td>
<td>ğ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>غ</td>
<td>gh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ف</td>
<td>f</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ق</td>
<td>q</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ك</td>
<td>k</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ل</td>
<td>l</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>م</td>
<td>m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ن</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ه</td>
<td>h</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>و</td>
<td>w</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ی</td>
<td>ی</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Argumentative Discourse in the Qur'an: A Model for Translation Quality Assessment

Thana Al Gabashi

The study attempts to develop a translation-quality assessment model for the argumentative discourse of the messengers and their people as presented in the Qur’an. It draws basically on Stephen Toulmin’s (2003) model for the analysis of argumentation and Malcom William’s discourse based TQA approach to argumentation. It examines two source text oriented translations of the meanings of The Qur’an. These are the only published English translations by the major authoritative publisher of the Qur’an in the Islamic world, King Fahd’s Complex for the Printing of the Qur’an. The criteria that established this model are based on three sources of information. First, the standards that KFCPQ has set for the translations of the meanings of the Qur’an in order to be published and distributed. The second source of information is the norms or conventional features of argumentative discourse that reveal the general rhetorical typology of this discourse. The third source is the distinctive communicative features of the Qur'anic discourse as shown through the analysis of selected argumentative discourse units. These selected features formed the criteria that were used for the suggested assessment model. What is distinctive about the suggested model is that it accounts for both the standards and the criteria for the translation quality assessment. In other words, the suggested quality assessment model includes the major standards that are defined by KFCPQ: clarity and consistency with the approved meaning by the authorized interpreters of the Qur’an. It also includes the most crucial criteria for quality assessment of the translation of the Qur’anic argumentative discourse as identified in this study, namely, argument schema, cohesion, context, speech acts and the propositional content, voice and stylistic devices.
1. Introduction

How do we know when a translation is good? This simple question lies at the heart of all concerns with translation criticism. But not only that, in trying to assess the quality of a translation one also addresses the heart of any theory of translation, i.e., the crucial question of the nature of translation or, more specifically, the nature of the relationship between a source text and its translation text. (House 243)

The problem of making a study on translation quality assessment of a sacred text such as the Qur’an can be related to two different reasons. First, the need for an approach which guides us to an objective and systematic method for the assessment of the translation. Second, the nature of the Qur’an as a book of guidance which represents Allah’s message to all people and which is characterized by an extremely distinctive style.

1.1. Difficulties related to the study of TQA

One of the problems encountered in any research which is related to the assessment of the quality of the translation is that studies in this field indicate that old approaches are subjective and pass general judgment which is signified by words such as good, faithful, adequate, acceptable. At the same time, most of the modern approaches to TQA though use systematic method of analysis, they do not assign values to the defined criteria that reflect the degree of the appropriateness of the translation. Some translation scholars evaluate the translation according to language levels, others evaluate the translation according to the text type and function. Yet, there is a dire need for more studies and investigations in this complicated field.

The work of Eugene Nida on the Bible provides rich source of reference. He emphasizes that the role of religious translation is the production of a correct and clear message. Accordingly, the quality of the translation is related to the correct transfer of the message. Nida
acknowledges that “the process by which one determines equivalence between source and receptor languages is obviously a highly complex one” (Nida 245). He indicates that though “formal equivalence” represents an accurate transfer of the message, there are some cases when it cannot be attained. This ST-oriented equivalence, whenever obtained, needs to be supplemented with explanatory footnotes so that the target reader (TR) can understand the cultural and contextual implications that affect the meaning of the message. Nida clarifies the meaning of the discourse as a whole must be analyzed in terms of both content, subject matter of the message, and form, epic poetry, legendary narrative, exposition, or apocalyptic literature.(243)

Reiss uses the form of the text as one of the major factors of assessment. She relates her quality assessment models to text-types and their presumed functions. According to her study, assessment of translation should start with the designation of the original text-types, which can provide the critic with the noteworthy linguistic and non-linguistic features of the text. Reiss assures us that One of the causes for the inadequacies of translation criticism to date may be traced to the wide variety of views as to what a translation can or should achieve, or even the doubt as to whether translation is in fact at all possible. A theory of translation that is applicable to all texts has not yet been developed. (6-7)

Julian House presents a discourse-based model for assessing translation quality. She employs Halliday’s functional-systemic approach, which emphasizes the role of both textual and contextual dimensions of language as vehicles of meaning. In this approach, both the original and translated texts should be tested for maintaining the ideational, interpersonal, and textual values. House maintains that the evaluation and assessment of any translation should always be associated with the required function as stated in the translation commission.
Salem, Al Jehani, Kamara, Alyas, Bennyan, and Aittah consider the standards set by the translation commission as the most important source for TQA. This method guides the translator and the evaluator to the crucial criteria which should be considered in the translation process and assessment.

1.2. Difficulties related to TQA of the Qur’an

For all Muslims, the Qur’an is the supreme source of reason, knowledge, and guidance. It is also a highly valued masterpiece of literary work for Arabs. It is not only a sacred book, but also a source of legal, historical, social, and behavioral acts. Muslims believe that the Qur’an holds Allah’s message for mankind. Accordingly, the Qur’an is not restricted to a particular time, place, audience or culture. This sensitive nature of the Qur’an creates a difficulty in both defining and assigning values to the most crucial criteria and standards which measure the correct transfer of the true meaning of a book that represents Allah’s word.

Though the translation of the meanings of the Qur’an is less problematic than the translation of any other sacred book because it has one original script which has not changed since it was delivered, different people read it differently. Accordingly, there are different exegetical books which sometimes differ in their interpretation of the meaning of some of the texts in the Qur’an. Hussien Abdul Raoof explains “[e]ach translation represents one person’s understanding of the text, each is significantly different from the others, and none is the Qur’an itself. There is but one Word, but there are as many interpretations of that Word as there are readers” (181).

These problems highlight the importance of referring back to the standards set by the translation commission or to the stated purpose of the translation. The evaluator needs to know the target reader, the
appropriate authorized sources for the interpretation of the Qur'an and the required type of translation.

2. Setting the Criteria for the TQA Model

The present study investigates twenty argumentative discourse units and their translations which are selected from the two authorized translations by KFCPQ: *The Holy Qur’an: Text, Translation and Commentary* by A. Y. Ali and *Interpretation of the Meaning of The Noble Qur’an in the English Language* by Hillali and Khan. Each translation unit represents an argumentative discourse between one of Allah’s Messengers and his people. The reason for choosing this type of discourse is the general believe that it is the most problematic type in translation. According to Basil Hatim, “choices of argumentative strategy are closely bound up with intercultural pragmatic factors” (131)

Malcom Williams asserts that judgment of translation quality should be based on both the standards which clarify the function of the translation and “the contribution that the source text unit makes to the purpose, or illocutionary point, of the text” (150). In view of that, the process of defining the required criteria is done in three stages. The first stage defines the criteria which are based on the standards. The next stage explores the criteria which are based on the significant conventional features of the English and Arabic argumentative discourse. The final stage pinpoints the criteria based on the communicative devices which are used in the selected text as used in its context.

2.1. Criteria based on the standards

Considering the translation of the meanings of the Qur’an, *KFCPQ* is the largest and most authorized publisher in the Islamic world. The main function of the translation of the Qur’an as stated by this publishing house is to communicate the true meaning of its message
as interpreted by the scholarly consensus of Ibn Katheer, Al Tabari, Al Baghaiwi, and Al Saadi (Al Ofee 1). These scholars follow Prophet Muhammad’s interpretation of the Qur’an and the interpretation of his faithful followers without any additions or deletions that leads to the misinterpretation of the its message. The other standards as set by KFCPQ are clarity and consistency. Accordingly, the four above mentioned sources of interpretation of the Qur’an are going to be used as the tool for the assessment of the appropriate meaning. The other tools that will be used to support the analysis are The New Oxford Thesaurus of English, the Arabic Lexical Dictionary, Lisan Al Arab and A Dictionary of Religious Terms. Two TQA criteria are derived from the standards and defined at this stage; clarity and consistency.

2.2. Criteria based on the norms of argumentative discourse

Mona Baker explains that in order to maintain equivalence between a SL text and a TL text, the translator “will need to adjust certain features of source-text organization in line with preferred way of organizing discourse in the target language” (113).This part of the study explores argumentative text as related to a larger frame that characterizes a particular set of texts. Hence, conventions of argumentative discourse organization should be considered as one of the factors that influence the acceptability and comprehension of any translated text.

To achieve this goal, I have conducted a comparative literature review of the acceptable characteristics and organization of the English and Arabic argumentative discourse. This process led to the definition of the significant features which should be accounted for in the translation. The majority of argumentation theorists and linguists assert that argumentative discourse has logical and rhetorical dimensions. They also explain that this type of discourse has a definable schema that generally contains a claim or a conclusion and evidence. These argument components are linked by logical relations.
Toulmin explains that there are six possible argument components: “claim”, “data”, “warrant”, “backing”, “qualifiers” and “rebuttals” (103). The claim or conclusion can be explicit or implicit. It is mostly placed at the begging or at the end of the argument to guarantee its retention. Toulmin also emphasizes the logical and rhetorical dimensions of the argument. Accordingly, the logical dimension represents argument schema and the logical relations which represent the textual function. The rhetorical dimension represents the content and context which are referred to as the ideational and interpersonal functions in Halliday’s theory. Al Alma’a’i assures that in order to understand the Qur’anic argumentative discourse, we need to investigate the Qur’anic stylistic features which are used for persuasion. The theoretical review in this study defined the next criteria that follow clarity and consistency: argument schema, cohesion, persuasive devices which can be more specified by the analysis of the selected units for study.

2.3. Criteria based on the communicative features of the selected argumentative discourse

This part of the study explores the predominant rhetorical features of the argumentative discourse in the Qur’an. Accordingly, it investigates the selected discourse units as used in their context. At this stage, the original units are analyzed to find out the dominant structures, cohesive devices, persuasive devices and the role of the situational context in meaning representation.

The argumentation of Allah’s Messengers and their people belongs to the narrative type of reasoning. Therefore, the overall structure of this argumentative discourse should be divided first, according to the narrative frame that holds all its parts in a logical structure and then, according to its particular argumentative structure. This general organization is clarified in the following figure:
Though this type of argumentative discourse is embedded in narrative, its dominant function is argumentative. In *The Translator as Communicator*, Hatim and Mason consider that texts can be “multifunctional,” yet, they can be defined as of one particular type by their dominant function and without ignoring the “added rhetorical effect” of the other existing functions (129). The claim or conclusion is usually placed at the end of the argument in this type of Qur’anic discourse. Such organization is acceptable in English argument. At the same time, argument components in the Qur’an include all types of acceptable English argument components.

Moreover, each of the examined argumentative discourse units includes a dialogue which needs to be analyzed for its role in communicating the meaning. Roger Fowler explains that analysis of the dialogue should include the investigation of the speech acts, voice and tone. Accordingly, the preliminary model includes the following criteria:

1. **Logical Criteria:**
   1.1. Argument Structure
   Data
   Warrant
   Rebuttals
   Backings
Conclusion

1.2. Argument Cohesion

2. Rhetorical Criteria:
2.1. Pragmatic criteria: context, speech act, voice and tone.
2.2. Stylistic criterion: persuasive language

3. Clarity
4. Consistency

3. Assessments of the Translations

The application of the TQA model in this study shows that there are different problems which are related to the different criteria. Some of the argumentative units of the Qur’an include refutation of the rebuttals. This argument component should be added to the model to measure the correct transfer of the meaning of this component. Cohesive devices are used in the Qur’an for more than one function. The tone has to be included in the speech act. Therefore, the enhancement of the suggested model will lead to a more appropriate TQA model of the Qur’anic argumentative discourse of Allah’s Messengers and their people.

The analysis of cohesion and stylistic devices proved that parallelism and word repetition is used for more than one function in the Qur’an. These two devices are used to establish cohesion and persuasion. Cohesion functions within the argument itself and across all the argumentative discourse of Allah’s Messengers and their people in the Qur’an. Moreover, the Qur’an uses parallelism and repetition to mark out the important information. These two stylistic features are used as persuasive, cohesive, and recall devices. There are also some problems in the transfer of cohesive devices that have a logical function in the argument. For example, the verse "فَأَفْلَحْنَّهُمُ الْجَهَنُمْ فَأَصْبِحُوا فِي كَانَهُمْ جَنَّاتٗ" is rendered by Ali as “But the earthquake took them
unawares and they lay prostrate in their homes before the morning!” (٧:٩١). The conjunctive “fa” in this context signals the causal reasoning. The nonbelievers’ rejection of Allah’s Message, even after all the proofs that Allah’s messenger has offered, leads to their torment and destruction. The accurate rendering of this conjunction would be “So the earthquake seized them and they lay (dead), prostrate in their homes” (Hilali and Khan, ٧:٩١). The misinterpretation of the logical meaning of these connectives can significantly alter the process of reasoning.

The analysis of speech acts and propositional content mostly leads to the discussion of the dominant tone. A threatening speech act indicates the attitude of the speaker about the issue under discussion. At the same time, a speech act of disaffirmation and disdain reveals a scornful tone. This directs us to the conclusion that tone is mostly derived from the type of speech act and, therefore, it should not be included in the criteria. The translator’s misunderstanding of the speech act mostly leads to the loss of some important linguistic devices that signify it. For example, in Jesus argumentative discourse, the warrant,َ

\( \text{qala qad jitukum bilhikmati waliobayina lakum baAAda allathee takhtalifoona feehi,} \)

includes Jesus’s clarification of the nature of his mission. He uses an assertive speech act to assure them that he is Allah’s Messenger who is sent to clarify to them Allah’s Law and unite them. The emphatic particle qad “surely” is used to stress this assertion. Hilali and Khan render this warrant as “I have come to you with Al-Hikmah (Prophethood), and in order to make clear to you some of the (points) in that you differ, therefore fear Allah and obey me”. Ali renders it as “Now have I come to you with Wisdom and in order to make clear to you some of the (points) on which ye dispute”. The assertive word “surely” which emphasizes the illocutionary meaning of this speech act is not transferred by any of the translators.
The Qur’anic stylistic method of voice and time shift has proved to create a difficulty for the translators. Voice shift has more than one function in the Qur’an. It is used as an excitation device that breaks up the monotony of hearing one voice for a long time. It also draws the reader’s attention to the significance of the new information. The cohesion and the smooth development of the ideas of the Qur’an make the translators assume the continuity of the same speech. They mostly do not recognize this voice shift.

The following example which represents Ibrahim’s argumentative discourse clarifies this problem.

Qala afara’yum ma kuntum ta’Abudoon. Antum wa’aaba’okumu al’aqadamoon. Fainnahum AAaduwwun lee illa rabba alAAalameen.

“Ibrahim said: ‘Do you observe that which you have been worshipping, you and your ancient fathers? Verily! They are enemies to me, save the Lord of the ’Alamin’ (mankind, jinns and all that exists)’. (Hilali &Khan’s Trans)

“Ibrahim said: ‘Do ye then see whom ye have been worshipping. Ye and your fathers before you? For they are enemies to me; not so the Lord and Cherisher of the Worlds.’” (Ali’s Trans)

Ibrahim presupposes his people’s need for an identification of the “Lord of the worlds” that he calls them to believes in Him. So he prompts his people’s reasoning by definition. He helps them to define the criteria that guide them to the True God Who should be followed and worshipped as follow:

Ibrahim presupposes his people’s need for an identification of the “Lord of the worlds” that he calls them to believes in Him. So he prompts his people’s reasoning by definition. He helps them to define the criteria that guide them to the True God Who should be followed and worshipped as follow:
Allathee khalaqanee fahuwa yahdeen Wallathee huwa yufAimunee wayasqeen Wa’itha maridtu fahuwa yashfeen Wallathee yumeetunee thumma yuhyeen

“Who created me and it is He Who guides me; Who gives me food and drink; and when I am ill, it is He Who cures me; Who will cause me to die and then to live (again); And Who I hope will forgive me my faults on the Day of Judgment.” (Ali’s Trans)

Who has created me, and it is He Who guides me; and it is He Who feeds me and gives me to drink; and when I am ill, it is He who cures me; And Who will cause me to die, and then will bring me to life (again); And Who, I hope will forgive me my faults on the Day of Recompense, (the Day of Resurrection). (Hilali&Khan’s Tran)

Knowing that his people are not willing to be rationally persuaded, Ibrahim turns to the authority of Allah to show them that he is the only God who can Hear, Judge, Reward and Punish as indicated in his supplication:

O my Lord! bestow wisdom on me and join me with the righteous; Grant me honorable mention on the tongue of truth among the latest (generations); "Make me one of the inheritors of the Garden of Bliss; "Forgive my father for that he is among those astray; And let me not be in disgrace on the Day when (men) will be raised up. The Day whereon neither wealth nor sons will avail. (Ali’s Trans)
And Paradise will be brought near to the Muttaqun (pious); and the (Hell) Fire will be placed in full view of the erring (Hilali&Khan’s Trans).

“To the righteous, the Garden will be brought near; and to those straying in Evil; the Fire will be placed in full view” (Ali’s Trans)

At this point, there is a sudden voice shift from Ibrahim’s speech to Allah’s Speech. However, Ali keeps the quotations marks that indicate the continuation of Ibrahim’s speech even after this shift. The passive form of the verses draws our attention to the significance of the actions. The Speaker here distances Himself and makes the receiver perceive and live this experience. Though the events describe the future, they are reported in the past tense which is not used as a temporal reference but rather for its function as a signal of the certainty of what is going to be experienced. Time shift in the Qur’an is used as a stylistic device to signal a significant change of either topic or voice that demands the receiver’s attention. In English, a shift from tense to aspect can also mark a shift in narrative (Wales 32).

Moreover, Ali uses an archaic form of English which resembles the language of the translated Bible. This creates some confusion to the reader and it does not serve the purpose of the translation that is meaning communication. The translation of the Qur’an is only accepted as a book of meaning interpretation of the Qur’an and therefore, it cannot be regarded as a version of it.

Another problem which faces the process of evaluation is that there are some words which are cultural specific such as Arafat “a place where Muslim pilgrims go to at the first day of their pilgrimage”, sabbih “the act of declaring and acknowledging Allah’s glory”, and Ka’ba “a cube shaped building in Makkah that all Muslims face when praying”, can be easily understood by non-Arab Muslims but not by non-Muslims. Hilali and Khan sometimes borrow the Arabic word and
use it without explanation such as the case in the translation of the following verse:

Waya qawmi la yajrimanakum shiqaqee an yuseebakum mithlu ma asaba qawma noohin aw qawma hoodin aw qawma salihin wama qawmu lootin minkum bibaAeed

“And O my people! Let not my Shiqaq cause you to suffer the fate similar to that of the people of Nuh or of Hud or of Salih, and the people of Lout are not far off from you!” (11:89. Emphasis is mine)

The Arabic word Shiqaq is included in the English translation without the rendering of its meaning or the inclusion of a note that clarifies the meaning of this word. Therefore, the assessment of a translation which borrows such Arabic words would differ according to the definition of the target reader. These are some of the problems which affect meaning communication and the assessment of the translation.

Conclusions
The enhanced model includes the crucial criteria for the translation Quality assessment of the Qur'anic argumentative discourse. It examines the accuracy of the transfer of the reasoning by testing the transfer of the meaning presented in all argument components and the cohesive devices which link them. Each criterion in this model represents one of the major elements that affect the accuracy of meaning transfer of the argument. These criteria are given a value that ranges from zero to five. The results of the application of the suggested model are clarified in the following table.
Table 1: The enhanced model for TQA of argumentative discourse in the Qur’an

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TQAQA</th>
<th>Arguments1-5</th>
<th>Logical Criteria</th>
<th>Rhetorical Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Argumentative Discourse</td>
<td>Translator</td>
<td>Arg Scheme 0-5</td>
<td>Cohesion 0-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noah's Argument</td>
<td>Ali</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hilali &amp; Khan</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hud's Argument</td>
<td>Ali</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hilali &amp; Khan</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salih's Argument</td>
<td>Ali</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hilali &amp; Khan</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shuaib's Argument</td>
<td>Ali</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hilali &amp; Khan</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses' Argument</td>
<td>Ali</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hilali &amp; Khan</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: The enhanced model for TQA of argumentative discourse in the Qur’an

CP: Communicative purpose
PC: Propositional content

The grades of the general quality of the two translations in all the assessment tables show that Hilali and Khan’s translation is more consistent with the required quality. The most important argument components are rendered accurately. Qualifiers that assert the reliability and truth of the argument are also carefully rendered. Most important, the interpretation of the meaning is compatible with the authorized interpretations.

The study indicates that in order to define the correct criteria for the assessment of the quality of the translation, we need to define quality as required and perceived by the commissioner. In other words, different definitions of quality leads to the selection of different criteria that measures the accuracy of reaching the required function. The standards should be set according to the consensus of a qualified team of translators and consultant scholars of the different fields that are needed for the rendering of the meanings of the Qur’an.
Works Cited


• Al Ofee, Muhammad. “General Standards for the Translation of the meaning of the Qur’an.” Questionaire.2006.


Did they translate the
Holy Qur’an or its exegesis?

A corpus-based Treatment of the Translation of Synonymy and Polysemy in the Qur’an

Abdelhamid Elewa
Imam University, KSA

Introduction:
As the translators of the Qur’an have no direct access to the language of the Qur’an produced during the time of revelation, they have to rely on resources that belong to the same era to give the equivalent meaning. The only available resources at that time are hadith collections, nomad proverbs, poetry and the Qur’an itself. However, most of the translators consult the interpretations of the Qur’an which may differ from one exegete to another. They end up translating the exegesis of the Qur’an rather than the Qur’an itself. So, the translation of the Qur’an is mainly based on the same methodological approach of the author of the exegesis. This may be a key element in having different translations of the Qur’an. For example the most popular translation of the Qur’an sponsored by King Fahd Complex in Madina, Saudi Arabia relied on the commentaries of Tabari (d. 923 C.E.), Qurtubi (d. 1273 C.E.), and Ibn Kathir (d. 1372 C.E.). Even if someone wanted to give a translation free of exegetical commentaries, he will have no resources that help him know the meaning during the time of revelation and will end up using an exegesis of the Qur’an.

This study is an attempt at explaining some issues in translating the Qur’an, particularly the problems of synonymy and polysemy, which can be accounted for by using a computerized corpus that enable large
quantities of texts to be searched for all occurrences of a particular lexical item and then we can compare and contrast the characteristic uses of semantically related words such as synonyms and polysems. This implies a need for a fresh look at the translations of the Qur’an from an exegetical approach bearing in mind the technological progress in data processing. The new and unexpected findings will raise lots of questions about the credibility of most translations of the Qur’an.

The corpus-based analysis can be used as a successful methodology for testing what has been introduced by early linguists on all linguistic levels (morphology, syntax, semantics, etc.). More than that, it can give new insights and introduce rules and models which have not been previously discussed. I do not claim that my analysis is privileged, but rather it is more methodical and systematic than subjective analyses and those based on intuition. I am trying to find a common platform for the translators of the Qur’an to draw on rather than relying on one exegetical approach.

In the field of the Qur’an exegesis many works have been done but based on the old perspectives: non-corpus-based. The outcome was huge, yielding various contributions. Nonetheless, some verses are left either vague or misinterpreted because of the vagueness of some lexemes as will be discussed throughout this paper. This vagueness of meaning may not be sorted out by simple study of the word; it rather requires an accurate probing of the whole senses of the word using the corpus linguistics methodology.

**Translation of the Qur’an**

Tens of English translations of the Qur’an are available on bookstores and online. Every now and then we hear of a new translation of the Qur’an drawing on the previous translations and making some changes. In fact every translation is a reflection of how the translator understands the Qur’an based on his subjective reading, sectarian or
political orientation. Below we are going to give some examples of the translations of the Qur’an produced in the twentieth century.

One of the most widely used translations in America is Mohamed Ali’s translation entitled “The Holy Qur’an”, published in 1917. This translation supports the Ahmadi creed in rejecting miracles and the miraculous birth of Jesus as well as the reference to Prophet Muhammad as the final prophet (Khalil 2005). This translation is adopted by the Nation of Islam led by Louis Farrakhan in America.

Influenced by Mohamed Ali, Pickthall translated the Qur’an to remedy the problems of the translations produced by Christian missionaries. Although his translation, published in 1930, was almost free of extra commentaries, “[h]e adopted Muhammad ‘Ali’s bias against descriptions of miracles and argued, for example, that the Qur’anic description of Muhammad’s night voyage to the heavens was just a vision” (Khalil 2005).

Abdullah Yusuf ‘Ali’s translation published in 1934 was the most widely used English translation produced by a Sunni Muslim until 1995 when Alhilali and Khan published their translation. His translation was heavily ensued with exegetical glosses and footnotes derived from early books of exegesis. In addition, “some of his copious notes, particularly on hell and heaven, angels, jinn and polygamy, etc. are informed with the pseudo-rationalist spirit of his times” (Kidawi 1988).

In an attempt to avoid exegetical explanations, Mohamed Asad translated the Qur’an drawing on his own modern thoughts. He ended up denying some Islamic miracles. “Asad denies the occurrence of such events as the throwing of Abraham into the [sic] fire, Jesus speaking in the cradle, etc. He also regards Luqman, Khizr and Zulqarnain as 'mythical figures' and holds unorthodox views on the abrogation of verses” (Khalil 2005).
Al-Hilali and Khan (1993) adopted the sunni worldview in translating the Qur’an by heavily relying on three works of exegesis: Tabari, Qurtubi and Ibn Kathir. Their translation which is called the Noble Qur’an is widely distributed among sunni Muslims for adopting an orthodox approach to Allah’s attributes, confirming all the literal readings of miracles and incorporating explanatory notes. However, the extensive glosses derived from the exegetical works may exclude other possible interpretations.

Lalah Bakhtiar presented a new translation of the Qur’an that considers the gender of the speaker (Said, 2004: 132). She glued the feminine marker (f) to all gender-neutral words in English which have animate feminine references in the source text throughout the Qur’an. She noted,

Just as I found a lack of internal consistency in previous English translations, I also found that little attention had been given to the woman's point of view. So when words in a verse refer directly to a woman or women or wife or wives and the corresponding pronouns such as (they, them, those), I have placed an (f) after the word to indicate the word refers to the feminine gender specifically. Otherwise, in the Arabic language (as in Spanish), the masculine pronoun may be used generically to include both male and female human beings.¹

She adopted a feminine approach in translating the Qur’an to give more presence to women and ensure equality between the two genders. She even translated some verses which are seen today by some Westerners as an injustice and encroachment of the woman’s rights like the issue of beating a rebellious wife. Let us have a look at the following Qur’anic verse.

Men are supporters of wives because God has given some of them an advantage over others and because they spend of their wealth. So the ones (f) who are in accord with morality are the ones (f) who are morally obligated, the ones (f) who guard the unseen of what God has kept safe. But those (f) whose resistance you fear, then admonish them (f) and abandon them (f) in their sleeping place, then go away from them (f); and if they (f) obey you, surely look not for any way against them (f); truly God is Lofty, Great.¹

The word idribuhnnna “beat them” which is understood by the majority of Muslims as symbolic beating, i.e. beating which does not break a bone or leave a mark, is rendered as “go away from them”.

**Corpus Linguistics**

In modern linguistic terms, a corpus is a designed collection of written, spoken or a mixture of written and spoken data which can be used for linguistic investigation. In this sense, not any collection of texts can be called a corpus since there is a big difference between a corpus and a text database; the former has to be "a systematic, planned, and structured compilation of text” (Kennedy 1998: 4).

Linguists throughout the history of linguistic research used to rely on textual resources as a source of evidence, at least, to prove the correctness of their theories about language. The study of language in general, whether in the context of modern linguistics or in the context of earlier linguistic studies has also been largely based on empirical research. This empirical approach to language is basically dominated by the observation of naturally occurring data, as linguists tended to gather evidence for the grammaticality of a given word or a sentence. This is partly what corpus linguistics deals with. However, corpus

linguistics goes beyond the use of corpora as a source of evidence in linguistic description. “Corpus linguistics, like all linguistics, is concerned primarily with the description and explanation of the nature, structure and use of language and languages and with particular matters such as language acquisition, variation and change” (Kennedy 1998: 8).

With the introduction of the computer into the field, the interest in corpora has grown and continues to increase. This is because the manipulation of large corpora accurately is quite hard without the use of computer techniques. The computer made the process easier and more reliable. The early Arab linguists relied mainly on three sources of linguistic data to describe their language: the Holy Qur’an, poetry and nomad proverbs. This is obvious in their use of quotations from these sources as linguistic evidence. Such quotations were certainly taken from a corpus they designed for their inquiry about language. They have postulated certain selection criteria for designing such a corpus. Versteegh explained, “on the one hand, the corpus used by the grammarians was closed, being limited to the text of the Qur’an and the pre-Islamic poetry, but on the other hand, the grammarians upheld the fiction of native speakers whose judgement could be trusted” (1997: 42).

The electronic corpus has become widely recognised and exploited when Francis and Kucera launched their pioneering corpus (Brown Corpus) in 1961. Then, linguists began to realise that electronic corpora can offer a new insight and a reliable methodology for natural language processing, as they found out that computers have made possible the collection, storage and processing of very large and varied texts. Unlike manual corpora, computerised corpora can provide us with well-designed and representative corpora, which are easy to process in few minutes. This can reveal unexpected features of language. More important, “the ability to examine large text corpora in a systematic manner allows access to a quality of evidence that has not been available before” (Sinclair, 1991: 4).
Data

Using the commentaries of specific authors in understanding the meaning of the Qur’a’n will exclude the other linguistic contributions made by their contemporary authors in all scholarly fields like theology, hadith, medicine, physics, literature, etc. Instead of relying on the exegetical works which were issued in different times, we will use more representative samples produced at the same time. So I collected a corpus of the early Classical Arabic extending over the first four centuries of Islam, i.e. until the early eleventh century (Gregorian Calendar). The works I included are mainly books. I also gathered some short poems written by one poet into a collection and I treated them as a text. The time span of these writings starts as early as the advent of Islam up to the end of the eleventh century. The 5-million word Classical Arabic corpus was first assembled by the author of this paper in 2001 to conduct a Ph.D. thesis at the University of Manchester entitled “Collocation and synonymy in classical Arabic: A corpus-based study” completed in 2004. The corpus has the following features:

1. It is an electronic corpus; this makes investigating Arabic a more accurate and faster process.
2. It is balanced; it covers a wide scope of written Arabic texts to be used for more than one purpose.
3. It is a monitor corpus; we will keep on maintaining it by adding more texts and genres.
4. More importantly, this corpus is synchronic, which deals with only one variety of Arabic along a particular period of time, i.e. early Classical Arabic. This can make the study based on it more consistent and more methodical.

Since the corpus is limited to the early period of Islam, there is a possibility to include every text that exists. By doing this, it would definitely be representative (Biber, 1993), but this may take a long time to do. Moreover, it is enough for the purpose of my corpus to

83
conduct a principled selection rather than a mere accumulation of texts.

This corpus provides the translators of the Qur’an with a balanced account of the Arabic language. In other words, instead of relying on one source (exegesis) or one author (exegete), they will have an access to how the language is understood and used in most genres, including the Qur’an and its exegesis themselves.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subgenre</th>
<th>Texts</th>
<th>Text Size</th>
<th>Perc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Holy Qur’an</td>
<td>The Holy Qur’an</td>
<td>88,622</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prophetic Tradition (Hadith)</td>
<td>1. Sahih Al-Bukhari</td>
<td>683,970</td>
<td>13.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Sahih Muslim</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biography</td>
<td>1. seerah of Ibn Hisham</td>
<td>393,933</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Al-Akhbar Al-Tiwal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy</td>
<td>1. Ara’ Ahl Al-Madinah Al-Fadilah by Farabi</td>
<td>478,141</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Logic by Ibn Sina</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Al-Falsafa Al-Ula by Al-Kindi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theology</td>
<td>1. Exegesis of the Qur’an (Tafseer): by Al-Tabari</td>
<td>1,037,387</td>
<td>20.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Jurisprudence (fiqh):</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Al-Risalah by Al-Shafi’i</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Dogmatics (al-’Aqeedah):</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Al-Ibanah by Al-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Ash’ari

### Literature:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages/Word Count</th>
<th>Suitable for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poetry</td>
<td>1. Al-Mu‘allakt</td>
<td>69,385</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Al-Mutanabbi collected poems</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiction</td>
<td>1. Arabian Nights</td>
<td>1.</td>
<td>11.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. The Misers</td>
<td>79,223</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Linguistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages/Word Count</th>
<th>Suitable for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proverbs</td>
<td>1. Majma‘ Al-Amthaal</td>
<td>362,054</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Jamharat Al-Mthaal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lexicons</td>
<td>1. Al-‘Ayn (Al-Khalil)</td>
<td>404,080</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Fiqh al-Lughah (Al-Tha’alibi)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Science

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages/Word Count</th>
<th>Suitable for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>Ahsan al-Taqaseem fi ma’rifat al-Aqaleem by Al-Maqdisi</td>
<td>82,499</td>
<td>1.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>Al-Jamaher Fi Ma’rifat al-Jawahir by Albiruni</td>
<td>57,553</td>
<td>1.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>Al-Qanun fi Al-Tib by ibn Sina</td>
<td>736,469</td>
<td>14.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>Mafatih Al-‘Ulum by Al-Khawarizmi</td>
<td>26,684</td>
<td>.53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table (1) Structure of the corpus

Synonymy

Synonymy was recognised early by Arab linguists, for instance in connection with rhetoric (balaaghah) though it did not get extensive study. The main contribution of Arab linguists was the collection of what is called lexicons nowadays. Some works on a large scale were based on the collection of all names, or rather descriptions, that a given word has such as Khalawayh’s The Names of the Lion, The Names of the Snake and The Wine’s Names. More interestingly, Al-Fayrouzabadi produced a dictionary-like book called al-rawdu al-masluf fi-maa lahu ismaan ila uluuf (The Best Garden of Words (or Expressions) That Have Two to a Thousand Names). Al-Iskafi’s mabaadi’ al-lughah (Principles of Language) is considered a classical work on Arabic Synonymy. It was arranged according to topics like stars, constellations, time, clothes, food, weapons, etc. However, the best known of these classical thesauri is Tha’alibi. This was an Arabic dictionary based on a concept classification. Haywood (1965: 113) described it as follows:

It is a vast storehouse of vocabulary which sometimes gives synonyms, and at other times distinguishes between the finer shades of meaning of words which are roughly synonymous.

Similar works were made by later writers; an example is al-alalfaaaz {al-kitaabiyyah (Idiomatic Expressions), nuj’at al-raa’id wa shir’at al- waarid fi-l-mutaraadif wa-l-mutaawarid (The Spring of the Seeker in Synonyms and Associations) in which Arabic words, including synonyms, were arranged under such headings as physical descriptions, senses, good and bad manners, human behaviour, etc. They are all primarily concerned with distinguishing apparent synonyms. Al-Askari’s Al-furuq (The Differences) is another work on synonymy, where the author tried to pursue the finer shades of differences that hold between the seemingly synonymous words.
Such attempts were unsystematic by modern standards and cannot be regarded equivalent to the modern thesauri since they were not arranged alphabetically and lack comprehensiveness. Generally speaking, synonymy was frequently discussed, from a theoretical point of view, by early Arab linguists. Some linguists like Sibawayhi, Al-Mubarrad and Al-Siyuti stressed that synonymy is widespread in Arabic. On the other hand, Ibn Faris denied the existence of synonyms because this would contradict the wisdom of Arabs, who always used words for a reason. He argued that every word should have a specific meaning. Furthermore, Tha‘lab argued that there is a difference of meaning between any given pairs of synonyms. For example, investigating the contexts of qa‘ada and jalasa ‘sit’ which are commonly taken as synonyms will show that they have different meaning from each other (Versteegh et al, 1983, p.174). Perhaps the idea of denying the existence of synonymy was introduced by Ibn Al-Arabi (d. 802) whose apprentice Tha‘lab reported him saying, ‘any two forms used synonymously by Arabs, everyone of them has a specific meaning which is missing in its counterpart’ (Al-Anbari, Al-Addad: 7). Tha‘lab investigated the differences between lemmas like qa‘ada and jalasa manually and we can surely offer a more accurate analysis if we investigate the phenomena computationally. However, we will not investigate this very pair, because it has already been discussed by Tha‘lab. So, we will pay more attention to another pair of words which are still considered absolute synonyms like ja‘a and ata.

The word pair jaa’a and ata ‘come’

To prove the credibility of our methodology let us take the synonymous pair: jaa’a and ata, which are widely regarded as absolute synonyms and then have a look at the their contextual distribution. But before that we would like to give the definitions of jaa’a and ata as provided in the most authentic Arabic dictionaries.
Al-Muhiit


Jaa'a: 'ata (to come, arrive), -- بـ 'with' s.th.: to bring; -- an action: happened (the event which the whole people have waited happened).


'ata: jaa'a (come); -- an action: to do; -- a woman: have sex with her; - - a place: to arrive; -- بـ 'with' s.th: to bring. -- عليه: to pass by, to annihilate, to eradicate; -- على 'on' al-'akhdar wa-l-yaabis (come over the green and the dry): to destroy everything.;

Muhiiit Al-Muhiit

أنى: جاء الغيث نزل وأنى الأمر فعله والمرأة جامعها والمكان حضره. وأنى على الشيء أنفده وبلغ آخره أو مرض به وعليه الذهر أهله.

Jaa'a: 'ata; -- the rain: it rained; -- s.th.: to do; to arrive;

'ata: jaa'a; -- an action: to do; -- a woman: have sex with her; -- a place: to arrive; -- على 'on' s.th.: to finish it; -- عليه 'on him' the age: annihilate.

Al-Wasiit


Jaa'a: 'ata, (to come), -- بـ 'with' s.th.: to bring;-- the rain: (it rained); - - an action: to happen, occur;


'ata: ja'a (to come), to become near, to approach; -- عليه: pass by, accomplish; -- عليه 'on him' the age: annihilate; -- a man or a place: ja'a (to come); -- an action: to do; -- a woman: have sex with her.
Lisan Al-ʿArab
Jaaʾa: ata (to come)
ata: jaaʾa; ata ʿalayhi al-dahr (came on it the age): it was destroyed; --
s.th. or a sin: do.

Table (2) Definitions of jaaʾa and ata in Arabic dictionaries

The dictionaries above distinguish three main meanings for jaaʾa: (1) ‘come’, (2) ‘arrive’, (3) ‘do’. The other meaning (4) ‘bring’ comes up because of the preposition bi ‘with’: however, it is more or less closely related to the meaning (1). As for ata, it has the meanings (1), (2), (3), (4) in addition to (5) ‘have sex’ which is euphemistically related to the meaning in (3). The remaining meanings are mentioned because of the following prepositions: bi ‘with’ and ʿalay ‘on’. Al-Wasiit gives one more sense for ata: ‘approach’ which is also related to the previous meanings. In table (2) the words are defined in terms of each other.

In order to analyse the difference between these two words, we took a number of preliminary decisions. First, we discarded all combinations with a frequency lower than three as indicated in table 3. Secondly, we will see how frequent every item of the pair is in the corpus as a whole before doing further analysis. Then we can compare that to the frequency of the words used with them. n will stand for the total size of our corpus, x for our search term and y for the collocate. Thirdly, because of the inapplicability of wild-card search with Arabic texts hits are calculated first to include all possible syntactic forms of the pair under investigation. The significant collocations for ata are shown in table 3 below whereas the collocations of jaaʾa are represented in table 4.
$$n=5000000, \ f(x) = 2219$$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(y)</th>
<th>f(x, y)</th>
<th>F(y)</th>
<th>MI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mischief</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>9.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with sin</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unbelief</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>8.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torment</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>590</td>
<td>6.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soothsayer</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>6.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Falsehood</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>6.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allah</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>6.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the prophet</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>6777</td>
<td>5.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6939</td>
<td>5.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Man</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8646</td>
<td>5.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jibreel</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>386</td>
<td>4.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syria</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>520</td>
<td>4.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>calamity</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>404</td>
<td>4.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the good</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2269</td>
<td>3.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the mosque</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>924</td>
<td>3.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>heaven</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>814</td>
<td>3.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>11214</td>
<td>3.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>messenger</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>11805</td>
<td>3.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>command</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3002</td>
<td>2.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f(x, y)</td>
<td>F(y)</td>
<td>MI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makkah</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>914</td>
<td>2.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the night</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1352</td>
<td>2.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>2.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>owner</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2023</td>
<td>2.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the truth</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1171</td>
<td>2.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>36416</td>
<td>2.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>women</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2035</td>
<td>2.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>his family</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>537</td>
<td>1.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>king</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5046</td>
<td>1.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Umar</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3180</td>
<td>1.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with it</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>28912</td>
<td>1.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>his wife</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>401</td>
<td>1.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>people</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4564</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>from</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>34830</td>
<td>0.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with him</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8738</td>
<td>0.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5243</td>
<td>0.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>his tribe-men</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7901</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sin</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>19246</td>
<td>-0.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Son</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16734</td>
<td>-0.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>24009</td>
<td>-0.82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table (3) The immediate left collocates of ata in a span of four word-forms with minimum frequency of 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(y)</th>
<th>f(x, y)</th>
<th>F(y)</th>
<th>MI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>father</td>
<td>أبا</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17618</td>
<td>-0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>He</td>
<td>هو</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15055</td>
<td>-1.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>That</td>
<td>ذلك</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>17455</td>
<td>-1.36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

n= 5000000, f(x) = 2566

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(y)</th>
<th>f(x, y)</th>
<th>F(y)</th>
<th>MI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>with fertility</td>
<td>بالخصب</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with good deed</td>
<td>بالحسنة</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empty</td>
<td>فارغًا</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empty</td>
<td>فارغًا</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>visiting</td>
<td>زائراً</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clear proofs</td>
<td>البينة</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>8.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with lies</td>
<td>بالكذب جر</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>7.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nomad</td>
<td>أعرابيا</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>6.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>second</td>
<td>ثانياً</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>6.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dragging</td>
<td>يبر</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>6.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>victory</td>
<td>نصر</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>422</td>
<td>5.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>time</td>
<td>وقت</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>1726</td>
<td>4.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(y)</td>
<td>f(x, y)</td>
<td>F(y)</td>
<td>MI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the truth</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1171</td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knowledge</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1334</td>
<td>4.45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ramdan</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>385</td>
<td>4.33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the night</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1352</td>
<td>4.22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Man</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>8646</td>
<td>4.19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>11214</td>
<td>4.06</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islam</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1493</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>2775</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jibreel</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>386</td>
<td>3.92</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>owner</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1011</td>
<td>3.75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>somebody</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1005</td>
<td>3.54</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Qur'an</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1117</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>24009</td>
<td>3.24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the day-time</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>706</td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wants</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>961</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>information</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1486</td>
<td>2.97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the boy</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>828</td>
<td>2.81</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the Prophet</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6130</td>
<td>2.51</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wealth</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1479</td>
<td>2.39</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>from</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>34830</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(y)</td>
<td>f(x, y)</td>
<td>F(y)</td>
<td>MI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>1.97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Umar</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3181</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>explanation</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3347</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the country-men</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2537</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>women</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2035</td>
<td>1.52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>other</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4132</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Messenger</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>11805</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abraham</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2154</td>
<td>1.44</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>36416</td>
<td>1.39</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>command</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3002</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5243</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hitting</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3007</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>after</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7383</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>before</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3825</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allah</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>19246</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>people</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5882</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>already</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>24534</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7901</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>father</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17618</td>
<td>-0.17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>about</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>21153</td>
<td>-0.27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table (4) The immediate left collocates of jaa’a in a span of four with minimum frequency of 3.

Analysing the concordances of ‘ata and jaa’a shows that there is a wide range of overlap between them; as we can see in the examples below, there are several instances where both appear with words denoting place, person, time or abstract object. But jaa’a tends to be more frequently used with time and, unlike ata, is always followed by the preposition ila ‘to’ before places as can be seen in the tables. For the sake of brevity, we have only given translation and transliteration for the information which are relevant to our discussion.

(1.a.)
فُسَار يمشي وينتزع آثار الطريق حتى جاء إلى باب المدينة
fasaara yamshii wa yatatabba’ aathaara al-tariiq hatta jaa’ ila baab al-madiinah.
He kept going, following the road signs until he arrived at the entrance of the city.

(1.b.)
فُسَار حتى أتي الشام قُتل أهلها
fasaara hatta ata al-Shaam faqaatala ahlahaa.
He went until he arrived at Syria, then he killed its people.
(2.a.)
ثم جاء النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم يمشي في الصفوف.
thumma jaa’a al-nabiyyu ...yamshii fii al-ssuufuuf.
Then came the Prophet ...walking between rows.

(2.b)
أتي النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم بئس فاطمة فلم يدخل.
ata alnabiyyu ... bayta faatimah falam yadkhul.
The prophet came to Fatimah’s house but he did not enter.

(3.a)
فلا جاء الليل نام
falammaa jaa’ a allaylu naama.
When the night came he slept.

(3.b.)
ولما آتى الليل طلبه أمه فلم يجده
wa lamma ata allaylu talabatuh ummuhu falam tajidhu.
When the night came, his mother looked for him but she could not find him.

(4.a)
وَقَلْ جَاهِ بَعْظُ وَزَخَّ عُلُطُ
wā qul jaa’a al-haqqu wa zahaqa al-baatiilu.
And say: ‘Truth has come and falsehood has vanished’.

(4.b.)
وهل يأتي الخير بالشر؟
wā hal ya’ti al-khayru bi-l-sharri?
Does the good bring evil?
Let us now study the statistics given in table (3 & 4) above to see how similar or dissimilar the collocations of the word pair under examination are. The first obvious point we can get is that in table (4) the most statistically significant collocation of jaa’a, i.e. collocates of highest MI scores, is bi-l—khissb ‘with fertility’ with an MI score at 10.92. As for ata, table 3 shows that al-faahishah ‘mischief’ is the strongest collocate with MI score at 9.60. Can we say then that the semantic feature which distinguishes between jaa’a and ata is positivity vs. negativity?

Actually, we cannot come up with an exclusive distinction between jaa’a and ata by making such a simple analysis, simply because we should be aware of the fact that words could have multiple senses and different syntactic forms could entail different senses. So we need to make a more precise analysis before coming to a conclusion.

It is important to mention that jaa’a and ‘ata followed by the proposition bi (with) are frequently used in CAC with the meaning ‘to bring’ but our pre-theoretical approach of what a word is does not count propositions or conjunctions that are attached to the root word. Ata, in particular, has several meanings in different contexts. For example, ata followed by the proposition ‘ala means ‘to finish off or destroy something’ ata ‘al al-ta’aam (he has finished all food), (‘ata ‘ala al-‘akhdar wa-l-yaabis he destroyed everything (literally: he destroyed the cultivated and non-cultivated land). It can also be used metaphorically to refer to having sex. For example, ata imra’tahu/ahlahu (to have sex with his wife). Using ata in this sense is called euphemism which is widely used in Qur’an. However we will be restricted to analysing only one sense of ata, namely ‘come’ to set it off against jaa’a which is mainly used in this sense. For example, we manually eliminated instances where ata means ‘commit’, which constitute about 3% of the whole occurrences of ata. To look at this sense, i.e. ‘come’, only we have to manually proofread our counts and exclude all the instances which have other meanings. This particular use of ata and jaa’a is interesting to analyse because their meanings
are so similar that native speakers of Arabic tend to use them interchangeably. This gives another dimension for the use of both verbs, in addition to the previous differences brought out between them.

A closer look at the words reveals that the two words are not synonymous all the time. We cannot always use the two words interchangeably. I examined all the concordances of ata and jaa’a throughout CAC which enabled me to come up with the following three major distinctions between them. I made a further analysis of the concordances of jaa’a and ata with a minimum frequency of three. The result of this further analysis will be tested later on by t-test statistic as shown in table 5 below. Now let us have a look at the following uses of both of them:

i. When ata is followed by a place it means that place is not a destination point.
(5.a.)

\[
\text{"hatta idhaa ataw }\text{ala waadi al-namli qaalat namlatun ya ayyuha al-namlu udkhulu masaakinakum…"
\]

When they came to a valley of ants, one of the ants said: ‘O you ants, get into your habitations’ (Qur’an, Al-Naml: 18).
(5.b.)

\[
\text{"fa-ntalaqaa hatta idha atayaa ahla qaryatin…"
\]

Then-proceeded-they-(dual) till when came-they-(dual) people-town, asked-food- they-(dual) people-it, but-refused-(they) to entertain-them
Then they [Moses and Al-Khidr] both proceeded, till, when they came to the people of a town, they asked them for food, but they refused to entertain them. (Qur’an, Al-Kahf: 77)

A full translation\(^1\) of the example in (5.a) can make the meaning clearer.

When they [Solomon’s army] came to a valley of ants, one of the ants said: “O you ants, get into your habitations, lest Solomon and his troops crush you without knowing it.” (An-Naml: 18)

The ants’ colony was not meant to be the destination point for Sulayman and his army, nor did they stay there for a long time. The whole army was only passing by the colony when Sulayman heard the ant warning the rest of the colony of an imminent destruction by Sulayman and his army.

In (5.b) it is a part of Moses’ story with Al-Khidr when he set out on a journey searching for that knowledgeable person. After Moses had found him, Al-Khidr started teaching him a series of lessons practically. Then they passed by a town, which was not their terminal point, where they got hungry, so they asked them for food but the people of that town refused to host them.

Conversely, the place that follows jaa’a is meant to be a destination point where one can stay for longer time or for ever, so it gives a sense of stability.

(5.c.)

\(^1\) The translation of Qur’anic verses are taken from Al-Hilali and Khan’s *The Noble Qur’an*, but it is slightly amended, to omit information which is irrelevant to the main discussion and the exegetical glosses included in the translation and marked by inverted commas or brackets. We only focused on the phrases which contain the words under investigation, so we deleted the transliterated glosses and all extra explanatory comments rendered by the translator for elucidation.
The Prophet did the evening prayer, then he came to his house where he prayed four prostrations and slept.

(5.d.)

...hatta idha jaa‘uha wa futihat abwaabuha
‘And those who were pious to their Lord will be led to Paradise in groups, till, when they reach it and its gates will be opened’ (Qur’an, al-Zumar:73).

In (5.c) the prophet returned to his house after giving his prayers to sleep. His house is therefore an end point as he did not mean to carry on going to any other place. In (5.d) the paradise is the final abode of the pious people so when they come to it they will live therein forever.

ii. jaa‘a when followed by an event means that event has been waited for or expected.

(6.a.)

idhaa jaa‘a nassru Allahi wa al-fathu.
‘When come the victory of Allah and the conquest (of Makkah)’ (Qur’an, al-Nassr: 1).

(6.b.)

fa-idhaa jaa’a wa‘du al-‘aakhirati...
‘Then, when the second promise comes, (they will make your faces sorrowful and enter the mosque (of Jerusalem))’ (Qur’an, al-Isra: 7).
In (6.a) the conquest of Makkah and the victory over the disbelievers of Makkah was something which the Prophet and all Muslims were longing for. They were expelled from their own hometown, Makkah, without a just cause and left behind everything. In addition, since the advent of Islam, they were prevented from performing their pilgrimage to the Holy House to fulfil the duty which Allah had imposed upon them. Likewise, the example in (6.b) is mentioned in the context of the conflict between Muslims and the Jews where Allah promises the Muslims to return to their mosque and defeat the Jews in the end. Actually, freeing Jerusalem and the Al-Aqsa mosque is the dream of all Muslims; they are all waiting for Allah’s promise to come.

On the other hand, ata associates with things that happen unexpectedly. For example,

(6.c.)

\\(\text{Qur'an, Al-An'am: 40).}

‘Say :’Tell me if Allah’s Torment comes upon you, or the Hour comes upon you, would you then call upon any one other than Allah?’

(6.d.)

\\(\text{Qur'an, Al-An'am 39).}

‘When the earth is clad with its adornments and is beautified, and its people think that they have all the powers of disposal over it, Our Command reaches it by night or by day and We make it like a clean-mown harvest, as if it had not flourished yesterday’
In (6.c & d) the events are not expected because Allah keeps such things hidden so that every person is rewarded for what he does, and the people are not aware of what is hidden for them.

iii. jaa’a means ‘arrive’ as shown in (5.c & d) above, whereas ata has a sense of approaching a place or a time.

(7.a.)

\[
aata amru Allahi fala tasta
\]

‘(Inevitable) cometh (to pass) the Command of Allah: seek ye not then to hasten it’ (Qur’an, Al-Nahl: 1).

Allah’s command is the Last Day (the Day of Judgement) and this apparently contradicts the situation but it rather means ‘approached’.

The evidence mentioned in (5.a) above can also be used here.

\[
\text{hatta idha ataw ‘ala waadi al-namlu qaalat namlatun ya ayyuha al-namlu udkhulu masaakinakum…}
\]

‘When they came to a valley of ants, one of the ants said: “O you ants, get into your habitations’ (Qur’an, Al-Naml: 18).

The English translation by Muhsin Khan and Muhammad Al-Hilali given below translated ata to ‘at length … came’ which is a close interpretation to the meaning of ‘come’ in this context. Indeed, Sulayman and his army have not reached the ants’ colony yet, they were still by its outskirts because one of the ants asked the rest of the ants to go inside their colony.
Al-Hilali and Khan's translation of the above verse:
At length, when they came to a valley of ants, one of the ants said: ‘O ye ants, get into your habitations, lest Solomon and his hosts crush you (under foot) without knowing it’ (Qur’an, An-Naml: 18).

More interestingly, the slight change in the contextual use between ata and jaa’a in the following three verses can bring out the subtle difference between them. Transliteration is provided for the underlined Arabic words. We also marked the similar parts throughout the following three examples with square brackets.

(8.a.)
qaala li-ahlihi imkuthu innii aanastu naaran la’allii aatiikum minha bi-qabasin… falamma atahaa nuudiya…

‘[(i) He said to his family: “Tarry you;] [(ii) I perceive a fire;} [(iii) perhaps I can bring you from there some information, or a burning firebrand, that you may warm yourselves.”] [(iv) But when he came to the (fire)], [(v) he was called] from the right bank of the valley, from a tree in hallowed ground: “O Moses! Verily I am Allah”’
(Qur’an, Al-Qasas: 29-30).

(8.b.)
faqaala liahlhi imkuthu innii aanastu naaran la’allii aatiikum minha bi-qabasin… falamma ‘atahaa nuudiya…
‘So [(i) he said to his family, “Tarry you;] [(ii) I perceive a fire;] [(iii) perhaps I can bring you some burning brand therefrom, or find some guidance at the fire.”] [(iv) But when he came to the fire, [(v) he was called:] “O Moses! Verily I am thy Lord! therefore put off thy shoes: thou art in the sacred valley”’

Tuwaa‘ (Qur’an, Taha: 10-11).

(8.c.)

qaala muusa liahlilih inaana naaran sa’atiikum minhaa bi-khabarin… falamma jaa’aha nuudiya…

’[(i) Moses said to his family:] [(ii) “I perceive a fire;] [(iii) soon will I bring you from there some information, or I will bring you a burning brand, that you may warm yourselves.”] [(iv) But when he came to it], [(v) a voice was heard:] “Blessed are those in the fire and those around: and Glory to Allah, the Lord of the Worlds”’

(Qur’an, Al-Naml: 7-8).

As shown above we have three verses from different surahs (chapters) relating the story of Moses when he saw the fire where Allah talked to him. The story is put in different wordings in these three surahs, because every verse tells one aspect of the story. We can notice that there are similar parts in each verse (as marked in i-v). The remaining parts make the meanings of the three verses different from one another. For example, in (8.a) and (8.b.) Moses asked his family to wait until he goes and sees the fire. The verb ata ‘bring’, marked iii in both verses, is used in subjunctive form to express a wish but it is uncertain. In (8.c) Moses does ask his family to wait and the verb ata ‘bring’ used is in near future which expresses certainty. The fireplace was so remote that he had to promise his family not to give up. He has the intention to do his best to get some information from the people.
around the fire or to get a burning brand from it to warm themselves. This is to reassure his family even if the fire is far or he takes long time. Therefore he used the verb without a modal of probability.

Most importantly, in (8.a.) and (8.b.) ata is used to indicate that Moses is still far from the actual fireplace, because the call following ata in (8.a.) comes from the bank of the valley, and (8.b.) mentions that he is in the sacred valley and has not arrived at the fireplace. But in (8.c.) the call implies that Moses arrived at the fireplace because Allah says ‘blessed are those in the fire and those around’; ‘those in the fire’ refers to Moses and ‘those around’ are angels as al-Razi said. In Arabic one can use the preposition fi ‘in’ to mean absolute closeness.

So, jaa’a ‘come’ marked [iv] in (8.c) is used to relate the final part of the story after Moses’ arrival at the fire-place, where he talked to Allah. It is interesting to know that the two verses (8.a & 8.b) employ the verb ata ‘come’ marked [iv] in both to refer to a degree of nearness to the fire-place, whereas their equivalent in (8.c) uses jaa’a to describe a state of absolute closeness.

One more piece of evidence that supports the above argument is that the word Allah occurred in object position with ata 7 times and did not occur at all with jaa’a. Let us consider the following example,

\[
\text{yawma la yanfa'u maalun wa la banuun illa man ata allaaha biqalbin saliim.}
\]

The Day whereon neither wealth nor sons will avail except him who came to Allah with clean heart

ata is used in the above example, because Allah is not limited to a place nor can vision grasp Him, so no one can come to a point of closeness to Allah’s entity like a physical object.
Let us now use the t-test to show what sort of differences holds between jaa’a and ata as shown in table 5 below. To do the test it would be better to stick to one sense of the words under investigation.¹ We will analyse the most significant left collocates, i.e. items with the highest MI scores. As mentioned earlier, we will be restricted to analysing only one sense of the pair, namely ‘come’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>W</th>
<th>f(w)</th>
<th>f(Jaa’a/w)</th>
<th>f(‘ata/w)</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>1726</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.91</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clear proofs</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4.89</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>1334</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nomad</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victory</td>
<td>422</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.71</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the truth</td>
<td>1171</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.66</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empty</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.23</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visiting</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dragging</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the Prophet</td>
<td>6777</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>11.04</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.0001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Customarily, the test can be done generally without restricting it to one sense of the words under investigation. To me, it would be easier if we chose to do the calculation inside a closed set for short cut and quick results, i.e. I will search the items whose MI scores are significant, which co-occurred with ja’a and ata in a particular sense.
Table (5) the most significant ten left collocates\(^1\) with jaa’a (the top ten words) and ata (the last ten words).

The t-scores in table 5 show the differences between jaa’a and ‘ata; the former has a strong tendency to occur in positive contexts, whereas the latter has a negative sense. The bigger the t-score, the more different the pair under examination. jaa’a gets the highest scores with the following positive items: al‘ilm ‘knowledge’, al-haq ‘the truth’, and al-bayyinat ‘clear proofs’. On the other hand, ata frequently co-occurs in negative contexts: c’adhab ‘torment’, al-kufr ‘disbelief’, ba’s ‘calamity’, kaahin ‘soothsayer’\(^2\), ‘amr ‘command’ (meaning difficulty or torment), and baatil ‘falsehood’. The highest scores of jaa’a and ata in the table show that the items having this

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>W</th>
<th>f(w)</th>
<th>f(Jaa’a/w)</th>
<th>f(‘ata/w)</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Torment</td>
<td>401</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>5.11</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allah</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.64</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disbelief</td>
<td>406</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syria</td>
<td>520</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calamity</td>
<td>404</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soothsayer</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Command</td>
<td>537</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Falsehood</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td>P &lt; 0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gabriel</td>
<td>386</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Not sig.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\) These collocates are identified by MI statistic.

\(^2\) Soothsaying is forbidden in Islamic religion and is classified as a major sin.
score is more likely different from each other. Therefore, ata and jaa’a as shown in table 5 above are not synonymous because they are used in a different range of contexts.

Two points might seem contradicting to the above conclusion. In the first place, the positive use of ata in tables 3 as in ya’ti ‘comes’ followed by khayr ‘good’ or haqq ‘truth’ is not considered strong evidence because they are only used with ata in its present tense form. We think there might be a morphological reason why ata in its present simple form is used for both negative and positive sense. jaa’a in present tense form, i.e. yajii’, is not as easy to pronounce as ata. jaa’a in its present form occurs 181 times whereas its corresponding ata occurs 980, so jaa’a in present form is about five times less common in CAC than ata in present form. Secondly, the high t-scores in table 5 with al-nabiyy ‘the prophet’ (11.04) and waqt ‘time’ (4.91) are not significant because they are both neutral, so they fall in the area of overlap between ata and jaa’a as indicated in (7.6) below.

Analysing the concordances of jaa’a and ‘ata with minimum frequency of 1 can show their tendency to occur in negative or positive contexts. Further examples from CAC show that ‘ata is overwhelmingly used in unpleasant contexts. The main collocates concern committing sins, trouble, and falsehood. Figure 6 below shows the contextual preference of both of them.

\footnote{We ignore all hits which have neutral senses.}
Figure (1) the collocational differences of jaa’a and ata with minimum frequency 1.

The native speakers of Arabic are themselves unaware of these collocational differences between jaa’a and ata. The only difference brought out by Al-Askary, who belongs to the Classical period, in Al-Furuuq is that ata requires a complement. For example,

9.a jaa’a alrajulu nafsuhu.
came the-man self-him
The man arrived himself.

9.b *ata alrajulu nafsuhu.
came the-man self-him
The man came himself.

Otherwise they can replace each other without any loss of meaning. This is not consistent with Al-Askary’s proposition that difference in
form must produce difference in meaning but that difference was abandoned as time passed (Al-Askary, Al-Furuq: p. 9).

To me, the use of jaa’a in (9.a) above is consistent with our approach that jaa’a is always followed by the preposition ila ‘to’ before places. Therefore, the missing preposition in (9.a) eliminates the possibility of a following category that refers to a place. So, the use of jaa’a in (9.a) involves some sort of directional motion which implies an action not toward a place but rather toward the speaker. On the other hand, the multiplicity of the senses\(^1\) with ata makes leaving the complement position empty as in (9.b) above, ambiguous.

To sum up, the analysis of the seemingly synonymous pair jaa’a and ata was carried out in three stages in order to highlight the subtle differences that occur between them. The first stage consisted of lexical search for all occurrences in CAC of the tokens jaa’a and ata. The second stage involved the categorisation of the tokens syntactically and according to their frequency; this included manual elimination of all irrelevant hits. In the third stage, we used MI to highlight the collocations of both. Then we managed to highlight some distinctions between the two items by analysing their contexts. We finally used T-Test to capture the subtle differences between the pair by extracting a semantic feature, which can differentiate between them, i.e. negativity vs. positivity.

**Polysemy**

Polysemy can be defined as all the possible senses that a word has. Polysemous words are given separate entries in dictionaries for example, bank 1) one side of a river, and 2) financial institution. In

\(^1\)The senses with *ja’a* are all related to a directional motion, whereas the senses with *ata* are diverse and some of them are metaphorical or euphemistic.
Arabic this phenomenon is quite common. Consider the following examples:

a- برق 1) lightening; 2) telegraph

b- هاتف 1) he who shouts; 2) telephone

The second sense for each of the above words came to the scene because of modern technology. The terms have been coined to describe the borrowed concepts which have no equivalents in Arabic. In such a case we can either transliterate or arabize the ST term. When we arabise a given word we derive a word which already exists in Arabic. These derived words may be related to the new borrowed words or not. If we pinpoint a relationship that holds between the word and the second sense it is called polysemy if the two terms are not related it is called homonymy. There are certain relationships that my hold between ploysemous words, such as figurative usage, specialized sense (belonging to a certain genre), technical sense, and transferred sense (Zgusta 1971: 64). It so often happens that a polyseme is coined figuratively like in (a) and (b) above but the relationship is conceived afterwards as belonging to specialized or technical sense.

The translator will have to examine each of his selected equivalent words to check which, if any, sense is significant in its lexical meaning. We have to be aware of the language use with different genres (e.g. literature, medicine, religious, etc.) so that we can select the most appropriate ployseme. For example, the word المدة has different senses in geography, literature, law, etc.

**The word zhanna ‘think’**

The word zhanna, which means ‘think’, will be examined below to see how significant to use a corpus in translation. The dictionary meaning is given in Table 7 before doing our corpus-based analysis.
Al-Muhiit

zhanna

zhanna: --sth (to think: to know about s.th. but you are not certain i.e. probably. -- ‘in’ s.b. al-zhunuun: to think ill of him. -- s.th.: to believe in it. -- ‘in’ s.b. to be suspicious of him.

Muhiiit Al-Muhiiit

zhanna

zhanna: -- s.b. to be suspicious of him. -- s.th.: to believe in it. It can also be used to indicate certainty. It can be used if you say that something is likely to be the case, although you are not certain. al-zhinnah: suspicion. Al-zhanuun: the one who thinks ill, suspicious, dishonest.

Al-Wsiit

zhanna
zhanna: --sth (to think: to know about s.th. but you are not certain i.e. probably. It can also be used to mean ‘to believe in it’. -- s.b.: to be suspicious of him. azhunnuhu: I am suspicious of him. al-zhinnah: suspicion. mazhannah: the place where one expects to find s.th.

Lisaan Al-¢Arab

zhanna

الظن هو البقين والشك ولكنه ان كان بقينا لا يرتي الى درجة العلم ظن فلاانا يه: اتّهم ظن ه الطّلون: كل ما لا يوثق به.

zhanna: zhann is a doubt and certainty, but it is not a tangible certainty; it is rather a certainty based on meditation. As for tangible certainty, we use ‘alima ‘know’; -- s.b. to be suspicious of him. al-zhinnah: suspicion. Al-zhanuun: the one who thinks ill.

Table 7 definitions of zhanna in four Arabic dictionaries

The dictionaries give the denotation of the word under investigation which simply means (1) uncertainty or probability, (2) suspicion and (3) certainty. The meanings (1) and (3) seem contradictory because it would be confusing to have a word meaning something and its opposite. Let us consider the following examples in (10a-12b) below.
In Arabic grammar books, zhanna is classified as one of ‘af'aal al-quluub' (heart verbs) and it functions as naasikh\(^1\). It is used to mean certainty and probability but probability is more likely to be the dominant case (Mubarak, 1982: 180).

As corpus data revealed some important and subtle differences between the previous pairs of synonyms that are hard to recognise solely by intuition, we need to carry out the same methodology to examine whether the word under investigation is really polysemous or not. This can help us extract the contrasts or subtle differences that pertain to their collocational distribution.

The statistics\(^2\) shown by the corpus demonstrate that for zhanna the most frequent word form is zhann in nominal form. There are 1254 instances of that particular form, which is 53.58% (1254/2340) of the total. The second most frequent is the verb zhanna, with 1086 hits, which is 46.41% (1086/2340). That is a lot and suggests that zhann as a noun and zhanna as a verb are both central items to learn.

We will examine the first left and right collocates of zhann as nominal modifiers below, particularly those collocates that function as adjectives or genitives. In order to analyse the significant collocations of this word, we, in the first place, searched all collocations with minimum frequency 3. Secondly, we discarded all insignificant

\(^1\) *naasikh* are verbs that assign case endings for the first two nouns that follow. Some verbs like *kaana* assign a nominative case for the first noun, the subject, and an accusative case for the second, the complement. *zhanna* assigns an accusative case for two objects that follow, apart from the subject which is always in nominative case.

\(^2\) We have carried out the statistics after singling out all possible forms of the search-term. This can be done easily automatically if we have a tagged corpus. Having a tagged corpus will require a lot of time before conducting such lengthy research, so we searched the corpus for what we know as verbs and nouns separately.
collocations, i.e. combinations with MI scores lower than 1. Thirdly, we manually eliminated collocations other than adjectives and genitives. Table 8 below shows all adjective and genitive collocates of zhann with minimum frequency 3.

### zhann (left collocates)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(x)</th>
<th>F(x,y)</th>
<th>MI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>true</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>false</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>invalid</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the era of ignorance</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>suspicious</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ZHann (right collocates)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(x)</th>
<th>F(x,y)</th>
<th>MI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>bad</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>7.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>good</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>6.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>more likely</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>10.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>much</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>certain</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>suspicious</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8 the first left collocates with nominal zhanna (the top five words) and the right collocates (the last six words): adjectives and genitives with minimum frequency 3.
Examining the most significant collocates of zhann (in nominal form) as represented in table 8, we find out that zhann occurred more frequently with words of negative sense. For the negative collocates the table shows the following examples which occurred altogether 72 times in CAC: invalid ‘faasid’, false ‘kaadhib’, the era of ignorance ‘aljaahiliyyah’, suspicious ‘sayyi’, bad ‘suu’. For the positive collocates which occurred 41 times, the table shows the following: good ‘hasan’, true ‘ssaadiqa’. A minority of examples are neutral, which constitute only 28 examples: more likely ‘aghlab’, much ‘kathiir’), certain ‘mu’akkad’.

However, we cannot draw any conclusive description of zhanna before studying the other form (verb). Let us now examine the left collocates of zhanna (verb) with the same procedure taken above in table 8 as shown in table 9 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(x)</th>
<th>F(x,y)</th>
<th>MI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Suspicitions</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>10.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>untrue</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>false</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bad</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>death</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 In Classical Arabic, the canonical structure of a sentence is VSO. The alternative basic order which is SVO is also possible provided that we have a good reason like emphasis. Also, we may have a fronted object as in iyyaaka na’budu ‘You-(alone) we-worship’ (surah Al-Fatihah: 5). According to the Arabic grammar you can say, na’buduka ‘worship-You’ but a pronoun referring to Allah preceded the verb to exclude any other one from the act of worshipping. So we examined the left collocates of zhanna (V) because (1) analysing the right collocates could mislead us by counting items relating to other verbs and (2) most of the items which modify the Arabic verb fall on the left-hand side.

2 The construction ghayr al-haq ‘not truth’ is examined as a whole.
Table 9 the immediate left collocates with zhanna (verb).

Sometimes zhanna is used in the Qura’n to mean ‘certainty’ and other times ‘doubt’. So it refers to two contradicting senses: the thing and its opposite. All commentators of Qur’an give two contradictory meanings to zhann. They treat zhann as a polyseme that has two different meanings, but different here means oppositeness. One commentator, Al-Tabari, gives more examples from Arabic to strengthen his point of view; he mentions al-sudfa to mean darkness and light, al-ssariikh to mean the rescued and the rescuer. He is not actually the only one who is in favour of this approach. Ibn Al-Anbari compiled a book called Al-Addaad ‘The Opposites’ where he collected all homophones of opposite meanings, the top word of which was zhann.

On the other hand, some linguists denied the existence of this phenomenon in Arabic\(^1\) like Ibn Durustwayh who compiled a book called Ibtaal Al-Addaad (Refuting the book of Opposites) in which he

\(^1\) Some other linguists give two explanations for the existence of such phenomenon:
1. Broadening of meaning, such as al-ssareem, which literally means (the separated) to mean the night because it is separated from the day and the same applies to the day that is separated from the night. Al-sudfa which means both light and darkness can be explained in the same way, al-sudfa is originally put to mean to hide so when darkness comes it hides the light of the day and when light comes it hides the darkness of the night.
2. Dialectical variations: for instance, al-jawn means black in Tamim’s dialect and white in Qays’.

One more reason can be added to the above explanations which is not mentioned in Al-Muzhir: narrowing. For example, al-ma’tam which originally means a gathering of men and women for a sad or a merry occasion is limited later on to the sad occasion. Therefore oppositeness can no longer hold between homophonous words.
denied that approach because it contradicts the wisdom of Arabs (Al-Suyuti, Al-Muzhir: 400).

Now let us come back to the subject matter of this paper by looking at zhann which is often regarded as a polyseme that has two opposite meanings, ‘doubt’ and ‘certainty’. Some commentators, like Mujahid who says whenever zhann is mentioned in Qur’an it means certainty yet he interprets zhann in some verses as meaning doubt. The selection of meaning depends entirely as they presume on context. For example, zhann in the following two verses mean certainty in (16.a) and doubt in (16.b).

(16.a)

wa ista‘īnuu bi-l-ssabri wa al-ssalaati wa innaahaa lakbiiruun illa ‘ala al-khaash‘īin. alladhiin yazhunnuuna annahum mulaaqu rabbihim wa annahum ilayhi raji‘uun.

And seek help in patience and prayer; and truly it is hard except for the humble-minded. They are those who are certain that they are going to meet their Lord and that unto Him they are going to return.¹ (The Noble Qur’an, trans by Al-Hilali &. Khan, 2: 46)

¹ The translation is slightly modified (cf. fn. 26).
Allah described the true believers as those who have zhann that they will meet Allah and they will return to Him. This is a matter of belief. If they are doubtful they would not be called believers.

(16.b.)

And from-them unlettered not know-they the-book except wishes and but they think-they.

And there are among them unlettered people, who know not the Book, but they trust upon false desires and they but guess. (The Noble Qur’an, 2: 78)

zhanna is translated above as guess. The verse in (2) talks about some Jews who are illiterate and do not know the reality of their book; however, they follow their scholars blindly and believe them. This is a different category from those who know the truth and falsify it mentioned in the verse preceding it (2: 77). So if we interpret zhanna as doubt or guess as commentators say, we presume that that second category of Jews who do not know the reality of their book do not believe in it. But this is not the case since this category is blindly following their scholars and this is a type of belief. We would rather say there are some Jews who only know the false version of the Bible and they are certain about what they believe even if it is false.

The inconsistency of the interpreters of Qur’an and the translators later on created a big confusion when assessing the following verse.

(17)
And Dhun-Nuun when he went off in anger, and imagined that we shall not punish him! But he cried through the darkness: none has the right to be worshipped but You, Glorified are You. (The Noble Qur’an, 21: 87)

The first dictionary meaning of naqdira is ‘be able’. Ibn Katheer and Al-Qurtubi interpreted naqdira as ‘to narrow’ or ‘constrict’ as in (18):

\[
\text{وَمَنْ قَدِيْرٍ عَلَيْهِ رِزْقُهُ فَلْيُنْفِقْ مِمَّا أَتَىَ اللَّهُ}
\]

wa man qudira ‘alayhi rizquhu fa-l-yunfiq mimma ‘aataahu Allaah.

And who was-restricted on-him livelihood-his so-spend-(he) of-what gives-him Allah.

And the man whose resources are restricted, let him spend according to what Allah has given him (Qur’an, 65:7).

The meaning of the verse as presented by Ibn Katheer is ‘So Jonah (Dhul-Nuun) thought that Allah might not constrict him in the belly of the fish’.

Commentators on Qur’an eliminated the possibility that the Prophet Jonah had doubt that Allah was not able to get him by explaining the meaning of qadara as to constrict. But the question is still raised, how Prophet Jonah, who is infallible according to the Islamic creed, thinks that Allah might not constrict him in the belly of the fish, while he went off in anger fleeing from his people without permission from Allah. If we interpret zhanna here as certain, the whole argument will be solved. So the meaning is Jonah was certain that if he prayed to Allah he will be saved. The use of the fa with the following verb naada clarifies this point as fa introduces a result. So we can say,
Jonah was certain he won’t be constricted in the belly of the fish if he prayed to Allah.
Let us try to study the whole environment of zhanna particularly the first and second left collocates to see what preferential distribution they appear in.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(y)</th>
<th>F(x,y)</th>
<th>F(y)</th>
<th>MI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>suspicions</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>10.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>most</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>10.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>meeting Allah</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>certainly</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>very</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>9.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in</td>
<td>579</td>
<td>15537</td>
<td>6.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>much</td>
<td>252</td>
<td>34845</td>
<td>3.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1547</td>
<td>3.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>24009</td>
<td>2.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10 the 1st & 2nd left collocates with zhanna with minimum frequency 3.

We can see that zhanna collocates with the full range of intensifiers such as ‘certainly, much, most, very’. Therefore, we can say that zhanna is something that can increase or become more certain. It can increase to reach a level of conviction as mentioned above in example (16.a) Qur’an: 2:46).

We then see that ‘zhannu (annahum) mulaaquu Allaah’ (they believe they will meet Allah) has a high MI score at 10.71. We can say then that zhanna collocates with a word denoting belief in resurrection and

1 We searched this item plus the following one because they constitute one concept which is resurrection.
this involves certainty. In fact, the dominating sense for zhanna so far, on the basis of the evidence given throughout, is to denote belief. However, there are some occurrences of zhanna which are assumed to denote probability or doubt as mentioned earlier. For practical reason, we can fit all these senses in an epistemic scale.

Doubt ▶ possibility ▶ probability ▶ necessity ▶ prediction ▶ factuality

‘Factuality’ in the above scale represents the highest degree of certainty, whereas ‘possibility’ and ‘doubt’ is the lowest. So, we can easily include all senses of zhanna: probability, belief and certainty, to get the unanimity of all lexicographers by just sticking to one sense which resides halfway between ‘doubt’ and ‘certainty’ or between ‘doubt’ and ‘certainty not’, i.e. a state of strong or weak possibility, as represented in the following scale.

certainty not ← zhanna ← doubt ← zhanna – factuality → (certainty)

In fact, the use of zhanna to mean ‘believe’ reflects a faith-related commitment.

For instance, Allah gives an account, using zhanna (Qur’an 2:154-171), of the behaviour of some Muslims in the battlefield and the remedy of it. He, therefore, gave a lengthy treatment of such a problem, which is cowardice or fear of death, after it had found its way to their hearts. Therefore, zhanna is used for deeply held belief or conviction. For example, zhanna is used throughout the Qur’an to mean a state of belief or disbelief that leads either to heaven or Hell-fire. Let us consider the following examples of zhanna:

(20.a.)

وَأَسْلَمُوا بِالصَّمَعَ وَالصَّلُوعَ وَإِنَّهَا لَكَبِيرَةٌ إِلَّا عَلَى الْمُتَّقِينَ أَلَّا تَعْلَمُنَّ أَنَّهُمْ مُتَّقُونَ رَبُّهُمْ وَأَنَّهُمْ إِلَيْهِ

البقرة: 46–47
And seek help in patience and prayer; and truly it is hard except for the humble-minded. They are those who are certain that they are going to meet their Lord and that unto Him they are going to return. (The Noble Qur'an, trans by Al-Hilali & Khan, 2: 46)

(20.b.)

And as-for who given-(him) book-his in-right-hand-(his) so-says … Surely, I did believe that I shall meet my Account. (Qur'an, 69: 19-22)

(20.c.)

But whosoever is given his Record behind his back, He will invoke (his) destruction. … Verily, he thought that he would never come back (to Us)! (Qur'an, 84:10-14)
We can eventually say that zhanna is a verb whose meanings imply a personal element which is described by Badawi (2000) as an introducer for the relationship that holds between subject-predicate on the basis of one’s own point of view. Zhanna as discussed above is based on personal perspectives residing in one’s own mind with which he can believe in the validity or the invalidity of a given concept. These perspectives can be true with someone and false with another according to how accurate or inaccurate his perception of something is. So the semantic feature which can be deduced out of these senses is that zhanna is a personal reaction based on one’s own ideas which he obtained after long contemplation on it.

One final remark is that the negative semantic feature of zhanna in some instances gives the impression of a considered reaction which is mainly a negative report of the events, i.e. it expresses one’s personal evaluation of the situation or state of affairs referred to.

**Conclusion**

Much of the arguments among Muslim scholars and schools of thoughts arise from their own understanding of the language of the Qur’an. One of the main reasons of such differences is their linguistic differences concerning some texts of the Holy Qur’an on the syntactic or semantic level, leading sometimes to the difference in understanding and formulating laws derived from such texts. This gives birth to many translations of the Qur’an, each adopts the approach of the translator’s sectarian, political or personal inclination. This can be resolved by using corpus linguistics techniques. Corpus-based analysis can be used as a successful methodology for testing what has been introduced by early Muslims on all scholarly and linguistic levels. More than that, it can give new insights and introduce rules and models which have not been previously discussed. Corpus-based analysis of items which are often regarded as roughly synonymous or polysemous in Arabic can highlight subtle differences in meaning among such items. This can be done by abstracting semantic features through comparing differences observed in their
contextual idiosyncrasies and examining practical examples of the usage of such items. Corpus-based analysis can distinguish between the different senses of a given word synchronically or diachronically. With this methodology, a particular sense of a word is clarified giving the translator of the Qur’an a firmly representative platform to rely on when looking for what a word means.

**Bibliography**


Tha’alibi, Abd al-Malik ibn Muhammad, (b. 961 or 2-1037 or 8.) fiqh al-lughah wa-sirr al-‘arabiyyah (The Philology of the Arabic Language and Its Secrets) (vol). 1, Maktabat Al-Khanjiy, Cairo.


126
The Scientific Inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān and its Role in the Rendition of its meanings into English

By: Dr. Dalal Mahmoud ElGemei, Associate Professor of Linguistics, AlAzhar University in Cairo (currently on secondment to King Faisal University – College of Education – Dept. of Foreign Languages)

Abstract:
The present paper looks into the role played by the scientific inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān in the translation of its meanings into English. Studies on the linguistic difficulties of translating the meanings of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān abound. Moreover, science in our age has proliferated making great leaps and new discoveries that have been alluded to or are embedded within Qur'ānic verses. This has unleashed numerous extensive studies on a new aspect of the inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān known as its scientific inimitability. However, the role such inimitability can play in the translation of the meanings of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān has hardly been touched upon. It is suggested that by including the wider context of the scientific nature of the Qur'ān within its translation process provides a new approach to such a process. The new approach draws on previous translation theories and strategies while setting them within the wider context of scientific information.
To illustrate this approach, the following methodology is used. A data of several Qur'ānic verses with five translations into English is examined. The verses selected are those that encode various scientific facts. A comparison between the five renditions - set within the context of scientific information - is drawn to determine: the most accurate rendition of the Qur'ānic verse in question into English, how such rendition can be made accessible to the target audience, and
identify the strategy/method that is most appropriate in rendering such content. The paper finally re-defines the notion of the un/translatability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān and sets down a new purpose of religious translation.

1.0. Introduction:

The present paper is an investigation into the potentials of scientific inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān for the translation of its meanings into English. As such studies done on both the translation of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān into English as well as those studies done on its scientific inimitability will be reviewed in the introduction below. The review of studies will not follow a chronological order but rather they will follow logically from the un/translatability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān, to the limits of its translatability, to the translation strategies employed in rendering its meanings to finally its scientific inimitability and its role in the translation of its meanings.

1.1 The Un/Translatability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān:

Central to the studies on the translation of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān is the issue of its translatability. The approach to the issue has evolved from the view of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān as being untranslatable, to the view of it as translatable, to the view of its translatability as being a continuum with several degrees of translatability lying between its two ends. Early attitudes to the translation of the meanings of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān rejected the idea of translating the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān. Early Muslim scholars' objections to its translation of its meanings were based on their veneration for its great linguistic inimitability. Some linguistic features prove to be difficult – if not

---

1 Opponents of Qur'an translation were led by Sheikh Hassanein Makhluf, while the proponents were led by Sheikh Maraghi. A quick survey of both attitudes is found in an illustrative article by Sheikh Mohamed Abou Sheishaa (2004).
impossible to reproduce in the translation – as explained below. At the same time such linguistic features are loaded with significant communicative meanings whose renditions into English are crucial to an accurate understanding of the meanings of Ever-Glorious Qur'ān. Therefore, "their loss in the translations involved skewing information at the textual/textual, semantic, pragmatic or rhetorical meaning" (Abdul-Raof 2001:68). The scholars' refusal to translate the Qur'ān was, therefore, due to their fear that the translation may involve a distortion of its meanings. Later on, this attitude changed.

The change in this attitude occurred in the eighteenth century in response to the attempts made by early Christian missionaries to translate the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān into English. Translations of the Qur'ān made by early Christian missionaries aimed at attacking Islam. To counter such an offensive, Muslim scholars had to come up with more accurate renditions of their own. Two extensive articles by Kidawi (1987) and Mohammed (2005) survey, compare and comment on the various translations of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān. The various translations are divided into two groups on the basis of whether they are done by Muslims or by non-Muslims. Within each group, a brief note indicating the name of the translator, the date in which the translation appeared together with a comment on or an assessment of the quality of the translation are provided. The assessment of quality of the translation is based on the purpose behind the translation and on the translator's hidden ideology in undertaking the translation. The article shows that translations undertaken by Muslims such as that by Pickthall (1930), Yūsuf Alī (1934), and Al-Hilālī and Khān (1977) - to mention but a few - proved to be accurate and of a good quality. On the other hand, those done by non-Muslims such as Sale (1734), Rodwell (1861 ), and Palmer (1880) which aimed at "debunk[ing] Islam and aid in the conversion of Muslims to Christians"(Mohammed 2005: 5) were full of "omissions, distortions, and misinterpretations"(Kidawi 1987: 68). Similarly, those undertaken by Muslims of different sects such as 'Alī (1928) of the Qadyani group and M.H.Shakir (2004) involved "deviation from the view point of
the Muslims' orthodoxy" as well as "instances of mistranslations" (Kidawi 1987:69).

While Kidawi (1987) and Mohammed (2005) aim at detecting and describing the quality of Qur'ān translations on the basis of a translator's ideology, other studies - Hatim (1997) and ElGemei (2000) - aim at decoding such ideologies. Both studies employed different linguistic tools to prove that some Qur'ān translations were embedded with the ideology of the translator undertaking the translation, and proceeded to describe linguistically how such ideology involved a distortion of the meanings of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān. Hatim (1997) borrowed linguistic tools of pragmatics to decode power in some Qur'ānic verses, whereas ElGemei (2000) employed Critical Discourse Analysis tools (CDA) to detect cases where ideology of the translator led to deviations from the original meanings of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān. The significance of such studies is that they provide an essential tool for distinguishing accurate from inaccurate translations of the Qur'ān.

1.2. The limits of Qur'ān translatability

With the surge in the amount of Qur'ān translations, the question of whether the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān is translatable or untranslatable was no longer viable. The availability of a large number of translations, as well as the fact that the text of the Qur'ān itself involved sections that are translated into Arabic (Ahmed 2004:205)\textsuperscript{1} is a strong proof to its translatability. However, the issue of translatability took a new turn. While asserting that the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān is translatable, limits to its translatability had to be acknowledged. In undertaking the arduous task of translating the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān, it was demonstrated that certain aspects - either of its form or meanings - proved either difficult

\begin{footnotesize}
\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{1} For further counterarguments to Qur'an translation is found in Ahmed (2004:205-207).}
\end{footnotesize}
to translate or were insurmountable in translation, thus restricting the process of translation. Irving, himself admits that several grammatical and syntactic features of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān such as cohesive ties, verbal and nominal clauses, and morphological marking of dual numbers and pairs among other, do not lend themselves easily to translation (1985: 6-10). Hatim (1997: 4) had pointed to the criteria that determine the compositional plan (structure) and the way text is made internally cohesive (texture) as presenting several hurdles in the translation. An interesting study by Abdul Raof (2001) showed that some of those insurmountable aspects lied in its inimitable linguistic features. The study provides deep insight into the nature of those inimitable linguistic features and suggests methods to overcome them. Inimitable linguistic features – that are semantically and stylistically significant - included features at the micro-level such as morphological features, e.g. the use of epithet or past participle, verb tense markings, and gender markings. Examples of syntactic features include word order; while inimitable features at the lexical level included culture-bound lexical items causing lexical voids; other semantic-syntactically interrelated features include the use of prepositions and particles (Abdul-Raof 2001:41-54). The use of oath, metaphor, and prosodic features are some examples of semantic-stylistic problems; whereas rhetorical features include the flow of sound, cadence, emotive and non-emotive expressions (Abdul Raof 2001:54-61). In addition to enumerating difficulties related to linguistic features, Abdul Raof (2001) goes on to suggest strategies of compensating for the loss of those features in the translation. Translation strategies include explicating those features through "either 'within-the-text' exegetical material "or "through marginal notes and commentaries" (Abdul Raof 2001:39). "Lexical voids" or gaps created by "culture-specific words" can be bridged by means of a "paraphrase" or "periphrastic description of its semantic features" (Abdul Raof 2001:61).

In addition to the limits of the translatability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān rising from its form and rhetorical features, another serious
limits to understanding it in English especially by non-Muslim westerners lies in their "expectations" which is "likely shaped by knowledge – however limited – of the Bible" and which at the same time are different from those of the SL audience (Steward 2000:3). While the statement of Steward (2000) appears on the surface to be true, it is in contradiction with the notable characteristic of the Ever-Glorious Qur'an as being suitable for all people in all times and places. The validity of such statement can be demonstrated by the fact that some of the aspects, namely its scientific aspect, which was the very same weapon whereby anti-Islamists attacked the Ever-Glorious Qur'an, will prove to be the very same vehicle whereby it is rendered intelligible and accessible in English to non-Muslim westerners. The explanation of such a role is explained below.

1.3. The Scientific Inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'an

Though it is one of its significant aspects, the scientific inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'an was not discussed except recently by Muslim and non-Muslim rhetoricians and scholars (e.g. alZarkashī (1957), alBāqalānī (1963), alJirjānī (1984), Qotb (1963), Abdul Raḥmān (1971), and elSha'rāwī (1988) to name but a few. It is noteworthy that these early studies had focused mainly on the linguistic and rhetoric inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'an – for a very good reason – for it is the means whereby God, the Almighty, challenged ancient Arabs – famous for their eloquence. With the leaps made by science in our new era a new aspect of the inimitable nature of the Ever-Glorious Qur'an started to emerge. Some enthusiast Arab scientists (e.g. Dr.Zaghloul el-Naggār) started to connect recent scientific discoveries with Qur'ānic verses. It was noted earlier that a lot of scientific discoveries made nowadays have been alluded to in Qur'ānic verses revealed four thousand years prior to the time those discoveries were made – a strong proof not only that the Ever-Glorious Qur'an is revealed from God, the Almighty, but also to its scientific inimitability. This, has since, began a series of studies and
references by Muslims and non-Muslim scholars illustrating the scientific inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān.

Huge and significant as the issue of scientific inimitability is, its influence on exegesis and translation is still unfolding. Arab Muslim scholars have been divided among themselves regarding the role of scientific inimitability on its exegesis. Some were too enthusiastic to favor the idea of basing exegesis of the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān on scientific inimitability (e.g. Dr. Mustafā Mahmoud), while others (Sayed Qotb (1963) and el-Sha'rāwī (198) called for cautiously approaching the issue of scientific inimitability lest it may be taken to its extreme level of regarding the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān a book of science rather than a Scripture of religion. Such was the view of Arab scholars and orientalists regarding the role of scientific information on the exegesis of the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān.

1.4. The Ever-Glorious Qurʾān translatable – bridging the gap with non-Muslim westerns:

However, the role of scientific information on the translation of the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān has not been touched upon. It is the view of the author of the present paper that scientific inimitability can provide a new function of religious translation, especially the translation of the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān and the method most appropriate in fulfilling such a function. The Ever-Glorious Qurʾān is far beyond the stage when it had to defend itself against attacks by anti-Islamists. It is currently at a stage when it attempts to bridge a gap with its non-Muslim westerner audience. Bridging such a gap, according to the author, can be done by addressing expectations of non-Muslims shaped by their knowledge of the Bible. This can be achieved by

---

1 Though Abdul Raof (2001) had alluded to scientific information and inimitability in the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān but never discussed its possible role in translating its meanings into English.
drawing on audiences' 'parallel knowledge, i.e. knowledge of information that is found in the Bible and the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān and drawing a comparison with the purpose of assessing the accuracy of such verses on the basis of scientific information behind such parallel stories. In such a case it is hoped that the Qurʾān in English would be rendered accessible and intelligible to non-Muslim westerners.

Having identified the new function of religious translation as performed by scientific information, the issue to be dealt with is to determine which translation technique can best perform such a function – literal or free translation. And if neither can adequately perform such a function, then a third strategy appropriate for the newly envisaged function of translating the Qurʾān is proposed.

1.5.Strategy for Qurʾān translation – literal or free or a combination of both?

The question of whether a literal or free strategy should be adopted in religious translation is a complicated one and has been associated with the purpose of the translation, the type of the SL text being translated, as well as the type of the TL audience. The debate over this dichotomy started as early as the Bible translation.

1 The dichotomy has continued in the work of modern translation theorists, though under different terms, so the literal/free translation terms have been replaced over the years once by 'formal correspondence' vs. 'dynamic equivalence' (Nida 1964), 'literal' vs. 'idiomatic' (Beckman and Callow 1974), 'overt' vs. 'covert translation' (House 1981), and 'foreignizing' vs. 'domesticating' the SL (Venuti 1995). In this dichotomy, the function of 'literal translation', 'formal correspondence', 'overt' or 'semantic translation', or 'foreignizing the SK' is to reproduce as much as possible of the SL by sticking as close as possible to its form (Nida 1964:166); whereas 'free translation', 'dynamic equivalence', 'idiomatic translation', 'covert' or 'communicative translation', or 'domesticating the SL is to focus on the meaning behind the SL with the aim of creating an effect on the TL audience that is equivalent to that created by the SL text on its readers (Newmark 1981:38).
Bible, the aim in translating it was to stick as close as possible to the original. As such the technique considered most appropriate was literal strategy as opposed to free translation. A similar debate over the use of one of these techniques arose in the translation of the meanings of the Ever-Glorious Qur’an. The majority of early translations of the Ever-Glorious Qur’an, especially by Muslims, Arabs and non-Arabs have adopted semantic translation. In so doing, some adopted an "archaic language" in the TL and copied some literal word order into the TL. This is specifically evident in the translations by Pickthall (1969) and 'Alī (1934). Other translators, for instance Irving (1985) provide a "communicative translation" that strayed away from archaic vocabulary and word order. Instead, he attempted to introduce the Ever-Glorious Qur’an in 'idiomatic' English that drifted away from the word order in the original Arabic (Irving 1985).

Adopting one of these two strategies is not without its detrimental effect on the quality of the translation. Adhering too literally to the form and word order of the Ever-Glorious Qur’an, has had – as Abdul-Raof (2001) – rightly remarks – the effect of making "the meaning of the Qur’an unintelligible, that they isolate every Qur’anic structure, number it and show it as an independent whole and thus take away life and dynamic force out of it." (Abdul-Raof 2001:21). Additionally, sticking to the literal meaning of lexical items may sometimes "confuse the target language reader and provide wrong socio-cultural presuppositions" (2001:28). In the following Qur’anic verse:

أَدْمَرِنِّهِمْ أَوْ أَضْرَبْنِهِمْ أَوْ لَا تَشَيَّرِنِّهِمْ فَإِنَّ اسْمُهُمْ فَقَرْبُ عَلَيْهِمْ سَيْبِيْلَانَ إِنِّهُ كَانَ عِبَادًا

Admonish them (first), (next), refuse to share their beds, (and last) beat them.

The translator has rightly rendered the word /?iDrūbūhunna/ in its literal meaning as beat because according to the exegetes the literal meaning of the verb /?iDrūbūhunna/ is to beat or hit. However, this
literal meaning gives a false presupposition that men are encouraged to exercise violence against their wives. A more accurate rendition, however, should be accompanied by footnote illuminating the sound socio-cultural presuppositions behind the verb (Abdul Raof 2001:29). "Communicative translation" is not without its drawbacks either. For one reason, it might give a translator a free leeway whereby meaning of the verse may be distorted. Taken to its extremes, a free translation can license a translation wherein a reader might impose his own personal understanding as falsely advised by Neil (2002). Neil claims that "the multiple renderings or interpretations of a particular Qur'anic text (which) spiral around its essential meanings… can never be translated. However, the net of meaning that these multiple translations create places the reader or hearer within a symbolic universe that calls for his/her own experience to fix a final meaning for this moment, in relation to a particular community of inquiry" (Neil 2002:10). A translation of the Ever-Glorious Qur'an which distorts the authority of the SL by imposing a reader's individual interpretation of meaning on it can never be acceptable. Consider for instance a translation by one of the Qadyani groups namely, 'Alī (1991) in which the sectarian ideologies are given free rein and authority over the meaning of the original SL. For instance, while the Qur'an supports the story of 'Issā (Jesus) virgin birth, Muhammad 'Alī denies it, providing a footnote to deny that the Qur'an was referring to anything miraculous (Mohammed 2005:3). As such neither the literal nor free translation can be accepted as the only adequate strategy in the case of Qur'an translation.

Considering the drawbacks of both strategies, the literal/free dichotomy as such, can no longer, be accepted. Instead of either being literal or free, a more adequate opinion would be to view Qur'an translation as a continuum with various levels lying between the two ends. This has, led Abdul Raof to recommend a third strategy that belongs to neither literal nor free translation. It is a strategy that he refers to as "exegetical translation" whereby the Qur'an can be made both "accessible and intelligible to the target language readers"
(Abdul-Raof 2001:40). By 'exegetical translation', he meant a translation based on "prominent exegetical works by Muslim scholars"; a translation whose aim is "to plug culture gaps to counter ambiguity and illuminate the fog of the target language" (2001:40)

A similar view of religious translatability as a continuum with the adequate strategy lying between them has been suggested by some Bible translators. Realizing that the literal/free dichotomy is no longer adequate in translating the Bible, an eminent Bible translator, Floor (2007) sets up a four-category translation strategy, two of which are varying degrees of literal translation, while the other two are varying degrees of open or free translation. An eight-item criterion of distinction has been set up to distinguish one category from the other. The criteria are: the order of clauses and phrases, sentence length, reference disambiguation and tracking, concordance of lexical items, key terms and unknown terms, figurative usage and idioms, transition marking, and information structure (Floor 2007:1). Translation categories that stick to those eight criteria are varying degrees of close or literal translation, whereas those that drift further from them are varying degrees of open or free translation. He goes to define the eight categories as follows: the first is 'close semblant translation' which involves maximum form resemblance with minimal explicitness' of meaning; the second is 'open semblant translation' which involves maximum form resemblance', similar to the first category, but differs from it in requiring "some explicatures" in meaning. Unlike these two, the third category referred to as "close interpretation translation" involves less adherence to the form but more explicitness in meaning, for it is defined as entailing "some limited form resemblance, significance interpretative resemblance with significant and even optical explicitness". The last category, the closest to the traditional end of free translation, is "open interpretative translations". It involves

---

1 Though the focus of the present paper is on the translation of the Ever-Glorious Qur'an, the translation of the Bible will be referred to since it is of relevance to the general topic which is religious translation.
"little or no form resemblance extensive interpretative resemblance, also with optical explicitness". The last category is the one "least closest to the SL in form" but allows "a highest level of explicitness" so as to draw as closest as possible to the meaning interpreted (2007:8).

Such a third strategy is the one recommended in the present paper as the most adequate. The discussion above has shown that 'literal translation' in Qur'ān translation is difficult – if not impossible, may involve certain drawbacks. Free translation, on the other hand, cannot be licensed since it may involve distortion of the meaning of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān. The second part of the paper will show that the third strategy of translation which is based on Abdul Raof’s (2001) "exegetical translation" and Floor’s (2007) "close interpretive translation" is the most appropriate in the case of Qur'ān translation. Cases where a literal strategy reproduces the nuances, the subtle semantic and stylistic meanings – behind the form - without involving a distortion of the original meaning, it will be adopted. On the other hand, cases where literal adherence to the SL fails to produce the form or involves a distortion of the original message, or fails to clarify the original meaning then the suggested approach referred to as 'close interpretative strategy' based on both the exegesis of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān and the scientific information embedded therein, will be resorted to. This is illustrated in diagram (1) below.
Two points are noteworthy here. The first is that scientific information referred to in the present paper consists only of scientific information long established as being true, not on scientific theorems that emerge only to turn out later to be inaccurate. The second is that scientific information are just a vehicle whereby the meanings communicated in the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān – the most important purpose of religious translation – are demystified and rendered intelligible. They are not meant to show the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān as a book of science. The Ever-Glorious Qurʾān remains the Scripture revealed to Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) from God, the Almighty.

In the second part the suggested approach is applied to verses making allusions to scientific information. The Qurʾānic verses are divided
into two groups: the first includes verses encoding scientific information at the micro-level, that is, the morphological, the grammatical, the lexical and the semantic levels; the second group includes verses encoding scientific information at the macro-level. Five translations by trustworthy translators for each Qur'anic verse are provided. A comparison of the translations is drawn in the light of both the exegesis of the Ever-Glorious Qur'an and the scientific information to correct any inaccuracies in the translation and explain how can the Qur'an in English contribute to "shared knowledge" of non-Muslim westerners and render it accessible to non-Muslim westerners.

2.1. Scientific information at the Micro-Level
2.1.1. Scientific information at the morphological Level:
2.1.1.1. Gender Marking
Morphological features in some Qur'anic verses encode significant scientific information. An example of such morphological features is the gender markings of verbs in some Qur'anic verses. Consider the following two Qur'anic verses:

1. And your Lord inspired the bee saying: "Take your habitations in the mountains and in the trees and in what they erect." (Al-Hilālī & Khān).
2. And thy Lord taught the bee to build its cells in hills on trees and in (men's) habitations: ('Alī)
3. And thy Lord inspired the bee saying: choose thou habitations in the hills and in the trees and in that which they thatch; (Pickthall).
4. And (consider how) they sustainer has inspired the bee: "prepare for thy self dwellings in mountains and in trees, and in what [men] may build [for thee by way of hives] (Asad).
5. And thy Lord revealed unto the bees, saying: "Taking unto yourselves, of the mountains, houses, and of the trees, and of what they are building." (Arberry).
Consider also the following example:

من أُذِينَتْ لِأَلْبَاءَ حَدْثًا وَمِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ أُخَوِّيَةً كَانَلَّا أَصْحَابُ بَيْتٍ بِهِ وَمَنْ أُلْبِسَ لِأَلْبَاءِ بَيْتُهُ

1. The likeness of those who take (false deities as) Auliyā’ (protectors, helpers) other than Allah is the likeness of a spider who builds (for itself) a house, but verily, the frailest (weakest) of houses is the spider's house – if they but knew (Al-Hilālī & Khān).

2. The parable of those who take protectors other than Allah is that of the spider who builds (to itself) a house; but truly the flimsiest of houses is the spider's house; - if they but knew ('Alī).

3. The likeness of those who choose other patrons than Allah is as the likeness of the spider when she taketh unto herself a house, and lo! The frailest of all houses is the spider's house if they but knew (Pickthall).

4. The PARABLE of those who take [beings or forces] other than God for their protectors is that of the spider which makes for itself a house; for behold, the frailest of all houses is the spider's house. Could they but understand this! (Asad)

5. The likeness of those who have taken to them protectors, apart from God is as the likeness of the spider that takes to itself a house and surely the frailest of houses is the house of the spider did they but know (Arberry).

A comparison of the translations of the first verse from Sūrat the Bee shows that the renditions involve an inevitable grammatical loss resulting from the lack of an appropriate equivalent of the 3\textsuperscript{rd} person singular feminine of the /tāʔ/ suffixed to the verb /?ittaxiʔīl/. For English does not allow such gender marking in verbs as is the case in Arabic. That accounts for dropping of the gender marking in the translations. Note that while such a loss has no impact on the grammaticality of the five English translations, it involves loss of significant scientific facts that the reader may require in order for him
to understand the reason behind the sudden shift to the 3rd person feminine singular.

The situation is different, however, with the second Qur’ānic verse from the Sūrah of the Spider. It was only the third rendition by Pickthall that copied it literally into English. However, a certain loss is still present. A reader of English - who is used to the general rule of referring to insects with the pronoun it - may find the reference to the spider with a 3rd person feminine singular pronoun. Had it not been for its scientific significance, the presence or absence of such a pronoun – would not have been of any value. Recent scientific facts have alluded to the role of the female bee or spider especially in building cell or web. It has been revealed that the building of such a home is the assignment of the female not the male (el-Khālīdī 2000:422). To convey such a significance a literal rendition is insufficient – for it does not explain why should the 3rd person singular feminine rather than the inanimate 3rd person singular it –be used to refer to a spider in these two Qur’ānic verses. Therefore an additional gloss – where the scientific information lying behind the use of this pronoun in particular is illuminated – is a must.

2.1.1.2. Singular/Plural Marking

A second instance of morphological features encoding scientific information is the juxtaposition of the morphological marking of singularity/plurality. Two examples of this peculiar morphological marking are demonstrated in the two coordinated nouns /alsam'/i.e. hearing and/?al?abSār/i.e. eyesights, on one hand, and /nūr/ i.e. light and /dhulumāt/ darkness (es) as in the two following Qur’ānic verses.

The first is in the ninth verse from Sūrat al-Sajdah

1. And He give you hearing (ears), sight (eyes) and hearts. Little is the thanks that you give. (Al-Hilālī and Khān)
2. and (He) made for you the faculties of hearing, seeing, feeling and understanding: little thanks it is ye give. (‘Alî)
3. He it is who gave you being, and hath assigned unto you ears and eyes and hearts. Small thanks give ye (Pickthall)
4. and (He) has endowed you with hearing, and sight, and hearts: [yet] how seldom are you grateful. (Asad).
5. and (He) appointed for you hearing and sight and hearts: little thanks you show. (Arberry).

The second is the first verse from Sūrat al-'An'am (The Cattle)

1. All praises and thanks are to Allah, Who (Alone) created the heavens and earth, and originated the darkness and the light (Al-Hilālī and Khān)
2. Praise be God, Who created the heavens and the earth, and made the darkness and the light.('Alî)
3. Praise be to Allah, Who hath created the heavens and the earth and hath appointed darkness and light(Pickthall)
4. ALL PRAISE is due to God, who has created the heavens and the earth, and brought into being deep darkness as well as light.(Asad)
5. Praise belongs to God who created the heavens and the earth and appointed the shadows and light(Arberry)

The above Qur'ānic verses encode a significant juxtaposition of number between the singular noun in /?alsam'/i.e. hearing, /nūr/light on one hand and the plural nouns /?al?abSār/ i.e. eyesight(s), on one hand, and/dhulumāt/ i.e.darkness and /nūr/light, on the other. Two different accounts have been given to explain the significance behind the juxtaposition of number in these two pairs. The first account is grammatical. Some exegetes gave a grammatical account for the use of singularity/ plurality markings in the case of the first pair, /alsam'/ and /al?abSār/. According to as-Sāmarā?ī, /sam'/ is an abstract deverbal noun which in Arabic cannot be suffixed for number. Whereas /?abSār /i.e.eyesight(s) is a concrete countable noun and can
therefore be suffixed for number (as-Sāmarā?ī 1999: 63). While the grammatical explanation is sound, it does not adequately bring out the significant nuances of meaning behind this morphological marking. Grammar also fails to explain the juxtaposition of number marking in the case of the second pair /nūr/ light and /dhulumāt/ darkness. For both are abstract deverbal nouns and as such the second noun should not be marked for number. However, it is marked for plurality with plural feminine suffix /-āt/ as in the case of /dhulumāt/.

Instead of resorting to grammar, a second explanation would be one based on scientific information as indicated in the first coordinated nouns. According to alSha’rāwī, a group of different people hearing a sound cannot differ over its nature; for it is the same sound to all. That explains why this noun is not inflected for plurality. The case is different with eyesight. For the same figure might be viewed differently by each individual of a group of people. This is why this noun is marked for plurality (alSha’rāwī 1991: 52). An account for the plurality of the noun /dhulumāt/ on scientific basis is provided by elNaggār. According to Dr.elNaggār, the creation of the universe passed through more than one type of darkness, namely, the primary darkness of the universe, the current darkness of the universe, the darkness of the bottom of deep sea and oceans, the darkness of the womb and the darkness of the grave (elNaggār 2005: 9). Another account that draws on a wide semantic notion can be resorted to explain the significance behind the juxtaposition of number in this second case. AlMut‘nī rightly points out that /nūr/ is made singular because the source of light is solely God, the Almighty; whereas darkness is marked for plural feminine because it can be brought about by several means: atheism, ignorance, following ones inclinations, straying away from the path of God, the Almighty (al-Mut‘nī (1992:396-397).

A literal rendition – as illustrated in the translations above –fails to reproduce these subtle nuances of meaning. As such all five translations involve a subtle loss of number marking either by
rendering the two nouns as similarly plural as in the rendition by Pickthall or as similarly singular as in the other four renditions. The loss of the juxtaposition of number marking is inevitable in English. According to English grammar, coordinated nouns have to be grammatically parallel. That means that if the first noun is singular or plural then all coordinated nouns should be either similarly singular or similarly plural. An explanatory footnote where the scientific information is illuminated, is therefore a must to compensate for the loss of the morphological feature and its scientific information in the English renditions. Note that in the above two instances of the morphological markings, the scientific information has been significantly relied upon to provide a more accurate rendition of the exegetical translation.

2.1.2. Scientific Information at the Grammatical Level: 2.1.2.1. Word Order

Not only are the above coordinated nouns /alsam'/hearing and /albasar/ or /al?abSār/ significant for their morphological markings, but for their word order as well. The two nouns /alsam'/hearing and /albasar/ or /al?abSār/ have a co-occurrence frequency (14 tokens) in the Ever-Glorious Qur’ān according to Dr.elNaggār (2005). In all these tokens, the noun /sam'/ hearing always precedes the noun /baSar/eyesight. The word order of these two coordinated nouns does not pose a problem in the translation. Still, however, the translator should bear in mind that such an order should be maintained in the translation – if the translation is to ensure the accuracy of meaning. Such accuracy of meaning can be clarified when the word order is explained against scientific data. According to Dr.elNaggār, it has been scientifically established that in creating the fetus God, the Almighty, creates for it the faculty of hearing prior to that of seeing (elNaggār 2005:9). To ensure that the scientific information behind this word order is adequately decoded in translation, then a literal strategy copying the exact word order into English should be
employed, and a footnote shedding light on the significance behind it be provided.

2.1.3. **Scientific information at the Lexical level**

Scientific information is not only embedded in the morphological and grammatical features, but it also found at the lexical level as well. At this level, the selection and use of certain lexical items ring with subtle scientific information.

A peculiar example is found in the use of the expression /lahnu-l qawl/ in verse 30 of Sūrat Muhammad:

1. but surely, you will know them by the tone of their speech!
   (AlHilālī & Khān)
2. But surely thou shalt know them by the tone of their speech ('Alī).
3. And thou shalt know them by the burden of their talk (Pickthall).
4. Thou wilt most certainly recognize them by the tone of their voice (Asad).
   (Footnote: "by their marks" : implying, elliptically, that God does not grant to anyone a clear insight, as by a visible mark into another human being is heart or mind ".Lit. "the tone (lahnu-l qawl) of speech ": indicating that a true believer recognizes hypocrisy even without a visible mark.
5. and thou shalt certainly know them in the twisting of their speech (Arberry).

The Qurʾānic verse contains a lexical item whose literal meaning appears on the surface to be easily translatable into English. However, the lexical item in question denotes several meanings. The exegesis of the Ever-Glorious Qurʾān state that /lahnu-l qawl/ literally refers to either the twisting of the tongue, eloquence of speech or tone of voice. As such if rendered by any of these equivalents, the general meaning may be sound, but not scientifically accurate. This explains why it has been differently rendered as tone of speech by 'Alī, Asad. Al-Hilālī &
Khān), once as burden of their talk’ (Pickthall), and once as 'twisting of their speech by Arberry. However, only one of those three different renditions is the most accurate. To determine which is the more accurate, the meaning of the Qur'ānic verse has to be set within two contexts, the first is exegetical and the second is that of scientific information. The former shows that the context is that of God, the Almighty, describing the general qualities or features of liars/hypocrites so as to help the Prophet (peace be upon him) and Muslims in being aware of them. So God, the Almighty points out to general features, /sīmāhum/ i.e. marks, then singles out one feature namely /lahn ul qawl/. Two questions pose themselves: first why does God, the Almighty, single out this mark; second, if the expression has more than one equivalent, which would be the most accurate. The answer to both questions lies in the context of scientific knowledge. Recent scientific discoveries have concluded that several means of detecting deception include the subject's (i.e. the liar's) body language; movement of his eyes, and tone of the voice (Ekman 2004: 1). Nevertheless, body language and gesture "vary with nationality and culture and can be misleading to some….” (2004:2 ). The tone of voice is not culture-bound, it is universal. That explains why God, the Almighty singled it out. Second, the scientific information shows that it is tone, not eloquence or twisting that can be used as detecting lie. The accurate equivalent of the expression should be tone of voice. Setting the verse within scientific context complements that of the exegetical context and clarifies significant scientific information – that are just beginning to unravel them nowadays – though they have been stated in the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān over fourteen thousand years ago.

The second example is found in verse 15 of Sūrat al'Alaq (The Clot) below:

1. Nay! If h (Abu Jahl) ceases not; We will catch him by the forelock – A lying sinful forelock! (AlHilālī & Khān)
2. Let him beware! If he does not We will drag him by the forelock; A lying sinful forelock (Alī)
3. Nay, but if he ceases not W will seize him by the forelock. The lying sinful forelock (Pickthall)
4. Nay, if he desist not, We shall most surely drag him down upon his forehead; a lying sinful forelock (Asad)
5. No indeed, surely, if he gives not over, We shall seize him by the forelock. A lying sinful forelock. (Arberry)

Comparing the translations, it is noted that they all provide similar equivalents; i.e. all of which are considered accurate – on the basis of the Qur'ān exegetes. Still, this does not adequately provide an explanation as to why, specifically, should the front part of the head be described as lying. What, then, is the relationship between the front of the head and lying and sinfulness? The front of the head is referred to as the prefrontal area of the cerebrum. An online report on the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān pointing the clues of detecting lies points out that "The motivation and the foresight to plan and initiate movements occur in the anterior portion of the frontal blobs, the prefrontal area. This is a region of association cortex...The prefrontal area is also thought to be the functional center for aggression." Online Report 2009:2) The implication is that this area of the cerebrum is responsible for planning, motivating, and initiating good and sinful behavior and is responsible for the telling of lies and the speaking of truth. It is, therefore, proper to describe the front of the head as lying and sinful as stated in the above Qur'ānic verse. Though literal translation provides a sound rendition of the lexical item, it does not fully reproduce the scientific significances behind it. For a more adequate rendition, it is suggested that the scientific information behind the description of the front of the head as lying and sinful be added in a footnote. Note that in the previous two examples, the setting of the meaning of the lexical item against the context of scientific information demystifies unclear associations of meanings.
A final example is taken from verse 25 of the Sūrah of Iron:

وَأَرْزَقْنَا ابْنَيَّكَ هُذِيَّةً مَخْيَامِينَ

1. And We brought forth iron wherein is mighty power (in matters of war) (Al-Hilālī & Khān)
2. And We sent down iron in which is (material for) mighty war (‘Ali)
3. and He revealed iron, wherein is mighty power (Pickthall)
4. and We bestowed [upon you] from on high [the ability to make use of] iron in which there is awesome power as well as [a source of] benefits for man (Asad).
5. And We sent down iron, where is great might, and many uses for men (Arberry)

The basic difference between the five renditions lies in the rendition of the verb /?anzlanā/ i.e. literally to send down or to cause to bring down. Whereas some translated it literally, others rendered it figuratively. Unfortunately, early exegesis – according to Dr.elNaggār have assumed that the verb is used metaphorically rather than literally (2006: 88). A conclusive decision to whether it is used literally or figuratively can be made on the basis of recent scientific discoveries. Modern astronomical findings have disclosed that the iron found in our world as well as the iron in the entire solar system comes from giant stars in the outer space. For the temperature in the sun is inadequate for the formation of iron. The sun has a surface temperature of 6,000 degrees celosias, that is, approximately 20 million degrees. Iron can be only produced in much larger stars than the sun, where the temperature reaches a few hundred million degrees. When the amount of iron exceeds a certain level in a star, the star fails to accommodate it, and it eventually explodes in what is called a "nova" or super nova". These explosions make it possible for iron to be given off into space. This shows that iron did not form on the earth but was carried from supernovas, and was "sent down" as stated in the verse (elNaggār 2006:89). This is a clear indication that the verb is used literally not metaphorically. Thus, the most accurate rendition is to provide the literal meaning of the verb. Additionally, a gloss is a
must. In addition to being a clear evidence of the scientific inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān, the scientific information also dispels the inaccuracies in some of the exegesis.

2.1.4. Scientific information at the Semantic level:

The final micro-level encoding scientific information is the semantic level. At this level, the semanticity of certain lexical items ring with scientific connotations.

The first example is the two lexical items used to describe the illumination of both the moon and the sun in the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān. Note that the two words /nūr/ and /Diyā'/ are close collocants of the moon and the sun – respectively. Consider Qur'ānic verse 5 of Sūrat Yūnis and the translations of its meanings into English.

1. It is He Who made the sun a shining thing and the moon as a light (AlHilālī & Khān)
2. It is He Who made the sun to be a shining glory and the moon to be a light (of beauty) ('Alī)
3. He it is Who appointed the sun a splendor and the moon a light (Pickthall)
4. He it is who has made the sun a [a source of] radiant light and the moon a light (Asad)

[Fnt. The nouns /diyā'/ and /nūr/ are often interchangeable, in as much as both denote "light"; by many philologists are of the opinion that the term /diyā'/ or /daw?/ has a more intensive connotation, and is used to describe "a light which subsists by itself, and that of the sun and fire" – that is, a source of light – while /nūr/ signifies "a light" that subsists by some other thing." (Lane v.1809 on the authority of Tājul 'Arūs).
5. It is He who made the sun a radiance, and the moon a light (Arberry)
The strong collocation between /nūr/ and /qamar/ on one hand and /Diyāʔ/ and /shams/ on the other hand, has its roots in scientific information. It has been scientifically proven that the moon is an inert body which reflects light, whereas the sun is a celestial body in a state of permanent combustion producing both light and heat (elNaggār 2006:58). This scientific information is established in the Ever-Glorious Qur‘ān in the subtle and careful choice of the lexical item /nūr/ to constantly collocate with moon and the lexical item /Diyāʔ/ to constantly collocate with the sun. Apart from the translation of Asad, the other four renditions fail to point out to the significance behind the unique collocations of these two lexical items and therefore fail to connect it with recent scientific information. Note that English fails to reflect such a fine distinction in meaning. For it lacks an exact equivalent for each lexical item. A gloss is therefore a must for two purposes. First, it compensates for the lacking of the subtle meanings of these two lexical items /nūr/ and /Diyāʔ/ in English; second, it brings out the subtle scientific information behind the use of these two specific SL lexical items in these unique collocations. Note that without reference to such scientific information, the subtle difference between the two lexical items cannot be brought out.

A second example is found in Surat al-Waqiah, verse 75:

1. So I swear by the setting of the stars (AlHilāli & Khān)
2. Furthermore, I call to witness the setting of the stars (‘Alī)
3. Nay, I swear by the places of the stars (Pickthall)
4. Nay, I call to witness the coming down in parts [of this Qur‘ān](Asad)

Or the setting [or "orbiting"] of the stars. The term (mawqi‘) of which (mawāqi‘) is the plural denotes the "time [or "place" or "manner"] at which something comes down." Although many of the commentators think that the phrase mawāqi‘an-nujūm relates to the breakup of the stars at the Last Hour, Ibn ‘Abbās, 'Ikrimah, and As-Suddi were definitely of the opinion strongly supported by the
subsequent verses, that this phrase refers to the step-by-step revelation or "coming down in parts nujūm of the Qur'ān (cf. Tabari and Ibn Kathīr) see also note.

5. No! I swear by the fallings of the stars (Arberry).

By comparing the Qur'ānic verse with its five renderings, it is noted that four of them use a literal strategy that attempts to render as close as possible the literal meaning of the word /mawāqi' / as being setting, position or location. The fourth and fifth renderings by Asad and Arberry are based on inaccurate exegesis explaining /mawāqi' / as place of falling or coming apart of stars. Setting the meaning of the whole verse against scientific information corrects the inaccuracy in the exegesis. According to Dr. El-Naggār stars cannot be made visible or seen by the normal eye. What humans see is light reflected from position or place of star which travels thousands of years till it is made visible (2006: 39-40). This explains why God, the Almighty, makes an oath by the location/setting of stars. In order to render the content of the Sūrah accessible, a gloss in which such scientific information is clearly explicated should be provided. The function of scientific information here dispels inaccuracies in the exegesis.

The last example is based on the verb /ja'ala/ i.e. to make, cause something to happen, or create. It is one of the most highly frequently used verbs in the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān (346 tokens). It denotes several meanings, one of which is the meaning that renders it falsely synonymous with the Arabic verb /xalaqa/ to create. This special meaning is of strong relevance here because it draws on important scientific information while connoting the sublime omnipotence of God, the Almighty. This can be denoted from the use of the verb in the two verses cited in 2.1.1.2 above. According to al-QaTTān, the difference between the two verbs /xalaqa/ and /ja'ala/ is that the former denotes the action of creating something out of not, that is, without there being a prior cause or factor that would lead to its coming into existence; while the latter refers to causing something to exist, through a cause or factor leading such a thing or object to come
1. Or He bestows both males and females, and He renders barren whom He will. Verily, He is the All-Knower and is Able to do all things (AlHilālī & Khān)
2. Or He bestows both males and females, and He leaves barren whom He will; for He is full of knowledge and power ('Alī)
3. Or He might mingleth them, males and females, and He maketh barren whom He will. Lo! H is Knower, Powerful (Pickthall)
4. Or He gives both male and female (to whomever He wills), and causes to be barren whomever He wills; for, verily, He is all-knowing, infinite in His power (Asad)
5. or He couples them, both males and females; and He makes whom He will barren. Surely He is All-knowing, All-powerful (Arberry).

The above verse refers to an important scientific discovery whereby barren women are caused to become pregnant after a series of medical operations. The meaning of the verb /ja'ala/ draws on the Omnipotent Will of God, the Almighty to provide the proper causes leading something to exist. (Note some women might undergo medical operations but still cannot be made to become pregnant. It all depends on God, the Almighty's Willing). The religious connotations of the verb /ja'ala/ create what Abdul Raof (2001: 61) refers to as a "lexical void" in English since such connotations are absent in English. This is evident in all the English renditions – with the exception of that of Asad which provides the nearest possible equivalent as causes to be -toning down such connotations by replacing the verb /ja'ala/ with verbs like renders (AlHilālī and Khān) maketh (Pickthall and
Arberry), and leaves ('Alī). The nearest equivalent would be cause you to have or cause something to happen.

2.4. Scientific Information at the Macro-level:

An important aspect of scientific information encoded in the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān is that it draws on "shared knowledge" and the content that is accessible to non-Muslim westerners. For not only can it be used for the better understanding of the Qur'ānic verse but in a century where, for many people scientific truth has dealt a death blow to religious belief, it is precisely the discoveries of science that, in an objective examination of the Islamic script, have highlighted the supernatural nature of Qur'ān revelation. "Shared knowledge" refers here to knowledge based on information and stories that are parallel, that is, that exist in both the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān and the Bible. By setting knowledge of these parallel stories against recent scientific facts that concur with information in the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān, the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān neither imposes itself, nor implants itself on the minds of the westerners, but rather appeals to their frame of mind, thus rendering itself not only translatable but accessible and comprehensible to non-Muslim westerners. This gives the lie to the claim made by Moir (2008) concerning the Qur'ān's low level of translatability. According to Moir, the low level of the Qur'ān's translatability is due to its "diffusion", that is, its resistant to translation because it "implant(s) itself and its language into the receiving society", forcing the target culture to "accept the imposition of the source culture's language" (2008:9).

To illustrate two examples of stories in Ever-Glorious Qur'ān that are comparable to the Bible are provided below. Boucailles (1978) noted the points where the Biblical and Qur'ānic narrations agree and points where the two texts complement each other, or disagree. An illustration of a story where the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān complements the Bible is that of the Egyptian Pharaoh in the story of Mūsā. Consider verse 92 from the Sūrah of Yūnis.
1. "So this day We shall deliver your (dead) body (out from the sea) that you may be a sign to those who come after you! (Al-Hilālī & Khān)

2. "This day shall We save thee in the body, that thou mayest be assign to those who come after thee. (‘Alī)

3. But this day We save thee in thy body that thou mayest be a portent for those after thee. (Pickthall)

4. [Nay], but today We shall save only thy body, so that thou mayest be a [warning] sign unto those who will come after thee (Asad).

5. So today We shall deliver thee with thy body, that thou mayest be a sign to those after thee (Arberry)

The above Qur'anic verse is based on the story of Moses, the Exodus from Egypt of the Hebrews and the ultimate death of the Pharaoh of Egypt. A medical study of the mummy of Merceptah has yielded useful scientific information on the possible causes of the pharaoh's death. A fact that has been alluded to thousand years ago in the above Qur'anic verse by using the simple lexical item /badanaka/ i.e. thy body. The Bible records that he was engulfed in the sea, but does not give any details as to what subsequently became of his corpse. The Ever-Glorious Qur'an complements the Bible and describes it in a short, yet highly informative and rhetorically beautiful way. A gloss detailing the scientific information is a must to explain the reason behind the unique choice of the lexical item /badanaka/. By setting the meaning of the whole Qur'anic verse against scientific information that concurs with the information found in the Qur'an, it appears that the Qur'an complements, illustrates and sheds full light for complete understanding.

The second example is based on the Qur'anic narration of the creation of the universe; a case in which the Ever-Glorious Qur'anic is not in agreement with the Bible. In talking about the story of the creation of the universe, there is a strong tendency in the West – according to
Boucailles - to claim that the Prophet (peace be upon him) copied the general outlines mentioned in the Qurʾān from the Bible in addition to the reference to six days of creation as described in the Bible, plus an extra day for rest on God's Sabbath (Boucailles 1978:32). The differences between the two narrations with respect to the time length or 'days' of creating the universe and the day of rest are illustrated first to challenge the claim that the prophet copied anything from the Bible. The difference between the Bible and the Qurʾān narration concerning the duration of creating the universe based on the inaccurate understanding of the word /?ayām/denoting the period during which God, the Almighty, created the universe as indicated below in Sūrat al-?Arāf (54)

1. Indeed your Lord is Allah, Who created the heavens and the earth in Six Days (AlHilālī and Khān)
2. Your Guardian Lord is God, who created the heavens and the earth in six days, and is firmly established on the throne (of authority) ('Alī)

Footnote: As for the Creation in six days, 47 we are told that a Day in the sight of Allah is like a thousand years of our reckoning….and in IXXX 4, the compassion is with 50 000 of our years. In the history of our material earth, we may reckon six great epochs of evolution. Here, we are told of the creation of the heavens and the earth in six days. But lest we should b obsessed with the Jewish idea that Allah rested on the seventh day, we are told that the creation was but a prelude to Allah's work
3. Lo! Your Lord is Allah who created the heavens and the earth in six Days, then mounted He the Throne (Pickthall)
4. VERILY, your Sustainer is God, who has created the heavens and earth in six aeons, and is established on the throne of His Almightyness (Asad).
The word yawm commonly translated as "day" but rendered above as "aeon" is used in Arabic to denote any period, whether extremely long "aeon" or extremely short "moment". Its application to an earthly "day" of twenty four hours is only one of its many connotations.

5. Surely your Lord is God, who created the heavens and the earth in six days – then sat Himself upon the Throne (Arberry)

Some of the above renditions ('Alī and /Asad) – as indicated above – have clarified the denotation of the word /ʔayām/ in footnotes. The clarification is based on exegesis stressing the interpretation of the Arabic word /ʔayām/ (one translation of which is 'days'), as meaning long periods or ages rather than periods of twenty-four hours.

The second difference between the two narrations centers round the claim that God, the Almighty has taken a day of rest. This is based on a misunderstanding of the conjunction Thumma. According to the footnote made by Asad (1980:80), this conjunction "does not always denote order in time (then or thereupon). In cases where it is used to link parallel statements, it has often the function of the simple conjunction 'and'. All Muslim commentators, classical and modern, are unanimously of the opinion that its metaphorical use in the Qur'ān is meant to express God's absolute sway over all His creation" (Asad 1980:80). Moreover, it should be noted that in all the Qur'ānic verses (7:54, 10:3, 13:2, 20:5, 25:59, 32:4, and 57:4), this expression is connected with a declaration of His having created the universe. Moreover, in contrast to the narration contained in the Bible, the Qur'ān does not lay down a sequence for creation of the earth and heavens. According to elNaggār, the notion derived from the Qur'ān is one of a parallel in the celestial and terrestrial evolutions. There are also basic pieces of mass (dukhān) which are unique to the Qur'ān as well as descriptions of the elements which, although at first were fused together (ratq), they subsequently became separated (fatq). According to modern science, the separation process resulted in the formation of multiple worlds, a concept which appears dozens of times in the Qur'ān (elNaggār 2006:30).
Both the Qur'ān and the Bible obviously disagree here. As Muslims we of course accept the Qur'ān without the need for any further confirmation to its truth and accuracy. But to westerners who neither believe in the Qur'ān, nor read exegetical translation but rather give more credit to science, the resort to the science will be of crucial importance in this case. According to elNaggār, the brief survey of Qur'ānic references to creation clearly shows us that modern scientific data and statements in the Qur'ān agree on a large number of points. Qur'ānic references are all in perfect agreement with modern ideas on the existence of primary nebula (galactic dust), followed by the separation of the elements which resulted in the formation of galaxies and then stars from which the planets were born. Also Qur'ānic reference made to an intermediary creation between the heavens and the earth corresponds to the modern discovery of bridges of matter which are present outside organized astronomical systems(elNaggār 2006: 34). On the other hand, the successive phases of creation mentioned in the Biblical text are totally unacceptable – from the scientific view point (Boucailles 1978:26).

Nowhere does scientific information and the scientific inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān prove to be of crucial significance than in this case. "Exegetical translation" as such sheds light on the meaning of the verse but does not shed full light on the scientific aspect of the story of the creation of the universe. Resorting to scientific information is of great importance here to determine which of the two narrations – that of the Qur'ān and that of the Bible - and which are not in agreement – is more accurate. Otherwise, the Qur'ān would remain inaccessible to westerners who do not share same knowledge of the story. By resorting to scientific theories, and proving that these theories and scientific information in the Qur'ān concur, the Qur'ān proves itself accessible and intelligible to non-Muslim westerns without 'imposing' itself or 'implanting' itself in the target culture.
Conclusion:

The following paper is an investigation of the possible contribution of the scientific inimitability of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ân to the translation of its meanings. It has been found that it has three significances to the quality of the translation of the Qur'ân, to the purpose of religious translation as well as to the technique most appropriate in Qur'ân translation. To assess such contribution scientific information at both the micro-level (morphological, grammatical, lexical and semantic levels) and the macro-level (the conceptual level) in some Qur'ânic verses are examined. By comparing each Qur'ânic verse with five their translations, it was found that resorting to Qur'ân exegesis solely was sometimes insufficient to explain and correct inaccuracies in the meaning rendered in the translations. It was by complementing the exegesis with scientific information that inaccuracies in renditions were clarified, ambiguous meanings were disambiguated, and the gap resulting from differences in shared knowledge SL and the TL audiences is narrowed.

Scientific information also re-defines the purpose of religious translation – especially the translation of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ân. The Qur'ân is no longer translated into English only to ward off attacks on anti-Islamists, but in order for it to become a link reaching out to non-Muslim westerners. Finally, the paper envisages of a new strategy that is most appropriate in the translation of the Ever-Glorious Qur'ân. Such a strategy is a third strategy lying between literal and open translation, that sticks to the literal strategy based on the exegesis of the Qur'ân as long as the exegesis and scientific information are adequately reproduced in the translation. Once, however, inaccuracies or ambiguities emerge, then a gloss based on scientific information is resorted to. It is therefore, one of the recommendations made by the present paper that exegesis of the Qur'ân which translators depend on in translating the meanings of the Qur'ân, be revised in the light of recent scientific discoveries to ensure the adequacy of the meanings of
verses in the Ever-Glorious Qur'ān, especially those that allude to scientific information.

REFERENCES:


• alHilālī, Muhammad Taqiuddīn and Muḥammad Muḥṣīn Khān. *The Noble Qur'ān in the English Language: A Summarized Version of At-Tabari, Al-Qurtubi, and Ibn Kathīr*


• Qotb, Muḥammad. AITaSwīr AlFanī fil Qur‘ān. Cairo: Dar AlShoroq, 1963.


• Report on "alIljāz alIlmī fil Qur‘ān alKarīm wa kashf alKazīb. Online Report at info@art4Islam.com (Date retrieved: Sept. 20th, 2009)


Euphemism in Prophetic Hadith: Domestication or Foreignization

Nagwa Taha El-Zeiny
Helwan University
Egypt, Cairo

Introduction

In spite of the various recent definitions of euphemism, it may be noticed that at close scrutiny they almost revolve around the same idea, that is, the use of lexical, and in a few cases grammatical, devices by speakers to be more demure and polite in human interaction. However, it can be noticed that there is a slight shift of focus in the more recent definition of the term in comparison to the old ones. This shift is observed in the turn from associating euphemism with good omen to associating it with ‘face-saving and politeness strategies’. Consequently, such shift reflects the current development in linguistic studies, and the new window through which linguistic verbal behavior is to be viewed, namely, the realm of pragmatics. This very shift also has its implications for diachronic linguistic studies as it carries from underneath a slight change in the motive behind using euphemism. Whereas use of words of good omen in the old definitions reflects a purely psychological element in utilizing euphemism, expressions like ‘face-saving’ and ‘loss of face’ in the recent definitions (e.g. Allan and Burridge 1991, p.14) reflect the new sociopragmatic framework within which euphemism is to be viewed. Put differently, previous definitions may be viewed as studying euphemism from a purely semantic stance, which can be noticed in allocating some sections of books on semantics to euphemism, as in Ullmann (1963) and Palmer (1981), in contrast with the recent studies which focus on the pragmatic stance (e.g. Farghal 1992).
To clarify this point further, the following definitions of euphemism are presented. The Encyclopedia of religion and Ethics (1981, vol. 5, p.585) for instance, defines euphemism as “the use of names or words of good omen,… instead of those of evil omen, … to avoid the dangers which are inherent in the use of the latter.” Thus, euphemism was associated with good omen because of a psychological reason: fear of danger from that which is euphemized. This was especially the case since the field of religion, as Neaman and Silver (1983 pp.1-2) tell us, is the one in which euphemism first appeared. For instance, they indicate that “Gods were referred to by their attributes (The Thunderer) …Perhaps most mysterious of all the types of religious euphemism was that convoluted variety which referred to gods by naming what they were not.” (p.2) This is attributed to the fact that man was afraid of Gods, especially in ancient Greek religions. This finds support in the origin of the term euphemism which comes from the Greek eu, “good”, and pheme “speech” or “sayings,” and thus it means literally “to speak with good words or in a pleasant manner.” (Neaman and Silver 1983, p.1) and Farghal 1992, p. 366).

In contrast, Allan and Burridge (1991) offer this more recent definition in which a euphemism “is used as an alternative to a dispreferred expression, in order to avoid possible loss of face or that of the audience, or of some third party.” (p.14).The dispreferred expression may be taboo, fearsome, distasteful, or for some other reason have too many negative connotations to felicitously execute speaker’s communicative intention on a given occasion. “Face” refers to the respect that an individual has for him/herself and maintaining the “self-esteem” in public or private situations. Moreover, the underlying principle of politeness is to preserve harmony by showing good intentions and consideration for the feelings of others. Every culture has its strategies and mechanisms that are manipulated by speakers to be polite. Such politeness strategies are developed for the main purpose of avoiding face threatening acts (FTA) (Brown and Levinson 1978). Brown and Levinson (1978) have developed four types of politeness strategies that sum up human “politeness”
behaviour: Bald-on-record, negative politeness, positive politeness and off-record-indirect strategy. In this way, politeness is considered the main factor that motivates the use of euphemism. (check quotation)

The sociopragmatic input /flavour thus is evident in the use of the term “face”. This means that a speaker has to care about his choice of linguistic option so as not to embarrass or threaten the other’s face, which leads to a more refined interaction. In this sense, using euphemism cannot be separated from pragmatics, since it is “the study of language in operation or context” (Hatim and Mason 1990, p.59).

Still, a further observation on the definitions of euphemism is that this shift is not only noticeable in the linguistic framework in which euphemism is to be studied but also in the motif behind its use. In the ancient times, euphemism was used for benign purposes, namely to avoid embarrassing the other, or invoking gods’ or spirits, from the perspective of Greek religions, or for fear of environmental or factual reality that man has to face such as disease or death. However, in recent definitions, this benign intention, the researcher notes, is slightly altered in favor of a more, so to speak, malignant one, as a camouflage for harmful operations or issues that man himself creates and not for environmental factors that man is likely to be afflicted with. For instance, “normal gratitude” is euphemistic for ‘bribe’ in English (HYPERLINK http://www.westwords.com/guffey/uguiz.html.) and ‘surrogate mothers’ for a woman who is paid to bear a child for another woman, either through artificial insemination by the other woman’s husband, or by carrying until birth the other woman’s surgically implanted fertilized egg HYPERLINK http://www.counterbalance.net/biogloss/surrrmum/body.html).

In this sense, surrogacy is in fact, a sort of human abuse and is against the medical ethics, the thing which called many States to consider it
illegal and “to pass legislation outlawing the entire procedure.” (Thompson, 1990, p. 205).

This example of ‘surrogate mother” draws our attention to the important point that euphemistic expressions are not only culture-loaded but also they reflect ideology. This becomes clear in the translation of this very euphemism “surrogate mother”. In Egyptian newspapers for instance, this expression is known as “الأم البديلة” al’umm al-badillah. Nonetheless, because Muslim scholars unanimously consider surrogacy an illegal act from the legislative viewpoint of Islamic Shari‘ah, they reject this euphemistic translation in favour of the dysphemistic one “تأجير الأرحام” ta’gir al’arham, literally, ‘hiring out wombs/uteruses for rent”, which reflects their ideological stance towards this phenomenon and their negative attitude towards it. In this way, euphemism is used in a sense closer to ‘double speak, (Wikipedia 2003, cited in Mazid (2003, p. 45), that is, using language to “disguise its actual meaning.” This new sense of “disguise and camouflage” represents the other end of the continuum in which euphemism is used as a weapon of destruction, here destroying human values, rather than a shield to protect them.

**Scope of the study**

In this study euphemism, those resulting from a sense of decency and propriety (Ullmann, 1963 pp.193-195) are selected from Prophetic Hadith, specifically in Bukhāri’s Sahīh. Hadith stands for “what was transmitted on the authority of the Prophet, his deeds, sayings, tacit approval, or description of his sifaat (features)...However, the term was used sometimes in much broader sense to cover the narrations about the Companions ans Successors as well.” (Azami 1977, p.3) These euphemisms deal with the marriage act, illicit sexual intercourse, and husband and wife relationship, among some other sensitive issues.
It is worth noting here that, in the case of Hadith, which represents the corpus of this study, euphemisms are used neither in the sense of doublespeak nor in the sense of good omen, but rather from the recent perspective mentioned above, which mainly aims to avoid taboos. This is attributed to the fact that the motive for using euphemism in Hadith, as Ibn Hajar (2000, 9, 365) says is to avoid mentioning anything that causes embarrassment and that one feels modest to mention.

Hypothesis

It is hypothesized that euphemisms in Hadith should be translated following foreignization rather than domestication (Venuti 1995) when the target reader is a member of the Muslim non-Arab minority groups so as to maintain the source language cultural input. However, the foreignized version has to be followed by its domesticated version so as to guarantee correct understanding of the euphemisms by the foreign reader and to reduce the alienation of the translated text. This is especially the case because Hadith texts are classified as documentary in Nord’s . and as such, they should be retained as much as possible in their original wording.?

Operational definitions

Euphemism

In this study, the following definition of euphemism, which is adapted from Ali (1996), is adopted:

A euphemism is a rhetorical device that participates in communicating aesthetic and cognitive experiences. A euphemistic expression “may cover clandestine, outlawed or disgraceful practices in society”. It may give “a cushioning effect and hide the actual meanings.” (Ali pp.23-24). A euphemism is used to make remarks less blunt, to add a
touch of politeness to certain expressions, e.g. البصير‘the sighted’ as a euphemism for الأعمي‘the blind’.

Dysphemism

The term “dyshpemism” is usually used as the opposite of euphemism. It refers to words and expressions that “flagrantly announce” the unpleasant pejorative words and expressions (Ali, p. 23) and they stand at the other end of the continuum. Another opposite of euphemism is “cacophemism,” which refers to “something deliberately offensive” (Wikipedia, 2003, www, as cited in Mazid 2003, p.47). Examples of dysphemisms include swear-words, four letter words, and insults.

Foreigization and Domestication

Foreigization according to Venuti (1995, p.19-20) is a term used to designate the type of translation in which a translated text deliberately breaks target conventions by retaining something of foreignness of the original and which moves the reader towards the author. Domestication in contrast refers to a translation strategy in which a transparent fluent style is adopted in order to minimize the strangeness of the foreign text for TL reader and in which the author moves towards him.

Theoretical Framework

Euphemism in English

Leech (1990) explains that euphemism (Greek: ‘well speaking’) is the practice of referring to something offensive or indelicate in words that make it sound more pleasant than it really is. He indicates that in this technique a word which has offensive connotations is replaced with another that does not make direct reference to the unpleasant side of the subject “and may even be a positive misnomer.” (p.45) He adds that by euphemism one tries to purge the subject of its damaging
affective associations and that it is palliative, e.g. restroom for bathroom.

As Sha’baan (2000, p.24) points out, “the euphemistic meaning is merely a lexical form that loses its denotative central meaning, and acquires a new connotative meaning to match the new use of the word.” According to Ullmann (1966) the main motive for euphemism is psychological, as the speaker uses a decent word to evade using a harmful one. This explains how euphemism is a source of semantic change, e.g. ‘toilet’ originally means a piece of cloth in which we wrap clothes ((Pyles and Alego 1993, p.258). Since speaking of euphemism is directly related to taboo, the definition of taboo is discussed below.

Taboos

Most linguists agree that speakers utilize euphemism as a means to avoid taboos. “Taboo” comes from the Polynesian polysyllabic word, of which /ta/ means mark, and /bu/ means ‘adverb of intensity’ (Ullmann 1962, p.204). It refers to that which is sacred, prohibited and fearful. Therefore, speakers usually avoid uttering tabooed words. The common taboo topics across cultures include sexuality, physical and mental illness, disease, personal finances, politics, and criminality (Trinch 2001, p.571), however other taboos vary from one society to another. Thus, to avoid taboos, speakers resort to violation of some of the Gricean maxims, i.e., set of norms expected in a conversation. (1957), especially those of relevance (response relevant to topic of discussion) and manner (speakers avoid ambiguity or obscurity).

Strategies for achieving euphemism in English

Euphemism can be achieved in various ways. Some of the basic strategies for achieving euphemism in English are offered by Williams 1957, pp.202-3), Warren (1992, pp.132-137) and Ham (2001).

1-Word formation devices
Williams (1957, pp.202-3) identifies five semantic processes through which euphemism is created. These include 1- borrowing (e.g. WC and toilet for lavatory). 2- semantic expansion or innovation, in which the connotations of a word are expanded to widen the scope of meaning of that word to make it more appealing to the hearer (e.g., growth for cancer). 3- semantic shift: a total change in the meaning of a word is created by inventing a new use for it (e.g., pass away for die, where the meaning has one of the associations of the verb die, and as such it undergoes a semantic shift). 4. Metaphorical transfer (e.g., ‘blossom’ for ‘pimple’). 5- Phonetic deviation/distortion, which is produced by using phonetic alternation to avoid uttering an embarrassing word (e.g., vamp instead of vampire).

Warren (1992, pp.132-137) adds other word formation processes, such as:

1. Compounding (e.g., comport station); derivation (e.g., sanguinary “bloody”), and acronyms, e.g., SAPEFU “military blunder”, an acronym for surpassing all previous fuck-ups, etc.
2. Foreign terms: e.g., lingerie from French.
3. Phonemic and morphological modification, e.g. epar, backslang for rape, and rhyming slang, phonemic replacement and abbreviation.
4. Omission: the offensive word is omitted or replaced by some articulated noise in speech, e.g., where’s the ehum?
5. Use of proper nouns as disguises for offensive words, e.g. Little Willie for ‘penis’.
6. Semantic innovation, which is broader than Williams definition, as it includes particularization, e.g., ‘innocent’ for ‘virginal’; metaphors, e.g., melons for ‘breasts’; implication, e.g., sleep with somebody ‘have sexual intercourse with somebody’; metonymy, e.g., ecstasy for ‘amphetamine’ (p.131), i.e., that which causes ecstasy; and reversals, e.g., early for ‘late, and blessed for ‘mad’; overstatement, e.g., ‘fight to glory’ for death, and understatement, e.g. drug habit for ‘drug addiction’.
Euphemisms are also classified based on the rationale behind their use. Ullmann (1963, pp.193-195) identifies three types of euphemism: 1- those inspired by fear, such as fear of mentioning God’s name. 2- those dictated by a sense of delicacy, e.g. euphemism for death and bodily defects/deformities. 3- those resulting from a sense of decency, e.g. euphemism for sex and private parts.

**Euphemism in Arabic**

**Controversies about the equivalent of euphemism in Arabic:**
The term euphemism has been translated differently by Arab linguists. However, the main five translations, as cited in `Abd-Ennabi (2001, pp. 8-10) are:

- **kinaaya** (Add-Dawaakhly and AL-Qassaaas 1950.; Shabâna 2000).
- **husn atta`beer** (Bishr 1992, p. 196).
- **attalattuf fi ta`beer** (Umâr 1988, p. 295) and **tahšiin al-lafz** (Husam Eddin 1985, p.14).

`Abd-Ennabi argues that **husn al-lafz** do not always refer to this phenomenon since they imply expressiveness and rhetorical use of words regardless of whether or not they cover bad or embarrassing meanings. As for **kinaaya** and **lutf al-lafz**, they are not adequate as they are too general, which does not match the specificity indicated in the English term, although they are the closest terms to euphemism. He offers the example of using nice expressions from a doctor to a patient in order to alleviate his pains and to give him hope of recovery, which he does not consider euphemistic though it is a kind of **lafz al-lutf**. Therefore, `Abd-Ennabi concludes that **kinaaya** is the closest equivalent term to euphemism. He supports his view with Ath-Tha’aalibi’i’s (p.259) words in his subtitle of a chapter as “**faslun fi al-kinaaya fi maa yustaqqbah dhikr yah bimaa yustahsan lafzuh** in which **yustaqqbah dhikr yah** refers to taboos, and **yustahsan lafzuh** refers to euphemism. Nonetheless, `Abd Ennabi still adds that the term **kinaaya** is deeply rooted in Arabic rhetoric, which
makes it hardly acceptable as an equivalent to euphemism as a sociolinguistic term. Hence, he suggests using *ism al-maf′uul* ‘the participle’ of the verb *kanaa* without geminating the sound /n/, that is *makni* and the adjective *makniyy anhu*, or the *masdar* ‘participle’ *takniyah* as a more suitable equivalent.

Nonetheless, the researcher agrees with `Abd Ennabi’s argument concerning the equivalents /wawU /yaraF/baM/aynM/taM/lamI/alifU /nunF/sinM/haI /yaraF/baM/aynM/taM/lamI/faF/ta-M/lamI/ and /zaF/kashidashort/faM/lamM/lamI/alifU /yanunF/sinM/kashidashort/tahaI, as all are inadequate, since they do not necessarily replace an embarrassing or an unpleasant term, and as such they fail to reproduce the meaning of the term. As for /zaF/faM/lamM/lamI/alifU /yanunF/sinM/tahaI in particular, researcher believes that it is expected to result in confusion as it has shades of the meaning of the rhetorical term *muhassin badi`ii* ‘a figure of speech’, such as *tibaaq* ‘antithesis’ and *jinaas* ‘homophony’ in Arabic. With regards the term *kinaaya*, though it is the closest equivalent to euphemism, as At-Tha`aalibi himself has rightly noted, it cannot be used in its general sense, since it can be used to refer to positive and negative aspects and not merely to negative ones. For instance, *tawiil an-nijaad* is *kinaaya* for generosity. Hence, if *kinaaya* is used as an equivalent to euphemism, it has to be followed by the sentence mentioned by Ath-Tha`alibi above, i.e., for that which one finds offensive to mention' otherwise it remains inadequate. This being the case, the researcher finds that *tada`al* is the closest term since the morphological pattern *tafa`ul*, derived from the verb *talattafa*, implies a deliberate choice of a more decent and pleasant term which is close to the definition of euphemism. It has also to be noted that the term *tahdhiib al`alfaaz* is used in Arabic to refer to another phenomenon by Ibn Essikiit, and therefore it is rejected as an equivalent to euphemism, in spite of the fact that it sounds close to the English term.

Though Shabâna’s thesis on euphemism in Arabic is excellent and comprehensive, he argues that *kinaaya* ‘metonymy’ in Arabic is
almost the equivalent to euphemism. He bases his argument on ‘Abu
Ubaida’s (1954, vol. I. p. 73) definition of kinaaya which says,
“Kinaaya is that type of meaning that is realized only from the context
of speech, without directly referring to the original meaning of the
word.” (Cited in Shabâna p.59). One of the major sources of
euphemism identified by Shabâna is the second type of kinaaya in
Arabic according to Al-Mubarrid (vol. II, p. 674), in which kinaaya is
used by way of avoiding a disgraceful word in favour of another
appropriate one.

In fact, the researcher argues, in this definition the pragmatic input of
kinaaya in Arabic is implied in the use of the word ‘appropriate’,
which echoes the politeness principle in Grice’s taxonomy (1975) in
spite of the fact that al-Mubarrid wrote this long time ago. Still
another important definition is that of Ibn Il’İbâ’ al-Misî (1963, p.
143)

وهي أن يعبر المتحكم عن المعنى القبيح باللفظ الحسن وعن الفاحش بالطاهر”

“(kinaaya) denotes/designates the speaker’s use of a pleasant
word to express a disgraceful/ an unpleasant meaning, and a pure
word to express an obscene meaning” (Translation mine).

Yet, it has to be noted that kinaaya here is not used in the technical
sense of metonymy in rhetorical terms, but rather in a general sense as
a strategy used by speakers to avoid unpleasant or obscene words,
which is almost similar to the use of euphemism in English. This
finds support in Shabâna (2000, p. 60 see note 26, p.71 Shabâna).
However, this is as far as the function of kinaaya is concerned. In
other words, this type of kinaaya is equivalent to euphemism in
English in terms of the function and the rationale behind its use, yet it
is not the only way as far as devices of producing euphemism are
concerned. According to this researcher, euphemism can be achieved
by various strategies, apart from kinaaya, as explained by Ali and
Farghal above. Nonetheless, other strategies are added or highlighted
by the researcher, namely synecdoche, and ta’riid ‘hedging or indirect
expression’. At-ta`riid ‘hedging’ is defined according to Al`askary as “A rhetorical device which permits shifting from direct expression through words to just hedging or pointing at from far”, cited in Tabaana, p.147)

This finds support in Husam Eddin (1985, p.20) who notes that euphemism in Arabic is equivalent to kinaaya ‘metonymy’, and ta`riid ‘hedging’. Thus in euphemism the maxim of manner according to Grice (1957) “Be clear, do not obscure meaning. Do not be ambiguous” is sacrificed/flouted in order to avoid sensitive issues and embarrassment, whereas the maxim “be polite” is not flouted so as to keep one’s positive face. Arabs deploy euphemism in their speech to “make it more pleasant and acceptable to the listener, instead of using blunt words.” (Al-Misri (1963, p.144). This becomes evident in many verses of the Qur’an (Shabâna, Ali, Ibn Hajar). The researcher also finds that the same applies to Hadith.

**Strategies for achieving euphemism in Arabic:**

As for devices of achieving euphemism in Arabic they are mainly presented by Farghal (1995), Ali (1996) and Shabâna (2000). In the following section an account of these devices in Arabic is provided.

Euphemism can be effected in various ways in Arabic. Metonymy is the most salient device used in Arabic for this purpose (Shabâna 2000; Husam Eddin 1985). However, other devices include figures of speech, circumlocution, and antonyms which are discussed by Farghal (1995). Ali (1996) adds other devices such as ellipsis, vague expressions, indirect speech, some grammatical devices such as qualifying adjectives, e.g., somewhat, and double negatives, e.g. ‘not un-’ (p.24). Idioms also represent another source of euphemism in Arabic (Ali, p.36), e.g. *kama waladathu ‘ummuh*, literally, ‘as his mother gave birth to him’, i.e., naked.
The researcher adds that synecdoche *majaaz mursal* is another major source of euphemism in Arabic that is used in the Qur’an and Hadith, e.g. ‘*aw jaa’a ’ahadun minkum min al-ghaa’it* (Q, An-Nisâ’, verse 43)” or one of you comes after answering the call of nature” Khan and Hilâli (1996) in which the place *al-ghaa’it* is used to refer to the euphemized act itself, namely answering the call of nature. However, this device is not given adequate consideration in studies on euphemism in Arabic.

Nonetheless, the researcher also argues that the final word concerning formation of euphemism in Arabic should be postponed until a contrastive rhetoric research is carried out. The above mentioned categories and strategies for achieving euphemism are in fact overlapping. For instance, what Farghal refers to as “figures of speech” is termed by Warren as “semantic innovation”. Over and above, rhetorical figures used in the models provided by non-Arabs do not usually designate the same concept or figure in the models offered by Arabs. For instance, “ecstasy is a metonymy for amphetamine” in Warren’s model, that is, it causes ecstasy. This causal relationship is referred to in Arabic as synecdoche. A synecdoche in Arabic is defined as “The relation between the actual use of a word and that in which it is borrowed for is other than similitude, e.g. the word ‘hand’ is used to refer to blessing ‘*ni`mah*’, as it is the hand that brings about blessing. However, there must be a hint at this meaning in the expression used.” (Tabaana pp.251-2 ; translation mine) Another example is the expression ‘sleep with his wife’, which is referred to by Warren as ‘implication’, though in Arabic this would be called a metonymy. In this way, it becomes obvious that the rhetorical features are classified differently in Arabic and English, which threatens the validity and correctness of any conclusions based on such classification. This being the case, the term metonymy is selected here as a general over-all umbrella term that encompasses all these subcategories. This is because it is the closest in function to euphemism in English especially as seen in the definition of Al-Mubarrid and Al-Mi'ri above.
Review of the Literature

Warren’s (1992) study of euphemism in English focuses on one type, namely semantic innovations. He analyzes 500 euphemisms from Spears (1981) A Dictionary of Slang and Euphemism, and Neaman and Silver (1983) A Dictionary of Euphemisms. Semantic innovations, according to Warren, include particularization, implications, metaphors, overstatement, metonyms and reversals. Hijazi (1986) deals with *kinaaya* metonymy as a rhetorical feature in Prophetic Hadith as an Arabic text, with special application to Bukhari’s *Sahih* in its Arabic version. Among the many examples analyzed, he includes metonyms referring to sexual intercourse that appear in 12 Hadiths in his corpus, which he presents under the subtitle *Ahaadiith al-Wat*’ (pp.64-77). His analysis is comprehensive and detailed and it clearly asserts the function of *kinaaya* in Arabic as a euphemism for that which is embarrassing and/or repugnant to mention. He concludes that such linguistic use in Prophetic Hadith attests to the Prophet’s decency and decorum and that Hadith is a source of politeness that teaches one how to improve his mannerisms (p. 242).

Farghal (1995) identifies categories of euphemism in Arabic and relates them to the politeness principles and the cooperative maxims of conversation. He argues that euphemism is a pragmatic mechanism that reflects the interlock between the politeness principles and conversational maxims. Farghal indicates that this interlock is evident at the level of lexis rather than the level of discourse and grammar. He adds that euphemisms flout one or more of the conversational maxims, thus giving rise to particularized conversational implicatures or “floutings.” (p.368). Particularized conversation implicatures result from flouting one or more of the conversational maxims in order to exploit them for communication purposes.
Farghal also explains that Arabic euphemisms are relevant to particularized rather than standardized conversational implicatures. On the other hand, dysphemism, (the converse of euphemism) results from flouting one or more of the conversational implicatures, yet in a directionality contrary to that of euphemism. Farghal focuses on the main categories of euphemism: circumlocutions, figurative expressions and antonyms; however he excludes ellipsis, abbreviations and over- and understatements. To establish the interpretation for the phenomenon of euphemism in Arabic, he illustrates these categories with examples from MSA and Jordanian Arabic. His rationale for choosing this level of Arabic is that euphemism is deeply rooted in the linguistic politeness manifested in careful speech, in contrast with dysphemism, which is more manifest in colloquial speech. Farghal’s analysis deals with sensitive issues, such as euphemisms for death, defecation, sex and other taboo topics.

Ali (1996) investigates euphemism in two translations of the Glorious Qur’an, namely the Qadiyyani translation by Maulawi Sher Ali (1967), and M.M. Pickthall’s translation (1981). He analyzes euphemistic expressions particularly in two Surahs: al-Baqarah (The Cow) and An-Nisaa’ (The Women), with the purpose of identifying some problems of translating euphemism through comparing the two renderings. For instance, the euphemistic expressions “al-lams, al-‘ifdaa’ are used in Surah Al-Baqarah to refer to sexual intercourse. Ali’s analysis yielded the conclusion that both translators have obliterated the euphemistic implications of these expressions because of reproducing their lexical equivalents without reproducing the same euphemistic overtones in English. For instance, the word “touch”, and the phrase “gone in unto” are provided for all the following words in the original Arabic words, “lams, tamth, mubasharah, ‘ifdaa’ and dukhuul”, which are all sex euphemisms. Thus the translators have either flattened the original Arabic expressions, which resulted in obliterating all intentional associations of these words, or missed the euphemistic force of the original. Other results of mistranslating euphemism also include contradictory translations of the same verse.
Ali asserts that euphemism in the Qur’an acquires an aesthetic and poetic overtone that may be missed or less effectively reproduced in the translations into other languages. Both the two translations he analyzed failed to provide the functional, figurative and communicative equivalence of euphemistic expressions and obliterated their euphemistic force by literal lexical equivalents. Ali explains that part of the problem is that the style of the Qur’an necessitates the employment of “a dynamic intertextuality approach to analyze, interpret and render into English” (p.35), because it is characterized by its poly-functionality and multiplication of reference, and unity of style.

Shabâna (2000) deals with euphemism in the Qur’an from a lexical semantic perspective. He argues that the motive for using euphemism in religious texts is not fear, but rather “politeness and respect for the Lord.” (p.51). He adds that Muslims also euphemize the name of God by using the Fairest names of Allah (’asmaa’u Allaahi al-husnaa), as His name is Allah. However, this researcher refutes this argument /disagrees with him since this is typical of other religions but not Islam. The rationale is that, as Shabâna himself mentions, “ancient people believed that talking about a god without euphemism may evoke his spirit, and hence the anathema of such god will surely hurt the speaker” (p.47). Obviously, this quotation is not consonant with the concept of God in the Islamic credo in which Muslims are ordered to call Allah by His Fairest names (The Qu’an 9 Al-‘A`raaf, ) and not as a means of euphemizing His names.

Another area over which the current researcher disagrees with Shabâna, is that the ‘devil’ or Satan is another second name euphemized in all religions including Islam. For instance, ‘the Old Gentleman’ and “Peter” are substitutes for the devil (Hasting 1981, vol. 5, p.586, as cited in Shabâna, p.52). In Islam, Shabâna argues, Satan is euphemized as al-mal`uun and ar-rajiiim, ‘the cursed and the stoned’, respectively. Again, the researcher argues, these are epithets of Satan as clearly appears from their denotations, which are in fact
dysphemisms and not euphemisms. Satan is always cursed and insulted or at least bluntly mentioned in the Qur’an by way of reminding the reader of his being punished for his blasphemy and disobedience to Allah. This can be easily pointed out at a glance in the Qur’an in many verses (For instance, Al-Baqarah).

Shabâna then mentions that death is euphemized in the Old Testament and in the Qur’an. For instance, “eternal house” for cemetery, is used in modern Hebrew (Neaman and Silver p.267), and ‘intaqala ‘ila Ar-raftiq al-‘A’ala ‘He transferred to the Highly Exalted Companion’ refers to death in Islam (Al-Jurjaani 1908, 48-50, as cited in Shabâna).

Shabâna rightly concludes that the rationale for euphemism in the Qur’an is politeness in referring to man’s private parts, husband /wife relationship, among other things. This is in order to preserve the sacredness of the divine text, to teach people good manners, and to set an example for politeness, even in the most embarrassing issues (pp.74-77). Examples of euphemism for the marital relationship discussed in Shabâna’s thesis include rafath ‘to lie with one’s wife’, libaas ‘garment’, among others (p.81).

Another conclusion Shabâna reached is that euphemism is a sociolinguistic phenomenon through which speakers avoid bluntly mentioning taboos and they are as old as man on earth. It is short-lived as it keeps changing from time to time, and as such, it is a sort of lexical semantic expansion that enriches the dictionary. Over and above, the various forms of euphemism in the Qur’an reflect the richness of the Arabic language and of the Qur’anic style in particular.

Ham (2001) analyzes sex euphemism in three literary texts: Jane Austin’s Emma, Walker’s Well-groomed, and Lawrence’s Lady Chatterley’s Lover from a pragmatic perspective. He shows how the Maxim of Relevance is flouted in producing euphemisms. He also advocates that the use of euphemism is a vent for expressing ‘touchy or taboo’ issues upsetting or embarrassing people.
Trinch (2001) investigates euphemism used by women in expressing rape assaults. She reports that women use terminology that “palliates indecency and indelicacy in order to uphold decorum” in narrating their experience (p.572), and to “veil the offensiveness presumably produced by the referent rape, a word that has sexual, criminal, and fear instilling connotations” (p.587). Trinch argues that euphemism can be expressed through ambiguity, a politeness strategy “manipulated by speakers to avoid loss of face, or to offer to their interlocutors, as well as to guard for themselves, a way out of a potentially offensive interpretation.” (Brown and Levinson 1987, and Lakoff 1974, as cited in Trinch p. 571). However, Trinch explains that euphemism in such sex assault cases stands in the way of meaning making, especially in legal documents in court cases. This is attributed to, as Allan and Burridge (1991, p.4) clarify, the duality of the contextual frame of euphemism as it is “determined by both the world spoken of, and the world spoken in”. This duality ambiguates the meaning. Nonetheless, Trinch continues to argue, though ambiguity flouts the Gricean (Grice 1957) maxim of manner, such flouting is a strategy used by such women “to avoid cultural transgressions in their speech.” (p.589)

`Abd-Ennabi (2001) provides an account of taboos in Arabic with special focus on Hadith in Bukhârî’s Sahîh. He analyzes three areas of euphemism: sex, defecation, and names. His analysis of sex euphemism has yielded 25 instances that specifically deal with legal/illegal sexual intercourse. However, he merely lists the euphemisms in the Hadiths and carries out a statistical account of their occurrence in Bukhârî. He does not provide an in-depth analysis of each euphemism, as he is content with just identifying the taboo term and its euphemistic expression based only on the dictionary meaning of each.

Hasan (2003?) presents us with a contrastive study of euphemism in English and Arabic and its translation problems. He illustrates his
theoretical input with data from both languages, following Warren’s (1993 p.133) model, according to the semantic fields of euphemism and their translation into Arabic.

In Hasan’s work, Orwell’s Animal Farm (1984) is selected for application of euphemism in English, whereas the Qur’an is selected as a field of application for Arabic euphemism. The translations of both texts were analyzed in order to point out problems of translating euphemisms. Some of the semantic fields of euphemism covered in the study include love, poverty, fear and death. Hasan identifies some translation problems such as loss of euphemism, producing a more general term or sacrificing the original euphemism for the sake of clarity, and reproducing euphemism at the expense of the original meaning. He concludes that euphemism plays a vital role in language ability, and hence it has to be integrated into language teaching through “the language awareness approach and thorough cross-cultural training” (p.415). He also calls for compiling an English-Arabic dictionary of euphemism so as to help translators overcome resultant problems of translating euphemism.

Mazid (2003) explores euphemism and dysphemism in the war-on-Iraq discourse. He analyzes newspaper texts and on-line texts from news agencies following Allan and Burridge’s (1991) metaphor of language as “a shield and weapon”, with special focus on the discourse of Bush ad Saddam. He analyzes American euphemism and Iraqi dysphemism in referring to the war. He explains how legitimizing and delegitimizing are realized in a quadrant of euphemizing self and dysphemizing the other. For instance, Americans use ‘liberation’ to refer to the invasion of Iraq, whereas Iraqis describe the invasion as “imperialist blood-suckers.” Mazid concludes that his study confirms the findings of the literature on war language in general and the war-on terror and the Gulf Crises of 1991 and 2003 in particular.
Method

Data for this research are collected from Prophetic Hadith and its translation in *Sahîh Al-Bukhâri* by Khan (1997). The areas of euphemism are selected based on the criteria developed for defining a word or an expression as euphemistic in Warren (1992, p. 135), and in the light of the definition of Ali cited above. Warren’s criteria are as follows:

1. The referent is a sensitive phenomenon, e.g., sex.
2. The referring expression is less harsh or coarse or less direct than some alternative.
3. The interpreter’s perception that the speaker’s choice of expression is dictated by considerations of tact or embarrassment with the referent that determines whether an expression is a euphemism or not. This implies that “euphemism is in the eye of the beholder and cannot be strictly verified, although there is a consensus among language users as to what words are euphemistic. It also implies that the speaker uses evasive expressions because of his awareness that the referent in question is a taboo.

The euphemistic words and expressions in *Sahîh Al-Bukhâri* are pointed out. To avoid redundancy in the analysis repeated euphemisms are discussed only in the first instance of their appearance in the Hadiths under investigation, except when the same expression is translated differently in more than one context. Euphemisms analyzed here belong to type three in Ullmann’s (1963, p.193-195) classification, i.e. those resulting from a sense of decency and propriety.

Euphemistic expressions are extracted and listed followed by their translations in Khan’s version. Before presenting the euphemism, an analysis of each Hadith is provided, based mainly on Ibn Hajar’s commentary as well as other resources so as to set the scene and to
help the reader contextualize the expression at hand. Then, the linguistic analysis is provided through reference to Arabic dictionaries such as Ibn Manzuur’s Lisan Al-'Arab and other dictionaries, such as Al-Jurjaani’s At-Ta’rifat, Az-Zamakhshari’s ‘Asaas al-Balaaghah, in case this linguistic meaning is not stated in the commentary on Hadith. The denotative meanings are then compared to their associative and euphemistic senses, with the purpose of identifying the joint connotation that connects the two meanings with special reference to the commentaries on Hadith. Moreover, the strategies used to achieve them are also identified.

The translation equivalents of euphemisms are then studied and analyzed to check the extent to which they are successfully or otherwise translated into English. To adjudicate the researcher’s final judgments and to avoid subjectivity in the final evaluation of these expressions, these euphemisms are presented in a questionnaire form to two Muslim native speakers of American English who know Arabic. Their task is to read these expressions and to point out whether they are equally euphemistic in English. The questionnaire contains all the Arabic euphemisms in the Hadith investigated (50) followed by their translations in order to reach final judgments concerning the effectiveness of the original and suggested translations of the items in the corpus.

Analysis

A. Euphemisms of licit relationship
Between man and woman
E.g. The book of An-Nikâh, (The Wedlock)

Hadith 5152, pp.66-67

عن أبي هريرة رضي الله عنه عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: لا يحل لامرأة تسأل طلاق أختها لتقترع صفحتها فإنها لما قد أن لها.

185
The Prophet said, “It is not lawful for a woman (at the time of the wedding) to ask for the divorce of her sister (i.e. the other wife of her would be husband) in order to have everything for herself for she will take only what has been foreordained (by Allāh) for her.”

Analysis

This hadith speaks about the case of a woman who asks a man to divorce his wife in order to marry her. However, instead of using the word divorce bluntly, the Prophet used a euphemistic expression. The verb is the present form of which is derived from the root and it means to turn the plate upside down in order to empty it and throw what is in it/spill what it contains. The word means ‘qas`ah mabsutah’, i.e. ‘plate’.

Euphemism

The euphemism here is in the form of a metaphor, in which the selfishness of a woman who asks a man to divorce his wife to gain all her pleasure of marriage for herself, is compared to a woman who turns her sister’s plate down to take the delicious food from that plate into her own plate. Thus, the happiness of marriage is compared to the delicious food in that plate; the resultant separation is compared to emptying the plate. The implicature that such woman is self-centered and egoistic is left for the listener to draw from the metaphor, instead of directly stating it. Such euphemism is employed in order to be didactic, yet in a less embarrassing way, as the Prophet gently attracts her attention to the negative results the other woman would suffer from by her getting divorced. In addition, the use of ‘Āchnitta ‘her sister’, instead of saying ‘another woman’, for instance, sensitizes her to the fact that that woman is either her sister in Islam or in humanity in the broad sense (vol.9, p. 274, Bab 53, Hadith 5152).
Hijaazi (p.96) argues that though a metaphor is used here, the final outcome/function of using this metaphor is a metonym for the case of a wife deprived of her husband by such a woman.

Assessment

The translation as it stands obliterates the euphemism. The translator uses a communicative translation in which he directly states the cause behind the woman’s asking divorce, yet he ignores the image completely. This has resulted in:

1. Dropping an important aspect of Hadith style, namely the use of figures of speech, which reduces its emotiveness.
2. Depriving the reader of visualizing the extreme selfishness of such woman through this image, which is supposed to sharpen the sense of guilt of this woman so as to realize her sin by so doing. This in consequence is expected to make her refrain from committing such sin.
3. It creates a misconception about the Prophet’s method of giving advice, which is usually done through using mild and lenient words, rather than rebuking and embarrassing the receiver.

Suggested translation

…to empty her plate (to take another woman’s husband).

E.g. 2  The Book of An-Nikâh (The Wedlock)
Hadith 5105, p. 41.

لاحرم عليه حتي يلزم بالرض : وقال أبو هريرة...

The marital relation to one’s wife does not become unlawful except if one has had sexual intercourse (with her mother).
Analysis

Ibn Hajar (vol. 9, p.197) cites this Hadith within the framework of the lawful and unlawful women for men to marry (Bab 25). In this Hadith, the ruling concerns the wife in case the husband has relations with her mother, which is not lawful in Islam. Therefore, the ruling says that a wife becomes unlawful to her husband only when he has sexual intercourse with her, i.e. the mother.

Euphemism

The expression ‘يَلْزِقَ بِالْأَرْضِ’ يُلْزِقَ بِالْأَرْضِ is a metonymy that is euphemistic for sexual intercourse (Ibn Manzur; al-Fayruuzabady p. 921). Ibn Hajar (vol.9, p. 197) reports Ibn It-Tiin’s opinion concerning the verb lazija. He says that the present form of this verb could begin with either fatḥa /a/ in which case it is intransitive, as in آَلَزَقْ بِعِرْهِ ‘alzaqa ba’irah, or with dammah /a/ in which case it is transitive, as in لَازِيَقَ بِهِ لُزْعُوقَانَ laziaqa bihi luzzuqan. He also reports that it is a metonym for jima‘ ‘sexual intercourse’. Thus, this expression is euphemistic as it results from a sense of propriety to avoid mentioning an embarrassing term, namely sexual intercourse, by using a metonym which makes the meaning more vague than the direct term. The metonym here is a kind of camouflage that hides the direct denotative referent.

Assessment

The translation misses the euphemism as it uses the direct denotative referent “sexual intercourse”, thus resulting in a misconception about the Companion Abu Hurayrah, as it presents him as one who does not abide by the propriety a Muslim is required to. It is not an accurate translation since it also flattens the expression and reproduces the sentence as if it were void of euphemism.

Suggested translation
‘Till he “sticks to the ground” (i.e. consummate the marriage)’.
This translation is polite and also indirect, and as such it retains the euphemism present in the original. Moreover, it retains the cultural input of the Arabic idiomatic expression in the translation, thus giving the target reader an insight into the Arabic culture that he should be familiar with as a member of the Muslim minority group in the West.

E.g. 3 The Book of Ghusl
Hadith 268, p.195
كان النبي يدور على نسائه في الساعة الواحدة من الليل والنهاور وهن إحدى عشرة قالت قلْت لأنس أو كان يقول قال كنت نتحدث أنه أعطي قوة ثلاثين.

The Prophet used to visit all his wives in a round, during the day and night and they were eleven in number.” I asked Anas, “Had the Prophet the strength for it?” Anas replied, “We used to say that the Prophet used to have the strength of thirty (men).

Analysis
This Hadith deals with having relations with one’s wife in the case of polygamy, which is implied from the context, specifically in the question “Had the Prophet the strength for it?” which reflects the speaker’s amazement (Ibn Hajar). It is further supported by the response of Anas above in which the Prophet’s sexual strength is pointed out to be equal to that of thirty men (Abd Enabi, p.36).

Euphemism
The metonymy يدور على نسائه yaduur `ala nisaa’ih is used as a euphemism for the Prophet’s having sexual intercourse with his wives.
Assessment
The translator failed to capture the meaning of the original completely as he missed the denotative meaning of the euphemism.

Suggested translation
…used to make the rounds (i.e. have sexual relations) with his wives

E.g. 4 The Book of An-Nikâh (The Wedlock)
Hadith 5065, p.20

"…Shall we marry you to a virgin who will make you remember your past days?"

Analysis
In this Hadith, there is an indirect reference to sexual intercourse, which is omitted by the speaker, here the Companion `Uthmaan (Ibn Hajar vol.9, p.135), as it is part of the shared knowledge by the speaker and the hearer. Ibn Hajar mentions that the omitted part cannot be easily identified though it encompasses the enjoyment, both the physical and spiritual, that a husband gets from marriage. Interpreters of Hadith mention three possible interpretations of the ellipsis in this Hadith:

1. It might be that `Uthmaan found `Abu `Abdul-Rahmaan’s outer appearance not good and so he attributed this to his need of a wife who cares for him.
2. May be a wife would remind him of his past youth and strength.
3. She might make him recall sexual relations with a wife, which is now missing.
Adopting the third interpretation, it is argued that this Hadith is making use of euphemism for sexual intercourse with one’s wife. This is achieved through using a vague term manifest in the relative pronoun ‘maa’, ‘that which’, which is a substitute for the ellipted part.

**Euphemism**

In Arabic, the pronoun ﴾maa﴿ meaning ‘that which’ is used as a camouflage for ‘sexual relation with one’s wife’ in this context. This vagueness leaves the door open to the addressee to think of all possible interpretations and denotations that he would imagine between husband and wife in the speaker’s memory.

**Assessment**

The translator has succeeded in reflecting the euphemism by using ﴾maa kunta ta’had﴿, which is an indirect reference to the past days in which he had the chance to enjoy sex with his wife.

**Suggested translation**

Since ambiguity is a strategy of achieving euphemism (Trinch 2001, p. 571), this translation would be more vague yet it is an allusion to the ellipsis that is retained in the speaker’s/hearer’s memories as part of their shared knowledge. Ambiguity is defined as a politeness strategy, manipulated by speakers to avoid loss of face, as well as to guard for themselves, a way out of a potentially offensive interpretation of an utterance (Lakoff 1974).

A more accurate translation though is suggested below:

“…who will remind you of what you were used to (i.e. your past relations with your wife.)”
The wife of Rifā`ah Al-Qurazi came to Allah’s Messenger (SAWWS) and said, “O Allah’s Messenger! Rifā`a divorced me irrevocably. After him I married `Abdur-Rahmaân bin Az-Zubair Al-Qurazi who proved to be impotent.” Allah’s Messenger (SAWWS) said to her, “Perhaps you want to return to Rifā`a? Nay (you cannot return to Rifā`a) until you enjoy the sexual relation (consummate your marriage) with Abdur-Rahmân and he with you”.

Analysis

In this hadith the woman was expressing an indirect complaint to the Prophet because her husband was impotent. However, she felt ashamed of bluntly mentioning this to the Prophet because this was a direct violation of the politeness norms of her society, as speaking of sex in the presence of men, especially in the Muslim community, is a taboo. It has to be noted that, in the commentary on this Hadith a man was present, and the Prophet’s wife `Aa’ishah too, which made it more embarrassing to the woman to express herself clearly in addressing such personal problem relating to her marital relationship with her husband. To save her face, she used a metonymy that expressed her problem with consummating the marriage with the new husband in a polite and indirect way.
Euphemism

The woman used a euphemism in the form of a simile. The word al-hudbah is a noun derived from hadb al `ain ‘eyelashes’. It could also mean that part or end of a piece of cloth or a garment that is not stitched or ragged (Ibn Manzuur, and Ibn Hajar 9, 465). So the woman compared the man’s organ to the ragged end of a garment in which the joint similarity between the two is being limp and loose, which are signs of his partial impotency. The use of euphemism here reflects the cultural norm and the sense of decorum in speaking about taboo when talking to the Prophet, even in asking for a Fatwa ‘a legal opinion’.

Assessment

The translator failed to reproduce the euphemism in the English version as he used the dysphemistic expression “impotent”. This resulted in:

1. Loss of the euphemism
2. Obliterating an important aspect of the culture of the Muslim community, namely the value of modesty, in spite of its significance as a social value in Muslim society.
3. Inaccurate denotative meaning, as the image the woman used implies partial impotency, and not total impotency.

Suggested translation

“He is as limp as the ragged edge of a garment, (i.e., he is partially impotent).

Though the translation sounds literal, it is preferred to that of Khan because the euphemism is conveyed to the English reader through a similar simile, which is as indirect as the original. In this way it is indirectly expressed, and it leaves the reader to draw the possible conclusion/implicature without breaking the politeness principle. In
addition, it gives the reader an insight into the cultural norms relating to male/female interaction in the time of the Prophet.

E.g. 6
In the same hadith, another euphemism is used in the Prophet’s answer to the woman’s question. He said:

“Perhaps you want to return to Rifā’a? Nay (you cannot return to Rifā’a) until you enjoy the sexual relation (consummate your marriage) with Abdur-Rahmān and he with you”.

Analysis
The word `usaylah is the diminutive form of `asalah, meaning little honey (Ibn Hajar, vol. 9, 639, An-Nawawi vol.10, p.3). Al-ʿAzhari (cited in Ibn Manzūr) also adds that `usaylah is used as a metonym for the sweetness of sexual intercourse, as the sweetest part of a woman is tasted through having intercourse with her.

Euphemism
So the Prophet used a euphemism expressed via a metaphor in which the marriage act is referred to as honey. Moreover, the verb “taste” is used by the Prophet to collocate with “honey” in order to help the addressee to imagine the pleasure of enjoying marriage, and he also made the word `usaylah have a taste. What is more, he repeated the sentence once with the pronoun reference for the man, and another with that for the woman, in order to stress the reciprocal relationship between husband and wife, and their equal share in enjoying the marital relationship. In this way, the Prophet answered the woman’s question, whether she could return to her ex-husband or not, yet without embarrassing her by mentioning the direct use of any sex term. For instance, he could have said, ‘no, until you have sex with your new husband’. His use of this image in fact allows for a degree
of vagueness and it envelops the sex act in a metaphor in which the meaning gamut of sexual activities from A to Z is wrapped up in the umbrella expression “taste honey”.

Assessment

Euphemism is obliterated and replaced by a blunt expression ‘enjoy sexual relation’. Compared to the Arabic, the original text uses a metaphor, which palliates indecency in order to uphold decorum. The translation as it is fails to reproduce this sense of decorum demonstrated in the Prophet’s euphemism. It also fails to shed light on the role of modesty in Muslim culture, which is implicitly taught to the Muslim community through the use of euphemism in talking about taboos.

Suggested translation

No, until you taste his honey, and he tastes yours (No, until you consummate your marriage).

E.g. 7 The book of Divorce
Hadith 5265, 124

َالمزوجة إلى شريكتي، وكلما كان يقربني إلا ظنناً واحداً لم يصل مني إلى شيء

…and (he) did not approach me except once during which he benefited nothing from me.

Euphemism

In this part of the Hadith, two euphemisms are used:
1. يقرب يقرب ‘come close/draw near’
2. هنّ هنّ once

8. Basically the verb yagrub means to come close or draw near. However, it is also used in Arabic as a metonym and a polite expression denoting the sexual act with one’s wife (Al-
Asbahaani 399; An-Nawawi vol.2, p.207; Ibn Kathiir p. 260 in his commentary on verse 222 Surah al-Baqarah). As Sha’baan (p.87) points out, this verb is removed from its main denotative meaning to acquire a euphemistic one to mean “To hold intercourse with one’s wife”. The joint connotation between the two meanings is represented in the fact that both husband and wife are ‘close’ and ‘near’ to each other during their private act. The same meaning of yaqrub is also cited as a euphemism for the marriage act by Hijazi (pp.74-75). However, he cites another Hadith

Hilâl Ibn ‘Umayyah is a weak old man who does not have a servant/helper, would you hate it if I serve him? The Prophet (ﷺ) said to her “But he should not approach/touch you”. (Translation mine)

Hijazi argues that, since coming close is a necessity for doing the sex act, this verb is utilized to refer to such act (p.75).

**Assessment**

The translator succeeded in reproducing the same euphemistic expression by using the word approach. Other possible suggestions are “draw near” (Ghaali, verse 222 al-Baqarah), and “go on unto them”(Khan and Hilâli, p.61, the same verse).

E.g. 8 Euphemism

. هنأ once

**Analysis**

The word ‘hana’ is used in Arabic as a metonym for things that one would feel embarrassed to mention (Ibn Hajar vol.9 p.463). Ibn Ittiin,
cited in Ibn Hajar on the same page, explains that this word is euphemistic for having intercourse as in Arabic *hana imra’atahu* means *ghashyiahah*, i.e., ‘had sexual intercourse with her’.

**Assessment**

The translation is equally euphemistic as the equivalent ‘once’ is rightly used. Moreover, the context is enough to help the reader figure out the intended euphemism.

**E.g. 9 The book of *An-Nikâh*, (The Wedlock)**

Hadith 5245, p.113

> "An the Prophet said, “If you enter (your town) at night (after coming from a journey), do not enter upon your family till the woman whose husband was absent (from the house) shaves her pubic hair and the woman with unkempt hair, comb her hair.”

Allah’s Messenger further said, “(O Jâbir!) Seek to have offspring, Seek to have offspring!”

**Analysis**

Ibn Hajar (vol.9, p. 424) explains that *al-kays* may be interpreted in two ways: either as urging men to have children, or a warning against refraining from having intercourse which is the way to have children (al-Khattabi, cited in Ibn Hajar, 9, p.422). Another interpretation is that *al-kays* means being mild and genteel in going unto one’s wife. Ibn al-‘A`raabi says that *al-kays* means prudence and reason, so it is as if the Prophet made seeking children a wise thing to do. Another explanation is that offered by Hibbaan in his *Sahih*, in which he mentions that *al-kays* means intercourse. Bukhâri’s
interpretation of this *al-kays* as seeking children is supported by `Iyaad who explains that *kaasa al-rajulu kaysan* means the man had received a child (cited in Ibn Haajar, p.425). The word *al-kays* in isolation means *al-`aql* ‘reason’, as al-Khattabi asserts, however, it is not the meaning intended here, but it is rather prudence in seeking to have children that is intended.

Ibn Manzuur states that in this Hadith this word refers to the sexual intercourse, as the Prophet asks men to have intercourse with the purpose of seeking to have children. He thus means that seeking offspring is a wise thing to do, which is *al-kays*, as he equated having children with wisdom and prudence.

The word *al-kays* is a case of *majaaz mursal*, i.e. ‘synecdoche’, in which the relationship between words is that between the cause and result: the result of the intercourse (children) is used instead of the cause (the intercourse). This rhetorical device is used in the Hadith for achieving euphemism in order to avoid mentioning the more embarrassing word or the taboo word ‘intercourse’.

**Assessment**

The translator succeeded in reproducing the euphemism. However, the cultural input is lost though the translated expression reflects the euphemism. It is not the exact equivalent to *al-kays* in which the rationale in the Arabic version behind having children or proliferation, namely prudence, is not conveyed in the TL, simply because he did not produce a link between prudence and seeking children. The value of modesty is on its way towards becoming obsolete. In this example, we are not actually translating the sentence, but we are translating beyond the sentence. In other words, the value of modesty is taught through the euphemism that is demonstrated in the Hadith. Missing the euphemism gives a misconception about the spirit and the ethics of Islam.
Suggested translation

The only way to reproduce this euphemism and the rationale behind it would be by introducing the phrase between brackets:

Prudence! Prudence! (Seek to beget children)

This translation is as vague as the original, and as mentioned earlier, vagueness is a strategy of achieving euphemism. However, to make the reader able to grasp the missing link between prudence and having children, a footnote in which a short account of this Hadith and of the significance of proliferation in Islam is mandatory.

E.g. 10 The Book of An-Nikâh (The Wedlock)
Hadith 5207, p. 97


cان نعزل علي عهد النبي

We used to practice coitus interruptus during the time of Allah’s Messenger.

Analysis

Ibn Hajar (vol. 9, p. 379) explains al-`azl as pulling out after the marriage act, in order not to let the semen enter into the uterus. Al-Jurjaani in his book At-Ta’rifaat (p.86) defines al-`azl as letting the semen out of the woman (’s vagina) list she should get pregnant. This also finds support in Arabic dictionaries. For instance, Al-Fayruzabaady (p.1031), points out that the word نعزل is the verb of the noun al`zl , which means not wanting to have a child from one’s wife, or as Ibn Manzuur and Muslim (10, p. 9) explain, man’s keeping his semen away from his wife’s vagina during sex in order to avoid her becoming pregnant. It is also defined as pulling out of the vagina when man feels he is about to ejaculate (al-Qaradaawi ,19? P.184).
Euphemism
The Arabic verb is a polite expression that refers to this type of practice as it denotes a taboo. Therefore, ellipsis of the complement of the verb ya`zil, namely “the semen out of the woman’s uterus”, could be the device used to refer to this phenomenon.

Assessment
The translator used coitus interruptus, which is relatively polite since using the Latin term, a foreign term, is a strategy of using euphemism and avoiding taboos (Warren 1992).

Suggested translation
However, the translation is partly euphemistic, since not everyone understands Latin. A clearer rendering to modern readers would be as follows:
We used to pull out (from our wives) …
Or
We used to withdraw (from our wives)...

E.g. 1 The book of An-Nikâh, (The Wedlock)
Hadith 5191, p.85
The Prophet ﷺ kept away from his wives...

Analysis
The verb ‘i`tazala means leave aside. It could be transitive as in this Hadith ‘اعزل نساءه, ‘kept away from his wives’, or intransitive as when followed by the prepositional phrase ‘اعنها’ anhaa it means does not want to have a child from her (Ibn Manzuur). The man from the ‘Anṣaar used the verb ‘i`tazala in this Hadith to avoid mentioning the taboo, particularly that he was speaking to him in the presence of others. Keeping away from something does not necessarily have to do with sex; it can apply also to breaking the relationship with them in
other ways. However, because it is followed by ‘his wives’, it implies that keeping away from them includes also not having sex with them. This is supported by Ibn Hajar (vol.9, p.360) who asserts this meaning by mentioning that the Prophet had said somewhere else that “he will not go unto his wives for a month.”

**Euphemism**

The verb اعتزل is used to euphemize the Prophet’s keeping away from having sex with his wife:

اعتزل النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم نساءه

The Prophet kept away from (having sex with) his wives.

**Assessment**

The translator succeeded in producing an equivalent euphemism in English as the translation implies the same meaning of not having sex with them.

E.g.211 The Book of An-Nikâh, (The Wedlock) Hadith 5077, p.26

يا رسول الله آرآيت لو تزنت وادبا وفيه شجرة قد أكل منها و شجرة لم يأكل منها في أيها كنت ترعى

؟نبرك

O Allah’s Messenger! Suppose you landed in a valley where there is a tree of which something has been eaten and then you found trees of which nothing has been eaten, of which tree would you let your camel graze?

**Analysis**

In this Hadith, the tree of which something has been eaten is euphemistic for a woman who was previously married, known in Arabic as thayyib, that is, not a virgin, whereas the other tree is
euphemistic for a woman who is a virgin, known in Arabic as bikr. The euphemism here is expressed through a number of metaphors in which a woman is compared to a tree, and eating from the tree stands for the previous marriage of that woman, as both share the similitude that somebody has enjoyed each before. In the case of a previously married woman, it alludes to man’s enjoying sex with her previously, whereas in the case of the tree, somebody has enjoyed eating from its fruit. ‘Aa’ishah, the Prophet’s wife, was alluding to the fact that she was the only virgin the Prophet married and so she is proud of this fact. It could be also that she is alluding to the Prophet’s love for her. Other possible connotations and implications of marrying a virgin are also left for the reader to perceive (Ibn Hajar vol.10, p.152).

**Euphemisms**

The euphemisms here are achieved through a number of metaphors:

1. ‘The camel’ refers to man’s organ or masculinity, or ex-husband.
2. ‘Grazing’ stands for the marriage act
3. ‘Has eaten’ refers to having been previously married, or the previous marriage act itself.
4. ‘The tree’ stands for a woman.
5. All these metaphors are used to compare the status of a virgin versus a previously married woman or a matron through the figures of speech to avoid mentioning the embarrassing direct terms themselves, as these are sensitive issues.

**Assessment**

The translator succeeded in reproducing the equivalent euphemisms by using the same elements of the tree image and (not) eating from it.
E.g.13 Hadith 5242 (p.112)

Narrated Abu Hurairah: (The Prophet) Sulaiman (Solomon), son of (the Prophet) Dâwud (David) said, “Tonight I will go round (i.e. have sexual relations with) one hundred women (my wives), everyone of whom will give birth to a male child who will fight in Allah’s Cause.” Then that an angel said to him, “Say: ‘If Allah will.’ But Sulaiman (Solomon) did not say it and forgot to say it. Then he had sexual relations with them but none of them gave birth to any child except one who gave birth to a half person.

Euphemism

The Arabic phrasal verb طاف ب taafa bi in the sentence طاف ب امرأة taafa bi mi’at imra’atin is euphemistic for the marriage act with one’s wives by way of metonymy (Ibn Hajar vol.9, 420; `Abd Ennabi p. ; Hijaaazi p.74). The verb طاف taafa can also be followed by the preposition علی `ala, as in Hadith 5215, p. 392. This phrasal verb is used only when a man has more than one wife. (This is not acceptable in Islam unless all the wives agree or on man’s arrival after a long travel, Ibn Hajar, 9, p.421).

Assessment

The euphemistic expression is translated as “I will go round (i.e. have sexual relations with)” in the first instance, and as “had sexual relations with them” in the second. Thus, the euphemism is retained in the first, and followed by its direct meaning in parentheses, yet it is lost in the second. This sounds paradoxical, unless Khan, the
translator, relied on the fact that it is understood on its first occurrence.

E.g. 14 The Book of An-Nikâh, (The Wedlock)
Hadith 5165, p.72-73
قال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم: “أما لو أن أحدكم يقول حين يأتي أهله: بسم الله …

The Prophet said, “If anyone of you, when having sexual intercourse with his wife, says: Bismillâh…

The verb ‘ata literally ‘to come’ is here a transitive verb as it is followed by ‘ahlah, i.e., one’s wife (Ibn Manzuur vol.1, p.21). It is euphemistic for the marriage act with one’s wife (Ibn Hajar vol.9, p.284; Al-Karmaani 2.p. 183, cited in Hijaazi 1986, p.65). Hijaazi clarifies that, the general meaning of this verb is ‘to come’, and of the noun ‘ahl is ‘family’. However, in this metonymy, the meaning is particularized by being restricted in the first to ‘coming’ in the sense of approaching, and in the second to ‘one’s wife’, which together refer to having sexual intercourse with one’s wife. This becomes clear in the context of Hadith in which the couple ‘may get a child’. This is because, as Hijaazi further explains, metonymy is used to avoid that which is abominable or embarrassing, regardless of the original meaning assigned by the word and its denotative reference in reality.

Euphemism

The euphemism for sexual intercourse is achieved in the Arabic version by the indirect metonymy ‘ataa ‘ahlah. However, the translation uses the direct expression.

Assessment

The euphemism is lost, and the more blunt and face threatening expression “sexual intercourse” is used instead. As such it fails to reproduce the euphemistic force of the original.
Suggested translation

‘Come up to one’s wife’, or ‘go in unto one’s wife’.

These expressions are euphemistic for the marriage act as they camouflage the direct physical contact, which is a taboo. These translation equivalents are favoured by many translators of the Qur’an, Ghâli (1997), Khan and Hilâli (1996) e.g. al-Baqarah, 222 (cf. Sha’baan 2000)

E.g. 15 The book of An-Nikâh, (The Wedlock Hadith 5158, 69

عن هشام بن عروة، عن عروة: "نزوج النبي صلی الله عليه وسلم عائشة وهي بنت ست سنين

وربي بها وهي بنت تسع;

Narrated ’Urwa: The Prophet wrote the (marriage contract) with ’Âisha while she was six years old and consummated his marriage with her while she was nine years old…”

Analysis

The verb bana is derived from al-binaa’ which means ‘ad-dukhuul bil zawjah, i.e., consummating the marriage with himself. (Ibn Hajar , vol. 9, p.254). The intransitive verb bana followed by the prepositional phrase biha is used as a polite expression to refer to the marriage act, expressed in Arabic by the word ‘dukhuul’. Az-Zamakhshari explains that “bana `ala `ahlihi” is figurative and it means dakhala `alayha, i.e., consummated the marriage with her. He explains that it comes from the Arabic “kana yabni `ala `ahlihi khuba’an”, ‘when he wanted to consummate his marriage, the bridegroom used to build a tent as a shelter to cover his wife so as not to allow others to see her or both of them’.
Euphemism
The expression بَنَّا بِّئْلُ (‘ahlihi) is euphemistic for the more blunt Arabic jimaa`, ‘having intercourse’.

Assessment
The translator succeeded in reproducing an equally euphemistic expression “consummated his marriage with her”.

E.g. 16& 17 The book of An-Nikāh, (The Wedlock) Chapter 26, p.42
باب (٢٦) "وربائكم لاتي في حجوركم من نسائكم الثلاثي دخلتم بين النساء وقال ابن عباس:"

الدخول والمسيس واللاس هو الجامع...

(26) Chapter. (The Statement of Allâh:)… your step-daughters under your guardianship, born of your wives, to whom you have gone in (consummated your marriage)… (V.4.23)
And Ibn `Abbâs said (regarding the verse) that the words ‘Dukhûl’, ‘Masîs’, and ‘Limâs’ all means the sexual intercourse.

Euphemism
In this Hadith, the verb دَخَّلَا dakhala is intransitive here, as it is followed by the prepositional phrase وَبِنَى and it is used to refer to ‘consummating the marriage’. This is supported by Ibn Hajar (Hadith 5106, p. 197-8). "

Assessment
In this Hadith there is a case of dysphemism, in the term dukhuul, followed by its euphemism. The translator was able to retain both euphemisms equally at the same level of the original, by using “have gone in”, followed by “consummate” in parentheses in order to ascertain that the foreign reader will receive the intended meaning,
since the term might be foreign and unfamiliar to him. It has to be noted that the expression appears in the Qur’an and Hadith, therefore it is not excluded in the study. Moreover, Khan and Hilâli are the translators of this version of the Qur’an (1997).

E.g. 18 The book of An-Nikâh, (The Wedlock)
Hadith 5127, p. 53.

...that there were four types of marriage during the Pre-Islamic period of Ignorance. ...The second type was that a man would say to his wife after she had become clean from her period, “Send for so-and-so and have sexual relations with him.” Her husband would then keep away from her and would never sleep with her till she got pregnant from the other man with whom she was sleeping. When her pregnancy became evident, her husband would sleep with her if he wished. Her husband did so (i.e., let his wife sleep with some other man) so that he might have a child of noble breed. Such marriage was called Al-Istibdâ’.

Analysis

The Hadith speaks about the various types of marriage in the Pre-Islamic period. In this Hadith, there are four instances of euphemism:

فاستبضعي منه، ويعترضها زوجها ولا يمسها زوجها

The first is فاستبضعي منه، translated as “have sexual relations with him”. This verb means, اطلبي منه اجسامي, i.e., ask him to have sex with you (so that you become pregnant). It comes from al-mubaada’ah derived from al-bud’, which could stand for either the sexual intercourse (Ibn Manzur), or al-farj, i.e., (woman’s) ‘private part’ (Ibn Hajar 9, p.231). (This is supported by Hadith (5157, p.68) which says...
Euphemism

The verb استَضَعَى is euphemistic for having intercourse with the purpose of getting a child. It is translated as “have sexual relations with”. (It has to be noted that this marriage is typical of the Pre-Islamic period and is considered a type of adultery in Islam).

Assessment

The euphemism is obliterated as the direct taboo “sexual intercourse” is used.

The second instance is يعِترَز which means ‘should not sleep with’, a euphemism for the act of avoiding intercourse with one’s wife (See Hadith al-`azl above). Ibn Manzuur tells us that the verb could refer either to avoid having relation with one’s wife, or to avoid having children from her by pulling out so as to avoid her becoming pregnant.

Assessment

The translator succeeded to reproduce the euphemism as he used the equivalent “Her husband would then keep away from her”.

E.g. 19 The third euphemism:

…would never sleep with her.
The verb *yamass* means ‘to touch’ and it refers here to the private physical contact with one’s wife (Az-Zamakhshari al-Kashshaf, vol. 1, p. 284). The verb is also explained as to touch or “pass a hand on a thing without having any thing in between” (An-Nadawi, 1983, p.626, cited in Sha’baan 2000). It is another euphemism for the sexual act. It appears in other Hadiths and in the Qur’an with the same meaning (e.g. al-Baqarah, 236). It is usually translated as “touch” (Ghâli; Khan and Hilali 1996).

**Assessment**

Though the translation is euphemistic, it is less indirect than the Arabic term.

**Suggested translation:**

“…and would never touch her (i.e., he would not have relations with her (until she gives birth)”.

Still in another Hadith, the verb *yamass* is also used in the same sense:

**E.g. 20 The Book of Divorce**

Hadith 5251, p.117

... وإن شاء طلق قبل أن يمس ، فتلتعدة التي أمر الله أن يطلق لها النساء

…*and if he wishes to divorce her he can divorce her before having sexual intercourse with her; and that is the ‘Idda (prescribed period) which Allâh has fixed for the women meant to be divorced.”*

**Euphemism**

In this Hadith, the euphemism lies in the use of the verb *yamass* as a polite verb that refers to sexual intercourse. As Az-Zamakhshari (vol. 1, p.284), cited in Shabana (2000, p.98), explains, it means to come into a private contact with one’s wife. It is translated as “having sexual intercourse”.

209
Assessment
The euphemism is obliterated through using the taboo “sexual intercourse”. It might be that the translator avoided the euphemistic expression so as to avoid any misunderstanding concerning the juristic ruling of divorce. However, he could have used the euphemism followed by the direct meaning between parentheses.

Suggested translation:
“…before sleeping with her.”

The same verb yamass is used in the following Hadith:

E.g.21 The Book of Divorce
Chapter 37, p.157:
If a person divorces his wife thrice and she marries another man after the completion of her `Idda but her second husband does not consummate his marriage with her.

In this Hadith the verb yamass is marked as it refers to the consummation of marriage rather than the usual marital relationship. However, the translator was able to distinguish between the two meanings as he used the correct equivalent. This meaning is implied from the context as the verb is preceded by the negative particle lam ‘not’. As such, the context shows that the marriage is only a marriage contract, and it is not consummated yet. The accurate translation is important here as it results in an Islamic ruling that varies according to whether or not the marriage is consummated.

Assessment
The translation is equally euphemistic and it captures the meaning and form of the original.
E.g. 22 The fourth euphemism

, her husband would sleep with her if he wished

The verb أصاباً'asaaba comes from the Arabic root s w b, which is the opposite of error. ‘asaaba means he said or did that which is right or hit the target (cf. Ibn Manzuur; al-Mu’jam al-Wasiit p.546). In Hadith in general, the verb ‘asaaba and the noun ‘isaabah are always used as a metonymy referring to man’s achieving his goal from his wife, i.e., having sexual intercourse with her. Some expressions that appear in Hadith using this verb include ‘asaaba ‘ahlah and ‘asaaba jaariyatah. (cf. Sunan ‘Abi Daawuud, Hadith 2394, an Al-Hindi, Hadith 4668).

Assessment

The translator successfully reproduced the equivalent euphemism in the English language, ‘sleep with her’.

The same verb appears in Hadith 7367, yet with a different translation.

E.g. 23 The Book of Holding Fast to the Qur’an and the Sunnah

Hadith vol.9 7367, p.280

Finish your ‘Ihām and go to your wives [i.e., now sexual relationship with your wives is legal (allowed)].

Analysis

In this Hadith Ibn Hajar explains that this is a permission for men to have intercourse with their wives which indicates that it is the sign for terminating ‘Ihraam in Hajj and `Umrah (vol.13 p. 337)
Euphemism

'asibuu is euphemistic for having relations with one’s wife, and it is translated as ‘go to your wives’.

Assessment

Though a different equivalent go to your wives is used, it is still a successful rendering since it is euphemistic as well. Moreover, Khan supplemented this equivalent with the direct meaning in English in parentheses so as to avoid any misunderstanding.

E.g. 24 The Book of As-Sawm (Fast), Hadith 1935p.100, vol. 3

“...I had sexual intercourse with my wife in Ramadān [while I was observing Sawm (fast)].”

Euphemism

The verb ‘asaba is transitive here as it is followed by the object ‘ahl+ possessive pronoun /ii/ ‘my wife’. As mentioned earlier, this verb is used as a euphemism for having sexual intercourse with one’s wife.

Assessment

Although the translator succeeded in the earlier examples in which the same verb was used, he failed to achieve the euphemism here, as he used the expression “sexual intercourse” instead in spite of the fact that he previously used the equivalent euphemistic expression above. A possible explanation is that when it comes to serious legal opinions Fatwa and juristic rulings, the Prophet dispenses with euphemism in favour of direct expression. This is mainly to avoid misunderstanding
of such ruling, especially that it touches upon one of the main pillars of Islam which is fasting in Ramadaan. At any rate, the euphemism is obliterated.

**Suggested translation**
*I slept /had relations with my wife in Ramadaan.*

**E.g. 25 The Book of Divorce**
**Hadith 5268, p.126**

Allâh’s Messenger was fond of honey and sweet edible things and (it was his habit) that after finishing the `Asr prayer he would visit his wives and stay with one of them at that time.

**Analysis**
Ibn Hajar explains that *dakhala `ala nisaa’ihi* here means went to them, so it is not used the usual sense of *dukhuul* in Hadith, namely having intercourse. In contrast, the verb *yadnuu* refers to kissing, touching or other kinds of fondling preceding intercourse, which is known as foreplay, but not intercourse per se. (Ibn Hajar vol. 9, p.470, Hadith 5216, p.393); Muslim (10, p. 77).

**Euphemism**
The verb *yadnuu*, literally ‘come close or approach’ is used as a euphemism for foreplay preceding intercourse. It is more decent than mentioning other verbs, such as kissing or the like.

**Assessment**
The translator used “stay with one of them” which actually misses the euphemism completely.
Suggested translation
…and comes close to one of them (as a way of fondling her)

In the same Hadith the same verb is repeated with Sawda as follows:

The Prophet \(\text{sall}^\text{a}\) will \textit{approach} you, and when he \textit{comes near you}, say: “Have you taken Maghāfīr (a bad-smelling gum)/packages)?

**Euphemism**
The verb \textit{yadnuu} is translated here as “approach” in the first instance, and “come near” in the second.

**Assessment**
The first ‘approach’ is rightly translated as it is a euphemism for the foreplay. As for the second, it is as euphemistic as the Arabic one, since it carries implicatures of literally coming close to one’s wife.

E.g. 26 The book of \textit{An-Nikāh}, (The Wedlock)

(104) Chapter. If a man \textit{goes to all his wives (have sexual relations with them)}

\(\text{Hadith 5216, p. 100}\)

Whenever Allāh’s Messenger finished `Asr prayer, he would \textit{enter upon his wives} and stay with one of them.

**Euphemism**

In this hadith, the same verb \textit{yadnuu} is used here as a euphemism for foreplay too, yet it is translated differently: it was translated earlier as “come close”, but here it is translated as “enter upon his wives”.

214
Analysis

Muslim adds that it is permissible to enter the other wives’ houses for a certain need or for emergency (vol. 10 p.77), but not to have sexual relations in the other women’s houses, except with the wife whose turn is due. Moreover, the title of the chapter itself also mistranslates dukhual as (have sexual relations), although the commentary on the Hadith clearly states that it does not refer to the marriage act, but to merely entering the house of the wives and visiting them. This is even further supported by Ibn Abi Az-Zinaad’s addition in this Hadith of the phrase “bighayr wigaa”’, i.e., without having sexual relations” (Ibn Hajar vol.9, p.393). As such, the translator should always check the meaning of words in context through reading the commentary on the Hadith.

Assessment

This translation is not correct since Ibn Hajar (vol.9, p.393) and Muslim (vol.10, p. 77) assert that yadmnuu excludes sexual intercourse.

Suggested translation

…he would visit his wives and come close to one of them (without having relations with her).

E.g. 27 The Book of the Stories of the Prophets
Hadith 3329, p.328.

"As for the resemblance of the child to its parents: If a man has sexual intercourse with his wife and gets discharge first, the child will resemble his father, and if the woman gets discharge first, the child will resemble her.”
Analysis
The verb ghashiya has the masdar ‘participle’ ghishyaan i.e., enveloping or covering, and hence it is used a metonymy for having sexual intercourse with a woman as can be understood from the Qur’an (Al-‘A`raaf 189) (Ibn Kathiir vol.2, p.274; Ibn Manzuur 6:2362). Sha`baan (p.106) and Hijaazi (p.74) also mention that this verb means to envelop something or someone, e.g. ghashiyahu an-nu`as ‘He fell asleep’ (Al-Mu`jam Al-Wasiit vol.2 p 660). Az-Zamakhshari who cites another example ‘ala `absaarihimghishaawah “and on their eyes there is a covering” Khan and Hilâli 1996” (vol.2, p.165). They explain that this is a euphemism for “went into contact with his wife” as both husband and wife represent a cover and a shelter for each other, not only during their physical contact but also in their daily life. This meaning is implied in the verb taghashha.

Assessment
The euphemism is lost as it is translated as “has sexual intercourse”.

Suggested translation:
“When the man envelops his wife (i.e. have relations with her) and his water precedes hers, the child will resemble him, and if her water precedes his, the child will resemble her”.

E.g. 28 The Book of Provisions (Outlay)
Hadith 5368, p.183

I had sexual intercourse with my wife while fasting (in the month of Ramadân).

Analysis
The verb waqa`a may be intransitive as when followed by the preposition `ala in the expression, "waq`a `ala `ahlih or
transitive when followed by the direct object as in \textit{waqa`a imra`atah} to refer to having intercourse with one’s wife (Ibn Manzuur). Al-`Asbahaani (p.530) also states that the words \textit{wiga`a} and \textit{muwaaqa`ah} are used as metonyms for having sexual intercourse. Ibn Hajar (vol. 4, p.165) explains that this expression is used to mean ‘I have broken my fast because I have had sex with my wife’. In addition, it is euphemistic as it is included under the subtitle of the chapter in Bukhâri “باب إذا جامع أهله في رمضان”, Chapter on if man has intercourse with his wife in Ramadân”, which supports the view that \textit{waqa`a} is a euphemism.

**Euphemism**

\textit{I had sexual intercourse with my wife}

**Assessment**

The euphemism is obliterated as the direct taboo expression “sexual intercourse” is used instead.

**Suggested translation**

I had relations with my wife in Ramadaan.

**E.g. 29 The book of \textit{An-Nikáh}, (The Wedlock)**

Hadith 5193, p. 90

\textit{فَإِنَّ النَّبيَّ صلِي الله عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَمَ قَالَ: إِذَا دَعَى النَّاِرِ امِرْتُهُ إِلَيْهِ فَشَفَتُهُمُ الْمُلَائِكَةُ أَنَّى لَعْبَتُمُ اللَّهَ يَا بُرَاءَةُ مَا ذَكَرْتُونَ}

The Prophet said, “If a man invites his wife to sleep with him and she refuses to come to him then the angels send their curses on her till morning.”

**Analysis**

The Arabic root \textit{f-r-sh} denotes \textit{al-bast wal-madd}, i.e. spreading and hence the word \textit{firaash ‘bed}’ is derived from it. The word \textit{furush},
plural of firaash is also used to denote women by way of metonymy. Ibn Manzuur also clarifies that the plural furush in the Qu’anic verse و قر ش مرفو عة "furushun marfu`ah" (al-Waqi‘ah 56: 34 “couches or thrones raised high” Khan and Hilâli, ), refers to the women of Paradise. He also adds that a wife is referred to as firaash, ‘izaar and lih. i.e.,’ the husband’s bed sheet, garment, and quilt’. Al-Asfahaani (1992, p.629) also states the same opinion, yet he adds that the word firaash is used to refer to each of the husband and the wife. More interestingly, Ibn Manzuur points out that a man who is married to noble women is referred to as “ karîm al-mafaarish”.

A such, it becomes clear that the Arabic word ‘al-firâş’ is a euphemism for ‘sexual relation’ as Ibn Hajar explains that "الظاهر أن الفراش كتابة عن الجماع وبقيه قوله "الأولد لنفراش" أي لن يطأ في الفراش ، والكتابة عن الأشياء التي يستحبها منها كثيرة في القرآن والسنة (365)

The word al-firaash ‘the bed’ is a metonymy for sexual intercourse, which is supported by (the Prophet’s) saying “al-walad lil-firaash ‘the child belongs to the bed’, i.e., to the owner of the bed. Metonymy for things that one avoids to mention because one may feel or modest /embarrassed to mention is very frequent in the Qur’an and the Sunnah. (Translation mine).

**Euphemism**

"... a man invites his wife to sleep with him"
The sentence is euphemistic for sexual intercourse.

**Assessment**
The translator succeeded in partially retaining the euphemism. However, it is less euphemistic than the Arabic word firaash.
Suggested translation
…a man invites his wife to bed (to have sex with her).

E.g. 30 The book of An-Nikâh, (The Wedlock)
Hadith 5194, p. 90
قال النبي ﷺ "إذا باتت المرأة مهاجرة فراش زوجها لعنها الملائكة حتي ترجع"

The Prophet said, “If a woman spends the night deserting her husband’s bed (does not sleep with him), then the angels send their curses on her till she comes back (to her husband).”

Euphemism
The euphemism here is both in the word ‘muhaajirah’ which is translated as “deserting”, and firâash, which refers to the marital relationship, is translated as “husband’s bed”. In other words, she abstains from sleeping with her husband.

Assessment
The translator produced an equally euphemistic expression by using “her husband’s bed” followed by the explanatory note between parenthesis in order to avoid any misunderstanding or loss of the euphemism. However, the verb “desert” might be misunderstood as refusing to sleep with him forever. Therefore, another translation is suggested below to avoid such misunderstanding.

Suggested translation
…refusing her husband’s bed…(refusing to have relations with him)

E.g. 31 The book of An-Nikâh, (The Wedlock)
(93) Chapter, p.94
باب هجر النبي نساءه قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم "ولا تهجر إلا في البيت...
The decision of the Prophet not to share the beds with his wives and to stay away from their houses. Mu`awiyah bin Haida said that the Prophet said, “When you desert your wife (abstain from sleeping with her) you should stay (with her) at home.”

Euphemism

In this Hadith, the verb *yahjur* means to abstain from having sex with his wife (Ibn Hajar, p.374).

Assessment

The verb *yahjur* is translated as ‘desert’, which is not suitable in this context as it means to leave forever or leave completely. Therefore, the euphemism is not accurately translated. It is only through the paraphrase of this euphemism in parentheses that the euphemism could be perceived.

Suggested translation

When you refuse to share (your wife’s) bed…(i.e. refusing to have relations with your wife)

E.g.32&33 Hadith 5052, p.455 (The Book of the Virtues of the Qur’an)

قال أتكحلي أي امرأة ذات حسب فكان يتعاهد كنه فيما أها عن يلها فتقول نعم الرجل من رجل لم يبيتا لنا فراشا ولم يفتئتنا لنا كنفا منذ أن ناه

“My father got me married to a lady of a noble family, and often used to ask my wife about me, and she used to reply, “What a wonderful man he is! He never comes to my bed, nor has he approached me since he married me.”

220
Analysis

Ibn Hajar explains this expression لَمْ يُطَأْ لَنَا فَرَاشًا “lam yata’ lana firaashan” as ‘has not slept with me’. As for لَمْ يُفَتْشِفْ لَنَا كَانَفا لَمْ يَدْعِي ‘lam yufattish lanaa kanafa’ the word al-kanaf means the sitr, i.e. ‘the covered aspects’, that is, it is a synonymous euphemism for not having intercourse with her. Ibn Hajar clarifies that it was the habit of husbands (in the Arab culture) to interfere with the wives’ personal affairs referred to here as kanaf ‘covered aspects’ (vol. 9, p.120). As such, this second euphemism is culturally loaded.

Assessment

Both translations of the two euphemisms are successfully reproduced in the English version. However, in the second, the cultural element is lost since the literal rendering would not make sense in the English version.

E.g. 34 The Book of Divorce (p.170)

(52) Chapter (What is said regarding) the Mahr of the lady whose husband entered upon her to consummate the marriage. And does, just entering upon one’s bride, and staying with her in seclusion mean the same as the consummation of marriage. And (what) if a man divorced his wife before entering upon her and before consummating his marriage with her.

Euphemism

The words dukhuul and masiis are used as euphemisms for intercourse. They are translated as “before entering upon her” and “before consummating his marriage with her”.

(See above).
Assessment

The translations are equally euphemistic. However, the direct meaning “to have relations with her” should be included in parentheses.

E.g. 35 & 36 The Book of WuDû’
Hadith 180, vol. 1 p.156.

... فقال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم: "إذن أDispatchك فقلناك " فقال نعم، فقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: "إذا أعجلت أو أفتحت عليك الوزوء."

The Prophet said, “If you are forced to hurry up (during intercourse) or you do not discharge then you should perform ablution. (This was cancelled later on l, i.e., one has to take a bath.)”

Analysis

The verb ‘عجل ‘ُجَل’ is the passive form of the verb ‘들 ‘اِجْل’ ‘hurry up’. However, in this context, it is used together with the verb ‘عَحَت ‘عَحْت’ to refer specifically to hurrying up as the cause of interrupting man during the sex act, and as a result he does not ejaculate. As for the verb ‘عَحَت ‘عَحْت’ , it is the passive form of the verb ‘اَحَت ‘اَحْت’ as in the sentence: ‘اَحَت ار-رجل’, which means ‘he approaches his wife, yet he does not ejaculate/ or without semen coming out’. Thus, the difference between the two verbs is that though both refer to the marriage act without ejaculating, the first is because of a specific reason like being hurried up by a call or the like, whereas the second refers to not ejaculating for any general reason. The verb is originally used in the context of absence of rain as in the sentence “اَحَت ان-نااس, ‘people have no rain’, and then it became used as a metaphor that is borrowed in the context of marital relationship in case man
does not ejaculate (Ibn Hajar vo.1, p.284), which is a case of semantic expansion (cf. Ullmann 196?above).

**Euphemism**

The first euphemism is in the sentence includes ellipsis “‘hurried up (to end your intercourse before ejaculating)” (An-Nawawi Hadith 343). As such, the euphemism for this meaning is expressed through ellipting the embarrassing words, namely, ejaculating, and sexual intercourse. This euphemism is translated as “to hurry up (during intercourse). The second is in the verb ‘uḫita translated as “you do not discharge then you should perform ablution”.

**Assessment**

The euphemism in the verb ‘uḫila is retained, yet the ellipsis is restored in the parentheses for communicative purposes, as this is the only strategy at the translator’s disposal to guarantee the target reader’s correct understanding of this part. As for the second verb, it was used in the Arabic by way of a rhetorical device, namely the metaphor explained above. However, the translator had to sacrifice the form and the euphemism for the sake of retaining/communicating the content and the juristic ruling in the Hadith, which are in fact here more important than the form. So, although it is a case of translation loss, the translator is excused for that because content should not be sacrificed for form as far as criteria for evaluating translation are concerned.

E.g. 37 Hadith 4942, vol.6. p.392

“...It is not wise for anyone of you to lash his wife like a slave, for he might sleep with her the same evening.”
Analysis

The verb ضائع daaja’a in Arabic means to sleep or lie down on the floor, or to lie one’s right side on the floor and it is used as a metonymy for having intercourse (Az-Zabiidi vol.5, p. 438). Ibn Manzuur also provides the same meaning. He also reports al-‘Azhari’s (p.219) words “‘the verb daaja’a is used with a man and his wife/slave girl, and it means he sleeps with her in the same bed’.

Euphemism

…sleep with her

Assessment

The translator succeeded in reproducing the equivalent euphemistic expression in English “sleep with her”.

E.g. 38 The Book of al-‘Adab
Hadith 6042, vol. 9 p.48

"’يم يضرب أحدكم امرأته ضرب الفحل ثم لعه بعناقها’"

“How does anyone of you beat his wife as he beats the stallion camel and then he may embrace (sleep with) her?”

Analysis

The Hadith prohibits beating women as it makes them hate or avoid the one who beats them, here the husband or master (Ibn Hajar 9, p. 303), as this makes the woman hate to have the marital relationship with such man.
Euphemism

The verb *yu’aaniq* means to ‘have sexual intercourse with his wife/or slave-girl’ (Ibn Hajar vol.9, p. 303). So the Prophet used this word *‘inaaq* as a metonym for sexual intercourse:

“…embrace (sleep with) her?”

Assessment

The translator was able to reproduce the euphemistic force of the original by using the literal equivalent, or the *foreignized* equivalent verb ‘embrace’, followed by its direct meaning in order to avoid misunderstanding.

E.g. 39 The Book of Coercion


“A governmental male-slave tried to seduce a slave-girl from the Khumus of the war booty till he deflowered her by force against her will;…

Analysis

The verb *fadda* means break or open and it is used in Arabic in the expression *‘fadda al-khaatam’* to mean deflower a virgin by way of metonymy, as in Hadith of Dhi’l-Kifl (number 3465) (Ibn Manzur vol. 7, p. 207; Ibn al-‘Athiir vol. 3, p. 454). Ibn Manzur adds that the word *khaatam* is used as a metonymy for the vagina, whereas the verb *fadda* as a metonym for deflowering the girl, as she is still a virgin. Az-Zuhri (cited in Ibn Hajar, vol. 12, p. 322) also clarifies that the verb *iftadda* is taken from *al-faddah* which denotes the woman’s virginity.
Euphemism

The verb ‘iftadda is used as a euphemism for sexual intercourse for the first time or for deflowering a girl:

...he deflowered her

Assessment

The translator used the verb deflower which means ‘to have sex with a woman who has not had sex before (Oxford Advanced Learner 2000). This is thus a successful rendering, particularly that the same dictionary classifies the word ‘deflower’ as literary, which suits the literary quality of Hadith and matches the level of literary style of the original.

E.g. 40 Hadith 5470, p.229, The Book of Al-`Aqîqa

Abû Talha had a child who was sick. The child died, Next morning Abû Talha came to Allâh’s Messenger…The Prophet (PBUH) said (to him), “Did you sleep with your wife last night?” Abû Talha said, “Yes”. Then the Prophet said, “ O Allâh! Bestow Your blessing on them as regards that night of theirs.” Then (later on) Umm Sulaim gave birth to a boy.

Analysis

The verb `arasa is an intransitive verb that is used in Arabic that may be followed by the preposition bi ‘with’ or without any preposition. E.g. ’arasa bi`ahlihi, or ’arasa ar-rajulu wa-l mar`ah, that is ‘he consummated his marriage with his wife’. (Ibn
Manzur vol.6 p.134; Ibn Hajar vol.9, p.730). Ibn al’Athiir (cited in Ibn Manzur p.135) adds that this is especially true when the husband and wife are newly wed. However, the word has undergone a semantic change/expansion as it came to be used for the marriage act in general regardless of the period of marriage.

Ibn Hajar (vol.9 p.589) also points out that ‘أَرَاسُتْم’ is a question in which the question word is omitted and it is used when man enters upon his wife.

**Euphemism**

**The first euphemism in this Hadith is:**

Did you sleep with your wife?

**Assessment**

The translator achieved the equivalent euphemism by using ‘sleep with your wife’.

**E.g. 41 The second euphemism in the same Hadith is:**

اللهم بارك لهما في ليلةها

“O Allâh! Bestow your blessing on them as regards that night of theirs.”

**Analysis**

In this invocation, another euphemism is encountered as implied from the next sentence “فولدت غلامًا” fawaladat “Then (later on) Umm Sulaim gave birth to a boy”, as it carries the implicature that the couple had sexual intercourse on that night (Hijaazi 1986, p. 68). This meaning is further reinforced by the fact that the lady gave birth to a child then. As such, the Prophet’s saying “that night of theirs” is a
metonymy for the marriage act in order to avoid mentioning the taboo ‘sexual intercourse’ in the invocation.

**Assessment**

The equivalent literal translation of this euphemism as can be seen above, is adequate, as it is equally euphemistic. This translation of the invocation for bestowing Allâh’s blessings would have been vague had the Hadith ended with it. However, because it is directly followed by “she gave birth”, drawing the conclusion that the blessing concerns the marriage act whose fruit is that boy is readily perceivable from the context.

E.g. 42 The Book of Medicine

Hadith 49, p. 363-4

If a person is bewitched or is unable to have sexual intercourse with his wife, is it permissible to remove the magic effect or use the Nashra (special kind of treatment)?

**Analysis**

Ibn Hajar explains that the verb يَؤْخَذَ yu’akhkhadh means to become unable to have intercourse with his wife. It is derived from the noun أَخْخَادَة ‘ukhadhah, which denotes either the words said by a magician to spell the patient, or حِرَازَة kharazah ‘beed’ on which the Ruqiah is said or even the Ruqiah itself (Ibn Hajar vol.10, p.287).

Ibn Manzuur explains that أَخْخَادَة is a type of magic that afflicts the eyes so that a person perceives of something in a certain way that is actually different from reality.
Euphemism

The expression is considered euphemistic as it is a synecdoche reflected in the verb *yu‘akhkadhnh*, which is derived from the noun ‘*ukhadhah*, the means by which a person is spelt magically (here is the effect), followed by the prepositional phrase عن ‘*an imra‘atih* from his wife’, which leaves the effect of this magic (magic itself being the cause), namely being unable to have sex intercourse with his wife, implicit. He thus uses the relationship of cause and effect to create this synecdoche. There is also ellipsis of the NP جَمَاعَ *jimaa* ‘intercourse’, before the NP ‘his wife’ to avoid mentioning this taboo. The euphemism is translated as follows:

...is bewitched or is unable to have sexual intercourse with his wife,

Assessment

In the translation, the ellipsis is restored and thus the euphemism is obliterated since the blunt expression ‘sex intercourse’ is used. Nonetheless, the ellipsis in this case cannot be retained in the translation, as it will result in both an ungrammatical sentence, *a person is unable to...from his wife*. Therefore, the translator is excused for not being able to maintain the ellipsis and in turn for not reproducing the exact equivalent. However, the translator should have either used another euphemistic expression that has the same euphemistic effect, or put the restored ellipsis in parentheses so as to alert the reader that the restored ellipsis is not part of the original text. This is significant in so far as it gives the true nature of Hadith in which embarrassment is evaded by using euphemism. Another possibility is to use a literal translation followed by an explanation between brackets.
Suggested translation
A man who is hindered from enjoying his wife/ prevented from having relations with his wife (unable to have sex with his wife).

B. Euphemisms for illicit relationship

E.g. 43 The Book of AL-Hudûd
Hadith 6819, p. 423
A Jew and a Jewess were brought to Allâh’s Messenger (ﷺ) on a charge of committing an illegal sexual intercourse…

Analysis
The verb ‘ahdathaa is used her to refer to illicit sexual intercourse, which finds support in the rest of the Hadith in which they were both punished by the assigned Hadd ‘punishment’ for adultery in Islam (`Abd Ennabi, p. 32).

Assessment
The euphemism is lost as the taboo ‘sexual intercourse’ is used instead.

Suggested translation
…committed illicit sex act…

E.g.44 The Book of Divorce
Hadith 5348, p.170
The Prophet forbade taking the earnings of a slave-girl by prostitution.
Analysis
In this Hadith, the Prophet prohibits earning money through prostitution, but other ways are permissible. For instance, sewing, spinning and other similar professions are acceptable (Muslim, vol.9, p.231).

**Euphemism**

The euphemism is made here by ellipsis of the word ‘prostitution’, which is an abominable sin in Islam. However, the translator restored the ellipsis in order to clarify the thing which is prohibited, namely, prostitution.

**Assessment**

The translator should have introduced the restored ellipsis in parenthesis in order to distinguish it from the original wording of the Hadith. Dropping the ellipsis results in losing the euphemism.

**Suggested translation**

…taking the earnings of a slave-girl (by prostitution).

E.g. 45 & 46 The Book of Divorce
Hadith vol. 7, 5309, p. 152.
Analysis

Ibn Hajar mentions that in the narration of Al ‘Awzaa‘i, this part of the Hadith was (vol. 9, p.561) ‘Then she had a baby who looks like the one the Prophet PBUH has expected him to be.’ That is, there is the implicature that it is an illegal child.

First, in the first part, “a man saw another man with his wife”, there is a euphemism realized by the omission of the verb taznii’ ‘have illegal intercourse’. In the other part, “Then she delivered it in the shape one would dislike (as it proved her guilty)”. There is another euphemism realized through at-ta’riid ‘hedging’ / indirect hint which implicitly shows that she had an illegal intercourse with another man, thus he is doubting her chastity. This indirect meaning is achieved in the Arabic version by using the vague and unspecified phrase “dhaalika”, in which the word dhaalika functions as an anaphoric reference to the previously mentioned description in the previous sentence. As such, it leaves the reader to infer from the context/to draw the conclusion that the woman committed adultery. This is further implied in the use of the man’s question “should he kill him”, which supports the view that the woman was with a man in the sense of having sex with him. However, it is noticed that Ibn Hajar does not comment on this possibly because it is understood from the context, particularly that it is clear from the narration by Al-‘Awzaa‘i above.

Assessment

The first euphemism is correctly conveyed in the translation as the ellipsis is retained in the English version as well. In the second instance, the same level of indirectness and vagueness is kept in the translation, yet the direct meaning is provided in parentheses so as to
ascertain the reader’s understanding of the intended meaning that might be unclear as it stands. Hence, the translator is successful in rendering these two instances of euphemism.

E.g. 47 The Book of Coercion, Hadith 6949, Vol. 9, p. 63

آن عبدا من رقيق الأمارة وقع علي وليدة من الخمس فاستكرهها حتى افتنها

“A governmental male-slave tried to seduce a slave-girl from the Khumus of the war booty till he deflowered her by force against her will;…

Euphemism

…tried to seduce a slave-girl …by force against her will;…

Analysis

The verb used as a euphemism her is istakraha+ha derived from the root k r h, which means to force someone to do something, and in this Hadith it means forced her to have sex with her, which is known today as ‘rape assault’. This may be understood from this part of the Hadith in which the expression الزنا ‘to have illegal sexual intercourse’, is ellipted. This finds support in the translation of the Qur’an 24:33

"But if anyone compels them (to prostitution), then after such compulsion, Allah is Oft-Forgiving, Most Forgiving to those women, …(khan, p.63).

Assessment

The translator restored the ellipsis as he used “tried to seduce …by force against her will”, as the sentence would not be understood as it stands. Besides, there is a partial loss in the denotative meaning as the verb seduce refers to persuading someone young and without sexual experience to have sex with one. This being the case, the verb is not the accurate equivalent here since the girl was forced to do so as understood from the Arabic verb ‘istakraha, that is, force to do something against one’s will. As such, the verb ‘rape’ is the correct
equivalent as it refers to having sex with a woman against her will. The euphemism is thus partially lost, as the verb ‘seduce’ is not as euphemistic as the original, though the rest of the euphemism is retained.

**Suggested translation**
...a male-slave compelled a slave-girl (to commit an illegal sexual intercourse under coercion).

**E.g. 48 & 49 The book of Al-Mazâlim (The Book of Oppression)**
**Hadith 2482, Vol.3, p.384**

وكان جريج في صومعة فقالت امرأة لأفتنن جريجها، فتعرضت له فكلمتة قابي. فأنت راعيى...

فأمكنت من نفسها فولدت غلاما فقالت: هو من جريج

...Juraij used to live in a hermitage. A woman said that she would entice Juraij, so she went to him and presented herself (for an evil act) but he refused. She then went to a shepherd and allowed him to commit an illegal sexual intercourse with her and later she gave birth to a boy. She alleged that the baby was from Juraij...

**Analysis**

First the sentence *kallamat+hu*, ‘(she) spoke to him’ here does not refer to speaking in its general sense, but rather speaking in the sense of asking him to commit adultery ((Al’îini 13: 39, cited in Hijaazi 1986, p.71). Hijaazi supports this view and he points out three contextual clues to support this argument (p.72). The most suitable one here is that, as he says, the fact that the woman got pregnant and had a baby whom she alleged to belong to Juraij, as this indicates that she called him to commit adultery. The cotext is further evidence, as the verb *تعرضت* *ta’arradat* ‘presented herself’ stated earlier in the beginning of the Hadith, means ‘she beautified herself to entice him so as to fulfill her aim’. In this way, talking to Juraij is considered a euphemism for calling him to have an illegal sex intercourse with him.
Second, allowed him to commit an illegal sexual intercourse with her is a metonymy for a woman’s allowing a man to have an illegal sexual intercourse with her. This is implied from the context as there is ellipsis of ‘fahamalat’, i.e., she got pregnant. Another instance of ellipsis in this Hadith is noticed when the woman said “from Juraij”, in which the ellipted part could be “fasu’ilat: miman hadha? ‘from whom is this (child)’” (Ibn Hajar vol.5, p.481). These ellipted parts, together with the answer “from Juraij”, show that the Prophet is using ellipsis as a strategy for achieving euphemism to refer to the woman’s sinful act of adultery. This is consonant with ‘Abd Ennabi (p.31.) who states that this euphemistic expression is used to denote ‘zinaa’, i.e., adultery.

Assessment

The first example is adequately translated as the euphemism is retained through the strategy of foreignization, followed by restoring the ellipted part in parentheses so as to help the target reader perceive of the implicature that she enticed him to commit adultery. As for the second, the euphemism is lost because the direct meaning is stated bluntly leaving no room for euphemism. A possible strategy to partially reproduce the euphemism is to include the sentence “to commit illegal sexual intercourse” in parentheses so as to make the reader aware that this is not included as part of the original wording of the Hadith.

E.g. 50 The Book of Adhân Hadith 660, p. 377

Narrated Abû Huraira: The Prophet said, “Allâh will give shade, to seven, on the Day when there will be no shade but His. (These seven
persons are) a just ruler,…, a man who refuses the call of a charming woman of noble birth for illicit intercourse with her and says: I am afraid of Allâh.

**Euphemism**

وَرجل دعته امرأة ذات منصب وجمال فقال إني أخف الله

In this Hadith, the woman’s call is euphemistic for having adultery (Al-Karmaany, cited in Hijazi, p. 67). This is understood from the contextual clues, such as the woman’s enticing beauty, and the man’s response “I am afraid of Allah”, which shows that he refused her call because it is something that brings about the wrath of Allah (Hijzaai 67). This euphemism, however, is achieved by omission of the taboo expression ‘to have illicit intercourse’.

**Assessment**

The euphemism is totally lost/flattened as the dysphemistic expression “for illicit intercourse with her” which was omitted in the original is restored and presented in the text without pointing out that it is not part of the original.

**Suggested translation**

This underlined part should have been included in parentheses so as to alert the reader in translation that it is not part of the Hadith at hand

**Results and Discussion**

Table I below presents the percentages of successful and unsuccessful translations of the total number of euphemisms. Table 2 presents the percentages of successful and unsuccessful translations of euphemisms for licit intercourse, whereas table 3 presents percentages of successful and unsuccessful translations of euphemisms for illicit intercourse.
The study yielded a total of 50 euphemisms in *Sahih Al-Bukhāri* which were identified according to the criteria described above (see method section). These euphemisms cover the semantic field of sex relations in toto, ranging along a continuum of various different states beginning with licit intercourse/ the marriage act itself (42 instances), and ending up with rape and adultery/ illicit sexual intercourse (8 instances) at the other end of the continuum. The translator succeeded in rendering 31 (62%) instances of the total number of euphemisms correctly, yet he failed at varying degrees in translating the rest 19 (38%) instances. Out of the 42 euphemisms of licit intercourse, 27 (64.28 %) were successfully translated in contrast with 15 (35.71%) that were not. As for the euphemisms for illicit intercourse, 4 ((50%) were successfully translated whereas the other 4 (50%) were not. Naturally, the terms ‘successful versus unsuccessful’ utilized in assessing the translated euphemisms here are used in a relatively general sense. They encompass varying degrees of success and failure, for instance, partially successful, successful to a certain degree, versus total missing of the euphemism, obliterating it or partially missing it.

Table 1
Percentages of successful and unsuccessful translations of all euphemisms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Number of Euphemisms</th>
<th>50</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of successful Translations</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of unsuccessful Translations</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

237
Table 2.
Percentages of successful and unsuccessful translations of euphemisms for licit intercourse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total number of Euphemisms for licit intercourse</th>
<th>42</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of successful Translations</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>64.28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of unsuccessful Translations</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>35.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.
Percentages of successful and unsuccessful translations of euphemisms for illicit intercourse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total number of Euphemisms for illicit intercourse</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of successful Translations</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of unsuccessful Translations</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is worth mentioning here that the researcher could identify a larger number of sex euphemisms in Hadith present in *Sahih Al-Bukhari* translated by Khan in comparison to other researchers, particularly `Abd Ennabi and Hijaazi. Out of the total number of euphemisms
identified here, only 25 of them were previously reached by those researchers. The newly identified are 25 in number, of which 21 deal with legal sex intercourse and only four with illegal sex or adultery (See Table 4 below).

Table 4
Translation assessment of euphemisms in Bukhārī’s _Sahīh_ and suggested translations

Total number of euphemisms = 50 (Licit and illicit)
S= successful; Total S=31 (62%)
U= unsuccessful ; Total U=19 (38%)

*= a new euphemism reached through this research and not available in previous researches; total number of * =20

Table 4 A
Euphemisms for licit intercourse (Total 42)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number Of Hadith in Bukhârî</th>
<th>Translation of the euphemism</th>
<th>Assessment of The translation</th>
<th>Suggested translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. (268)</td>
<td>Visit all his wives in a round</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>Make the rounds with his wives (have sexual relations with his wives)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. (5105) *</td>
<td>Has had sexual intercourse</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>sticks to the ground” consummate the marriage with</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. (5065) *</td>
<td>Will make you</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>Who will remind you</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Of Hadith in Bukhāri</td>
<td>Translation of the euphemism</td>
<td>الأكناية أو التعبير المزيف</td>
<td>Assessment of The translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. (5260)</td>
<td>remember your past days</td>
<td>نَذَرُكَ بِما قُلْتُ لله َبِهَ *)</td>
<td>U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. (5260)</td>
<td>Who proved to be impotent</td>
<td>إنِّي مَعِي مِثْلَ اهْدَيْهَ</td>
<td>U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Until you enjoy the sexual relation (consummate your marriage) with Abdur-Rahmān and he with you.</td>
<td>يدوق عِسْبَانِكَ وَنَذَرُكَ وَقَيِّ عِسْبَانِهِ</td>
<td>U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. (5265) *</td>
<td>Approach me</td>
<td>يُقْرِينِ</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. (5265) *</td>
<td>once</td>
<td>هَنَة</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. (5245 *)</td>
<td>(Seek to beget) children! children, O Jabir!</td>
<td>الْكَبْسَ الْكَبْسَ يَا جَابِرٌ</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 (5152) *</td>
<td>In order to have everything for herself</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>To empty her plate (to take another</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Of Hadith in Bukhāri</td>
<td>Translation of the euphemism</td>
<td>Assessment of The translation</td>
<td>Suggested translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>woman’s husband)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 (5207)</td>
<td>We used to practice coitus interruptus</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>Pull out (from our wives)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. (5191) *</td>
<td>The Prophet kept away from his wives</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. (5077) *</td>
<td>O Allah’s Messenger! Suppose you landed in a valley where there is a tree of which something has been eaten and then you found trees of which nothing has been eaten, of which tree would you let your camel graze?</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. (5242)</td>
<td>I will go round (i.e. have sexual relations with)... Then he had sexual relations with them</td>
<td>$U$</td>
<td>Had the rounds with them (had sexual relations)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 (5158) *</td>
<td>Consummated his marriage with her</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. (5165)</td>
<td>Having sexual intercourse with his</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>Come up to one's</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Of Hadith in Bukhari</td>
<td>Translation of the euphemism</td>
<td>اكتئابية أو التعبير النطفي</td>
<td>Assessment of The translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. (chapter 26)</td>
<td>You have gone in (consummated your marriage) ‘duukhâl, Masîs all means the sexual intercourse</td>
<td>دخلتم بِن دخول الرجل</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Have sexual relations with him</td>
<td>الاستيعاب، استضفي على مثليه</td>
<td>U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 (5127)</td>
<td>Never sleep with her</td>
<td>لا إسماها</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 (5127)</td>
<td>Before having sexual intercourse</td>
<td>قبل أن يمسها</td>
<td>U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 (5251)</td>
<td>does not consummate his marriage with her</td>
<td>لم يمسها</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 (5127)</td>
<td>Her husband would sleep with her</td>
<td>أصابها</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. (7367)</td>
<td>Go to your wives [i.e., now sexual relationship with your wives is legal</td>
<td>أصيروا (من النهار)</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Of Hadith in Bukhāri</td>
<td>Translation of the euphemism</td>
<td>Assessment of The translation</td>
<td>Suggested translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 (1935)</td>
<td>I had sexual intercourse with my wife</td>
<td>$U$</td>
<td>I slept with my wife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 (5268) *</td>
<td>He would visit his wives and stay with one of them</td>
<td>$U$</td>
<td>He would visit his wives and comes close to one of them (as a way of fondling her)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. (5268) *</td>
<td>He would enter upon his wives and stay with one of them</td>
<td>$S$</td>
<td>He would visit his wives and comes close to one of them (without having relations with her)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. (3329)</td>
<td>A man has sexual intercourse with his wife</td>
<td>$U$</td>
<td>When the man envelops his wife (have relations with her)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. (5368)</td>
<td>I had sexual intercourse with my wife in Ramadān</td>
<td>$U$</td>
<td>I slept with/ had relations with my wife in Ramadān</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. (5193) *</td>
<td>If a man invites his wife to sleep with him</td>
<td>$S$</td>
<td>...invites his wife to his</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Of Hadith in Bukhari</td>
<td>Translation of the euphemism</td>
<td>الترجمة الوحيضية</td>
<td>Assessment of The translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>إمرأته إلى فراشها</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. (5194) *</td>
<td>Deserting her husband’s bed</td>
<td>مهاجرة فراش زوجها</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. (chapter 93) *</td>
<td>When you desert your wife (abstain from sleeping with her)</td>
<td>ولا بجر إلا في البيت</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. (5052)</td>
<td>He never comes to my bed</td>
<td>لم يطأ لنا فراشها</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. (5052)</td>
<td>Nor has he approached me</td>
<td>ولم ينفس لنا كما</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Chapter 52</td>
<td>Before entering upon her and before consummating his marriage with her</td>
<td>قبل الدخول والمس</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. +36 (180)</td>
<td>Forced to hurry up (during intercourse) or you do not discharge</td>
<td>أهملت أو أشترطت</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. (4942) (4942)</td>
<td>Sleep with her</td>
<td>يضاجمهها</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. (6042) *</td>
<td>Embrace (sleep with her)</td>
<td>يعانق</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Of Hadith in Bukhārī</td>
<td>Translation of the euphemism</td>
<td>الكتّابة أو التعبير المنطفي</td>
<td>Assessment of The translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. (6949)</td>
<td>Deflowered her by force</td>
<td>افتضها</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. (5470)</td>
<td>Did you sleep with your wife?</td>
<td>أعرستم؟</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. (5470)</td>
<td>O Allah! Bestow Your blessing upon them as regards that night of theirs</td>
<td>اللهم بارك لها في ليلتها</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(42), Chapter 94 *</td>
<td>Is unable to have sexual intercourse with his wife</td>
<td>يؤخذ عن أمرأته</td>
<td>U</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4 B**

**Euphemisms for illicit intercourse** *(Total=8)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number Of Hadith in Bukhārī</th>
<th>Translation of the euphemism</th>
<th>الكتّابة أو التعبير المنطفي</th>
<th>Assessment of The translation</th>
<th>Suggested translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>43. (6819)</td>
<td>Committing an illegal sexual intercourse</td>
<td>أحدنا</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>...committed illicit act?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. (5348) *</td>
<td>The earnings of a slave-girl by prostitution</td>
<td>كسب الإمام</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>...(by prostitution)…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. (5309) *</td>
<td>Saw another man with his wife</td>
<td>وجد رجلا مع امرأته</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46. (5309) *</td>
<td>She delivered it in the shape one would dislike (as it proved her guilty)</td>
<td>نجاءت به علي المكره من ذلك</td>
<td>S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47. (6949) *</td>
<td>Seduce a slave-girl</td>
<td>استكرهها</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>A male-slave compelled a slave-girl</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(to commit an illegal sexual intercourse) under coercion

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>48. (2482)</td>
<td>Presented herself (for an evil act)</td>
<td>فتعرضت له</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49. (2482)</td>
<td>Allowed him to commit an illegal sexual intercourse with her</td>
<td>أمكنت من نفسها</td>
<td>U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>The call of a charming woman of noble birth for illicit intercourse with her</td>
<td>رجل دعته امرأة ذات نصب وجمال</td>
<td>U</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This larger number of sex euphemisms identified here could possibly be attributed to the fact that most scholars of Arabic rely on *kinaaya* as the sole device of effecting euphemism. This being the case, the major sources of Hadith commentary as *Sahih Al-Bukhari* and *Muslim* were considered the main source for identifying *kinaaya*, which might have distracted scholars or made them overlook other euphemisms effected by other devices. In contrast, this study has relied on criteria that are derived from various sources, such as Farghal, Ali and Warren above. Subsequently, a natural outcome of such different criteria is the richer analysis and the larger frequency of euphemism encountered in Prophetic Hadith.

Another possible explanation of this same phenomenon would be that though Hadith commentary is extremely rich, in certain instances the
interpreters are more concerned with religious rulings as a priority. As such, they employ linguistic analysis as a means to this end, and not as an end in itself. In turn, some of the euphemisms might be overlooked as they do not serve their main goal of the commentary. Linguistic analysis, in contrast, focuses on language as an end in itself, and therefore, scrupulous attention is allocated to the linguistic devices as tools to such end. Hence, attention is directed to all cases of euphemisms regardless of the legal opinion. This is because the ultimate goal is to investigate the cultural and pragmatic aspects, as these constitute an indispensable part of language, inherent in the euphemisms, and then to assess the extent to which the translator could reproduce such aspects in the translation.

The study offered also a larger number of sex euphemisms in Hadith compared to their counterparts in the Qur’an as evident in Shabān’s thesis. A possible explanation would be that the Hadith addresses various types of receivers and it is said in different contexts other than those in the Qur’an. In addition, sex euphemisms in Hadith add to those used in the Qur’an. For instance, the words *ar-rafath* and *al-‘ityaan* are sex euphemisms in the Qur’an and Hadith, yet *yalziq bil ‘ard* and *yadnuu*, *al-binaa‘*, *yalziqu bil ‘ard*, and *al-wiqaa‘*, *al-kays*, *al-firaash*, *al-‘usaylah* among others, are euphemisms that appear only in Hadith. This may be interpreted as a means by which the Prophet cope with the various levels of the readers/receivers so as to come closer to their minds and to adapt to the contextual constraints imposed on the situation. Another possible interpretation of this result could be that it is not the Prophet that is using the euphemism all through Hadith, but other Companions as well. Hence, the speakers’ various linguistic features may also affect the choice and use of euphemisms. For instance, the variables of sex, social background, status of the speakers may also determine the choice of euphemism. However, this needs further investigation.
As regards the translation of Hadith in particular, the study yielded a larger variety of sex euphemisms (42 licit intercourse versus 8 illicit intercourse) referring to the marriage act in Hadith that outweigh their English counterparts.

The study also shows an important aspect of Hadith in particular and Arabic in general, namely the wide variety of euphemisms referring to marital relationship in contrast with their English counterparts. Some of the English euphemisms in this respect include ‘sleep with his wife’, go in unto wives/women, touch, and approach which are extremely few in comparison with their Arabic counterparts. This phenomenon attests to the richness of the Arabic language as well as to the seriousness of avoiding this taboo as manifest in the various indirect ways of referring to this issue in a polite manner so as to abide by norms of propriety in Muslim society. It also reflects the Prophetic decorum and decency in addressing such sensitive issues. This result is consonant with `Abd Ennabi’s and Hijzai’s conclusions in this respect. Hijaaazi for instance says:

This research has asserted that the eloquence of the Prophet is perfect and that when the decency/etiquette in certain contexts requires the use of kinaaya, the Prophetic use of kinaaya has proved the perfect etiquette of Him who has taught the Prophet the best mannerisms. Thus one who would like to refine his sense of taste to perceive of the aspects of beauty should directly consult the eloquence of the
Bounteous Book ‘the Qur’an’ and the Sunnah of the Prophet (PBUH). As the Qur’an has the greatest effect on the _nazm_ ‘composition / stringing’ of the Prophetic style, similarly, the Sunnah too has its great role that could not be overlooked in refining the habits and mannerisms of the Companions and in developing their ways of talking and arguing.

As such, failure to reproduce such euphemisms results in misconceptions about the Prophetic style, which may be traced in dropping a salient feature typical of this style, namely the use of euphemism. Euphemism in Arabic is achieved through various strategies, as mentioned above, of which figures of speech are pervasive. It has to be noted that all these are tools for producing effectiveness that constitutes the emotiveness typical of Hadith style. Replacing such euphemisms by mere flat equivalents, and ignoring these figurative devices is in blatant contradiction with the fact that the Prophet is the most eloquent among the Arabs (Cf. Hijaaizi; El-Zeiny 1976; (p.13 in Hijaaizi). This may even have more serious implications as it puts the whole message of Islam at stake, since one of the basic miracles of this religion is eloquence of the Qur’an and of the prophetic style.

Still another negative effect of not reproducing euphemism in translation is that of depicting Muslim women as too daring, and lacking a sense of decorum. By mistranslating euphemism, women may be viewed as openly addressing sensitive issues or taboos, such as sex, in the presence of men and thus breaking the norms of politeness and face-saving strategies in a society that holds high esteem of such norms and values. This, in turn, is bound to have widespread social ramifications as far as women social behaviour in Muslim society is concerned, especially in the current age in which women in general, and Muslim women in particular, are in focus.

From the pragmatic stance, euphemism is mainly used in Hadith as a strategy for teaching Islamic rulings that touch upon sensitive issues,
such as marital relationship, women, purity, and the like, yet in a way that keeps the other’s face. Dropping such euphemism produces a text that is face-threatening, which, apart from not being untrue, portrays the Prophet Muhammad as a person who lacks a sense of decorum and who breaks the maxims of politeness. It may also present the Prophet in a way that supports the misconception about their Prophet typical of Western and orientalists’ claims that the Prophet’s craze for sex. This is totally unexpected from a prophet, and particularly this Prophet whose politeness is attested to in the Qur’an and in history (cf. Ibn Hesham; Ar-Raafi’i).

Mistranslating or obliterating euphemisms in Hadith may also have further ramifications as far as the cultural profile of the Arabs of the early Islamic period is concerned. Various euphemistic expressions are available in the Arabic language to avoid blunt mentioning of taboos, which reflects the Arabs’ keenness to avoid them. For instance, about 11 (See Questionnaire) euphemisms were translated as “sexual intercourse”, which obviously depicts the Prophet and his Companions as daring, so much so that they did not hesitate to overuse this taboo term.

It is worth noting here that, the Prophetic Hadith stands as the source of etiquette, code of manners in the Muslim society and it sets the indices of politeness and decorum one should abide by in interacting with others (Heikal; Al-Qalamaawy; Hijazi; `Abd Ennabi). Thus, dropping euphemistic expressions brings about total or partial distortion of some features of Hadith itself.

Concerning the devices of effecting euphemisms, kinaaya ‘metonymy’ showed to be the main device as it was employed in most of the examples presented in this study. Nonetheless, other devices were also employed, such as ellipsis, synecdoche, simile, metaphor and antonyms, but in very few instances. However, it could be argued that these are still considered cases of metonymy in a general sense as mentioned above, as it seems that Arabs use the term for the overall
function of the expression rather than for its constituents. In other words, be it ellipsis, simile or whatever device, that does not represent the euphemism itself, but rather the device for effecting it, which is the total sum of whatever constituents used. This finds support in Hijazi’s words:

... ولكن القصد والمعنى هو التعبير بما فيه تغطية طريقة عياً يستهجن بغض النظر عن المعنى الموضوع له النطق والمعنى المستعمل فيه من صيالات القرابة كأن يكون بينها تشبيه أو عموم أو خصوص أو سببة أو غير ذلك ص 65

Metonymy in Arabic usually purports to nicely enveloping something that is embarrassing or repugnant to mention, regardless of the relationship between the meaning which the lexis designates or denotes and that meaning which it is used to express or connote, such as particularization versus specification, causality and the like (p. 65). (Translation mine)

Conclusions

The study yielded a number of conclusions that have implications for translation theory and practice.

Euphemism is a linguistic and literary device that all languages harbour, yet it figures heavily in the linguistic behaviour of the Prophet and the Companions as they avoid direct mention of taboos, such as sex and marital relationship, among other issues. Such euphemisms reflect the cultural norms and the politeness maxims that Muslims have to abide by. Thus, euphemism in Hadith embodies one of the main values that Arabs uphold, namely *haya* ‘modesty’, which is considered “a part of faith” (Sahih Bukhari, vol. I, p. The Book of Belief, Hadith 9). This religion-based value reflected in euphemism enjoys a noticeable presence in Hadith texts to the point that the translator’s competence in dealing with such texts is highly constrained by his understanding of such value. This is attributed to the fact that, as Ibn Hajar himself asserts (2000, vol.9, p. 365), the الكتابة “...
The use of *kinaaya* ‘metonymy’ to avoid issues that one is embarrassed to mention/ or that one feels he needs to be modest about (i.e. taboos in modern terms), is recurrent in the Qur’an and the Sunnah.” (Translation mine) This being the case, the translator’s awareness of the value of modesty is a key factor to a successful rendering of euphemism in Hadith translation. Euphemism is so culture-loaded, which requires a special orientation in the interaction between language, culture and religion in translation.

Nonetheless, the value of modesty is on its way towards becoming obsolete. In the English language of today the difference between the levels of formality is fading away. Consequently, the need for euphemistic expressions in the West is decreasing. However, from the perspective of American Muslims who represent minority groups in the West (the target readers for which the current research is directed), they are creating a Muslim subculture in the English speaking community that has its own values and morals. In translating euphemisms, more than one meaning is conveyed to the target language: not only the euphemism, but also the cultural values it carries through its words. Such values are demonstrated through using euphemisms in Hadith, which is the saying of the Prophet.

Another significant conclusion is that, as mentioned in the introduction to this study, unawareness of the cultural input that euphemisms camouflage, in addition to the resistant (Venuti 1995) nature of many euphemistic expressions, represents a serious problem for translators. Missing the euphemism in translation may yield negative results, such as distortion, obliteration, and subversion of the source culture. In the case of Hadith, partial misrepresentation of salient features that characterize the Prophetic style may also be encountered. It may also result in misrepresenting the profile of the Muslim code of ethics, and of the Arab culture in turn.
As Vogt (1998) explains, reading literature in translation usually “distorts the view of the source culture and its interface with the target culture” (p. 14) as a result of appropriating or substituting a cultural reference for an analogous one in the target culture. Moreover, as Vogt rightly argues, the inaccurate translation of a culturally loaded word makes it lose its specific connotations in the target culture. The problem as Vogt depicts it, and with which the researcher totally agrees, lies in the absence of a culture sensitive reader who can recognize such distortions or misrepresentations. Consequently, the phenomena remain only in the translator’s mind, giving him the opportunity to manipulate his power in distorting culture.

Translation may in fact consolidate or challenge existing power structures through the picture of the source culture portrayed by translators for the target cultures. Translation, which is a source of gaining knowledge about the culture of others, stands for the original and replaces it. In this way, translation becomes, to use Vermeer’s (1992: 40) terms “a culture transcending process”, which is crucial to the formation of cultural identities. This phenomenon is usually referred to as “inscription” of the source text by linguistic and cultural values that conform to target language domestic ones. Domestication results in moving the foreign text from its foreign tradition that gives it its significance, which is instrumental to shaping cultural domestic attitudes towards the foreign cultures (Venuti 1993, pp.67-8). This same view is shared by many translation theorists such as Lefevere (1990), Venuti (1998) Seguint (1994), Wolf (1995), Dingwaney and Maier (1995) Vogt (1998), Salama (1999) and El-Zeiny (2001).

To avoid such problems and negative effects, the researcher offers the following suggestions. First, equipping the translator with the adequate linguistic and cultural competence of the source language so as to develop sensitivity to critical issues that may result in misconceptions. This could be achieved through access to the source culture not only through the literature available on the topic, but also
through cultural centers and institutions concerned with the respective languages.

Another important source of cultural knowledge is carrying out empirical research methods in translation through interviews and questionnaires. This is expected to help the translator delve deeply to understand the mentality and background of the receiver, and to envisage his reactions to his translation of certain cultural aspects, in order to pinpoint some translation problems and cope with them in due course.

Second, this researcher recommends foreignization as the most suitable technique to be adopted in translating euphemism. This conclusion, however, is not consonant with those reached by others, such as Ali (1996) who calls for the dynamic translation of euphemism in religious texts in order not to obliterate their euphemistic salience. Nonetheless, the researcher argues that Hadith is of special religious significance, and so translators have to bring the reader closer to the source language and culture. A translated text, as Venuti (1995) puts it,

…but should be the site where a different culture emerges, where a reader gets a glimpse of a cultural other, and resistancy, a translation strategy based on an aesthetic of discontinuity, can best preserve that difference, that otherness, by reminding the reader of the gains and losses in the translation process and the unbridgeable gaps between cultures. (p. 306)

Venuti’s thesis, with which the researcher totally agrees, is that fluency or domestication conceals the ideological work done by translation, which should be made visible through selective disruptions, such as the use of archaisms, neologisms, and rare or foreign words.
However, this foreignized translations, the researcher believes, have to be followed by their dynamic equivalents in parentheses or footnotes. As Ali argues, euphemism reflects the cultural indices of politeness and decorum a certain nation adopts. Hence, this cultural input has to be brought to the foreign reader so as to help him view closely these indices through the window of euphemism. This is simply because from an ethnolinguistic perspective, euphemism is not studied only as a linguistic device per se, but rather as one that gives the reader an insight into the culture in which the euphemistic expression is used. This is also expected to serve a double purpose: First as minority groups, the Muslim community living abroad will have access to the original wording of some aspects of the Muslim culture. In this way, they are likely to develop deeper understanding of this culture, and feel more attached to it, which in turn has its implications for preserving their cultural identity. Assertion of cultural identity, as Ezzat (1995) rightly asserts, is mandatory especially in the age of globalization in which strong powerful nations spread their culture and devour that of the less powerful ones, which is usually the case of minority groups. Second, for the non-Muslim ethnolinguist and the anthropologist, the source-language-oriented rendering will help the linguist to perceive of key terms and concepts typical of the Muslim community that provide him with the insight into understanding such community.

At the other end of the continuum, a shift in presentation of the equivalent euphemism should take place, had the study been administered to non-Muslims living abroad, this might have modified this conclusion in varying degrees. Non-Muslim receivers might have totally different perspectives, interests and goals, as their need might be geared towards a target language-oriented-text that helps them to gain the knowledge they seek about the Islamic rulings, rather than towards the literary style of the text or the euphemistic level of Hadith text. In such case, the strategy of domestication should be adopted in translating euphemistic expressions in Hadith, followed by their foreignized equivalents or source language-oriented literal equivalents.
so as to reduce the feeling of alienation they are likely to encounter in reading Hadith in translation. This is also expected to meet their goals and to cope with their attitudes and cultural background. As such, this conclusion is consonant with the view that it is the *Skopos* (Reiss and Vermeer 1984) in which translation is embedded in context of behaviour, and as such, it is a kind of social behaviour subordinate to the specific aim he assigns to the target text. (Cf. `Enani 2000? Translation theory) This calls for further research in this area and for replicating the study with another group of receivers of a different cultural background, and with a different goal in mind in order to investigate the role of the receiver in rendering religious texts.

From the perspective of language learning, a foreigner who is instrumentally motivated to learn Arabic is likely to benefit by such source-language-oriented foreign terms, as he will come to know about taboos as a cultural aspect in Muslim society, as culture is inseparable from language. Thus he should avoid such taboos in his interaction with members of that society in order to be able to integrate within that society and not to be shunned by its members. As mentioned above by Warren (1992), euphemism is “in the eye of the beholder” and it is not strictly agreed upon in all cultures. Moreover, euphemisms are so immersed in the culture in which they appear because they are so tightly related to taboos and hence, as Hasan (2003?) asserts, they should be given more attention in language learning.
References

- Al-Kirmaani .() AL-Kawaakib Ad-Daraari.


259


• Leech, G.N.(1990) Pragmatics?


• Mazid, B.-E. (2003).Sharp wits and fine phrases: Euphemism and dysphemism in the war-on (?)- Iraq discourse. *Cairo studies in English (CSE) (pp. 43-84)*. Cairo: Cairo University, Faculty of Arts, Department of English Language and Literature.


شرح النووي على صحيح مسلم / تأليف: الإمام النووي، طبع المطبعة المصرية، القاهرة، بدون تاريخ.

المعجم الكبير / إصدار: مجمع اللغة العربية (مصر) الجزء الثاني: طبع الهيئة المصرية العامة للذكر (مصر) 1402 / 1982 م.

التعريفات / تأليف: الشريف الجرجاني. ط. دار الشنو النظفية العامة، العراق، بدون تاريخ.

الشفائق / الزعيم: حقيق: علي محمد البخاري، محمد أبو الفضل إبراهيم طبع عيسى البابي الحلب، القاهرة، الطبعة الثانية، بدون تاريخ.

هدي الساري / تأليف: أحمد بن علي بن حجر، العسقلاني. قام بإخراجه: حسب الدين الحطب. طبع دار الفكر، برلين، بدون تاريخ.

المفردات في غريب القرآن (تص) / تأليف: الراغب / لسان العرب / تأليف: ابن منظور طبع دار المعارف، مصر، بدون تاريخ.

سنن أبي داود / تأليف: أبو داود الشجاعي، تحقيق: عزت عبد العظيم، وعادل السيد، أشرف على الطبغ: محمد رفيق السيد، طبع دار الحديث، حمص، سوريا، 1388 هـ: 1969 م

تفسير ابن كثير.
تاج العروس / تأليف: الزيدلي، طبع المطبعة الخيرية، مصر، 1306 هـ / 1889 م

النهاية في غريب الحديث (نص) / ابن الأثير، تحقيق: طاهر أحمد الزاوي ومحفوظ الطناحي.

طبع دار الكتب العلمية، بيروت، 1399 هـ / 1979 م.

الأصهلي، تحقيق: محمد سيد كيلان، طبع مصطفى الحلبي، مصر، 1381 هـ / 1961 م


تيل الأوطار / تأليف: الشوقاني، طبع دار الجميل، بيروت، 1373 هـ / 1954 م.

فيض القدر / تأليف: الماندي، طبع دار المعرفة، بيروت، 1392 / 1972 م، الطبعة الثانية

السجستاني، تحقيق: عزت عبيد الدعس وعادل السيد. أشرف على الطباع: محمود زهير.


الزيدلي، طبع المطبعة الخيرية، مصر، 1306 هـ / 1889 م.

النهاية في غريب الحديث (نص) / ابن الأثير، تحقيق: طاهر أحمد الزاوي ومحفوظ الطناحي.

طبع دار الكتب العلمية، بيروت، 1399 هـ / 1979 م.

النهاية في غريب الحديث (نص) / ابن الأثير، تحقيق: طاهر أحمد الزاوي ومحفوظ الطناحي.

طبع دار الفكر، بيروت، 1401 هـ.

كنز العمال (تص) / تأليف: المنفي الهندي، طبع مؤسسة الرسالة، بيروت، 1409 هـ / 1989 م.
Techniques of Translating Religious
And Culture-Bound Elements in
A Small Arabic-English Legal Corpus

By
Hanem El-Farahaty

1. Introduction

This paper investigates the techniques of translating religious and
culture-bound elements in a parallel Arabic-English corpus. More
specifically, we aim to show how these Arabic elements have been
rendered into English with reference to the approaches initiated by
Vinay and Darblnet (1995) and Alcarez and Hughes (2002). The
corpus used for this study covers two text types: (i) the first includes
official documents cited in a published translation book by Hatim,
Buckley and Shunnaq (1995), (ii) the second type is legislative
Arabic–English documents cited in a two-volume book by Mansoor
(1965). The aim of choosing these two books is that they are
established sources.

The analysis falls into two stages; the first of which is a tabulated
quantitative analysis, and the other is a critical-theory-based analysis.
The aim behind the first phase is to give a descriptive view of each
element in the source text (ST) and in the target text (TT) along with
the technique of translating each element. This is done in the form of
an alignment table. The aim of the second phase is to critically analyse
some of the examples given and relate them to the theories and
provide some of the problematic instances and solutions if possible. It
is worth mentioning that I have included transliteration for the Arabic
in text examples, yet leaving the off text examples in Arabic to keep the
2. Theoretical Framework

This part will discuss Vinay and Darbelnet’s model (1958/1995), and Alcarez and Hughes’ techniques of adaptation (2002).

2.1 Vinay and Darbelnet’s Model

In A Methodology for Translation, Vinay and Darbelnet (1958/1995) propose their contrastive stylistic analysis of translation. They set up their model according to three basic microlinguistic aspects: vocabulary (lexicon), grammar (syntax), and composition (text or as they put it message) (1995:30).

Vinay and Darbelnet claim that ‘certain stylistic effects cannot be transposed to the TL without upsetting the syntactic order or even the lexis’ (1995:84). To tackle this stylistic problem, they suggest two general translation strategies and seven translation procedures to be followed by the translator according to the above levels. The two main translation strategies include direct and oblique translation.

2.1.1 Direct Translation

Direct translation is further divided into the following subcategories:
(i) Borrowing:
   The SL word form is transferred to the TL to fill a lexical gap or to create a certain effect. For instance, hijab, kebab and intifadah are taken from Arabic to English.
(ii) Calque:
   This is literal translation at phrase level as in the famous English-Arabic pair: (skyscrapers - ناطحات السحاب / natihat al-sihab). A calque may be lexical or structural. A lexical calque respects the syntactic structure of the TL while introducing a new mode of expression: (spiderman - الرجل المعكبوت / al-rajul al-`ankabut). A structural calque introduces a new construction into the language.
such as the English-French pair: (Science-fiction – Science-fiction).

(iii) Literal translation:
Although this is far-fetched between languages of different families, it can sometimes be applicable as in the English-Arabic pair: (I get up early every day - أَسْتِبِطِقِّي كُل يَوْم / astiyyqiz mubakiran kul yawm), or the Arabic English pair (وُسُلت إِلَى الْطَّارِئ / wasalt ila al-matar liaylan - I arrived at the airport at night). This example shows that the task of the translator is limited to observing ‘the adherence to the linguistic servitudes of the TL’. (Vinay and Darbelnet, 1995:33-4). It is, according to Vinay and Darbelnet, common between languages of the same family.

Literal translation is the author’s prescription for ‘good translation’ unless the technique is unacceptable because it:
- gives a different meaning;
- has no meaning;
- is impossible for structural reasons;
- ‘does not have a corresponding expression within the metalinguistic experience of the TL’;
- corresponds to something at a different level of language.
(cf. Munday, 2001:57)

The above restrictions show that literal translation cannot lead to ‘a good translation’. If we take legal translation as an example, one can see that there is a certain degree of adherence to the ST, but the translator still faces, at some points, some cases which cannot be resolved unless an adaptation strategy is applied. This will be discussed again in Alcarez and Hughes later in this chapter.

2.1.2 Oblique Translation
Oblique translation involves the following four sub-classes:
(i) Transposition:
Transposition ‘involves replacing one word class with another without changing the meaning of the message’ (Vinay and Darbelnet, 1995:36). For example, the English sentence: ‘The economy did not stop growing’ can be translated into Arabic in two ways:

1) لم يتوقف الاقتصاد عن النمو
2) النمو الاقتصاد نموا ثابتا

The first translation is literal, where no change has occurred, while in the second translation a transposition has occurred on two levels, the first of which is a verb (يتمو / yanmu) for noun (growing / نمو) and the second is an adjective (ثابت / thabitan) for a verb (did not stop - لم يتوقف - / lam yatwaqaf).

Transposition can be either obligatory or optional as in the following two examples:

1) - إدارتها إدارة علالة
   Operating it effectively. (obligatory)
2) He heard noise when he got up - سمع ضجة عند استيقاظه - (optional)

In the first example, an obligatory transposition has occurred as the Arabic phrase (إدارة علالة / idarah fa'alah) which is categorized as an absolute object in Arabic, and a means of root repetition is translated into English as an adverb. It can also be translated as a prepositional phrase: ‘in an effective way’. More precisely, the noun (إدارة / idarah) and its adjective (فاعل / fa'alah) is translated into English as an adverb (effectively). The reason why an obligatory transposition has occurred is that there is no equivalent in the TT to the absolute object and avoidance of the repeated word was pertinent. In the second example, an optional transposition has occurred with the translation of the English adverb of time (when) as an adverb of place in Arabic (عند / ىinda ) and a phrasal verb (got up) as a verbal noun (استيقاظه / 'stiyqazih). Thus, a transposition has not been occurred if the whole sentence was translated as:

سمع ضجة حينا استيقظ (2a)
(ii) Modulation:
Modulation entails a change of the message due to change of the point of view. A negative SL expression is turned into a positive TL expression such as ‘it is not a strong argument’ which can be translated as (حجة واهية / hijah wahiyyah).

Like transposition, it can be obligatory or optional. It is optional if (متبوع العلم / manba’ al-‘ilm – the fountain of knowledge) is translated as ‘the root of knowledge’, but obligatory if one translates (حجة باردة / hujah baredah – cold argument) as ‘weak argument’.

(iii) Equivalence:
It is not the same as the term used by other theorists. A typical example is that of the proverbs and clichés that describe the same situation across languages by different stylistic means. This is exemplified by the English-Arabic proverb pair:
‘Birds of the same feathers flock together – الطيور على أنفاسها تقع’

(iv) Adaptation:
It occurs in cases where the translator faces a situation in the SL that does not exist in the TL culture such as in the case of translating story and film titles. English and Arabic are languages of remote cultures, thus this technique will be useful in translating culturally-bound terms and expressions from and into Arabic.

The above discussion shows that transposition and literal translation presuppose a solid knowledge of the linguistic structures of both languages whereas modulation, equivalence, and adaptation require translators to have additional experience and locate texts in their social contexts. It is also clear that both transposition and adaptation apply in the process of translating from English into Arabic and vice versa.
Thus, they will be useful as tools of analyzing translationally-parallel legal texts.\(^1\)

2.2 Alcherez and Hughes: Techniques of Adaptation
In their book *Legal Translation Explained*, Alcherez and Hughes discuss legal translation between English and Spanish. This book is essential in this research since it provides a good account of legal translation; identifying the features and genres of legal discourse; listing some types of legal translation, and most importantly, discussing the problems of legal translation. It is equally essential since it does not only discuss the problems of legal translation, but it also offers some strategies of dealing with them. These strategies are called the ‘techniques of adaptation’.

Alcarez and Hughes argue that word-by-word translation does not exist between languages and it is ‘a metaphor albeit a buried one’ (2002:180). Saying this they differ with Vinay and Darbelnet who claim that literal translation is the author’s prescription for ‘good translation’ (1995:34). As Alcarez and Hughes believe that ‘the idea of identity is illusory’, they support the idea that there must be some adaptation while translating between two languages, or more specifically they speak of ‘naturalness or dynamic equivalence’ (2002:179-80). Nevertheless, they do not advocate for free translation since there is ‘no place for such free-ranging adaptation in the translation of legal texts’ (ibid). They rather meant to deal with translation by adopting Hamlet’s principle ‘by indirections, find directions out’ (ibid). To achieve this, they discuss some aspects that the translator should consider in the process of translating legal texts. These aspects are:

(a) Transposition
(b) Expansion
(c) Modulation

---

\(^1\)Transpositions and techniques of adaptations will be revisited again in Alcarez and Hughes’ model.
In the following section we will be concerned with the discussion of transposition, expansion and modulation only. Other elements are not dealt with as they are outside the scope of this thesis.

2.2.1 Transposition

According to Alcarez and Hughes, transposition describes ‘the substitution of one category for another, on the basis that may be fairly said to possess the same semantic weight or equivalent semic density’ (2002:181). Their example: ‘for late delivery’ (ibid) can be translated into Arabic as (تاخر السليم / lita’khur al-taslim - due to delay in the delivery) where a transposition of a noun for an adjective has occurred. That is, the SL adjective ‘late’ was rendered in the TL as a noun (تأخر / ta’khur – delay). Alcarez and Hughes (181-3) have listed types of transposition as (a) verb for noun; (b) pronoun for noun; (c) noun for adjective; (d) noun for verb; (e) active or impersonal form for passive; (f) relative or noun phrase for gerund or prepositional phrase with ‘with’; and (g) noun phrase for adverbial phrase.

2.2.2 Expansion

For Alcarez and Hughes (2002:184), expansion, periphrasis, or explicitation, as they put it is ‘one of the techniques that may be called for in translating virtually any part of speech, often in conjunction with transposition’. They maintain that this technique is helpful in translating prepositions, and/or adverbials. An example of English would be (irrevocable divorce - طلاق بائن لا رجعة فيه - talaq ba’in la raja’ata fihi). In this example, the word irrevocable is rendered into
Arabic as (بائن / ba’in) then the translator opted for an expansion of (بائن / ba’in) with (لا رجعة فيه / la raja’ata fihi) to distinguish it from another type of divorce (revocable divorce) in which one can return his divorcee to his custody.

2.2.3 Modulation

Modulation, according to Alcarez and Hughes (2002:185), involves changes to semantic categories or even alteration of the processes by which thoughts are expressed. For them, it is more common in both general and literary translation than in specialized and technical translation as it involves a spill of the translator’s own point of view and change of style through the ornaments of some touches of rhetorical figures.

It is clear, however, that the above techniques are not totally different from those given by Vinay and Darbelnet (1995) and which are discussed earlier in this chapter. They are equally similar to Catford’s structure shifts.


In chapter two and three, culture-bound elements were discussed and it was noted that they are one of the problematic areas in legal translation. Our task here is to check how certain religious, Shari‘ah Law and culture-specific elements are translated and which technique is used with regards to Vinay and Darbelnet (1995), Catford (2000), and Alcarez and Hughes (2002), the following table represents the technique of translation of the pre-mentioned elements.

### 3.1 Quantitative Analysis of Religious, Shari‘ah Law and Culture-Bound Terms and Phrases:

---

1 For examples on this, see Alcarez and Hughes, p185.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Arabic (ST)</th>
<th>English (TT)</th>
<th>Technique of Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم</td>
<td>In the Name of God the Compassionate, the Merciful</td>
<td>adaptation of the term ‘Allah’ to ‘God’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Hatim, Buckley and Shunnaq, 1995:80-109)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>يتقوا الله</td>
<td>may God be his sufficiency</td>
<td>adaptation of the term ‘Allah’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(ibid: 84–85)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>حسبه الله تعالى</td>
<td>a firmly established conviction</td>
<td>addition expansion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(ibid)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>عقيدة راسخة</td>
<td>and a belief in Almighty God.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>و إياك يبان الله سبحانه وتعالى</td>
<td>religious, legal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(ibid:90-91)</td>
<td>.equitably</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>الشرعي</td>
<td>shall have attained the age of puberty and should be free of all legal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(ibid:102-103)</td>
<td>impediments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>المعروف</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(ibid: 96-97)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>باغلا خلوا من الموانع الشرعية</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Mansoor, 1965a, b: 299,140)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
amount and type of dowry

absolve literal

categorically and totally

absolves me from
divorce adaptation

the expansion

of the marriage

being together literal transposition

remarriage to a divorced wife
The following table provides some statistical information on the above techniques:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Technique of Translation</th>
<th>No of Occurrences</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>adaptation</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>expansion</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>literal</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 These dots between the word ‘minor’ and the word ‘degree’ is how they have been represented in the TT.
Table 2: frequency analysis of the techniques of translating religious and culture-specific terms in Arabic-English official documents

The above information can be presented in the following chart:

Figure 1: frequency analysis of the techniques used in translating religious, Shari‘ah and culture-specific terms in Arabic-English official documents.
As shown in the above table and the chart, ‘adaptation’ comes in first place in terms of the number of occurrences and percentage (30%). Similarly, ‘expansion’, and ‘literal translation’ have achieved the same degrees of frequency of the total number of techniques (25%), whereas ‘transposition’ comes in second degree (15%), ‘borrowing’ has registered only (5%).

3.2 Qualitative Analysis of Religious, Shari‘ah Law, and Culture-Bound Terms and Expressions.

This section offers a theory-based critical analysis of the above elements. For easiness of layout, it is worthwhile dividing them into some subcategories as given below:

(a) Reference to God:
Reference to God includes elements such as the basmalla (بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم / bismi Allah al-rahman al-rahim - in the name of God, the Compassionate the Merciful). As seen from the alignment table, the translator uses the technique of ‘adaptation’ according to Vinay and Darblenet (1995:37). That is, (الله /Allah) is rendered as ‘God’. This technique, according to Venuti’s (1995) ‘foreignization’ makes the phrase more accepted in the TL. It has been used as it is for a long time and has been given the static form of a template and it becomes accepted translation. Asensio (2003:21) suggests the possibility of deleting these elements as follows; …formulas of salutation referring to God are intertextual references, fully meaningful in the Arabic text, but this intertextuality is lost in non-Islamic cultures … These ritual formulas do not have any relevance for the legal validity of the document; consequently, the possibility of omitting their translation remains open.

Aixela (1996:64) justifies the omission of culture-specific items in cases where they are either unacceptable in the target culture or irrelevant to the target reader or when the item in question is
ambiguous. I do not agree, however, with Aixela’s viewpoint regarding the possibility of omitting items on the grounds of ambiguity. It is not his/her task neither to deal with such ambiguity nor omit them. The only thing one can do is to represent this ambiguous term as it is in the TT as Alcarez and Hughes (2002:43) put it as follows:
Although structure ambiguity is a problem, the translator must stick to the structure at hand. Then, he produces a similar ambiguous translation. He has no choice to choose from other alternatives. The best thing a translator can do is understand the context he faces a linguistic ambiguity, if not he must stick to the literal sense of the source text and leave the interpretation to the court.

They (ibid: 153)add:
Also the translators might seek to use the most frequent structures that are specifically used in dealing with problems of legal discourse.

Although Alcarez and Hughes discuss the structural ambiguity, I believe, this can also be applied to lexical ambiguity. For example, the phrase (بتقوى الله / bitaqwa Allah – to be God fearing) in the example that follows as it stands is not clear to the target reader what is the relationship between ‘fearing God’ and the importance of keeping an eye on the minor’s money. Although part of this meaning is given in the next clause: ‘and to perform all tasks related to the guardian’, yet one cannot decide to omit it because of this reason.

Other phrases referring to God have been used in the body of the certificates themselves. Consider the following instance from a Certificate of Guardianship:

وقد أوصي به تعالى و القيام بشؤون هذه الوصاية بما فيه الخض و النفع لجهة ... فقبل ذلك مني وتعهد بالالتزام حسب الله تعالى.

I have informed the guardian to be God fearing and to perform all tasks related to guardianship in the interest and in the benefit of … He
has accepted this from me and undertaken to fulfil his obligation, may God be his sufficiency. (Hatim, Buckley and Shunnaq, 1995: 84–85)

In the above example, the Arabic reader can easily understand the connotative meaning or the implicit meaning of the first underlined phrase. That is, if you are a guardian of any person’s money or any other interests, you need to be careful not to steal or cheat them. The translator has given, in the TT, the denotative meaning of the phrase ‘to be God fearing’ following the technique of ‘adaptation’. Because of this, the English reader does not get the same connotation given in the original and he/she needs to know what is relationship between fearing God and the importance of keeping an eye on the minor’s money. Part of this meaning is given in the next clause: ‘and to perform all tasks related to the guardian’, but not conveying the religious sense of the Arabic statement given in (God fearing - /تقوى الله / taqwa Allah).

The translator has followed the technique of ‘adaptation’ (Vinay and Darblenet, 1995:34) in rendering the two phrases ( /بَيِّنَتْنَا لَهُ / bitaqwa Allah – to be God fearing and ( /حَسَبَهُ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى - may God be his sufficiency). The latter for example denotes that ‘God’ will be the only witness if the guardian will fulfil his commitments or not. This statement is one of the religious formulas added to the ST and it does not add anything to the TT and omitting it will not affect the legal validity of the document, according to Asensio (2003:21) quotation above. This omission can be justified by the existence of the previous statement (He has accepted this from me and undertaken to fulfil his obligation - /فَاقِبَلَ ذَلِكَ مِنْي وَتَعَهدَ بِالنِّزَامِ - faqabila dhalika miny wa ta‘ahada biltizamahi) that conveys that intended meaning.

(b) Islamic and Shari‘ah Law Terms and Concepts

In chapter two, we have discussed the difficulty of translating culture-bound terms between two different languages. Because of this, the
target reader is confronted with a whole range of Islamic concepts that are specific and they cannot be understood unless the target reader has a strong background. The solution we suggested, in chapter four, is that the translator can provide some explanation in a form of a footnote. In chapter four, we have also referred to Alcarez and Hughes (2002) adaptations as means of overcoming the differences between two congruent cultures. The following are some examples of the documents cited in Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq (1995). For easiness of citation I will be referring to the page number only.

**Translation of the word (الشرعي / al-sharṣī – legal or religious)**

The ST word (الشرعي / al-sharṣī) is rendered in two ways, either as religious or as legal. Consider the example below:

From a Certificate of Confirmation of Parentage

في المجلس الشرعي المعقود لدي أنا ... قاضي ... الشرعي حضر لدي المكلف شرعا ... من ... وسكان ... وبعد التعريف الشرعي عليه من قبل ... قرر بحضورهما وهو في الحالة المعتبرة شرعا ... قالتله قصد تولد لي من زوجتي الشرعية ... على فراش الزوجة الأولاد أو الولد ...

In the Legal Council convened in my presence, I ... the religious judge of ... received the legally capable ... from ... and resident in ... and after the identification by ... he deemed to be legally competent, resolved in their presence, stating:

The children or child ... was born to me from my legal wife within the state of matrimony. (Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq, 1995:102-103)

As the above excerpt shows, the word (الشرعي / al-sharṣī) is used to denote two senses, the first of which is rendered as ‘legal’ and the other as ‘religious’ as it specifies the judge that deals with these matters as a religious judge and a normal judge that deals with other cases. This religious judge’s role is similar to the role of the (كاتب العدل / katib al-‘adl – adults), or notaries in modern times. Consider also the following excerpt which occurred in all the documents:
This is a cliché in all the official documents cited in Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq. In the first line, an addition of the word ‘Islamic’ occurred though not existing in the ST (Chief Justice) to identify this type of court in the Islamic countries. Accordingly, the word (الشرعية / al-shar′iyyah) is rendered as ‘religious’.

There is a problem in the translation of (وعبد التعريف الشرعي / wa ba‘ada al-ta‘rif al-shar′i) as ‘and after identification’ which does not represent the same sense given in the ST. The translator has unjustifiably omitted the equivalent of the word (الشرع / al-shar′i - legal), hence omitting very important piece of information for the validity of the TT as a document that can stand alone.

(قد تولد لي / qad tulad li) with the modal particle (قد/ qad) denoting probability in the future. This clause is rendered as ‘was born to me’: a passive in the past which is inaccurate. It should be ‘My wedded wife may give birth to...’ by employing a ‘voice shift’ from passive in the ST to an active in the TT. The ST also refers to the baby (ies) that will be born to him from his legal wife as (الأولاد أو الولد / al-awlad aw al-wald – the boys or the boy). The ST restricts the gender of the babies to boys only. In fact, Arabic still uses the superiority element in referring to gender and this does not exclude both sexes. The evidence of this argument is that the translator, being aware of this element, translates both words as ‘children or child’ to include both sexes in the TT. A shift has occurred to make the TT more binding.
Translation of the term (المعروف / al-ma‘ruf – ‘equity’ or ‘good act’)

One more religious term was mentioned in a Certificate of Maintenance of Legal Minors:

بدفع المبلغ المذكور ... لأنفاقه على الفاعل ... بالمعروف.

... so that he may equitably provide for the legal minor. (Hatim, Buckley and Shunnaq, 1995:96-97)

Again the Arabic word (بانالمعروف / bilma‘ruf) was rendered as ‘equitably’. One of the meanings of the word ‘equitable’ as defined in the Osborn’s Concise Law Dictionary is:

‘That which is fair’ (p.152)

The Arabic word (بانالالمعروف - bilma‘ruf) is general as it can give more than one meaning. Yet, it means in this context (العدل –bil‘adl - justice /fairness). Accordingly, the translator chooses the nearest equivalent: ‘equitable’. The technique of ‘transposition’ (Vinay and Darblenet, 1995:36) or Catford’s technique of ‘class shift’ (1965:78) is employed in translating the ST prepositional phrase (بانالالمعروف / bilma‘ruf) as an adverb ‘equitably’ in the TT. This technique results in giving the nearest economic translation presented in the TT. It can also be translated as ‘fairly’ or into a prepositional phrase ‘in a fair way’.

Terms related to marriage in Shari‘ah

From a Marriage Contract:
Example 1:

الزوج - الرجل – البالغ – العاقل – الأعزب

The male spouse, a bachelor/married man of legal age and of sound mind:

الزوجة - البيت - يكر - ثب - البالغة - العاقلة

The female spouse, a virgin/non-virgin of legal age and of sound mind (Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq, 19:5.86-87)
This example represents the legal requirements for a man and woman to be married. A man has a legal age to be eligible to marry. This legal age, in Egypt for instance, is 18 under the child protection law. Thus, the legal age is to be distinguished from the maturity age. A man has to be of sound mind and can be a bachelor or married. This piece of information is not given in the ST but is added by the translator in the TT. The translator does not justify this addition although it is correct because it is based on the cultural differences between English and Arabic marriage laws. 1

Example 2:
In the Tunisian Code of Personal Status I, Mansoor (1965a:299) gives the following example:

Both spouses shall have attained the age of puberty and should be free of all legal impediments. The woman is considered to have attained the age of puberty on the completion of fifteen years of age and the man on the completion of eighteen years. The marriage of either who is below the said ages shall be subject to a special authorization by the

_____________________________________

1 According to theSharī‘ah law, a man can marry up to four wives. A wife, on the other hand, can be virgin (not married before) or non-virgin (married before, but no longer married before the consummation of a new marriage). These conditions, on the contrary, are different form the English marriage conditions. An English man cannot marry more than one by law. Also, the marriageable age of a man is 18 years and for a woman is 16 years. A marriage must take place in the Church with parental consent. Accordingly, the translation as it stands is literal. The translator needed to add a footnote to clarify why he/she has added this word: ‘married’, otherwise he/she should adhere to the ST to avoid misunderstanding.
judge, and that will be given upon proof of attainment of physical maturity. (Mansoor, 1965b:140)

As the example shows, there are two different concepts, (العمر الشرعي / balighan khulwan min al-mawani‘ al-shar‘iyyah) which was translated as ‘shall have attained the age of puberty and should be free of all legal impediments’. The other expression is (البلوغ الطبيعي / al-bulugh al tabi‘iyy) which is rendered as ‘physical maturity’. Thus, the translator refers to (balighan and al-bulugh) as ‘puberty’ and ‘physical maturity’. Thus, the first word (balighan) according to the overall context refers to the legal maturity which is defined in the text 15 years for the female and 18 years for the male. It is rendered as ‘puberty’ which can refer to physical maturity and/or legal maturity as defined by Webster’s Dictionary as follows:

1. ‘the condition of being or the period of becoming first capable of reproducing sexually marked by maturing of the genital organs, development of secondary sex characteristics, and in the human and in higher primates by the first occurrence of menstruation in the female.’
2. ‘the age at which puberty occurs often construed legally as 14 in boys and 12 in girls.’

Example 3:
المهر و نوعه: Amount and Type of Dowry
المعجل: Down-payment
المؤجل: Deferred Payment
توابع المهر: Extras (Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq, 1995:86-87)
Farauqi's Law Dictionary Arabic-English, translates the word (مهر / mahr) as 'dower'.

‘Dowery’ is an archaic word defined by Webster’s Dictionary as: Dower (1) the money, goods, or estate that a woman brings to her husband in marriage (2) a gift of money or property by a man to or for his bride. It is also defined in Osborne’s Concise Law Dictionary (2001:142) as follows:

1. The property which the bride brings to her groom in marriage. Also known as dowry or dowery.
2. A widow’s life interest in a portion of her deceased husband’s property: that portion of lands or tenements which the wife hath for a term of her life of the lands and tenements of her husband after his decease, for the sustenance of herself and the nurture and the education of her children …

The translator has used the technique of ‘cultural adaptation’ by giving the nearest equivalent in the English culture. If the document is legally binding, we recommend that the exact concept of the word should be included in the TT. In this context Asensio, 2003:62 argues:

The Arabic sadaq is regularly translated as dowry. But the dowry (in fact, shiwar) is offered to the bride by her father as a custom whereas the sadaq is offered by the bridegroom as an element necessary for the legal validity of the marriage. This is usually law-risk information but could become critical. For instance, it could lead to the annulment of the marriage by a Spanish judge applying Moroccan law.

Translation of the term (إبارة / ibra’ – absolution)

From a Certificate of Non-liability

قررت قائلة وهي في الحاله المعتبرة شرعا اني ايرأت ذمة زوجي ...

She, being legally competent, resolved, saying:

I absolve my husband … from responsibility over … (Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq, 1995: 92-93)
‘Absolve’ according to Webster’s Dictionary is defined as follows:
1: to set free from an obligation or the consequences of guilt.
2: to remit (a sin) by absolution.

‘Absolve’ is translated into Arabic by Faruqi’s Law Dictionary
(English-Arabic) as:

‘Aquittal, absolution, release, release of a debtor from his liabilities,

According to the definitions given above, the Arabic word
(إبراح / al-ibra’) presupposes the husbands’ liabilities or obligations (i.e.
maintenance) towards his wife. The word ‘absolve’ is one of the
equivalents in English, although the two meanings of the word given
in Webster’s Dictionary do not mean the same in Islamic Law. The
translator has ‘added’ the word ‘responsibility over …’ in the TT to
make the absolving more specific and denotes what is exactly meant
in this particular context (i.e. paying a fixed sum of money each
month).

It is worth mentioning that the word (إبراح / ibra’) was rendered in the
title as ‘non-liability’ leaving it vague at the first instance. The reader
needs to wait to see what is meant by the word through the text.
Translating the term (طلاق / talaq - divorce) and its synonyms

This term occurs in a considerable number of the Arabic corpus. It is very important to look at the different synonyms of the term and how they are rendered into English. But before we do this, it is beneficial to introduce the meaning term.¹

It is worth mentioning that (الفسخ / al-faskh) is used in Arabic if a man and a woman are engaged and in most cases there is no marriage contract as yet. If a marriage contract exists, its dissolution is called (طلاق / talaq - divorce). It can also be called (انفصال / infisal - separation).

It is worth mentioning that Asensio (1995:62) commented on the translation of the word (طلاق / talaq) from Arabic into Spanish as follows:

Many official translators render the Arabic talaq as divorce, although it means repudiation. ‘Divorce’ benefits the Western local authority, which thus avoids the dilemma of validating legal act, repudiation, that may be unconstitutional and against the local law. This solution is inaccurate but inconvenient.

Although Asensio, in the above quotation, highlights the existence of a difference between the concept of ‘talaq’ and ‘divorce’, he does not make it quite clear what this difference is. Neither does he explain what he means by the idea of ‘divorce benefiting the local authorities’. One of the definitions of ‘repudiate’ is given by Webster’s Dictionary as ‘to divorce or separate formally from (a woman)’. Thus, it is likely that ‘repudiation’ can be one of the alternative equivalents for the

¹ Talaq refers to the termination of marriage by the husband either verbally by declaring ‘I divorce you’ up to three times or through an authorized written form.
word, but it will not highlight the cultural difference imbedded in the Arabic term. The translator uses the word ‘divorce’ in the TT, he/she uses the strategy of approximation (i.e. the nearest equivalent in the TT). Another way of keeping the spirit of the ST culture in the TT is to transliterate the Arabic word (طلاق / talaq), and include the meaning of the concept in a footnote.

Example3:
حجة رجعة – Certificate of Remarriage to a Divorced Wife

قَرَرَ قَانِلًا إِنِّي كَنُتْ قَدْ طَلَقْتُ زَوجَيٌّ وَمَدْخُوْلَيْنِ الشِّريْعَة ثُلَّةً رَجَعَة
He resolved stating:
I revocably divorced my wife with whom, I had consummated the marriage … (Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq, 1995: 98-99)

In the excerpt above, the Arabic text includes a doublet (زواجتي و مدخولتي / zawjati wa madkhulati), which seems synonymous but they are indeed different. In Islamic law a man and a woman can be married with a legal marriage contract but they may not have consummated marriage. Thus, the translator employs the technique of ‘expansion’ according to Alcarez and Hughes (2002:184) twice. Firstly by adding the word (مدخولتي / madkhulati) to clarify that the actual marriage is being undertaken between the couple. Secondly, the translator explained the word (مدخولتي / madkhulati) by adding ‘with whom, I have consummated the marriage’ to the word ‘wife’ giving the exact meaning of the Arabic term.

In the same example, the word (طَلَقَة رَجَعَة / talqah raj‘yyah) is an Islamic law term which is also referred to, according to (Al-Khudrawi, 1995:263-4), as (طَلَقَة رَجَعَيْنِ talaq raj‘i – revocable divorce), which is again referred to below as (talaq ba‘in baynunah sughra). This is how it is defined by Al-Khudrawi (ibid)
Revocable divorce, remarriage may take place with the divorcer before or after the completion of the (‘iddah) provided only the first or second sentence of divorce has been pronounced.

Based on the above examples, in translating the term in the title of the document, the translator uses the strategy of ‘addition’ in rendering the term (رجعة / raj‘ah) in the title of the document, when the ST term is rendered as ‘remarriage to a divorced wife’. This is most common in translating titles which depend mainly on the main body and content of the document.

Example 4:

و حيث إنها ما زالت في العدة الشرعية فأرجعتها إلى عصمتني و عقد نكاحي...

And whereas she is still within the legally prescribed waiting period before remarrying, I return her to my matrimonial authority and to my contract of marriage. (Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq, 1995: 98-99)
The above excerpt represents another instance of the Shari‘ah terms that cannot be just transliterated or simply defined as Hatim, Buckley and Shunnaq did above. The term (العده الشرعية / al-‘iddah al-shar‘iyah) is rendered as ‘the legally prescribed waiting period before remarrying’.\(^1\) The translator has used the technique of ‘explicitation’ or ‘expansion’ (Alcarez and Hughes, 2002:184) by explaining the meaning of the term rather than, perhaps, transliterating it followed by this explanation. The meaning of the term is not clear despite the addition of ‘before remarrying’. I believe, it is still incomplete and alien to the target reader who is not familiar with Shari‘ah law. Mansoor (1965b:141) has given the following translation of the term (عدة / ‘iddah) in the Tunisian Personal Status – II:

The wife of the missing person, following a court decision designating him a missing person, shall observe the same period of ‘iddat as that applicable in case of death. (Mansoor, 1965b:141)

---

\(^1\) This term (‘iddah) is mentioned in the Qur’an in Sūra 65 verse: 4. I have provided three parallel forms of translation referring to it as provided by Ali, Pickthal, and Shakir. These are given below:

**YUSUFALI:** Such of your women as have passed the age of monthly courses, for them the prescribed period, if ye have any doubts, is three months, and for those who have no courses (it is the same): for those who carry (life within their wombs), their period is until they deliver their burdens: and for those who fear Allah, He will make their path easy.

**PICKTHAL:** And for such of your women as despair of menstruation, if ye doubt, their period (of waiting) shall be three months, along with those who have it not. And for those with child, their period shall be till they bring forth their burden. And whosoever keepeth his duty to Allah, He maketh his course easy for him.

**SHAKIR:** And (as for) those of your women who have despaired of menstruation, if you have a doubt, their prescribed time shall be three months, and of those too who have not had their courses; and (as for) the pregnant women, their prescribed time is that they lay down their burden; and whoever is careful of (his duty to) Allah He will make easy for him his affair. (065.004)
In this example, Mansoor has borrowed, then transliterated the Islamic law term (عدة/ یبدت) because it has no equivalent in the English language. And because there are two cases for یبدت in Islamic law, Mansoor distinguishes the one mentioned in the text in case of (الوفاة/ al-wafah - death) from the other type of یبدت (that applicable if the wife has been divorced). Mansoor has added ‘as that applicable in case of death.’

Al-Khudrawi (1995:277) has defined and distinguished between two types of (عدة/ یبدت) below:

The term of probation incumbent upon a woman in consequence of dissolution of marriage either by divorce or the death of her husband. After a divorce the period is three months, and after the death of her husband, four months and ten days, both periods being enjoined by the Qur’an.  

---

1 Details of the exact time of iddah in the Qur’an has been mentioned in Sura 2 , J.2 , verses (232-234) as follows:

‘When ye divorce Women, and they fulfil the term of their (Iddat), do not prevent them from remarrying their (former) husbands, if they mutually agree on equitable terms. This instruction is for all amongst you, who believe in Allah and the last Day. That is (the course making for) most virtue and purity amongst you. And Allah knows, and ye know not. The mothers shall give suck to their offspring for two whole years, for him who desires to complete the term. But he shall bear the cost of their food and clothing on equitable terms … If any of you die and leave widows behind; they shall wait concerning themselves four months and ten days when they have fulfilled their term. No soul shall have a burden laid on greater than it can bear. No mother shall be treated unfairly on account of her child. Nor father on account of his child. An heir shall be chargeable in the same way. If they both decide on warning, by mutual consent, and after due consultation. There is no blame on them, if ye decide on a foster-mother for your offspring. There is no blame on you, provided ye pay (the foster mother) what ye offered on equitable terms. But fear Allah and know that Allah sees well what ye do. If any of you die and leave widows behind; they shall wait concerning themselves four months and ten days when they have fulfilled their term, there is no blame on you if they dispose of themselves in a just and reasonable manner. And Allah is well acquainted with what ye do’. 

292
Judging by the above definition, the overall translation of the term (عدة / ʿiddat) is not fully or successfully presented to the target reader. It will not, therefore, be a good reference for an English court if a case arises.

Example 5:
/ Certificate of irrevocable Divorce before Consummation of Marriage

... فأقول زوجتي المذكورة التي لم أدخل ولم اتحلي بها طلاق من عصمي وعقد نكاحي طلاق واحدة بائنة اطلت تسجيلها وتلبينها. و حيث حقق إلينا سبب الزوجية بينهما وعهد الدخول والخلوة الصحيحة بإقراره وإفادة المعترف المذكورين فقد أفهمته أنه وقع من طلاق بائنة بينونية صغيرة على جمهته ... المذكورة. و أنها لا تحل له إلا بعد ومهر جديدين ولا عدة عليها ...

... and I state that my aforementioned wife with whom I have not consummated the marriage and have not been alone is irrevocably divorced from my matrimonial authority and my contract of marriage once and for all and I request that be recorded and that she be notified. Whereas a state of matrimony previously existing between them, non-consummation of the marriage and not being together have been ascertained to us by his avowal and the testimony of the aforementioned identifiers, I have informed him he has concluded an irrevocable divorce of ... degree of irrevocability from his aforementioned wife ... and that she is not permitted to him except by a new contract and dowry, that she is no legally prescribed waiting period before remarrying. (Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq, 1995: 104-105)

This excerpt is problematic in two ways: firstly it is erroneous in translating the term (طلاق / talaq) in the title and in the body of the certificate. The translator has given the wrong equivalent in the TT by
translating it to ‘irrevocable divorce’ rather than ‘revocable divorce’. The term ‘irrevocable divorce’ is defined by (Al-Khudrawi, 1995:264):

Irrevocable divorce

If the husband gives sentence of divorce to his wife a third time, it is not lawful for him to take her again, until she shall have married another husband.

Based on the above definition, and on the information given in the above Arabic excerpt (i.e. the number of talaq statements mentioned in the text / talqah wahidah ba’inh - one revocable divorce statement), one can identify the type of divorce as ‘revocable’ (طلاق بائن صغيرى / talaq ba’ín baynunah sughra).

The other problematic example existing in the above text is the translation of the clause (لم ادخل ولم اختملي بها / lam adkhul wa lam akhtali biha) which is rendered as ‘with whom I have not consummated the marriage and have not been alone’.

The first part is correctly translated while the underlined part is vaguely rendered. It is more or less the same meaning contained in the first part but it should be more explicit on the part of the translator. For the target reader, it does not give any sense and it does not represent the meaning included in the source culture. Later in the text, the clause is repeated with a different wording: (الخليوة الصحيحه / al-khalwah al-sahihah) and was vaguely rendered: ‘not being together’. As it is always advisable that the translator should keep the vagueness represented in the ST, for attaining the same sense given in the ST.\(^1\) Another suggestion is that translator may add an explanatory footnote

\(^1\) This has been mentioned earlier by Alcarez and Hughes (2002:43 and 153)
by providing the target reader with the conditions of the right ‘khalwah’ such as being separately in one room, with the door closed or curtains drawn.

**Example 6:**
From the Tunisian Code of personal Status – II

The husband in case of dissolution of marriage, recover from his wife whatever remains of gifts he gave her after the conclusion of marriage contract if the dissolution occurs after the consummation of the marriage. (Mansoor, 1965b: 141)

The example wording of the Arabic ST is vague and requires reconsideration. The ST introduces an article in the Tunisian Code of Personal Status that explains two cases in relation to the husband’s eligibility to recover any presents that he has given to his wife. In the first case, if the couple are officially married, but have not consummated marriage as yet, and their marriage contract comes to an end, from the side of the wife, the husband is eligible to receive all the remaining presents back even if they are used. In the second case, if the couple have already consummated marriage, then if divorce happens, the husband is not eligible to receive any of his presents back.¹

The condition for recovering the husband’s presents is exemplified in the conditional clause (إذا وقع الفسخ قبل الزواج) / idha waqa’a al-faskh ba’dal bayn)

¹ This shows an example of purely-cultural situations that do not exist in the TT. That is, the English culture distinguishes between engagements which do not take place at the Church. If this engagement is broken, the fiancé does not recover any presents back, he can sometimes recover the ring. Marriage itself takes place at Church and is consummated once a contract is signed.
al-bina’). What is meant by (الفسخ / al faskh) is ‘divorce’ or ‘dissolution’, and what is meant by (البناء – al-bina’) is consummation of marriage. This word is metaphorical as it exemplifies the consummation of marriage with the construction of a building. It word is not represented in the TT, neither metaphorically nor literally. Unjustifiable ‘omission’ is employed here when the translator leaves out the Arabic phrase (بسبب منها / bisababin minha – for a reason from her) which means that ‘the reason of divorce emerged because of the wife’. This phrase, I suppose, is important in this context as it gives one of the cases for returning the husbands’ gifts, thus cannot be omitted.

The other misleading clause is (لا يسترجع منها شيئا بعد الدخول / la ustajrjaً minha shya’n ba’da al-dukhul) which was rendered as ‘if the dissolution occurs after the consummation of the marriage’, not including that ‘the husband is not eligible to have his presents back if he divorced his wife after the consummation of marriage’. This results in a totally erroneous translation which does not include all the cases given in the ST. It does not also show to the target reader the real meanings of the purely cultural words mentioned above. A better translation should be:

The husband shall in case of dissolution of marriage, recover from his wife, if the dissolution occurs before of the consummation of marriage because of her, whatever remains of gifts he gave her. The husband shall not recover any remaining gifts if the dissolution occurs after the consummation of marriage. (my translation).

Although the translation is a bit repetitive, the main concern here is the clarity of showing the main condition of recovering the gifts which is the ‘consummation of marriage’.
3.4 Translation of Doublets, and Triplets in Arabic-English Documents

For the analysis of doublets and triplets in the Arabic-English documents, the following table presents all the instances that occurred in the corpus followed by a discussion. For the easiness of citation, I am going to present some examples given in Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq (1995) then follow on with examples from Mansoor (1965a, and b) in two separate tables. For this, I will refer to the page numbers of the quotation only after the Arabic excerpts. It is worth noting that the first number in the citation brackets refers to the Arabic ST and the second one refers to the English TT. The fourth column presents the technique of translation according to Vinay and Darblenet (1995) and Alcarez and Hughes (2002).

3.4.1 Quantitative Analysis of Doublets and Triplets in Arabic-English Documents

The following table represents doublets and triplets in Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq (1995).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Arabic</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Technique of Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>أمانته و استقامة وأكفااته وأماليته</td>
<td>his honesty, uprightness, eligibility, and competence</td>
<td>literal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(82-83)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>عينت وتنصيب</td>
<td>appointed and installed</td>
<td>literal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(84-85), (94-95)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>وصياً شرعاً ومتكلماً مرعياً</td>
<td>legal guardian and competent spokesman</td>
<td>literal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(84-85)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
his eligibility and honesty

is below the legal age of maturity

in the interests and in the benefit of …

I have given you my daughter in marriage

I accept your daughter in marriage

funds and assets

(a) a firmly established conviction
(b) and a belief in Almighty God.

the missing person

reliability and competence
my wife with whom I had consummated the marriage

my matrimonial authority and to my contract of marriage

(a) voluntarily and of my own free will,

(b) being fully aware and of sound mind

appoint as representative or deputise some other person.

(a) they are both of sound mind,

(b) fully aware and acting of their own volition

beneficiary or legatee
Table 3: alignment table and techniques of translating religious and culture-specific doublets and triplets in Arabic-English official documents.

Below is a table followed by a figure representing the frequency analysis of the techniques used in translating doublets and triplets in official documents.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Technique of Translation</th>
<th>No of Occurrences</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>literal</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>52.38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>omission</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>19.05%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>expansion</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>transposition</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>adaptation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>modulation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4: frequency analysis of doublets and triplets in Arabic-English official documents
Figure 2: frequency analysis of the techniques used in translating doublets and triplets in Arabic-English official documents

As the above table and chart show, the technique of ‘literal translation’ comes in first place with a percentage of (52.38%). ‘Omission’ comes in second place achieving a percentage of (19.05%) whereas ‘expansion’ achieved a percentage of (14.29%) of the total number of techniques used. ‘Transposition, ‘adaptation, and ‘modulation’ achieved the same number of occurrences and percentages (4.76%).

In some cases, the two words or phrases are adhered to or ‘literally’ presented, in others ‘reduction or omission’ is used and some others are translated by ‘expansion’. Repetition in translating some doublets is sometimes unjustified where one equivalent can render the intended meaning given in the original. One of these cases is given in example 2 of the above table:

appoint and installed (84-85; 94-95)

The translation of the ST words into ‘appointed and installed’ is redundant as ‘appoint’ gives the same meaning of ‘install’ in this context. Faruqi’s Law Dictionary (Arabic/English) (1983: 354) gives the following definition of the words:

appoint, install (in office, etc), institute (into)

Another needless repetition is exemplified in example 3 above where a legal guardian is supposed to be a spokesman as well. In number 6, either ‘interests’ or ‘benefits’ is enough as a rendition of (الاختياري / al-hadh wa al-naf). Examples 15 and 17 are other cases of redundancy. For instance, in 15 (بطموعي واختياري / bitaw‘i wa ikhtiyari) can be rendered in one word either ‘voluntarily’ or ‘of my own free will’. The translator has employed the technique of ‘transposition’ through rendering a prepositional phrase (بطموعي / bitaw‘i) into an
adverb ‘voluntarily’. In the second part of the doublet, a noun (اختياري / ikhtiyari) is shifted to a prepositional phrase (of my own free will). In so doing, the translator must be mindful of the TL collocational preferences and attempt to reconcile these with transfer of the semantic value of the expression (Emery, 1990:133).

In the second part of the example, (لاست مدهوش و متجمع بضواي العقلية /(lastu madhushan wa mutamati’ biqwaya al-إقلية) both parts are the same and can be rendered by ‘and of sound mind’. It is worth mentioning that Vinay and Darblenet’s (1995:37) technique of ‘modulation’ is employed in the translation of the negative clause (لاست مدهوش / lastu madhushan - not absent-minded) in Arabic into a TT positive clause ‘being fully aware’ with an addition of the adverb ‘fully’ that confirms the status of being aware.

In example 14, the doublet, (عصمتي وعقد نكاحي / ّismati wa ّaqd nikahi), is rendered as ‘my matrimonial authority and to my contract of marriage’. In Arabic, (عصمة النكاح / ّismat an-nikah) means ‘the bond of marriage’, and (في عصمة فلان / fi ّismat fulan) means ‘married to someone, under someone’s custody’ (Al-Khudrawi, 1995:286). Thus, I believe, the first part of the example 14 is best suited in this context.

Some repetitions are justified as given in example 13. As has been discussed earlier, a man can officially marry a wife, but still does not consummate marriage with her. Thus, the two words (زوجتي و مدخولتي / zawajati wa madkhulati) must be rendered into ‘my wife with whom I had consummated the marriage’ to explain the difference in the TT. Thus, the technique used in this example is that of ‘expansion’, as proposed by Alcarez and Hughes (2002:184).

Omissions are also used in some of the examples such as examples, 7, 8, and 11. In 7, and 8, the two words (زوجتك و أتكحلك / zawajtuka wa
ankahatuka) refer to ‘marriage’, and (قابِلَتُ وْ رضِيَتَ / qabiltu wa radiytu) is rendered as ‘accepted’. Also in 11, (الْمَفْقُودُ الْغَابِبِ / al-mafqud al-gha’ib – lit. the missing absent person) for which the two adjectives are rendered in one adjective ‘the missing’ with the addition of the noun ‘person’ as a substitution of the person pronoun implicitly existing in the two words. It is rare, though, that one word in Arabic can be rendered in English into two words (i.e. /al-shrut - terms and conditions). This procedure of omission in translating doublets and triplets can justify Asensio (2003:97) proposal towards translating doublets and triplets through ‘simplification as the valid translation procedure here’. Yet, this is not always the case as ‘translators, clients, recipients and lawyers prefer to translate into the same number of words’ (ibid). This is motivated by the quest of accuracy through adherence to the ST. Also in other cases, Asensio’s proposal cannot be applied as repetitions of the doublet and/or triplet in the TT is pertinent and simplification will affect the legal validity of the document in the TT (i.e. زواجه و مدخولتي / zawajati wa madkhulati) mentioned above).

There is also some examples which are not accurately translated such as example 9 where (عائِدات و تعويضات / ‘a’idat wa ta’widat) has been rendered as (funds and assets). The second part of the doublet (تعويضات / ta’widat) does not correspond to ‘assets’. It rather means ‘compensations’. It is worthwhile to see how ‘assets’ to is defined in by Bone (2001:39) in the Osborne’s Concise Law Dictionary as follows:

Property available for the payment of debts. Real assets are real property, and personal assets are personal property. Legal assets comprise everything which an executor takes by virtue of his office, and with which he would have been charged in an action at law. Equitable assets are such as could only be reached in a court of equity.
5.3.2 Translation of Doublets and Triplets in some Arabic-English Legislative Texts

In the following table, I will present some of the examples in Mansoor (1965a and b). In the third column, I will include the technique of translation page number of the ST followed by the page number of the TT as in the last table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Arabic</th>
<th>English</th>
<th>Technique of Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>دون ترخيص أو مانع أو عائق و دون أداء رسوم جمركية أو أية رسوم أو مكوس (285: article 2a)</td>
<td>without licence, objection or hindrance, and free of any customs duty or any other dues or taxes (126: article 2a)</td>
<td>literal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>التسهيلات والخدمات (287: article 3)</td>
<td>facilities and services (127:article 3)</td>
<td>literal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>النشاط المتبادل والصداق الوطيدة (289: article 1)</td>
<td>mutual understanding and firm friendship (129: article 1)</td>
<td>literal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As seen from the above table, all the three instances have been rendered literally into the same number of words compared to the previous examples given in Hatim, Buckley, and Shunnaq (1995) official documents. In the first instance, one can use hindrances for (مانع أو عائق / man‘aw ‘a’iq). In number 2, the ST doublets are synonyms and they can show much difference in a general context. Yet in a legal context, rendering the two of them is important as they may be legally binding to the TT.
6. Conclusion:

Translation of Islamic Shari‘ah, concepts, phrases and clauses do not follow a well-defined strategy. In translating culture-based terms, the translators employ many of Vinay and Darblent’s, Alcarez and Hughes’s, techniques such as ‘expansion, adaptation, transposition, and shift’. Similarly, translating doublets and triplets form Arabic into English does not follow a well-defined system, sometimes they are rendered into exactly the same range of words, no matter if they are redundant or not as it is the case in Mansoor (1965a and b), and in some examples in Hatim, Buckley and Shunnaq. Some of the repetitions are similar in the ST but they denote different cultural concepts that need to be transferred to the TT. Some doublets and triplets were rendered into one element in the TT. The translator views these as rewording of the same linguistic meaning and/or the cultural concept and decides to be economic in translating them.

Bibliography:

– Online sources:
Researching professional experience: 
focus on the freelance context

Muhammad Y Gamal  
University of New South Wales  
Sydney, Australia

Abstract:  
The academic examination of translation pedagogy over the past thirty years has gone through numerous phases that, to a large extent, have shaped the way it is delivered today. There has been a systematic effort to examine translation as an academic pursuit which led not only to the rise of Translation Studies but also to an increase in the number of descriptive models, theoretical frameworks and an increase in the number of postgraduate programs in the new discipline of Translation Studies. In this paper, I will argue that the over-academization of translation has been at the expense of practice and training. In many ways pedagogy appears to be divorced from the environment in which translation and interpreting services are being offered: a highly competitive market which operates within the freelance context. This paper is a part of a larger research that seeks to examine the nature of translation/interpreting experience and the views of academics, students and practitioners. In this part of my research, I will focus on translation experts who carry out practice but regularly reflect on their practice with reference to the academic/professional situation in the Middle East.

Key words: Translation pedagogy, research, relevance of theory, organizing practicum, professional practice, freelance context, translation experts, mentoring programs.
Introduction:

In the Egyptian temple of Abydos in southern Egypt, there is a scene showing the Pharaoh, King Seti I (c.1292 BC-1279 BC) with his young son, lassoing a bull. The significance of this scene lies in the fact that it sums up the handing down of experience and serves as one of the earliest examples of mentoring. Opposite the physical and practical scene is another very significant one showing the Pharaoh with his young son appearing before the “Kings List” in which the two regal figures examine the records of ancient Egypt from the First Dynasty (c.3100 BC-2890 BC) till their time. Here, once more, the young pharaoh is being trained and mentored by his experienced father of the Nineteenth Dynasty (c.1294 BC-1190 BC).

Apprenticeship, and to a large extent mentorship, has been a time-honored pedagogic technique that proved to be the most efficient and most successful technique surpassed only by talent. It is a professional technique that began in ancient Egypt and continued till the advent of the Industrial Revolution. Today, there are laws (in Australia and the US) that govern and regulate apprenticeships. However, the notion of apprenticeship has increasingly been confined to trades rather than the crafts, arts or sciences due to the “professional” rise of academic qualifications in the wake of the Second World War.

Despite the number of translation programs that proliferated in Arab, Asian and Australian universities over the past 20 years, almost all graduates still face the same challenge: no experience. While it is expected that fresh graduates from academic programs in translation and interpreting would lack “experience” and that they would gradually work, like other professions, towards accumulating experience through practice the reality is daunting: the competitive industry is not geared towards assisting fresh practitioners to gain experience, there are no mechanisms for supervising inexperienced interpreters and practitioners learn on the job as they go. Therefore, graduates feel that the swimming pool method of being pushed into
the deep end and the expectation that they have to learn how to swim, on their own, is neither efficient nor professional.

There is a huge a gap between academia and the industry. The former is governed by a set of rules that wants to maintain to stay socially viable while the latter demands a set of skills without which it can not remain commercially viable. This chasm has its roots in the development of translation studies over the past fifty years.

**Emergence of Translation Studies:**

Lefevere (1992: xi) describes the emergence of translation studies as the “success story of the 1980s”. Prior to that, attempts have been made to describe translation as an art and as a science. The work of Vinay and Derbelnet in the 1950s paved the way to the examination of translation learning through a comparative study of the styles of two languages. It is insightful to note that the grammar-translation method has been the preferred tool for translation learning and study for centuries. It is equally insightful to observe that learning methods seem to be determined and shaped by their environment and events. In the 1960s, Nida published his *Toward a science of translation* (1964). Later in 1969, and with Charles Taber, he provided what could be considered the first widely-circulating reference book for translation teachers and researchers *The Theory and practice of translation* relying on the long tradition of Bible translation into almost 1400 languages and reflecting the experience of translators who travelled allover the world and dealt not only with many cultures but with vast subjects varying from poetry translation to theological literature (1969:vi) John Catford offered different models through his linguistic theory of translation and the notion of “shifts” which tend to center, essentially, on the degree of “departure from formal correspondence” or equivalence between languages (1965:37). In the 1970s, in Germany, Wolfram Wilss (1982) continued the vogue of looking at translation as a science and his work is clearly influenced by Chomsky and Nida (Gentzler: 1993: 59) presented his translation
research as a *Wissenshaft* and translated his own work into English as *The Science of Translation*. Wilss points out clearly that his “science” of translation was not complete as it “has problems in finding an objective evaluative framework” (1982:11) George Steiner also published his seminal book *After Babel* (1975) that examined, inter alia, the phenomenon of translation both inside and between languages, the nature and function of a theory of translation and the notion of Chomsky’s universal grammar. In the 1980s, Peter Newmark presented two seminal books that were used as text books in a large number of translation schools in the US, Egypt, and Australia; *Approaches to translation* (1984) and later *A textbook of translation* (1988). Joseph Maloney introduced his book *The science of linguistics in the art of translation* in which he attempted to “exploit the open-ended resources of pure-linguistic science for the fashioning of techniques and procedures (…) to serve as applied linguistic accessories in the analysis and practice of translation” as a (1988:2).

The purpose of this quick review is meant only to highlight the significant works on translation theory and practice that formed the backbone of translation pedagogy. In the early 1990s, translation departments in Australia grasped Hatim and Mason’s *Discourse and the translator* (1990) which addresses not only the academic teacher/researcher but appeals also to the practitioner. Likewise, Roger Bell (1991) focuses on the ‘process of translating’ which features in the title of his book *Translation and translating*. These two books were prescribed as text books and greatly influenced the teaching pedagogy in the early 1990s.

The publication of Mona Baker’s book *In Other words* in 1992 revolutionized the teaching of translation and interpreting by its focus on meaning and equivalence at the word level, the sentence level and above the sentence level; a concept which has an immediate pedagogic value to teachers who needed a working model to use in the classroom. It provided a stimulus for understanding and expressing equivalence and for the first time provided examples in several
languages which added to the international appeal of the book. In other words is now a staple reading in almost all translation programs in Australia. It is interesting to observe how translation literature moves in vogues and every few years an author would produce a book that would have some appeal and would continue to influence almost all writing till it is eclipsed by another notion, theory or book.

The current state of teaching:

Pedagogic experience in the Australian context over the past 25 years shows that despite the popularity of translation and interpreting degrees the profession is lagging behind the industry. This is rather surprising given the strong multi-cultural nature of the Australian community. Today, there is at least a postgraduate program in translation at almost every major university in Australia even if translation courses are not offered at the undergraduate level. One of the visible signs of the multilingual nature of the Australian community is perhaps the Arrival Card which all passengers entering Australia must complete before Immigration and Customs are cleared. These cards are handed over on board to passengers coming to Australia in several languages. Flights originating from Amman, Beirut or Riyadh would be handed Arrival Cards in both English and Arabic and likewise if the flight originates from Osaka the Arrival Card would be in English and Japanese. Upon arrival at Sydney Airport, big TV screens at the baggage claim area welcome passengers and explain quarantine matters in the top 15 languages commonly used in Australia.

Due to the varied and complex nature of community work in Australia, translation and interpreting are treated as two different specializations that require separate qualifications/accreditations. Training and teaching programs are available at the vocational and

tertiary education levels. Despite different pedagogic philosophies that underpin the teaching and learning of the professional skills whether at a vocational college or an academic institution, both pedagogies share the same challenges when it comes to the quality of the graduates. These challenges are funding, selection of students, staffing, curricula and field practice. The latter is the most crucial and both institutions, vocational and academic; found that organizing filed practice for students has proved to be costly and complex to manage. It is not unusual for instructors, at both institutions to resort to long assignments that require a translation commentary, back translation and reference to Mona Baker’s book *In other words*. Some universities even stipulate that students must make a certain number of references to *In other words* or other works cited in the course’s reading list. Interpreting students are also required to record themselves or use family or friends, translate the dialogue, provide translation and back translation and use symbols from a supplied list of phonetic symbols that describe the tone of voice, hesitations, false starts and other extra-linguistic features.

Gamal (2009) explains how program administrations circumvent their own requirement of providing field practice by resorting to the above theoretical, class-based, student-centered and, thus safe and cheap-to-run, activities. He points out that lack of funding is essentially the reason but, in Australia, there are two other considerations. First, it is very difficult to organize field practice in community interpreting to a large number of students in medical, police, social security, immigration or indeed in any government departments’ context due to logistics, space, privacy and confidentiality. Second, program administrations aware of public liability issues shun the idea of “professional excursions” outside of the safe college premises. Quite often such excursions are limited only to large venues which in this respect would be the local or district courts. Since courts provide ample scope for students to sit and observe a professional practitioner at work, administrations insist that students do this on their own time and report in a 1000-word essay!
Thus, it becomes evident that the translation pedagogy is also governed by concerns other than professional or indeed academic. While they are undoubtedly valid concerns yet the tendency to over-academize “professional training” through theoretical work denies students the opportunity to acquire the relevant and practical skills and techniques they are seeking in the first place. Fraser (1994) points out that the purpose of academic programs is not to produce academic critics of translation but professional translators.

we owe it to our trainee translators to prepare them as well as we can for professional life, not only developing their linguistic and technical skills but also giving them guidance on such aspects as working method and encouraging them to be confident in their dealings with users. If it is true that translation is becoming increasingly professionalized in terms of the qualifications demanded by employers, then the employers themselves also need to be ‘professionalized’ in terms of their expectations, especially by the new generation of professionals. (1994:140)

It must be remembered that a lot has been written on students and their performance but little written on teachers and their teaching. In academia, like in many other professions, there are teachers who are not only good communicators, ‘interpreters’ of fact and theory but also like teaching and are good at it, and there are others who are merely doing their job. The latter group is actually large in Australia due to the prevailing economic practice of out-sourcing, using part-time teachers and the false premise of getting practitioners to teach on academic programs. While all casual teachers are practicing (but not necessarily accredited) interpreters and translators their expertise may not be broad enough and their ability to link theory to practice is limited and their knowledge of the academic literature may be minuscule. Yet, the practice is widespread as it is financially attractive to institutions to engage instructors on a part-time basis. However, it is a practice not without its shortcomings: it tends to be ad hoc,
subjective and more often than not administrations would not feel comfortable engaging a ‘translation expert’ who may possess more experience than full-time staff.

The term ‘translation expert’ is used here consciously to refer to a rather small category of translation professionals who practice, reflect on their practice and engage in research and/or training. Unlike practitioners, who though qualified are not interested in reflecting on their own practice or examining the way they do things or the larger picture of their profession. They rarely keep a notebook in which thoughts, information or indeed questions on the various aspects of their practice are recorded. Most are journeymen in the classical sense of the word and are mostly concerned with their daily, or journee, pay. What concern them most are the rates of pay, the next job, who is offering higher rates and where are the longer assignments and better conditions. The vast majority of practicing translators and interpreters fall under this category. On the other side there is the small minority of the academics who teach and carry out research. Their own qualifications, research interests and professional activities are governed by their respective academic institutions. Their productivity is measured by an academic yardstick which quite often would not apply in the professional context. As Pym (2000) admits they “adopt a certain distance with respect to the world” thus not having to deal with working in a freelance market, to invest in information technology, deal with a large sector of society and above all multi-tasking. This latter feature, is the unexamined aspect in translation programs despite the fact that graduates will be working as sole traders with very serious business consequences covering issues such as: marketing their own services, doing the translation work from A to Z, running the business side of the practice (from quoting to invoicing), managing projects, investing in information technology, building and maintaining networks and developing superior professional skills to survive in a competitive business environment.
In between these two major groups of translation practitioners and translation academics are the ‘translation experts’. Essentially, they are practitioners with long experience and strong interest in translation project management. They are interested in reflecting on practice, observing others as well as themselves and above all in raising questions and seeking to answer them. To them, translation is neither an exclusive dichotomy of either/or but an inclusive activity of both/and. In other words, translation, to them, is not only a science but also an art and it is the process of translation that underpins the final product and most importantly the strong conviction that continuous training leads to expertise. Quite often they teach, practice and research. By doing all three, concurrently and regularly, they become translation experts.

Miriam Schlesinger (2009) quotes Gile’s term “practisearcher” in her reference to the significant role of those who are professional practitioners and academic researchers. While the term is self-evident, it does not lend itself to semantic currency and is somewhat cumbersome. Experts are those practitioners who have experience and through reflection on their practice they distilled their experience into an expertise that can be described, analyzed and researched. More often than not, experts work as translation project managers, team leaders of interpreters (i.e., international conferences, the Olympic village, VIP visit, a large community event), or simply as professional translators and interpreters at niche markets. Such expertise can be used in doing things professionally or in showing others how to do things professionally.

**Experience matters**

In the early 1990s, Australia went through a recession described then by the political wisdom of the country as “the recession we had to

---

1 The then Prime Minister of Australia Paul Keating.
have”. The consequences were devastating for the business community from large corporations to sole traders. The most serious business measure that affected the translation and interpreting business was the introduction of user-pay system which had direct impact on the services of thousands of practitioners. The economic reality of the 1990s negatively affected the business of a large number of professionals who had to multi-skill and most went back to universities to obtain a master degree. This was the boom time of postgraduate studies in translation in Australia. By the end of the decade the world had entered a new digital age where the Internet, satellite television, DVDs and mobile phones were common technological tools in the service of interpreters and translators.

The effects of digital technology on the translation/interpreting industry have been huge. Yet, this impact is not examined neither in the traditional undergraduate translation degrees nor in the more “marketable” and trendy Master’s programs in translation. Most translation programs have not caught up with the vast technological advances although many have invested in the technical infrastructure from interpreting booths to computers and computerized library catalogues. The modus operandi of translation pedagogy lags behind technology both in teaching and the learning. For instance, translation programs do not examine audiovisual translation, localization or even how to work with translation software.

Translation and interpreting graduates in the 21st Century need to have portable skills that enable them to confidently engage in the world global economy. Email and Google alone have truly made the world small and projects can be sourced and completed round the clock but so is professional competition which is also coming from the four corners of the world. There is no doubt that the market today needs additional business skills that were not even known to translation/interpreting practitioners a mere twenty years ago. Students are also different: they are technologically different from the majority of their teachers. They are the children of the audiovisual and digital
revolution. This dramatic change has brought the neglected area of professional experience into the limelight. Academic experience is no longer sufficient to prepare the students for the technologically competitive global market economy.

**The nature of experience:**

The Wordreference.com defines experience as “the accumulation of knowledge and skills through the direct participation in activities or events”. In translation and interpreting, like in many other fields, trainees need to experience what it feels like when asked to translate a text or interpret a speech. The issue of translation/interpreting experience can be seen from two different angles; classroom-based and field-based. The former is, quite often, the more common, and takes place under the supervision of a teacher. Here the teacher controls the class and follows different pedagogic strategies that more often than fall under what Don Kiraly (2000) describes as the “transmissionist” mode of instruction. Depending on the breadth and depth of professional experience the teacher has, this early experience shapes the learning path students will take in the future. In addition to professional experience, the ability to summon examples, not only to issue instructions, has a direct bearing on the way students synthesize translation and interpreting skills and techniques. When students’ questions move from the one-word lexical question to the more sophisticated semantic or syntactic questions, the class begins to reflect an understanding that translation/interpreting is not simply a process of replacing words from one language to another. However, it is not uncommon for students to drop the whole course and change careers in the early days of their formative experience due to the teaching style of the teacher. This is mainly because of what, Don Kiraly describes as the ‘pedagogic gap” between teacher and students. (1990: 5)

The formative experience is an area where pedagogy plays a crucial role and requires language-specific examination of the factors that
have a direct bearing on its organization and delivery. For instance, in training Arabic translator/interpreters, it would be more appropriate to search for examples from Arab culture, history and contemporary life rather than use far-fetched examples, outlandish role models or simply irrelevant studies. For instance, the examination of advertisement translation in the Gulf region as opposed to Lebanon, the area of technical translation particularly user manuals, the image of the interpreter in Egyptian cinema and the niche markets of interpreting for top companies, conferences and VIPs are all worth examining and provide relevant examples. There is always the risk that teachers would attempt to turn students into an image of themselves, i.e., academics and not professionals, and this is due to the (limited or irregular) level of commercial and professional experience they have had. As explained above the vast majority of translation graduates end up being practitioners and not academics. The use of translation theory and other theoretical models in the early stages of translation training has been a bone of contention in the relatively new field of translation studies. In 1994, Janet Fraser commented:

For vocational training purposes, however, the need is for a theory which not only identifies an appropriate end-product but also provides a systematic and immediately relevant framework for the analysis, decision-making and processes involved in achieving that end-product. Let me stress that my aim is not to discredit the teaching of translation theory: I believe it has a contribution to make in enabling apprentice translators to reflect on the activity they are engaged in and forms one aspect of a more rigorous approach to the activity. I do, however, wish to see academic instruction integrating the lessons of professional practice in a more systematic and explicit way. In designing research which would contribute to this, I wanted first to study the performance of professional translators and second to attempt to highlight features of their professional practice which could usefully be integrated into vocational postgraduate translator training courses. (1994:131)
The formative experience needs an instructor who is capable of citing not only relevant but also good examples after examples and to encourage students to think and not to impose his or her own “correct” or “final version”. Pedagogic experience has shown that at this early stage of formative experience, instructors are faced with two tasks: to train students to ‘think before speaking’ and second to ‘listen to other students’ answers’ and to reflect on why such answers were offered. Here it is the process of decision-making that is so valuable to teach and to acquire. These two skills, of thinking and listening, are simply the prerequisites for teaching the theoretical framework of translation which has proved to be cumbersome and controversial to some teachers and students alike. Theory is not supposed to be taught as a list of dos and don’ts but as a notion that enables students to move freely and confidently and to reflect on their decision-making process. Translation theory is an enabling tool not merely an examinable academic subject. Once it is understood in these terms, there would be no need to revisit the subject but alas it is not the case. In 2009, Schlesinger finds it necessary to reiterate what Fraser said 15 years earlier and tackles the same subject: “Crossing the divide: what researchers and practitioners can learn from one another”. She clearly expresses the tension between practitioners and researchers and although she convincingly shows that research serves theory and thus it must be useful for practicing-researchers she, unfortunately, fails to present a good case for the relevance of research or indeed theory to the majority of translators and interpreters: the journeymen, the freelancers and students. Her argument:

I have always felt that research was to be valued in its own right, regardless of its relevance to anything practical – and besides, sooner or later, everything turns out to be relevant and one thing leads to another. In any case, theory feeds into practice and practice feeds into theory, as our discipline and its sub-disciplines diverge and converge and enter into symbiotic relations with other disciplines as well.
This is pure academe! This is a luxury that students can not afford nor can practitioners entertain. Research, unlike art for art sake, does not have a possible buyer and unless it has direct relevance to students who actually fund our programs such explanations would not hold water. What is required; however, is an explanation to convince students and practitioners of the value of research and theory to their acquisition of the tools of trade and the way they use such tools.

Needless to say, the formative experience is the one that will shape, to a great extent, the development of a professional life and the new type of professional experience that will emerge later, the incremental experience. Unless, instructors are able to employ theory to relevant, useful and readily applicable ends it will fall flat and moreover will backfire. It will be seen as a useless, irrelevant and wasteful effort as indeed Chesterman and Wagner (2004:1) report about a practitioner’s view of the Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies who raises serious doubts about its immediate relevance to his daily work as a practitioner. “From the point of view of my working life, it is interesting but irrelevant”.

A tale of two encyclopedias:

As a contributor, myself, to the Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies I have had a similar experience. In 2002, I introduced the Routledge Encyclopedia to my Arabic students who were working for their Professional Diploma in community interpreting at a vocational college in Sydney. Faced with administrative constraints that restricted field practice outside the college premises due to liability concerns and the usual lack of funding to organize activities within the college walls by inviting (and paying for) experts, I introduced my personal copy of the encyclopedia and photocopied my entry on Court Interpreting. As a published researcher, along with esteemed international scholars, I must confess my feelings of pride and academic gratification. Yet, the reception I got was a damper! One of the students asked: “I did not
understand anything! What were you trying to say?” which was rather shocking and another commented: “Your entry is on court interpreting but it doesn’t tell us how to be a court interpreter!” A third student was more to the point: “Who were you writing for?”

All these comments, and many more I encountered during and after my talks in Australia, Korea, Egypt, Japan and elsewhere, made me rethink not just the purpose of academic literature but also at what level should it be introduced? And how much should be introduced at one time. The experience made me reflect on the purpose of research and that translation theoretical framework should be regarded as a scaffolding carefully organized bottom-up, and not top-down, with lots of examples, observations, questions and (re)searching for answers by the students themselves and not by me or any famous scholar or writer on translation theory till the class is ready to grasp the terminology and then know who said what, where and why?

Earlier in 1998, having joined a team of almost 1000 translators, linguists and editors working on the production of the Global Arabic Encyclopedia in Saudi Arabia1, the experience was different. The Arabic encyclopedia was a huge commercial translation project that took almost five years before it was published in 30 volumes, covering more than 17,000 pages and with 24,000 entries. It was well received by Saudi and other Arab media, the public and most significantly by my translation students. Some of them commented that “it does not read like a translated text” which to a practicing researcher like myself was the professional seal of approval!

The significance of this incident lies in its relevance to the student. It highlights the importance of knowing the level of the students and presenting what the student needs not what we think they should have. Frankly, the situation must be tackled head on. In the course of one,

1 www.mawsoah.net
two or three years, depending on the program, students gain their accreditation to become “professional” translators and interpreters. They are taught some skills and techniques but they also learn other skills and techniques not necessarily taught, consciously, by us. As they observe us talk, analyze and do translations they assume habits, behaviors and attitudes about becoming professional translators. We need to be mindful that our teaching style, rationale and professional attitude is being monitored and possibly adopted by our students and trainees. Experience has shown that the type of experience they go through prior to accreditation (formative experience) shapes their professional experience (incremental).

Practitioners’ resentment of research and theory, as Schlesinger pointed above, stems from the earlier experience they had during their formative experience as students. Our pedagogy, sometimes, fails to be relevant, useful and helpful. The scaffolding of the theoretical framework, the grading of the abstract and theoretical framework, the sequential presentation of literature has to be logical, conscious and disciplined. But we don’t do that for several reasons: lack of time, interest and knowledge of the stuff we teach. Let’s face it not all translation teachers are fond of theory either.

The solution may lie in a change of strategy: if translation competence is seen as experience, then we can ensure that our students are given the bare professional minimum they were promised at the time of enrollment. It is not a coincidence that most Australian universities, who compete for government funding and for student numbers, advertise for their programs commercially. It is insightful to examine their advertising rhetoric and discourse. The language they use focus on “vocational” skills, on being a university “for the real world”\(^1\).

\(^1\) The slogan of the Queensland University of Technology QUT, which was formerly a vocational college known as the Queensland Institute of Technology, QIT.
inviting students to “turn your job into a career”. The adverts do not focus, let alone mention, theoretical frameworks, academic skills, research, writing a 3000-word assignment or reading the literature and quoting Mona Baker ten times. The focus is unmistakably career-oriented and almost vocational in essence. This is because the times have changed: students have to pay fees, the industry is very competitive, the employment is on a freelance basis, technology is constantly changing the way we work, multi-tasking is a fact of professional life and most important of all graduates have to learn business skills in order to manage their own professional careers. The translation/interpreting graduates of today are so different from their peers a generation ago.

Reflecting on the European context, Anthony Pym (2000) “admits” that beyond “the theorists who inhabit universities” and the translation industry that is “engaged in rather more of the hands-on practice side of life” there is a third group.

[T]here is surely yet another world. Is not commerce, business, money, rapidly outflanking all our combined efforts? Are not our very terms of references, not to mention our comparative rates of pay, lagging sadly behind the world of the ‘intercultural management assistant’, the ‘language service provider’, the ‘localizer’, or more benignly, the ‘multi-tasking translator’. In domains such as information technology, cross-cultural marketing and international consulting, translators are being called upon to do rather more than what we do. And they are being paid more.

What Pym is referring to here is that there is a new type of commercial competence (Gamal: 1994) and professional experience that needs to be examined. He points to the ‘multi-tasking’ translator and calls for a change to the way translators are trained: “We must train translators to do more than translation”. In his examination of the translation market he identifies three segments of the “poorly paid”, the “reasonably comfortable” and the professionals who “can
be paid two to four times the comfortable salaries earned by tenured teachers of translation”. And, this is a good reason why such experience is worth examining.

**Researching and teaching professional experience:**

There is no denying that students pay for their university education in order to get a job. The insistence on the development of the research skills and theoretical abilities of the students is not what parents are paying for! This is why university adverts take a “vocational” and not academic outlook in the glossy brochures. For instance, the first paragraph in a 2008 Translation Studies brochure by Monash University\(^1\) reads:

Monash University Faculty of Arts has a long-standing reputation for excellence in teaching, research and **responsiveness to industry and student needs**. The postgraduate interpreting and translation studies program, offered through the School of Languages, Cultures and Linguistics, provides the **skills** and **knowledge** students require for successful **careers** in today’s rapidly changing globalised **workforce**. (Emphasis mine)

In the Arab world, students go to private universities because of the better employment chances they will have. The situation is no different in Australia, where fees are charged at all tertiary institutions whether they are Sandstone universities\(^2\) or not. The same notion takes place in Japan albeit the other way round where public universities are the better ones and the private universities and colleges are for those who could not pass the rigorous entry exams. In South Korea, the situation is entirely different where education has

---

\(^1\) Monash University is located in Melbourne and is one of the Group of Eight top universities in Australia.

\(^2\) A ‘sandstone university’ refers to its old structure (pre WWI) and its leading position in research.
become a national agenda and investment in higher education is not just a government policy by a family policy as well. There are 198 universities in South Korea and most are private institutions. Pedagogic experience shows that students tend to develop better professional skills if they are given a successful role model. This can and should be their teacher but it is also an economic fact of life that successful translation professionals will make more money practicing and not teaching. Yet, some successful practitioners, with the right abilities, could be engaged as professional experts. The methodology is not new: this is the MBA style of education where business skills are taught by business experts who are not only successful but are also leaders in business. As a matter of fact, our postgraduate translation programs would benefit a great deal from a close examination of the teaching methods applied by the more efficient MBA programs.

Quite often a school’s pedagogy is determined by the interests of the available staff and other external factors such as the popularity of a certain language, student numbers, and the program on offer. In other words it is supply and demand. This is why we see a wide variety of teaching styles at numerous universities who are fairly close to each other geographically as is the case in Sydney. One would think that the Australian style of translation and interpreting is fairly clear and centered on community interpreting and translating. But in reality there is a vast difference between the teaching and research interests at each university.

---

1 I am indebted to Professor Soonyoung Kim, from Dongguk University in Seoul for her clarification of the tertiary system in South Korea. (Personal communication, November 2009)

2 Postgraduate translation programs are offered at four universities in Sydney: University of Western Sydney, Macquarie University, the University of New South Wales and Sydney University.

3 Only the program at the University of Western Sydney is professionally accredited by the National Accreditation Authority NAATI.
The notion of researching experience is worth tackling as more and more universities shed their medieval “learning” centers to become more of a university for the real world. To research experience means to take more interest in what actually happens in the real world. For instance and with reference to Saudi Arabia:

What professional skills are necessary for entering the local translation/interpreting market? In the absence of a strong translator association, what are the basic strategies for life long learning? How to train students to reflect on practice and to self monitor their performance? What is the social attitude towards translation and interpreting? Does it change from generation to generation? What is the role of talent in the production of popular translations? Why the translations of the Shakespearean plays that were carried out by none-university graduates almost eighty years ago are still considered “perfect”?

And more to the point;

How to ensure that experience is passed from generation to generation in the absence of a regulated translation profession? Should the profession be regulated? Is it beneficial to introduce an accreditation system? How to train talent and how to train new translators in rare languages? Should we encourage Asian languages or focus more on western languages? How best to train translators from Arabic into other languages?

And thinking about our students: How to bring experience to students who can not afford to spend a year abroad? If students do not work during their school holidays, for social reasons, how do we incorporate: life experience, professional ethics or cultural maturity? How to introduce the notion of the freelance context and the global market?
Further, how to design and carry out translation research that fits and fulfills the needs of the Kingdom? For instance: understanding of the local/regional market, raising the social and professional profile of the translator, training conference interpreters, developing a national translation policy, etc.

And finally, does a multi-cultural community have direct/indirect benefits to the teaching and learning of translation/interpreting?

**What to include in teaching experience**

Experience is what graduates need and will struggle to obtain in the first 10,000 hours of their career. In other words, the first five years by which time they are expected to have learned the ropes of the profession. But there are no studies to show the professional curve of experience among graduates. This not surprising as the current system has given the illusion that a university degree is the be-all-and-end-all of (professional) learning.

The concept of life long learning is not new but takes different shapes and adopts different and newer terms in different societies and times. Yet, it is essential for interpreters and translators to espouse this concept and they need to be shown how to do it. One of the under-utilized areas in translation studies is the literature written by the practitioners such as the memoirs. Here the works by the Soviet interpreters are very important. The life and autobiographies of top interpreters can shed light on professional development and particularly the relevant professional aspects academia does not tackle such as: the professional learning curve, turning points, luck, professional errors, mentoring, the good habits, business skills and most importantly life lessons.

Inviting experts to talk to students is not as easy as it seems for it requires preparation and interest by the teacher who will act as a host. The teacher, now presenter, has to do their homework designing the
questions, helping the expert to articulate professional and academic skills, tackle the relevant issues and to highlight the significant stages in the professional learning curve. Failure to do so may run the risk of having to listen to the personal life of someone who simply transfers language A into language B, enjoys fishing and has two cats.

Designing a module teaching experience requires a great deal of interest in examine primary source material such as newspaper articles, magazine interviews, video recordings of meetings and speeches, films, novels and books on and by interpreters. A module that examines experience should be creative, uses resources intelligently to motivate trainees and to instill in them the professional attitude of reflection on practice. For instance very few translation schools list Michael Frayn’s *The Russian Interpreter* (1966), J. Lahiri’s *Interpreter of Maladies* (1999) or Suzanne Glass’ novel *The Interpreter* (1999) in the reading list. As a matter of fact, fewer would even list Sydney Pollack’s 2005 film *The Interpreter* starring Australian actress Nicole Kidman as a worthwhile viewing for conference interpreting.

The use of film in the translation and particularly the interpreting class is very rewarding both pedagogically and professionally. The medium of film is underutilized and not researched in the translation literature. Gamal (2009a) points out “interpreters in film” is a subject that is not only relevant but also highly informative particularly in teaching Arabic interpreting and translation. He examines (2007) the use of film in the community interpreting class in Australia and illustrates the various aspects the examination of interpreters in film can contribute to the acquisition of professional skills by interpreters. He lists (2009b), inter alia, examples relevant to:

First language competence
Second language acquisition
Cultural aspects of translation
Translation of humor
Similarly, Cronin (2009) points out the significance of using the resource of cinema in the translation class:

In other words, neglecting to use cinema in translation studies is neglecting to use a highly engaging and effective medium for soliciting responses on a wide variety of topics directly related to the business of translation. (2009: XI)

Perhaps the most complex part of teaching a module on experience is to grade the content to suit the students whether undergraduates or postgraduates. There is plenty of material to choose from but the ability requires interest and familiarity with a large body of material. The underpinning philosophy must be clear: it is an opportunity to mentor trainee translators/interpreters by simulating real life experience. Thus the module is not taught “academically” and is not tested through essays but through activities, case studies and projects highlighting decision-making strategies, business skills, discussion, professional ethics, advanced communication skills, superior presentation skills, public speaking confidence, and to a certain extent voice manipulation, body language, business etiquette and professional dress.

With the increased talk about the necessity to link theory to practice, academic translation programs would do well to invest in the design and development of research patterns and applied research methods to engage the professional world a lot more. Students and practitioners alike would eagerly seek an expert who will show and not merely talk about what it is like out there. The examination of professional experience could take the shape of a module that aims to focus on the practical and professional aspects of translation and interpreting. Such
module would increase the relevance of any translation/interpreting program as it provides the nexus between theory and practice. Such module delivered by an expert has a higher degree of relevance and credibility. The experts will be experienced enough to draw on their vast expertise and also possess the mentoring abilities that will gain and maintain trust with the mentees. They would know how to praise, encourage and motivate learners through examples. An expert is he or she who is a master of their trade and who takes pride in showing others how it works. After all, this is how journeymen showed their master-piece to the professional guild before they were allowed to be masters in their own right and to have their own shops!

Like Ramses II who was supervised by his father on the walls of the temples at Abydos, learning both theory and practice, interpreters and translators need the opportunity to benefit from the expertise of an expert.

**Conclusion**

Quite often, translation programs work under the premise that translation experience is a process that takes time and graduates will develop their own experience, in due course. This notion is no longer tenable for several reasons: graduates have limited scope to get trained as industry is not geared to training and graduates must be ready and capable of working unsupervised. Moreover, the freelance market expects them to be flexible and learn new skills, as required, fairly quickly. The freelance context is tough and may not be suitable for many practitioners who prefer a more secure income. Our translation pedagogy cannot continue to ignore these professional and practical facts. In addition, most new practitioners tend to “learn on the job” and without adequate supervision this may have serious ethical and/or legal implications.

In this paper, I have argued that professional experience could be researched. To do this a mechanism in engaging the more experienced
translators and interpreters should be developed. This means that experts need to be engaged at a more interactive level where experience is analyzed and described and principles (supported by examples) identified. The purpose is to build a body of knowledge which would be reflected into a series of enabling skills that could be taught at a master’s level. Pedagogic experience shows that the weakest aspect of many translation programs remains the practicum. To this end, a ‘Module on Mentoring’, in the Master’s program, could see an expert engaged in teaching professional experience which would link the academic skills of translation to the business and professional requirements of industry.

References:

25. Web sites consulted:
   (Site consulted 22 November 2009)
27. www.wordreference.com
   (Site consulted 20 November 2009)
28. Anthony Pym’s web site:
   (Site consulted 26 November 2009)
30. The Global Arabic encyclopedia
   (Site consulted 20 November 2009)
This study explores the place of translation in EFL teacher education courses, and investigates the significance of the inclusion of such a component in the courses presented to Arab prospective teachers of English as a foreign language. The study starts with an argument of the place of translation within the framework of developments in the communicative approach viewing translation as a medium for language instruction. This leads to a discussion of translation as a process that encompasses more than one basic skill in learning foreign languages i.e. reading, researching and writing. The purpose of the study is to show that both roles played by translation (as a pedagogical tool, and a set of language skills) are inseparable in language teaching and teacher education. The argument centers around the thesis that within a discourse framework, translation both as a language competence and a teaching technique is relevant, and in fact needed, to the development of EFL prospective teachers linguistically and professionally.

1. Translation in Language Teaching.

1.1 Translation as a Pedagogical tool.

Lefevere (1992:46) points out that translation as a pedagogical tool has been used from about 100 AD until the end of World War Two. When people began to show an interest in foreign languages, it seemed to make sense that the move from the native language to the foreign, from the known to the new, would be made with the aid of translation. Translation as a pedagogical tool is still widely used in many parts of the world, especially in the teaching of the less common
languages, as well as in the teaching of English as a foreign language. As Howatt (1984:5) reports, the best-known example of Latin-teaching dialogue written in the 11th century is a Latin text which is accompanied by an interlinear translation in Anglo–Saxon.

Translation enables SL learners to compare similarities and contrast differences. Put simply, they need the reassurance of their mother tongue in order to make sense of the way the target language operates. In the case of teachers, an ability to translate into the mother tongue of the learners can offer a convenient and efficient way out of a tricky situation – why bother to spend ten minutes trying to explain the concept behind a particular utterance when a simple translation can achieve the same goal in seconds? For example, it is quite difficult to get across the meaning of useful, everyday expressions such as "As far as … is concerned, …" or "On the other hand …." Learning target language equivalents to key phrases like these in the mother tongue can be an extremely effective way to build up good working vocabulary. Translation can also be extremely creative. It is not only the translation of words from one language to another but the translation of ideas, concepts and images.

Some of the resistance to translation amongst certain teachers might stem from the kind of exercise they were required to do when language learners themselves. Dull, overlong, uncommunicative texts that were difficult to translate into the target language did little for motivation. But why should translation involve whole texts? Surely it is more relevant (and practical) to start with short, communicative pieces of language. When teaching grammatical structures, it can be very useful to check with your learners that they have fully grasped the concept of the language taught by asking them to translate into their mother tongue. As a checking stage, this could usefully come at the end of the lesson. The structure used in "If I had worked harder, I would have passed the exam", for example, is relatively complex and a quick translation check can avoid misunderstandings.
If we try for a moment to free ourselves from the reflex negation of the use of translation in language teaching that has been instilled into us by British and American theorists for the past few decades, translation seems to make perfect sense, particularly if you are learning a foreign language away from the country in which the language is spoken and intend to use it for purposes other than everyday casual conversation with native speakers. Moreover, it is regularly used by those teachers who share their learners’ LI, even if they reportedly feel apprehensive about this. Why is then translation proscribed with such vehemence by contemporary language teaching theorists?

"The rise and fall of methods", argues Richards (1984:13), "depends upon a variety of factors extrinsic to a method itself and often reflects the influence of fads and fashions, of profit-seekers and promoters, as well as the forces of the intellectual market place. It is these factors that give a method its secret life….often, the options that are offered to language teachers are not necessarily the ones with the firmest theoretical basis nor the most effective, but the ones most convenient or profitable to the powers that be".

Tzanetatou (1994: 7) points out that until the end of the 19th century there was no deliberate attempt on behalf of any country to push its language forward as an international language by actively promoting its teaching. When the advantages of such a promotion were realized the British were quick to seize the opportunities that the increasing use of English as an international language presented. Phillipson (1992: 138) recounts that “in 1934 a committee named 'The British Council for Relations with Other Countries' assembled a body of businessmen and educational experts to consider a scheme for 'furthering the teaching of English abroad and to promote, thereby, a wider knowledge and understanding of British culture generally'. From then onwards, this highly successful committee would represent in the eyes of almost everybody involved the most authoritative agent in English language teaching. The British council is responsible for the export of
teachers accredited by the British council, who will be using books approved and often produced by the British council, and who will be teaching students that will sit exams specified by the British council and will receive their qualifications from the British council."

Monolingual approaches to ELT were the natural outcome of this movement since (leaving all theoretical considerations aside) they provided thousands of jobs for native English teachers who would be employed in all parts of the globe, promoted the very lucrative trade of monolingual textbooks which could be used all over the world, and supported and were duly supported by native English language learning theorists who were resolved to ignore the learners’ and teachers’ L 1 at all costs. This means that the British should henceforth decide on the best methods, the best books and best teachers to teach English.

The superiority of the native speaker as a language teacher is by no means incontestable1. Why should people necessarily be better teachers of a language just because they happened to grow up in the country where that language is spoken? Isn’t it more logical to argue that people, who have a sound knowledge of their learners’ L1 as well as high proficiency in the target language, are far more qualified to deal with their learners?

1 The British had every reason to support monolingualism and the supremacy of the native speaker. This fact had serious repercussions, as Phillipson (1992:199) explains: "It is highly likely that the native speaker fallacy has served the interests of the centre, while blinding both its representatives and their collaborators in the periphery to its ideological and structural consequences, it has diverted attention away from the solution of urgent pedagogical questions, and prevented the flourishing of local pedagogical initiative which could build on local strengths and linguistic realities. The effect of the tenet has been to maintain relations of dominance."
1.2 Translation and the Communicative Approach:

It might be surprising to note that the developments in both the study of translation as a linguistic science and in language teaching methodology are quite similar, if not parallel. Thomas (1992) reviews that early philological approaches to translating were prescriptive and adopted a diachronic perspective to language. This approach lacked a distinction between *langue* and *parole*. Later formal views of translating corrected the earlier prescriptivism and altered the focus of attention to the synchronic dimension of language but, however, were still limited in perspective. The semantic and pragmatic dimensions of language were still neglected and translating was felt to be simply about the mechanistic transfer of codes. Such approaches gave no recognition to the creative dimension of translating and the whole process was felt to be about form without regard for a user perspective.

The Ethno-Semantic approach brought with it an attention to meaning and employed componential analysis as a tool with which to achieve *Dynamic Equivalence*. With the formulation of the Dynamic Equivalence approach to translating the progression in linguistic approaches to translating to pragmatics and the importance of culture is finally made. The central claim of a Dynamic Equivalence approach is that function should have priority over form. This dimension is further strengthened and extended in the Text Linguistic approach to the translating process. For the first time the whole text becomes the unit of analysis and the reader's experience of the world and other texts becomes an important factor in the translating process. The translator in a Text Linguistic approach to translating is no longer conceived of as a passive, mechanistic decoder of linguistic form but has an active, creative role to play.

In a similar manner language teaching was confined to the study of language structure with no real focus on the role of the situation or the
communicative needs of the learners. With the communicative approach, the communicative role of the student is finally focalized and he is no longer the passive learner who receives knowledge and responds in a predetermined way. The parallels with developments in language teaching methodology are evident although there is one important difference, as noted by Thomas (1992); the communicative approach to language teaching has been accused of neglecting the formal aspects of language in favour of the pragmatic whereas translating by its very nature has to unite form with function and this is one important benefit from translating.

In fact the main objection against translation in the communicative approach is that using the mother tongue interferes with the target language, and since different languages have different linguistic structures and thinking strategies, use of students’ mother tongue may hinder their learning and may result in a distorted view of language when using the target language with native speakers. This main

---

1 Canale and Swain (1980:23) neatly summarise the three basic assumptions underlying communicative language teaching:

1. The essential purpose of language is communication.
2. Grammatical form follows the communicative purpose.
3. In normal communication one is concerned with aspects of language use and not with aspects of grammatical usage.

Several objections have been raised concerning these assumptions. First of all, it is doubtful that externally oriented communication is more essential than, say self-expression, verbal-thinking, problem-solving, or creative writing. Secondly, it is by no means proven that form follows communicative purpose and thirdly, although experienced language speakers do not focus on form, beginners cannot focus on use since they don’t have the rudiments of usage. Other issues that have been raised include, as Richards and Rodgers (1986:83) point out, the question of whether a communicative approach can be applied at all levels in a language programme, whether it is equally suited to ESL and EFL situations, whether it requires existing grammar-based syllabuses to be abandoned or merely revised, how such an approach can be evaluated, how suitable it is for non-native teachers, and so on.
objection rests on an assumption which claims that different languages view life and the universe differently and that language learning strategies implied in learning one language differ when learning another language. However, with the recent developments in experimenting the communicative approach in teaching English as a foreign and a second language for more than half a century, and after the new methodological studies in the field of translation and translation didactics, we can safely declare that this view of rejecting the use of mother tongue in language education is ill-founded.

To support this argument, some studies that compared the strategies used by professional translators and foreign language learners (Thomas 1992, Tzanetatou 1994) showed that these strategies are quite similar and that reference to L1 in language use – whether learning, teaching or translating- will not lead to misused L2 strategies in language learning. It is not then unreasonable to claim that the practice of translating may actually promote language learning. At least the claim that translating prevents people from thinking in a language, whatever that objection actually means, must be seriously questioned. If translators do not think in the language they are using why would they, as shown in Thomas' empirical study 1992, use more L2/interlanguage strategies than learners who are presumably encouraged to avoid using L1/mother tongue strategies?

We would like also to emphasise that we do not object to the use of communicative activities in the classroom and that we view the use of such activities as a necessary prerequisite for the development of communicative competence in our learners. We remain sceptical, however, when it comes to the view which maintains that knowledge of the second language system is the outcome of communicative activity, not the prerequisite for it.

The suggestion then, that translating encourages an unhealthy dependence on the L1 or that it promotes semantic interference cannot be maintained. If professional translators employ successful strategies
which are L2-based, then the regular practice of translation cannot inevitably lead to an overuse of L1 type strategies. Translating includes all the features required for a communicative task. A genuine information gap exists between the person who produces the message and the person wanting to understand it. The cognitive complexity of the task can be controlled so as to allow gradual exposure to linguistic or pragmatic features of language. Translating tasks enable linguistic elements to be presented and practised in relation to communicative outcomes. In other words, the relation between form and function can be demonstrated to learners. In such translation tasks linguistic elements would not be drilled in isolation from communicative behaviour, nor would functions of language be taught apart from their linguistic exponents.

In fact the history of foreign language teaching is in the main a history of bi-lingual methodologies heavily reliant on the practice of translating. Thomas (1992:114) states that this bi-lingual movement becomes 'increasingly monolingual from the period of the Reform movement. Significantly members of the Reform movement were not themselves against translating within language teaching. What they sought redress in the excesses of the Grammar Translation method were problems of cross association and the obsessive focus on grammatical structure to the neglect of other features of language'.

\footnote{Howatt (1984:287) explains that the original motivation for adopting a communicative approach in the early seventies was remedial. It was particularly relevant for students learning English in Britain. They had already 'done' the grammar at home, and were disinclined to go over it all again. Instead they wanted to improve their practical skills, especially in spoken English, and build up their confidence in using the language. This is indeed a very valid reason for using communicative activities in the classroom. But what if someone has not already 'done' the grammar? Can he be expected to pick it up as he goes along, and if so how long will this process take?}
There are signs that the twentieth century attachment to monolingual language teaching is fading and this is perhaps more obvious in the more 'fringe' methods like Silent Way, and Suggestopedia. On this possibility it is interesting to quote Howatt:

"Finally, the monolingual principle, the unique contribution of the twentieth century to classroom language teaching, remains the bedrock notion from which the others ultimately derive. If there is another 'language teaching revolution' round the corner, it will have to assemble a convincing set of arguments to support some alternative (bilingual?) principle of equal power. (1984: 289)

There is some evidence that this return to a bilingual principle has now begun (Titford and Hieha 1985) and it is clear that translating is to form a major part of this principle.

2. The need for translation in a Teacher Education language Course:

2.1 Translation as a cognitive learning process.

Translating essentially involves selection; that is translators regularly choose from among a range of possible expressions the one which they feel to be most appropriate to a particular context. It is for this reason that exercise can be used to facilitate consciousness raising about differences between the mother tongue and the foreign language and can be used as a discovery procedure for finding and acquiring the necessary foreign language equivalents which will enable learners to function in cross-culturally problematic areas. What is suggested in this study is that learners can acquire knowledge more easily if their attention is drawn to it through calculated exposure to crucial pre-selected data and that this can be achieved through what Thomas reports to be degrees of elaboration (1992: 165).

Student/teachers in the first year of their university study are mainly learners of language. They may well be advanced learners of English but the fact remains that they still need more and more training in language skills in order to carry out the future profession as a teacher
of these skills. Student/teachers will be referred to in the following sections of this study as mere language learners since the reasons and the benefits of training in translation skills apply both to student/teachers and other learners of language at the university stage. Nevertheless, the assumption is that a student/teacher will benefit more from these skills simply because s/he is apt to use translation as a strategy in the foreign language classroom. It is only through a systematic training and an insightful understanding unto the nature of the process of translating that these prospective teachers can hopefully channel their use of this vital pedagogical device and language skill.

To advocate the integration (or in many cases the acceptance of the de facto use) of translation skills in ELT courses is to advocate first of all that the dominance of the first language in the mind of the learner is not necessarily a bad thing, provided it is channeled correctly. Secondly, it implies a view of second language learning as a conscious cognitive process. Finally, it implies the assumption that as the code is mastered, communication becomes proportionately more effective. The most important benefit to be derived from the use of translation in ELT is the facts that it forces the learner to deal with precisely those issues that are problematic for him and that he will in all likelihood try to avoid. In this sense we feel that the translation of model sentences or short texts created specifically with the view of practising a particular problem is entirely justified.

There is also plenty of room for the translation of larger texts which will help develop our learners’ reading comprehension skills. Such a use of translation will make the learner more aware of cohesive devices, register, potential readership, discourse conventions, and so on. In this sense it will also be invaluable at the production stage for the development of writing skills. A further advantage of translation is that it promotes the intelligent use of the dictionary and helps guard against false notions of equivalency. Finally it enhances the learners’ meta-linguistic awareness. In sum, it brings in every aspect of language and communication, as detailed below.
2.2 Reasons for introducing translation skills:

2.2.1 Translation is a reality

There are two lines to this argument. The first is that translation is a necessary prerequisite for communication even between people sharing the same language. Here we are using the term in the loser sense to include all types of reformulation of utterances either within one linguistic code or within separate ones. The second is that knowledge- new knowledge- is built upon what we already know. Therefore, we assume it is not reasonable to fight our learners’ natural tendency to try and build knowledge of the new language on the basis of the language they already know, their L1.

2.2.2 Translation is a necessary prerequisite for communication

It is argued that translation in one form or another "permeates our entire life". "When we learn to speak" writes Octavio Paz (2002:152) "we are learning to translate: the child who asks his mother the meaning of a word is really asking her to translate the unfamiliar term into the simple words he already knows". Steiner (1992) also postulates that translation is formally and pragmatically implicit in every act of communication in the emission and reception of each and every mode of meaning, be it in the widest semiotic sense or in more specifically verbal exchanges. He (1992:xii) declares: 'To understand is to decipher. To hear significance is to translate. Thus the essential structural and executive means and problems of the act of translation are fully present in the acts of speech, of writing, of pictorial encoding inside any given language. Translation between languages is a particular application of a configuration and model fundamental to human speech even where it is monoglot'.

344
The basic argument, therefore, is that we are used to translating, indeed we cannot communicate if we do not translate the message we receive into some from that is comprehensible to us and do the reverse when we are sending a message. To ask people to stop translating is to ask them to go against what is at the heart of human communication.

2.2.3 Translation makes sense

When faced with something we do not understand we try to transform it into something more comprehensible. It is only natural that when faced with a new language or with any instance of that language that we do not understand we will try to translate it either inter– or intralingually. To force our learners to go against this natural tendency is not only unreasonable but also impossible. Learners of a foreign language have a valuable resource, their L1. Tzanetatou (1994) believes that to ask our students not to refer their L1 while learning a new language is not simply unrealistic: “it is downright wrong”.

2.2.4 The Move from known to new

Ringbom (1991:172) points out that in the psychology of learning it is commonly agreed that new learning is largely based on what the learner already knows. Now, what the learner already knows when embarking on a second language is a language system. As Widdowson (1978:158–159) argues, the language to be learned should be associated with what the learner already knows and learners, when they undertake language tasks, should be led to recognize that these tacks relate to the way they use their own language for the achievement of genuine communicative purposes. Widdowson concludes that it would seem reasonable to draw upon the learners’ knowledge of how his own language is used to communicate. That is to say it would seem reasonable to make use of translation.

Thus, instead of asking the learners to forget everything they know, we should help them to make the appropriate connections between the
language system they do know and the language system they are trying to acquire. If we do not guide them in how to make connections, the learners will be forced to make their own, however inappropriate these might be. Instead of hiding our heads in the sand, we should channel their natural tendency to draw correlations, this will help in both building up on our learners' existing knowledge and imparting a valuable skill at the same time.

In a foreign language teaching situation it is much more reasonable to focus primarily on building up the learners’ knowledge of the system and this can be done much more naturally if we help learners make the appropriate connections between what is known and what is new. Besides, as Cook (1992:584) points out, the L1 is present in the L2 learners’ minds, whether the teacher wants it to be there or not. The L2 knowledge that is being created in them is connected in all sorts of ways with their L1 knowledge. The way many modern teaching methods treat the L2 in isolation from the first language is reminiscent of the ways of teaching deaf children language by making them sit on their hands so that they cannot use sign language.

### 2.2.5 The role of L1 competence:

Another issue that is not paid enough attention, although teachers do have some intuitive insight into it, is the role of L1 competence in second language acquisition. As Cook (1992:573) points out: “Teachers have frequently suspected that the success of the L2 learner in a classroom relates to how good the learner is in the first language”. We are convinced that L1 competence is a crucial factor in the

---

1 The researcher recalls how effective were some guided translation activities in teaching Arabic to non-native speakers to whom Arabic was a totally foreign language. Most translations were into the target language for consolidating grammatical forms and vocabulary items presented at earlier stages.
acquisition of a second language. Furthermore, since translation by its demanding and exact nature promotes L1 competence, it can serve the dual purpose of developing both the L1 and the L2. Cummins and Swain (1986:103) also claim that developing full proficiency in the first language promotes the same in the second language. What this assumes is that there is an underlying proficiency that is common to both languages. One does not, for example, relearn to read every time a new language is learned. One makes use of already learned skills and knowledge in the learning to read the second time around. Similarly, once one has learned how to use language as a tool for conceptualizing, drawing abstract relations or expressing complex relationships in one language, then these processes, or language functions, are applicable to any language context. 'Thus', they conclude, 'spending time learning in one language does not impede the development of these language functions in a second language, it enhances them'.

2.2.6 Translation as an end

It is important to any discussion of the place of translation within language and language teaching that the products and processes of translating be precisely understood. It is, incidentally also important to understand such products and processes in the other disciplines in which translation plays a role, e.g. comparative literature, sociology, anthropology etc. Thomas (1992) notices, as we have shown earlier in this study, that linguistic approaches to translation follow a surprisingly similar path of development to that evident in language teaching namely a progression from a focus on purely formal aspects of language to a concern with its communicative features. Given that language learning and translating are both manifestations of language use it is perhaps more surprising that they should ever have been viewed separately.

Malakoff and Hakuta (1991) point out that translation is typically viewed as a valuable skill that is available only to the highly trained
and linguistically sophisticated bilinguals who come out of interpreter and translator training. It is not a skill that is generally considered to be within the repertoire of just any bilingual. Yet, they argue, studies have found that bilingual children with no previous training can both interpret and translate materials that are within their comprehension and vocabulary this seems to confirm our assumption that translation is a natural process that is regularly undertaken within the mind of individuals possessing (to a greater or lesser extent) two separate linguistic codes.

Newmark (1981:180–181) claims that the ability to translate should be one of the main aims of a foreign language learner. He envisages this interlingual transference to include all activities involving the transfer of sense from one language to another, including paraphrase, summary, précis, explanation, abstracting, definition, simultaneous, consecutive ad hoc and two–way interpretation as well as publication and information translation. Although his position is a bit extreme, there is no doubt that many of these activities will prove invaluable to the language learner in his professional or academic career. King (1973:53) puts it succinctly: “practically, a large number of learners who have acquired some kind of qualification in English find themselves called upon in many situations, to translate or interpret into or from English in the course of their work or otherwise”. As Krings (1987:160) further argues, even private life situation in which one has to translate or interpret are not uncommon.

In order to reach this aim, we as educators and language teachers need to create tasks which engage the problem solving faculties of learners involving them with the linguistic system as a means to achieving their communicative intentions. Such tasks must contain genuine information gaps. If a task contains no information which is new to be transferred from addresser to addressee then there is no possibility of actual communication taking place. For genuine communication to happen requires that what is unknown is made known to at least one
of the interactants. Put differently communication requires the genuine transfer of information.

Translating can involve such an authentic exchange of information and is a task which confronts literally millions of people on a daily basis. One does not have to be a professional translator to be called upon to use translation skills by a colleague who needs a quick skim translation of a letter or to be asked to help a monolingual cope in an airport, with a taxi driver, or with the thousand and one problems inherent in multilingual situation. It is arguable that translating is a part of everyone's communicative competence; certainly most users of a foreign language will be called upon at one time or another to translate and given this fact it surely makes sense to prepare them for the task.

2.3 Benefits of training in translation skills:

2.3.1 Improving reading comprehension skills

One of the benefits that Denby (1987:41) identifies as stemming from L2–L1 translation is the obligation on students to engage in close reading of the L2 text, which can sometimes be avoided in other language–development exercises where the emphasis is on general meaning rather than close detail.

The good translator is in fact a competent reader. He cannot afford to skim over difficult points and be satisfied with just getting 'the gist of it'. He must be very clear about concepts, meanings, particular nuances, and so on. Above all he must be clear about grammatical meaning. "Grammatical meaning" argues Newmark (1981:26) "is more significant (the 'tone' or 'flavour' of the text, its primary aspect, is perhaps dictated by its syntax) less precise, more general and sometimes more elusive than lexical meaning".
Brumfit (1984:83) in discussing ways of promoting reading comprehension, argues: "There is, in comprehension, a role for specific accuracy–based work and this may take the form of intensive reading exercises of various kinds, of aural comprehension work, even of translation. Furthermore, anyone translating a text cannot do so by focusing only on the grammatical, lexical, and morphological levels, but must, as Nattinger and Decarrico (1992:159) point out, also draw on knowledge of more global markers of organization in the discourse for otherwise they cannot arrive at an efficient interpretation of the text in hand. Thomas (1992:60) refers to literary approaches to translating and emphasizes the central role of translators as 'readers' and 'writers' concluding that "current approaches to reading and writing are relevant to translating". Student/translators as well as student/teachers must call into play all the skills employed by competent readers in order to interpret the source text and must also possess the ability of writers when they produce the target text.

2.3.2 Improving writing skills

Denby (1987:41) argues that translation of texts can help students perceive the crucial importance of writing good English. It also helps draw their attention to issues of register, context and potential readership of the original. Finally, it provides a good context for comparing discourse conventions between the learners’ L1 and L2. Translation of larger discourse pieces can be viewed as an alternative to controlled writing exercises. Brumfit (1984:86) explains: "controlled writing exercises may be regarded as a monolingual attempt to perform a similar function to that of translation into the target language in grammar–translation approaches. But whereas translation did often demand that texts of some intrinsic interest might be used, controlled and guided composition seems invariably to produce texts which are totally trivial. Thomas (1992:56) wonders “why not reintroduce translation as an alternative to guided creative writing? We should think that translation is ideally suited to the purpose of expanding our learners’ repertoire of specific items of
vocabulary and grammatical structure, of training them in the appropriate and effective use of cohesive devices, of helping them identify what constitutes coherence, and so on”.

Silva (1993:669) argues that L2 writing is strategically, rhetorically, and linguistically different in important ways from L1 writing. Translation or even a simple comparative study of L1 and L2 discourse pieces, would help focus attention on these differences and thus help enhance learners’ writing skills. Cooper and Greenbaum (1998:7) seem to share this view since they claim that differences in cultural expectations are an obstacle for those who are learning to write in a foreign language. Under the influence of the norms within their own culture, they may deviate from the norms of the foreign culture in what kinds of material are to be included in a particular variety of written discourse, what style is appropriate, and how the discourse is to be organised.

As Soter (1998:177) indicates, "until the emergence of the contrastive study of culturally and linguistically diverse rhetorical styles, we have viewed the errors made by ESL students in their writing as linguistic ones and as caused by limited knowledge of the target language and linguistic forms as well as by what was termed 'interference' from the native language". Translation of larger texts affords us the opportunity to discuss problems beyond the textual level, i.e. at the discoursal level. Furthermore, as Thomas (1984:191) points out developing an awareness of style and lexical appropriateness in written English will benefit the spoken language too.

2.3.3 Promoting intelligent use of the dictionary

Polemics of translation in ELT claim that it encourages the development of false equivalences between the learners' L1 and L2. Our feeling is that learners run the risk of drawing false equivalences if translation is not used in the classroom, since they are thus left to their own devices. Indeed, as Denby (1987:41) argues translation can
be used as a means to underline, rather than to mask, the fundamental fact that languages are independent structures.

Bilingual dictionaries are notoriously unreliable and monolingual dictionaries are not ever as comprehensive as we would wish them to be. Translation can help demonstrate the dangers of over-reliance on bilingual dictionaries. Using the dictionary is one of the skills our learners should acquire, as Stern (1992:294) suggests, and the best way to impart this skill is by actively involving our learners in translation.

2.3.4 Enhancing learners’ meta-linguistic awareness

According to Newmark (1981:112), "the translator is continuously made aware of the functional and structural nature of language which appears to him in the common dynamic–functional simile of a game of chess and the static–structural simile of a crossword puzzle". Furthermore, translation not only enhances our learners’ meta-linguistic awareness but also provides an authentically communicative context for meta-linguistic observations.

King (1973:58) points out a further advantage, the fact that the learner’s awareness of his own language and therefore his sense of perspective is thereby increased. For example, even advanced students often have difficulty over such things as the finer points of English modals or tenses, and sometimes regard English as being finicky here, without realizing that their own language perhaps has some other device, and one which they themselves use every day, for making comparable distinctions.

2.3.5 Bringing in every aspect of language and communication:

Translation can present fertile ground for dealing with problems
relevant to all aspects of usage. It can be introduced to deal with problematic form as well as with problems of pragmatic equivalence, it can be used for the highlighting of cultural differences and so on. In short, the answer to the question 'Is translation a valuable exercise?' should be, as Marsh (1987:29) suggests, "yes, because we are dealing with a real, contextualized, meaningful, communicative manifestation of language.

In recapitulation we would say that since in order to translate one first of all needs to have understood as many of the meaning that can be read into a text as possible, translation is an ideal means of promoting reading comprehension. Furthermore since it requires a reformulation into the target language it also helps focus on developing writing skills. Moreover, it brings home the issue of pragmatic equivalence. Above all, it forces the learner to deal with problematic issues he might otherwise be tempted to avoid or bypass and also supplies a means of testing precisely those issues. Finally, it creates, as Edge (1986:121) points out, a communicative context for more formal follow–up work, including the development of a meta-language sufficient for the students to be able to talk about texts.

3. Conclusion:

The arguments presented in this study focused on the thesis that translation does have a vital role to play within a broader communicative approach to language teaching in general and language teacher education in particular. It was pointed out that linguistic approaches to translation follow a surprisingly similar path of development to that evident in language teaching; namely a progression from a focus on purely formal aspects of language to a concern with its communicative features. Teacher training in translation skills would therefore have multisided linguistic and professional benefits for the teacher of tomorrow, the learner of today. As prospective teachers of English and advanced and specialized learners of English as a foreign language, translation for them is a fifth
language skill that incorporates the use of reasoning skills and develops a needed insight unto the students' mother language in comparison with English as a foreign language. On the other hand, my suggestion is that if preservice teachers are apt to use translation as a teaching strategy with their students in the future when teaching English, one very important method of wisely channeling this use is training on the very skills of the process they will be using. Insights unto the nature of the process of translating and key understanding of its place in language learning, we assume, provides a framework for teachers to wisely use translation in their future career. A final role played by translation training for preservice teachers is the fact that translation nowadays is a life skill, just like literacy in computers or the internet, and that university students in general and students of the faculty of Education in particular need to master in order to cope with the daily demands of language use and exchange. In short, translation deserves a place within language teaching and teacher education language courses because it is centrally concerned with the communicative aspects of language.

References:


http://www.hyperdictionary.com/dictionary/strategy


Using a Translation-Oriented CIPP Evaluation Model in Evaluating Translator Training Programmes for Improvement Purposes

Ahmed H. Al-Maaini (Aston University-UK)

Abstract
Translator-training programmes are mushrooming all over the world as more translation services are needed in this age of globalisation. On the other hand, the translation market keeps changing, increasing the gap between training and profession. In order to maintain relevance and quality in training, translation programmes should be regularly evaluated. This evaluation should evaluate the situation in which training takes part, the approach of implementation, the process and the end-product. Since stakeholders affect or are affected by the training, all of them should be involved in the evaluation. This paper argues that translator-training programmes need a comprehensive, systematic and improvement-oriented educational evaluation model in order to keep up with the changes in the language industry. The CIPP model of evaluation is presented, followed by a discussion on how it can be applied in translator-training.

1. Introduction
It cannot go unnoticed that translator-training programmes are mushrooming all over the world. Arguably, this is to a significant extent a response to the increasing demand on interlingual and intercultural exchange services that resulted from globalisation and advancements in communication and technology. Further, the literature of translation pedagogy has gained more interest than ever, and this is evidenced by the increasing number of articles, books and conferences dealing with various issues in translator-training. There
are now two academic journals devoted to translation pedagogy: The Interpreter and Translator Trainer and International Journal of Interpreter Education. The training of translators has become much more systematic, and students are trained in academic institutions devoted to developing their translation competence and constructing their knowledge. And because our students need to be prepared for their future jobs, the training has to be relevant and efficient with regard to the market’s conditions, expectations and needs. But how can training maintain harmony with a market that is so complex and unstable as the translation market?

2. A major problem in translator training

The training of translators is a social action that is and must not be carried out in a vacuum; it is meant to achieve a social purpose, namely providing qualified translators who meet existing needs.

This purpose is challenged when we deal with a rapidly changing market that helps increase the gap between the (academic) training institution and the ‘real world’. The gap metaphor means that what is being taught at the university is not ‘compatible’ enough with conditions and demands of the market (cf. Aula int. 2005; Pym 1993; Li 2000). Many solutions have been proposed to bridge this gap, but as Anthony Pym notes, we will always be one or two steps behind such a market anyway (2003). It appears that this gap will always exist, and the best we can do is to keep it to the minimum; the smaller the gap, the more relevant the training becomes. Another related problem is the ambiguity and difference of opinion among translation scholars on the definition of translation/translator competence, as new competences are being added to the task of translator. In such a situation the need to evaluate our training practices becomes essential in order to assure quality and effectiveness in our translator-training programmes. As Moustafa Gabr concludes, a training is “functional and relevant only when it is evaluated” (Gabr 2001: 1).
3. What kind of programme evaluation are we looking for?

The needed evaluation should be able to scrutinize the situation in which the training will take place. There is always a social situation in which training takes place, and this situation consists of needs, challenges and opportunities. A translator-training programme should take into consideration the needs of the market, students and the university, in addition to the problems that may hinder the process of meeting them. It should also be aware of the resources and opportunities that can be utilized to meet those needs. It is by assessing all these factors that a programme can define appropriate training objectives. It should be noted here that the call for needs assessment has been advocated by a number of scholars such as Defeng Li (2000), Dorothy Kelly (2005) and Moustafa Gabr (2007).

Translator-training evaluation should help administrators make informed decisions about the planning of implementation strategies. In order to be able to make these decisions, there should be a clear definition of what translation is and what translation competence consists of. The literature of translator-training includes many different theoretical approaches that influence choice of courses, teaching methods, teaching materials, resources, sequencing of courses and other issues. Why would a programme adopt one approach not the others? Such a decision must be well informed and defensible.

Unlike traditional approaches, translator-training evaluation should be able to explain how and why things have happened rather than merely what. Therefore, the process of the training should be carefully monitored and regularly evaluated. A translator-training programme needs to know whether certain teaching methods are effective or not; whether evaluation criteria are valid or not; whether classroom activities are communicative enough or not, and so on. Post-evaluation is indeed useful to judge the outcomes of a course or a
programme, but it can be highly useful if feedback is provided by students and trainers ‘in the action’ for future improvement.

It is not enough to seek feedback from students and trainers, since other parties affect or are affected by the training. Therefore, evaluation of translator-training should involve all stakeholders starting from students and ending with future employers. Practitioners and employers, for instance, surely know much more about the market needs and conditions than administrators or academic trainers.

The above does not necessarily mean that translator-training programmes do not carry out such evaluations some way or another. There is no doubt that they have their own ways of dealing with deficiencies and calls for improvement. However, what this paper advocates is the use of a multi-level system that guarantees a continuous evaluation of the situation, plan, strategy and outcomes. This can be found in an educational evaluation model called Context-Input-Process-Product, or for short CIPP.

4. Introducing the CIPP Evaluation Model?

This model was developed in the late 1960s to help improve US school systems, and since has been further developed and applied to educational programmes inside and outside the US in schools, universities, government agencies and other institutions (Stufflebeam 2003: 31). Beside programmes, the model is also used for evaluating products, projects and human resources. It is not limited to educational systems, as it has been used in social, health, business and military fields.

The main contribution of this model is its new definition of evaluation. The traditional Tylerian philosophy of evaluation focused on checking the extent to which the end-product’s performance met the objectives of the programme. In the CIPP model, however,
evaluation is based on obtaining information that can help make the right decisions for improvement purposes:

“[Evaluation is] a systematic investigation of the merit and/or worth of a program...[through a] process of delineating, obtaining, reporting, and applying descriptive and judgmental information about some object’s merit and worth in order to guide decision making, support accountability, disseminate effective practices, and increase understanding of the involved phenomena” (Stufflebeam 2002: 280)

Obviously, this model rejects the notion that evaluation’s main task is to criticize and look for deficiencies. Instead, it uses evaluation as “a tool by which to help make programs work better for the people they are intended to serve” (Stufflebeam 1983: 118).

According to the CIPP model, evaluation should offer information to help make four types of decisions (Stufflebeam 2003: 40):

a. **Planning** decisions (e.g. specifying target group, needs, priorities and standards)

b. **Structuring** decisions (e.g. identifying work-plan, strategy, design and activities)

c. **Implementing** decisions (e.g. implementing and refining work-plan and activities, controlling process, judging implementation)

d. **Recycling** decisions (e.g. deciding to continue, terminate, modify or refocus)

These are essential decisions to be made before, during and after the implementation of any programme. However, administrators or policy-makers cannot make and defend such decisions without enough and appropriate information, and here comes the role of the CIPP model. In order to be able to make the above-mentioned decisions, information should be obtained by carrying out four types of

4.1 Context evaluation

Context evaluation is the investigation of the situation in which the programme takes part in terms of needs, problems, assets and opportunities. The first task of context evaluation is to identify a target group who will benefit from the services. Then, the needs and expectations of this group should be explored. In order for a service-provider to achieve the purpose of a programme, the needs of all stakeholders must be appropriately assessed. However, context evaluation is not limited to this task of traditional needs assessment, but rather seeks to identify problems that should be solved and available assets and opportunities that can be used to help meeting the targeted needs of the programme. Obviously, this type of evaluation should be initiated before a programme starts, but it is also done during or after a programme in order to judge already defined objectives. Data for this evaluation are obtained from all stakeholders through interviews, surveys, focus groups and analysis of documents. The collection of data should continue after the initial evaluation since needs, problems and opportunities tend to change.

4.2 Input evaluation

Input evaluation is the investigation of different approaches of implementation, including the currently used approach, in order to select the potentially most effective one in terms of strategy, work-plan and budget. This is highly significant as it helps to avoid wasting time, money and resources in an approach that is not potentially (cost-) effective. In order to do so, evaluators should review the relevant literature, explore exemplary programmes and consult experts in addition to other methods of finding useful information to judge the relevant approaches. When an innovation is proposed, input evaluators
should set criteria that the new approach should meet and then recommend one to administrators.

### 4.3 Process evaluation

*Process evaluation is the continuous monitoring of implementation to detect problems in pre-planned activities and procedures.* Some decisions made earlier in the planning stage might prove unsatisfactory or inapplicable during implementation. The main objective of process evaluation is to find such deficiencies, correct them, and make sure the work is running as planned and in the most efficient way. Moreover, this evaluation aims at exploring the extent to which all participants in the programme are able and satisfied to perform their duties. This type of evaluation is done by observing the process, interviewing participants, reviewing documents and consulting experts in addition to other methods by which implementation details can be obtained.

### 4.4 Product evaluation

*Product evaluation is the investigation by which outcomes of a programme are judged on the extent to which they satisfactorily and cost-effectively meet stakeholders’ needs.* Evaluators should take into consideration all outcomes, positive and negative, intended or unintended. Comparing outcomes of the programme to those of similar ones can also be useful. One main objective of this evaluation is to find out whether unsatisfactory outcomes were the result of poor implementation (process) or inappropriate plan. A number of quantitative and qualitative techniques can be used in this evaluation, one of which is to compare outcomes to needs, goals and other standards. The findings of this evaluation will be used to decide whether the programme should be continued, refined or terminated. If the programme needs modification or replacement, the evaluation’s results should provide useful guidelines.
5. Application of the CIPP model in translator-training

In light of what has been said above about the unstable translation market and the changing profile of translators, using the CIPP model may provide a systematic tool for improving translator-training programmes. This hope is supported by the model’s orientation to quality enhancement, and as Stufflebeam explains “the model’s underlying theme is that evaluation’s most important purpose is not to prove, but to improve.” (2003: 31). To make it clear and brief, we can visualize the role of this model in the form of a set of questions. When (academic) training institutions obtain answers to these questions, they will likely be able to make more appropriate decisions to help meet the assessed needs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is the targeted translation market?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the most needed language pairs, text types and professional skills?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are students’ needs? (e.g. L1 and L2 proficiency, text analysis skills)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What problems should be solved in order to meet the assessed needs? (e.g. social, legal, political)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are there any services or expertise that can be of help to meet the needs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are there any funding programs or other opportunities to solve existing problems?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the criteria for setting priority goals?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the criteria for judging outcomes?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Input Evaluation

- What are the translator-training approaches?
- What is translation competence?
- What is the best approach that helps achieving the programme’s purpose?
- What courses are most relevant to meet the assessed needs?
- How should the courses be sequenced?
- What are the criteria for selecting teaching materials?
- What learning resources are needed to enhance students’ learning?
- What are the guidelines for testing and evaluating students?
- What are the guidelines for teaching methods?
- How much theory and practice should be included?
- What are the criteria for selecting trainers?
- etc.

## Process Evaluation

- How are teaching materials selected?
- How are lessons taught?
- What activities are held in the classroom?
- How is students’ work evaluated?
- What are the examination conditions?
- How much practice is there in translation classes?
- How are learning resources used?
- etc.
6. **How does the CIPP model deal with improvement proposals?**

In his 2002 article, Daniel Stufflebeam shows how improvement proposals are processed in the CIPP model, going through all types of evaluation (pp. 282-286). Based on new information or findings from regular context evaluation, a modification or innovation is proposed for installation in the programme. This proposal should have justifications that convince stakeholders with the necessity of the change, and propose a solution. If this solution is satisfactory, it will be installed; if not, an input evaluation is required.

The input evaluation will examine the solution in light of available resources and competing approaches. When a promising strategy for implementing the solution is found, it will be either installed or implemented for testing.

In the testing period, process and product evaluations should be carried out to determine the effectiveness of the new change. If it proves satisfactory, it will be installed in the system; if not, a decision
should be made whether it is worth a second test or whether it should be aborted.

7. Conclusion
This paper tried to show how the CIPP model can be of use in evaluating translator-training programmes in order to be able to meet the needs of stakeholders. It might be true that a distinction should be made between ‘training’ and ‘education’, and that academic institutions should avoid total responsiveness to market demands (cf. Bernardini 2004, Mossop 2003), but the fact remains that quality, relevance and effectiveness should be eagerly pursued. These goals are hard to guarantee unless administrators are provided with information enabling them to make the right decisions. Such information are obtained through a serious evaluation of the whole system of training, from the realisation of needs to the reception of product. This paper argued that translator-training programmes need to be regularly evaluated. This evaluation should be as comprehensive as possible and oriented to showing what to do, not only what is wrong.

References


Who Translates What: 
Translated Literature &
The Recycling of Stereotypes

Hadeer Abo El Nagah Ph D
University of Ottawa /Taibah University

And among His Signs is the creation of the heavens and the earth, and the diversity of your tongues and colors. In that surely are Signs for those who possess knowledge. (The Holy Quran 30:23)

"Worlds in which different societies live are distinct worlds, not merely the same world with different labels attached"

Edward Sapir

Abstract:

Though Literary translation is undeniably an important tool in creating mutual understanding between different peoples and cultures, instead, such vital tool is intentionally or unintentionally utilized to recycle negative stereotyping against Islam and Arabs in general and about Arab and Muslim women in particular. What is being translated? Who translates? Who chooses what to be translated? And how the translation of literature is affecting the creation and/or affirmation of the negative/positive image of Islam and Muslims in the consciousness of the English reader? What is the role expected to be played by translated Arabic literature in reshaping the image of Islam? Through Edward Said’s Orientalism and the image of the Orient, three examples are given here to demonstrate selectivity of stereotypical models that conform with the image of the Arab world as the exotic: Sudanese Tayeb Salih’s Seasons of Migration to the North translated by Denys Johnson- Davies 1969, Egyptian The Yacoubian Building by Alaa Al Aswany and translated from Arabic by Humphrey Davies 2004, and Morrocan For Bread Alone, by Mohamed Choukri, translated from Arabic by Paul Bowles 2006.
Introduction:

Literature is the window through which different peoples and cultures know about each other. In that stand, literary translation plays an important role in transmitting certain messages and creating positive/negative images in the minds of the targeted group of readers. Literary translation has been always one of the venues to develop understanding between cultures. Its importance and sensitivity has been increasingly augmented especially within the current calls for the cultural dialogue. With the growing interest in Islam, the Middle East and the Arab world in general, literary translation is, may be, one of the ways of introducing the Arab world to the "West".

In a series of articles about Arab American art, published in San Francisco Chronicle, by Jonathan Curiel the following definition of the Arab culture is given: Arabs are united by an ancestral language (Arabic) and an ancestral homeland (the Arabian Peninsula) that gave birth to a Semitic people who have changed the course of human history. The footprints of those changes can be seen in Arabic culture. Even more than politics and military issues, culture is a gateway to understanding a world of distant capitals and disparate religions (16).

In fact, there is no such homogeneity; the Arabic region or world includes various heterogeneous cultures, dialects, religions and traditions. The term "Arab" is used in this study to indicate all literary texts that are originally written in formal standard Arabic and are published in a predominantly Arabic speaking country. Similarly, the term "West" is usually loosely used to describe the northern hemisphere and can elastically be stretched to describe its inhabitants as a homogeneous whole. While I have no inclination to reinforce the shallow divisive strategy that sees the world as "East" and "West", which is in itself a recycling of the colonialist vision of "us" versus "us".
Them", the term "West" is used in this study to refer to readers of English as opposed to Arabic ones.

Through reviewing the majority of the Arabic literary works selected for translation, the aim of this study is to investigate the role played by literary translation in recycling the negative stereotypes against Islam and Arabic culture.

Literary Translation and Reading Between the Lines:

It is, may be, true that today's world is getting smaller, but as the members of its family continue to speak different languages, the need for translation increasingly becomes more crucial in developing venues of mutual understanding. Literary translation evolves as one of the main pathways of cultural understanding and dialogues amongst the varied members of the modern world. As early as the thirties of the past century, scholars and university professors like Thomas R. Palfrey noticed the importance of literary translation as a valuable educational means in precise acquisition of foreign language, mastery of the vernacular, developing aesthetic appreciation of literature and as a method and an end in itself for students and teachers of foreign languages (418). Though remarks like Palfrey's were made in the twentieth century, inconsiderable scholarly attention is paid to literary translation as a valuable educational and training medium in foreign languages. Furthermore, its intra and intercultural role, as Shaw emphasized, remained insufficiently explored (29).

Finding scholarly works on literary translation was one of the difficulties confronting the preparation for this study; it also proves the limited scholarly attention paid to such field. Additionally, the very limited number of studies or reviews of Arabic literary texts translated into English demonstrates both the scarce attention such works attract, as well as the necessity of promoting more academic and critical interest in studying these works and exploring the role they may, potentially, play in creating and reshaping of the public opinion of the English reader about Arabic and Islamic culture.
In her "Translating Gender", Samia Mehrez emphasizes the cultural role played by translation to create the opinion of the target language readers about the culture of the original text: Translation theory tells us that translating a text means rewriting the original text, no matter how invisible that process attempts to be. This act of rewriting does not happen in a vacuum. It is always conditioned and shaped by histories, ideologies, values, beliefs, and representations that pre-exist the very act of translation in the target language. This relationship between a foreign text and a target language culture points to "the violence that resides in the very purpose and activity of translation" (106 italics is mine).

Mehrez also points out Lawrence Venuti's opinion on how, translation yields enormous power in the construction of national identities for foreign cultures, and hence, it potentially figures in ethnic discrimination, geopolitical confrontations, colonialism, terrorism and war. Despite this violence mentioned by Mehrez, translation as a cultural political practice, can enable innovation and generate new spaces for the development of individual societies and cross-cultural dialogue. Mehrez further detailed, how translation "enlists the foreign in the maintenance or revision of literary canons, dominant conceptual values, research and methodologies of the target-language culture" (ibid 106).

If getting the thought involved and rendering the passage in grammatically correct and coherent form in the target language may suffice to define translation in general, it hardly fulfills the minimum requirement of literary translation. Even with definitions like Palfrey's who sees literary translation as: "getting the thought involved and rendering the passage in grammatically perfect and idiomatic vernacular" (410), many definitions fail short to describe the magnitude of culture and cultural background to literary translation. In addition to the linguistic difficulty of translating between two grammatically and syntactical different languages like English and Arabic, literary translation is definitely deeper than to be
compartamentalized in the "idiomatic vernacular" specified in Palfrey's definition, as such reduction will lead to not only mechanical and lifeless texts but also considered flagrant betrayal of the tone and spirit of the original. While accuracy and fidelity, as with any other kind of translation, remain as indispensable necessity, literary translation requires vast knowledge of the source language and solid background of the culture of the original. Moreover, since literary translation is considered a rewriting, as above mentioned by Mehrez, the aesthetic value of literary translation in particular should not be underestimated. The translated text of literature is to be regarded as a creative reproduction in itself; thus the cultural value of such works should occupy more critical and scholarly attention.

One of the few renowned figures in the field of translating Arabic Literature into English, Denys Johnson-Davies, explains in his interview with Ferial Ghazoul how he sees literary translation as an "intertraffic" between cultures. He emphasizes that knowing and mastering two languages are not sufficient to make an efficient translator of literature. Johnson-Davies points out the importance of looking at the translated product of literature as a creative work in itself by giving examples of creative writers of caliber such as Baudelaire, Proust, Lawrence, Dryden and Pope and many of others who "did not find translation too worthy of undertaking" (Ghazoul 82).

**Who Translates What? Who Makes the Decisions?**

Who translates what, who makes the selection of the material to be translated and based on what criteria? Such questions are crucial in the field of literary translation. Arabic specialist, translator and professor, Roger Allen explains his own criteria in selecting texts for translation, as basically the "transferability" of the text into the target language. Allen, who translated numerous Arabic literary works of which the greatest bulk is fiction, states in his interview with Hala Halim, that he has recently focused on selecting the works that explore different
venues from other world fictional traditions, especially historical novels that are a reflection of pre-modern characteristics of Arabic and its literary heritage (Halim). Allen sees the real challenge confronting Arabic translation is that of creating the market and convincing the publishers to publish and market the book and then convincing the potential reader to read it (ibid). With the absence of specialists in the field, the selection, translating and editing process is merely left to the buyers and sellers as Ghalia Qabbani points out (qtd in Halim).

Likewise, in his interview mentioned above, Denys Johnson-Davies, elaborated that because of the lack of interest in publishing translated Arabic literature, especially in the first half of the twentieth century, he had to wait a period of twenty years between his first and second translated works (Ghazoul 82). The translator's choice can only be motivated if the work is assured of publication, Johnson-Davies explains, as the translator will not derive any satisfaction from "putting the efforts of his labor in the drawer of his desk" (ibid 84). Both Allen and Johnson-Davies agreed that the responsibility of the invisibility of the Arabic literary texts in English translation lies on the shoulders of the Arabs themselves. Allen places the lack of interest in disseminating translated Arabic literature at the door of the representatives of the Arab world in the capital cities of the world namely the cultural attaches, whom he sees as "totally unqualified, unequipped and unwilling to promote the literatures of their homeland" (Halim).

Placing the responsibility on another entity in the Arab world, Johnson-Davies believes that the lack of publishing system and serious literary criticism in the Arab world opens the doors for the Western publisher to choose the original texts in terms of the impulses of the market (Ghazoul 86). Additionally, the ignorance of the English publishers and readers of the Arabic literary scene, according to Johnson-Davies, is what made the practical criterion of publishability basic to one's choice of material, for instance, fame in
the Arab world is totally irrelevant as "no one is interested in Arabic literature per se" (ibid 87).

While Johnson- Davies' opinion was completely true during the eighties of the twentieth century, the events of September 11 and the waged wars against terror and Islam have changed the scene. Since then, an escalating public interest in Islam and the Arab world has been clearly evident. While such interest is politically invested by the US government to support its war against terror and to justify invasions of Muslim countries like Afghanistan and Iraq, it has largely remained unutilized by the Arabs. For instance, the very limited number of translators working in different European languages who were present at the SCC conference in 2004 Frankfurt Book Fair, in which the Arab world was the guest of honor demonstrates, in Roger Allen's opinion, how the Arabs fail to represent their culture internationally (Halim). Clearly, a quick review of the number of the translated Arabic literary texts published in the last few years post September 11 may lead to the same conclusion. Nevertheless, screening the titles and themes of the works raises many questions about the aim of the translation project, and reveals the need to investigate the effect of these works in creating and reshaping the Arab world and Islam in the minds of the English readers.

Edward Said's Orientalism and the Image of the Orient:

In 1979 Edward Said's canonic book Orientalism appeared, in which he analyzed the historical construction of the Western discourse that persistently misrepresents both Islam and its adherents especially within the Arab world. Despite the ample effect of Edward Said's book since its publication, the idea of dividing the world onto Orient and Occident as grounds of subordination and interests, which is the backbone of the book, was not novel. Said acknowledges earlier writings of his predecessors about Orientalism such as Michel Foucault and Antonio Gramsci who examined an array of nineteenth century French and British novelists, poets, politicians, philologists, historians, travelers, and imperial administrator. The voyages and
travel narratives of nineteenth century French authors such as Chateaubriand, Lamartine, Nerval, and Flaubert, Sylvester De Sacy, Earnest Renan, Richard Burton, lord Cromer and others are examples of the early roots of Orientalism (Bayoumi 63-113). The Orient as Said states in the introduction of Orientalism is almost a European invention, and has been since antiquity a place of romance, exotic beings and haunting memories and landscapes and remarkable experiences (iv). Said explains that the Orient were always part of the process of "Orientalizing" themselves. Orientalism is, thus, a Western style of dominating, restructuring and having authority over the Orient (Bayoumi 69). Though "Orientalism" and the depiction and stereotyping of the Orient have their roots back in history, it has never experienced such concentration as it did in the second half of the twentieth century with the wide spread of visual media and movies. Shaheen's widely read; Reel Bad Arabs¹, is only one of the examples in documenting the negative stereotyping of Arabs and Muslims in Hollywood. The book and many others only demonstrate the magnitude of the effect of the visual image of the creation of the image of the villain Arabs. In his interview with James Paul, Edward Said explained how such archetypal depiction affects the translation and publishing market:

At all levels of literary representations, television, and film images, it is virtually impossible to find anything like the degree of mindless or malicious stereotyping that you find in the case of Arabs and Muslims and the Middle East generally………. publishers have avoided opportunities to translate and publish contemporary and even classical Arabic literature or anything that might humanize Muslims (35).

¹ Shaheen presented the "worst list" in which he analyzed how Arabs were depicted and presented as dangerous and scary in Hollywood movies. His book includes more than fifty movies were Arabs were dehumanized and portrayed as the enemies.
Though the post September 11 scene demonstrates an accelerating interest in the Arabic culture. Such interest was not utilized in changing the negative stereotyping, conversely it feeds in Said's idea of the orient and, it only complements the tendency to inclusiveness of various ethnic cultures into the American main stream as mentioned by Hosam Aboul-Ela. Thus Arab and Arab American culture is anthropologically reduced into a set of music, poetry, fiction, cuisine, courtship, religion and language(16). It is true that the American universities experienced a remarkable interest in studying Arabic language and literature and more enrolment in political science courses focusing on the Middle East (Halim)¹. Likewise, the representation of Arab Americans through literature witnessed a sudden and noticeable rise in the last few years as many novels and poetry anthologies by Arab American writers were published². However Aboul-Elä argue that such attention does not necessarily indicate changing the stereotypical image of Arabs and Muslims, nor an indicative to amiable shifts in the public opinion, he ironically quotes the San Francisco Chronicle from a promotion of a concert "there has never been a better time to be Arabic". Aboel Ela explains that the fact that it appears approximately two years after 5000 Arabs and Muslims had been detained or suspicion of collusion with terrorism in the US made it questionable (17).

¹ I was surprised to be asked to start an Arabic language and literature program at a small rural college of the SUNY system. It was even more surprising when I had a full class with a waiting list and some faculty members as audits when I introduced my first pilot course. When I asked my students about their motives of studying Arabic, their answers varied from to get a governmental job, to work in the Arab world and to want to know more about the region!

² Many important publications by Arab Americans appeared since September 11, such as those cited by Aboul-Ela and others including Mattawa's second volume of poetry, Zodiac of Echoes, Abinader's memoir, Children of the Roojme,: A Family's Journey, Abu-Jaber's novel, Crescent and The language of Baklava , Hammad's Drops of This Story, and Halaby's novel West of Jordan (see Aboul-Ela 30).
Despite some scattered attempts to humanize Arabs during the last few years, the image of the Arab as a savage, violent and, in most cases, as a terrorist has continued to predominate the literary and media scene in America. Negative stereotyping of Arabs and Muslims has became the norm and has reinforced the idea of the orient and the White Western Eurocentric supremacy.

Central to the constellation of ideas of Said's "Orientalism" is the image of woman. Serving the theme of the exotic, and the colonial vision of the Orient, the Arab and particularly the Muslim woman certainly occupy quite a vast space of this image. Charlotte Weber for instance examines how the West has long evinced an enduring fascination with the women in the harem, and the veil, a recurring tropes of the Orientalist literature represent the Muslim women oppression and eroticism simultaneously. The Muslim woman in the Western media and literature is usually portrayed as, Amany Hamdan explains, through the binary contradiction of oppression and eroticism: The prevailing images of Arab Muslim women in the occidental world seem to shift between the dual paradigms, between either the image of salient beast of burden, or that of a capricious princess, the half naked …. Or the shapeless figure of woman behind the veil.

Such images of Arabs and Muslim women, as Hamdan stated, is considered general knowledge and are found in approximately 60,000 books on the Arab Orient that were published in the West between 1800 and 1950.

---

1 Many Americans generically believe that all Arabs are Muslims and think of Arab and Muslim women as one homogeneous entity.
Literary Translation and the Recycling of Stereotypes; Examples from Arabic Translated Literature:

In her "Translation and the Postcolonial Experience", Samia Mehrez basically argues that the plurilingual and pluricultural nature of postcolonial literature resists and ultimately excludes the monolingual. She demands that its readers be "in between," at the same time capable of reading and translating, where translation becomes an integral part of the reading experience (46). A quick review of the Arabic literature titles translated into English will simply imply that current translation activities is geared towards echoing and recycling of stereotyping, and that they increase misconceptions against Arabs and Islam. Such stereotypical selection forces the readers into monolingual and monocultural reading denying them the right to know the depth and variety of the culture of the original text. With the repeated presentation of themes that fossilized the Middle East and the Arab world as the exotic, it becomes almost impossible for the English reader to think otherwise of the Muslim character or using Fawzia Afzal-Khan's title, to "Shatter the Stereotypes".

The translated works of Egypt's Noble Prize winner for literature Naguib Mahfouz, are the best example of the misrepresentation of Islam and religious characters. With only few exceptions, such as the works of Salam Khadra Jayyusi's works, and a handful of other

---

1 I experienced great difficulty finding translated literary works that do not misrepresent Islam and Arabs, preparing my course material of Arabic literature and culture. I hardly found some "mild" works that do not conform with the predominant stereotypes of Islam and Muslim women in particular.

2 Jayyusi’s PROTA (the Project for the Translation of Arabic Literature) she has been responsible for the dissemination of a huge portion of the Palestinian literature available in the English-speaking world. I managed to establish contact with Dr. Salam Al Jayyusi who is by far one of the most respectable translators of Arabic literature. I was planning to interview her on the subject of this paper but due to her prior engagement to meet a deadline of some of her works, she was unavailable to answer my questions. I intend to interview her and publish her views of the current scene of translated Arabic literature in the near future.
translators, the translated Arabic literature made available to the American readers comply with the recurrent stereotypical image of Muslim men and women\(^1\). The themes of the most of the recently translated works naturally feed the image of the exotic and corrupt Arab world where men are Muslim terrorist and women are either oppressed or extremely sexualized. Nawal El Saadawi's hyper sexual novels and autobiography comes next in preference after Mahfouz's secular themes. Though mostly banned from appearance in Arabic, her books and novels are very popular and mistakenly viewed by the American reader as the contemporary "freed" voice of the Muslim women.

The majority of the Arabic literary text made available to the reader in English uniformly introduce two recurrent themes; erotic and exotic East and religious fundamentalism. Though translated on a stretch of time, Sudanese Tayeb Salih's *Seasons of Migration to the North* translated by Denys Johnson- Davies 1969, Egyptian *The Yacoubian Building* by Alaa Al Aswany and translated from the Arabic by Humphrey Davies 2004, and Moroccan *For Bread Alone*, by Mohamed Choukri, translated from the Arabic by Paul Bowles 1973, are only few examples. While one may argue that translators only choose from what is written in Arabic and what is popular in the Arabic market, it is hard to believe that the repeated and recurrent selection of such themes is just a coincident.

\(^1\) Some translated poetic works also do not conform to the recurrent themes translated in fiction, I like to precisely mention the works translated by the Egyptian Public Book Association, however they are only available locally in Cairo and are not available in the American or any other Western market!
Al Aswany's 2002-3 best seller *The Yacoubian Building* is a perfect example of recycling of Western and Orientalist stereotyping\(^1\). The novel is about a Cairian historic elite building that is used by the author to allegedly present a tapestry of current social problems. Loaded with sex, frustrations and corruption, the novel presents examples of Islamists' line of thought that shows Islam and religiousness as an outlet and solution to social and financial problems.

Though strongly criticized for its content when it first appeared in Arabic and when presented in a movie, the novel was an amiable choice to the translator and to its publisher, the American University in Cairo press. Such selection raises the question of what the aim of translating literature is, and how the process of translation reemphasizes negative stereotyping against Islam and Arab societies in general.

Equally loaded with sexual references and coming in line with the theme of the exotic is Choukri's *For Bread Alone*. The autobiographical novel describes a bleak childhood and youth in Morocco. Fleeing drought and starvation in the Rif, his family moves to Tangier and then Tetuan. Most of his siblings die, of neglect or starvation or abuse, but he survives the beatings of his father, the pangs of hunger, and the dangers of the street. He lives by begging, petty theft, prostitution, smuggling and occasional work, and he learns to enjoy sex, drugs and alcohol. The novel ends in Mohammad's attempt to learn how to write. It exemplifies the character of violent father and the street life of sex and prostitution which may give the

\(^1\) The book became one of the most popular and widely read translated Arabic novels in English, its title comes to the surface in any discussion about Arab world or Arabic literature, its publisher assured the popularity of the book and happily mentioned the fact it was reprinted several times. To my surprise, this is the only Arabic novel some Americans read or heard about and shockingly they take it as a source of information about Egyptian and Middle Eastern society!
English reader the impression that such life is "natural" in Middle Eastern countries and North Africa.

The third example to be considered, here, is Tayeb Salih's *Seasons of Migration to the North*, though the oldest of the three, yet demonstrates the translators' preference of certain themes and the selection of certain texts to meet the expectations of the English readers about the exotic East. The novel tells us about its protagonist, Mustafa Sa'eed, a prodigy from Sudan who goes to study first in Cairo and then in London, where he hunts women but eventually falls for one himself. After a marriage consummated by violence and a prison sentence, he returns to Sudan, moving to a small village on the Nile. Through the presentation of complex relations in the Sudanese village, the novel refers to women subjugation, sexual relations and corruption. Answering Ferial Ghazoul as she comments on Johnson-Davies' focusing on translating narratives of erotic themes, he says: "Yes, the erotic has always interested me". He also emphasized that there were many sexually explicit passages in *Season* which he translated from the manuscript. Though Salih decided to remove such passages from the Arabic version, he asked Johnson-Davies to keep them in the English version who in his turn, objected as that would make the two versions look uneven and may be later would be taken as a mischief on his behalf (87).

**Conclusion and Recommendations:**

Literature is considered the golden gate of introduction and a valuable bridge between peoples and cultures. In that stand literary translation is considered an opportunity of presenting the culture of the source text to the reader in the target language. Though Arabic literature is rich of literary works that can convey a positive image of Islam and Arabic culture, only the texts that comply with the colonialist image of the Orient and Orientalism are selected to be translated. With only few examples, literary translation intentionally or unintentionally echoes
the negative portrayal of the Arab and Islamic character and recycles the stereotypical depiction of both men and women in the Arab world.

Since Edward Said’s *Orientalism* in the late seventies, a plethora of critical works analyzing the mis/representation of Islam, Muslims and Arabs in general in English writing and more specifically in American media and literature were published. On the other hand very few works examined the depiction on Arabs and Muslims through selectivity in translating Arabic literary works. A quick review of the translated Arabic literary texts my easily lead to the conclusion that these texts were merely selected to meet the Orientalist expectation of the American reader and his perception of the Arab world as the exotic fantasy. The selection of the texts and the translating process itself is left to the mostly foreign publishing houses and translators who usually pick what suites the dominant image of Islam and Arabic society. A review of the translated literary titles in English can easily imply the translator's preference of themes of eroticism, corruption and works that depict the Arab and the Muslim man as a fanatic and the Muslim woman as either an extremely oppressed or highly sexualized being. As literary analysis is not the aim of this study, only examples of translated works were given to demonstrate how they recycle the predominant negative stereotypes against Islam, Arabs and Muslims. Such choices critically question the objectivity of the translators and the aim of their works.

Though Islam and the Arab world gained escalating public and scholarly interest since September 11, their image remained negative in the consciousness of the American public. Unfortunately the Arabs themselves did not take advantage of such increasing interest and were not able to gear it towards creating a more favorable image of themselves and their culture. Thus they became partners in the recycling of the negative stereotyping against themselves and their own culture.
Based on the findings of this study, more thorough examination of the translated texts is needed. While the efforts of Arabs and Muslims have noticeably increased in translating religious texts in the last decades, very limited attention and resources were directed to the translation of literature and other cultural texts. Thus, it is recommended that more efforts are to be exerted in the field of literary translation. The augment effect that may result in selecting the Arabic literary works that demonstrate the richness of the Arabic culture and the greatness of its legacy should not be disregarded. More scholarly attention should be given to Arabic works translated into other languages. Finally, the stage of selecting and translating Arabic literature should not be left open to non Arab translators and publishers and more Arab specialists should be more involved in creating their image and give a clearer portrayal of themselves.

Works Consulted

- Choukri, Mohamed. For Bread Alone, Paul Bowles; (trans), Telegram, 1973.
Elia, Nada. (Review) "Imagining Arab Womanhood: The Cultural Mythology of Veils, Harems, and Belly Dancers in the U.S." *Journal of Middle East Women's Studies* 5 no2 85-8 Spr 2009.


Translating Children's Literature and Its Impact on the Intellectual-Educational Growth of a Child

By: Dr. Effat Jamil Kh og eer
Associate Prof. English Literature,
Umm Al-Qura University.

Children's literature, as a literary genre, has considerably grown in size and importance since the late 18th century. Its importance has risen from its various uses; entertaining, didactic, and remedial. Some children's books were written for enjoyment such as bed-time stories. Others are used for their educational values and some are written having in mind their remedial effect for correcting a child's behavior or treating a psychological case. They ought to be considered among the great many books and stories for small children as well as big ones. In the words of an expert, the best children's literature is the book that "offers readers enjoyment as well as memorable characters and situations and valuable insights into the human condition" (Lynch-Brown 4).

Unfortunately, children's literature in the Arab world is not ideal in any way. Not only it came much later than other countries, but also because of certain shortcomings such as:
- It is repeating itself; folktales and stories are written and re-written in different ways rather than creating original new stories.
- It is directly didactic; certain values are stated in the books and the child has to be always trying to find the moral behind it rather than encouraging him to read and think creatively and express himself freely.
- It neglected early childhood stage; language and subject matter did not suit the child.
• It is not related to the child's personal life and interests, and misses that touch of realism. Thus it tends to be boring and less effective for children. In addition to that, there is a lack of professional Arabic literature for children- a lack in quantity as well as in quality.

The urge for translations for children is increasing. Most of the translated literature that is available now does not conform with the Arab/Muslim beliefs and culture (e.g. superman, god of gods, or those that deal with black magic), and may be harmful from the ideological point of view. It is needed for the cross-cultural understanding and international dialogue. Communication with others will enable the Arab kids to benefit from the civilization and advancement of the 'Other' in various branches of knowledge.

"In the wake of the atrocities of war, the public favoured stories that were idyllic and non-confrontational as part of a belief that children needed to be protected from the menace of the world. In the 1960s and 1970s, this view was countered by authors who believed it was best to expose children to a more problem-oriented realism. However, realists and romanticists alike created their works with the education and upbringing of children in mind."
(http://www.norway.org/About_Norway/culture/literature/children, 2009)

Having the theory of "problem-oriented realism" in mind, this paper aims at making the best use of Western children's literature as an example for world literature through providing a critical reading for some of the books assigned to the children in American elementary schools. These stories are intended to instill certain principles and values in children, and enhance their knowledge and intellectual growth. The stories also help in solving some of the children's problems, correct their behavior, and strengthen their self-confidence without undermining their childhood and innocence.
The books – most of which are award winners- are selected by a committee of the school board, members of teacher-parent associations, in addition to a group of local university professors specialized in education. A poll is also conducted to find out the opinions of parents. It is such a long procedure that might take a whole year to come to a final conclusion. The books are assigned as an extra-curricular activity for third graders. Each student chooses a book to read at home then undergoes a written exam in it at school. The child who passes, gets certain points. When a student completes reading the collection, he/she will be rewarded with a field trip of his/her choice.

The first story, The Sloppy Copy Slipup (2006), by DyAnne Disalvo, takes place in Franklin's Elementary school. The first school day began by announcing the word of the day in the school broadcasting service. It is "outstanding." The announcer started by spelling the word slowly then she explained its meaning by using it in a sentence: "For lunch we will be having outstanding macaroni and cheese with outstanding fresh fruit and your choice of outstanding juice or milk. Thank you. Have an outstanding day." (1)

After that outstanding introduction, the protagonist of the story, Brian or Big Hig, a third grader, narrates his agonizing experience after reciting the Pledge of Allegiance and how he was pretending to look in his bag for the written homework that has not been written actually! In a minute Miss Fromme, the teacher, will be collecting the assignments to return them later with a lot of editing, corrections and suggestions that will eventually enhance the students' writing abilities like her saying: "...'More description for this opening sentence, please.' Or 'Brian, please remember to use your five senses.' Or: 'You don't need all these commas.'" (2) All her comments would lead eventually to a next to perfect final copy, but Brian has not written his homework for this week yet.
Each detail in Brian's experience teaches a valuable lesson not only for kids, but also for grow-ups –parents and teachers. Brian's real suffering with writing is not the writing itself. Rather, it is the choice of topics; finding an exciting and interesting point to talk about is the most difficult task. All the topics around him are either too long, too short, or too boring (like writing about his family; his parents, brothers, and their dog). Once he wrote about a fishing trip that his younger brother Stevie's mischievous behavior has ruined. After completing it, instead of submitting it to Miss Fromme, he handed her a blank sheet of paper. That was when he got his first red zero! The lesson that he learned from her at the moment was that we need to observe the normal things in life around us and learn how to record them. The whole book is interspersed with tips that help students in writing assignments to the point that the last chapter is called "Big Hig's 'Facts' for writing."(102)

The lessons to be derived from this story are numerous. The school bulletin board can be a highly effective educational tool for discovering students' hidden talents when they post their poems or articles on it. (Rewrite these three sentences so that they join into the story)) The teacher asks the students to hand in their home works quietly and in an orderly manner: "Ladies and Gentlemen! Less talk and more attention." The kids immediately guessed that Miss Fromme was not in a good mood for she did not even thank the students when they gave her their papers. When it was Brian's turn to hand in his assignment, he was trembling with fear and anxious for being the only one who did not do his home work. But he had his own excuse for not being able to do it.

Another lesson is a child learns how to save money in order to buy what he needs, like the guitar he wanted for his future band. Students also get to go through a fire alarm drill so they can behave wisely in case of an emergency. The way the family dog was obtained teaches a moral lesson about honesty. The story deals with the issue of taking part in the family's responsibility, doing chores for the parents and
siblings rivalry when Brian compares between himself and his little brother who gets away with his naughty behavior. In addition to that, his mother makes him in charge of Stevie during her absence. The more he remembers his brother's behavior, the angrier he gets because he was busy taking care of Stevie and had no time to do his homework. And now he is on the verge of getting another zero. The last time he had a zero, his mother stopped him from watching television and playing with his play station. He stepped forward, put down his empty piece of paper, and decided to explain everything to the teacher and ask for another chance. He heard her usual words: "Write about what you know. Or research what you don't." (22) He told her his story so clearly, quietly and in simple correct sentences.

The teacher was listening to him attentively, respecting his feelings and encouraging him to go on with his story asserting, at the same time, that the written sloppy copy has to be done and there will be no exceptions. One of the students asked an outstanding question: "...isn't Brian's story like a verbal sloppy copy?" (63) That was quite an experiment for Brian that Miss Fromme would have accepted it, but ethically, she wanted to be fair with the rest of the class who did a written sloppy copy as was required.

Brian remembered one of the writing rules that the teacher used to repeat all the time that students have to establish a connection between the things around them and the ideas that they want to write about. It is important that teachers know a great deal about child psychology so that they turn into a source of knowledge and encouragement, not intimidation. Brian's tension is eased now and he felt relaxed after the teacher offered him some cookies while listening to him till the end. He felt safe to be honest, tell the truth, admit his fault and show willingness to fix it. She urged him not to repeat his mistake, and informed him that everything he had told her that day was "exactly the kind of story that [he] could be writing down on paper." Her words really restored his self-confidence and peace of mind when she asked
him to write down his story saying: "Write like you're talking to me. Remember this is your sloppy copy." (83)

Among many other issues that this book boosts is the healthy father-son relationship. The father was not just a parent, but also a friend who is always there whenever his sons need him, who would listen to their problems and help solving them. Brian concluded his story by explaining how the search for his lost money that he has been saving to buy a guitar ended happily. His father managed to give a down payment for the guitar so nobody else would buy it before him. The story closes on a happy note, expecting a bright future in writing for Brian who decides to write regularly for the local newsletter following the basic writing rules that he has learned from Miss Fromme. In translating this novel for younger kids may be it can be read with no reference to any religious practice.

*****************************************************************

Rules

Rules (2006) is a story that earned its author, Cynthia Lord, the Newbery Honor Medal for Children’s books. It is the story of Catherine, the twelve-year old girl who takes special care of her autistic younger eight-year old brother. His illness made him behave in an abnormal way which embarrasses Catherine although she loves him so much. Thus, she teaches him a list of rules to make him socially fit. David can say the rules, however, he does not apply them, which made them useless. But Catherine kept on treating him nicely. She longed to have a friend with whom she can empathize, and once she met the new neighbors' daughter, Kristie, she finds solace in her.

Catherine also meets Jason, a little crippled, boy in the clinic of her brother’s doctor. Jason can neither walk nor talk. She gets interested in his condition and the way he communicates with others. Eventually, they become friends. She seems to be leading a double life and falls
into a deep conflict for she lies and deceives in trying to hide the fact about her brother's illness and her friendship to Jason from Kristie. She is worried about what would Kristie say about her if she knew that Catherine is taking care of two handicapped people. She did not want to lose her. Certain morals and values are called for, here, such as trying to be honest with ourselves and with others regarding the way we feel and the kind of life we are leading. All we need to do is to be ourselves, admit our mistakes bravely and apologize for them. Catherine, nevertheless, comes to terms with herself and realizes finally that she was making a mistake in shying away from her brother's and Jason's disabilities, instead of facing up to the situation.

The lessons that Catherine and all the readers learn from this story is that we have to accept our family and friends as they really are and not as we like them to be. We have to love and deal with them normally regardless of their deficiencies.

The rules that this book presents, are not just for David, but for each and every individual in order to conform to the community's norms and be accepted in a civilized society. Those rules are some behavioral instructions that regulate people's ways of dealing with each other at all levels, and not to hurt each other's feelings. Catherine made rules that can make whoever follows them a normal and fit person.

One of the most crucial lessons of this book is the humanitarian way with which one should be dealing with persons who have special needs. Besides acknowledging their feelings, skills, aspirations and need to be wanted, loved and respected, communicating with them, they should not be made to feel that they are different in any way. Involving them in social activities instead of keeping them on the margin would help them a great deal.

Friendship and volunteer work are also stressed in this story. Befriending and taking care of people with special needs is not just the responsibility of the state, but of the community as well. (There is an
interesting message for each child that he can make his own rules and follow them in a way that does not clash with the general rules of the society that can not always set rules that suit everybody's personal requirements."

The writer was keen to list as many rules as possible to enable a child to choose what he likes and re-phrase what he does not like, such as "Call if you're going to be late" or "Homework first." (39) Some of those rules can be broken, like: "If you don't have the word you need, borrow someone else's," (50) depending on a child's need. The book is loaded with manners and behavioral instructions given in a story form so as to make it easy for children to grasp those teachings and revise their own behavior especially after knowing others' reactions towards David's behavior.

***************

**Listen!**

This novel, a bestseller, written in (2006) is among several recent contemporary children’s books by authors who produce didactic literature designed to cultivate the reader’s individual desire to read and learn, and to teach young people to reflect on the role of people in the universe. It is about Charley, the twelve years old girl and her multiple plights after losing her mother, the photographer, in a plane crash on her way to Brazil to take pictures of nature there.

Charley is fated with a series of troubles. In addition to her mother's death, she breaks her leg in a car accident that leaves her bed-ridden for a long time. She can not even go to school. Moreover, she keeps on having nightmares and suffers some kind of amnesia. When she wakes up, she would repeatedly ask her father about what had happened and he would answer her, until he decides to write the answers on a piece of paper. Charley's physical and psychological suffering culminates when her best friend, Amy, goes away to New York for a vacation. An important lesson is given here for parents not to neglect their children's need for their being close to them. Her
father's great sorrow for the loss of his wife makes him immerse himself in his work, thus spending less time with his daughter, although he tries to help her regain her health and start walking without crutches to be able to go back to school next year. She refuses to even look at the pictures that her mother had taken.

This story demonstrates an important factor in a child's growth; the friendship between children and animals. While strolling around the woods one day, Charley finds a dog that looks like a North American wolf and calls it Coyote. She intends to keep it, but her father refuses and promises to get her a puppy. She insists to domesticate it although everybody told her that it is impossible to tame a wild animal but she kept on trying and bought books that teach her how to do that. It gives her an incentive to move and live, for it helped in taking her out of that depression. It is a matter of challenge for her; she wants to prove that she can do something. The lesson that kids learn from Charley's story is that persistence and the strong will can help us overcome our hardships. Some great but slow changes took place. She heard her mother's voice saying: "Listen! Listen!" She started to contemplate the beauty of nature and the places that her mother had taken pictures of. A strong friendship has risen between Charley and Coyote in that wonderful and serene environment in the forest. But because he was scared of her crutches, she discarded them and started to walk normally again.

Charley's pains are finally and gradually eased. Once more, she is ready for a new school year. Her father buys a house for Coyote that shelters it from the rain. This kind of book can be very attractive for children for it talks about one of the nice and favorite topics which are pets and how to take care of them. Kids get to learn how to appreciate nature because as Charley's mother echoes: "every living thing is a spirit." (57) They also learn that they should not despair and lose hope easily, but rather keep on trying. Parents need to prepare children for the idea of death as part of reality, to avoid the traumatic effects when it happens.
Clementine

Clementine (2006) a winner of many awards such as the 2007 Bank Street/Josette Frank Award, is the story of a lively funny child in the third grade called Clementine. All the people around her describe her as having trouble focusing when one talks with her in her classes. Yet, she was loved by everyone and has many friends. One of them is her best friend, Margaret, who is in the fourth grade. This story is narrated by Clementine about herself and many of the situations and problems she was exposed to, and how she reacted towards them.

One of the most devastating situations was what happened to her friend Margaret. While Margaret was using glue to paste the decorations on the mask of the Princess, who was coming from the future, she made a mistake. The glue stuck to her hair and she tried desperately to remove it. When she failed, she cut that part using scissors. As a result, there was a large area on the left side of her head without hair. Margaret was very sad...and she did not know what to do. Clementine grieved for Margaret’s grief and wanted to help her. Thus, she made many attempts to fix the appearance of Margaret’s hair. Clementine started cutting Margaret’s hair to make it even but it became ugly, which hurt Clementine as well as Margaret. Margaret complained to the school Principal, Ms. Rice, who became angry with Clementine and rebuked her severely.

Her anguish for her friend’s hair made her think of another way to return the smile to her friend’s face. Clementine dyed Margaret’s hair using her mother's best permanent pens as well as drew some wavy hairlines to look natural. Unfortunately, it became like the shining sun. When Clementine felt that no one appreciated her efforts and Margaret continued being sad, she cut her own hair and dyed it using her mother’s green pen to show support to her friend. However, no one was satisfied with what she did. Thus, she decided to re-glue Margaret’s hair to look as it was before. In this way, she would solve
the problem. Even this idea did not work. Again the school Principal called for Clementine and reprimanded her.

Jealousy of younger siblings is a recurrent theme in children’s stories. Clementine feels that her mother likes her little brother more than her. Her mother calls her brother “easy going” while she calls her "stubborn". Clementine described one of her funny and exciting games with her brother, saying that she used to sit in a large frying pan, making her brother hold its handle, and then run full speed on the kitchen floor, and then you hear their loud laughter and her saying to him, "You are lucky because you have a sister like me.” Thus, she shows a great perseverance by her playing with him and bringing happiness to his heart.

The third problem that she faced was ‘pigeons’ war’, as her father was trying to keep pigeons away from the window and the front of the house by spraying them with water. However, they used to come back again. Also, he used to put out a statue of an owl to terrify the pigeons. Yet, the result was counterproductive, because the pigeons started to stand on the statue of the owl. Thus, Clementine wanted to help her father. She thought of putting out a big picture of her cat, Polka Dottie, in order to terrify the pigeons, yet she failed. What she got from this idea were tears and sorrow because she remembered her dead cat.

Finally, she was guided to a successful idea to keep the pigeons away from the front of the house. She asked her neighbor, Mrs. Jacoby, to feed the pigeons from the back window of the house. Accordingly, the pigeons moved to the back of the house and her father was relieved from the pigeon’s filth. Really, this was a brilliant idea which succeeded in ending the pigeons’ war, which her father used to carry on every day.
Her father rejoiced the intelligence of his daughter; thus, he prepared a wonderful surprise for her. However, this surprise was the most painful experience in her life. Once Clementine gave Margaret a gift at her birthday party, a hat she made by herself. Thus, Margaret told her the day before the party that she will make a hat as a gift for the party, which Clementine’s parents will hold for her. She did not know anything about the party. She thought that the party could be either the Christmas party that has already passed or a farewell party. She remembered that her parents like her brother "easy going" more than her. Accordingly, she told herself “they are giving me up”. Her doubts had increased when she heard her parents whispering: "one is all we need". Also, she heard her mother speaking with someone on the phone requesting him to write: "Good-bye and good Riddance!" and then dictated the spelling of her name (c, l, e, m, e, n, t, i, n, e). This made her sad and she went to her room to clean and arrange it. Her father entered her room while she was crying her heart out and said to him: “I won't talk so much and I'll clean up my room… and I will think about the consequences before I do stuff and I won't do stuff anyway and I will never lose my homework…” (127) She gave her parents a list of promises that would make any parents happy with their children such as promising to change herself to the better, do her homework, listen to the explanation of the teachers in order to achieve great success ... and attend the piano lessons, clean under her bed and make it look like the top of her bed! She ended her talk with her father saying: “I'll be easy going like my brother”.

At that moment, her father hugged her and took her to the other room, where Margaret and her family and other guests shouted loudly “surprise”. She found the cake that read "Good-bye and good Riddance to pigeons" and it was written at the bottom of the cake: “Thank you, Clementine, the great hero of the pigeons’ war”. Then, she understood the meaning of the words she heard from her mother “goodbye and good riddance”. Hence, she rejoiced greatly and her happiness increased when her parents gave her a huge box. She opened the box and found a little cat inside. He father told her that the
shop owner told them that he had only one and they told him that “one is all we need”. This way, she understood the meaning of the sentence that made her worried. Finally, Clementine’s problems ended happily by her parent’s surprise and gift.

What makes this novel highly recommendable for translation for Arab children is the touch of realism with which it handled the main theme which is that by perseverance and not giving in to despair one can overcome obstacles and achieve success especially when one is encouraged by those who are around him.

The story illustrates the perseverance of this little girl to help others and her seeking to bring happiness to their hearts by repeated attempts to repair what was damaged of her friend’s hair and her insistence to achieve her goals, despite the opposition of her friend’s mother and the school headmistress. Moreover, her perseverance and not giving in were clear in her attempts to help her father in the pigeons’ war...All this gave a wonderful picture to the little girl in her determination to achieve success no matter what problems she faced. This picture could be an example for every child to follow.

The story reveals the inner feelings of Clementine, in accounting for herself, her admitting her mistakes, and her determination to change her behaviors to the best. Moreover, the story is characterized by introducing multiple images of the problems encountered by Clementine, and they were coherent in the sequence of the events and its logic.

The generation gap between parents and children is dealt with in this story showing children’s perspectives towards adults and their disappointments when they do what they believe to be the right thing and they are not encouraged or appreciated by others. While on the other hand, it shows how the parents cared about their daughter -
contrary to what she expected - and rewarded and encouraged her when she did a good job.

This story suits children aged 7-12 years. The narration attracted their concern and attention and they looked forward to the results of each event. Perhaps this story attracts adults - parents – as well, as it introduces the best way for parents to deal with their children. For instance, parents should not keep on drawing sharp comparisons between their children making them feel inferior and lose their sense of security and peace of mind.

To better accomplish the task of translation, the following options are recommended:

1. If the story goes with the same values of the Arab child then we can arabize it as it is to make it available for our children.
2. If the story has some ideas that are neither objectionable nor common in the Muslim culture, (e.g. buying a guitar, forming a singing band, going to church, keeping pets) then translation is needed here to inform the child about other cultures and prepare him for dealing with them.
3. If most of what the story is talking about agrees with the Arab culture but has some objectionable concepts, (like friendship between boys and girls, drugs, drinking) we need to step beyond the bound of the translation proper into the realm of adaptation to make it applicable for our kids. It is worth noting here that all those concepts were talked about in the stories I have analyzed, but I removed them to prove to the reader that we can do away with them without affecting the values and the general meaning of the stories.
4. Stories that are basically racist and those that have discrepancy in religious and social values with Arabic ones should be avoided.
Conclusion:

Those were only some of the ten novels assigned for the elementary schools in the USA. The study demonstrates the great need for translating children's literature not only to enrich a child's library with the literary books it needs, but also to provide Arab writers with live patterns that enhance their literature. Furthermore, through presenting those novels, it is concluded that the best foreign books to be translated for children are the international prize-winner books or the extra carefully selected ones, because not all western literature can fit our kids.

An interesting finding for this paper is that most of those stories can be translated and read by Arab children whether via Arabization or adaptation according to the values presented. Therefore, the translator should not translate everything in the book. Certain ideas and concepts that do not go with the Arab culture can be either overlooked or re-phrased. Some can even be mentioned and explained to educate the child about other cultures. It all depends on how skillful and diligent is the translator.

Translation has played a key role in the dissemination and development of literature for children and adolescents. Educators and researchers are encouraged to study them some more for the possibility of translating and adapting the books for our students.

We have a moral responsibility towards our children. It is of an utmost import to head for translating such books as they have certain values and educational principles that appeal to kids all over the world and contribute to their intellectual growth. Eventually, this will help them to navigate a world in the grips of globalization.
Bibliography


**Additional Novels**


• MacGuire, Phineas L. *Erupts*

Sense Rendering in Translating Poetry:
The Viability of Sense-for-Sense Translation in Conveying Culture

Sawsan AbdulRahim Al-Jahdali
Faculty of Languages and Translation
King AbdulAziz University

ABSTRACT

Poetry is one of the challenging forms of serious literature to translate. The dilemma of loyalty to the SL author or to the TL reader is a problem existing in any attempt of poetic interlingual translation. This paper addresses the issue of translating culture in its linguistic context of a poem through approaching some problematic areas of poetry form a sense point of view. Problems of conveying sense at different levels form the concern of its practical part. The researcher/translator chooses a poem composed by Abu Al-Ḥassan Al-Anbārī (died 328H.) on the death of Ibn Baqīyah, the vizier, as one of the most famous elegies in Arabic to be the subject of translation and study in an attempt to see the extent to which sense and reference are attached to different linguistic levels of the poem. The poem has undergone an intercultural, rather than mere interlingual, transference as a number of Islamic terms and values beside some Arab names and traditions have been encoded in different linguistic units. Approaching units of variable lengths through a semantic analysis of sense made it possible to locate the rendered senses within their eligible contexts. Locating the text within its cultural and linguistic contexts has been an indispensable part of the whole process of translation. This study finds that free sense-for-sense
translation is the best translation method through which translators can account for each and every nuance of meaning. The researcher/translator thus recommends a recreation of the poem into another poem allowing, in this way, an equivalent impact and appeal of the conveyed senses and cultural bearings on the receptor.

INTRODUCTION

Poetry is one of the most challenging forms of serious literature to translate. This area of high expressivity and utilization of rhetorical devices causes the existence of the two opposite alternatives of literalism and unrestricted freedom throughout the translation history. Poems are born in unique cultures – a fact that entails a special use of language structures, diversities of cultures and an unlimited variety of literary genres. The problem of translating is, hence, "made acute"; however, there exists a kind of "golden mean" in the middle between the opposite poles though operating in a different axis.

Focus in translating may change when a translator recognizes that "one thing seems clear: to translate a poem whole is to compose another poem". Having this in mind, the translator's concern will be directed to moving his audience with nearly the same impact and appeal the original text exercises on its receptors. This new obsession created by trial of fulfilling a dynamic equivalent translation places him in a mid-way between the two extremes: faithfulness is directed to the matter of the original at the same time creativity is urged to "approximate the form". Here, emphasis is laid on that what is needed is "a creative verse translation" rather than a "new version on an old base". In this way, the translator's voice grants his poem the life that moves the receptor with the preserved subject matter; thus, the reader-text relationship is retained.

1 Jin & Nida, 14, 86, 98-99.
2 Mathews, in On Translation, 67.
3 Jin & Nida 95; Lattimore 48; Mathews 67;
Fulfilling a dynamic equivalent translation of verse is not an easy task; however, it is never impossible. The source-receptor relationships in the original and translation contexts are not the same; which requires the spell of the author-plus-translator work to create a new relationship. Hypothesizing that a thorough semantic and textual analysis of senses at all levels should be endeavoured in order to render the complete sense of the poem in a new mould is one of the major principles on which the present paper is constructed. Here, semantic studies of sense are relied on in addressing sense in its various levels. Through attempting an Arabic-English translation of an elegiac poem, the study aims to prove that sense-for-sense translation is one of the best methods in translating poetry that makes achieving an equivalent effect on TL readers possible. Here, the assumption that "languages and cultures … are really not that different. There is much which is universal"\(^1\) is examined as to whether this universality can assist a poetry translator. In undertaking the translating attempt and conducting the analysis, the viability of Lattimore’s attitude is investigated though it is used as a guideline. He suggests the following:

\[
\text{Right or wrong, I think verse translation is … author plus translator. But the translator cannot put his author bodily into English. He must use all talents, his understanding of the language and of the meaning of his original and his own skill in verse, to make a new piece of verse-work which represents, to him, what the original would be, might be, or ought to be, must be, in English. This will be neither the original-in-English only, nor the author-helped-by-original only, but a product rather a sum of the two.}\(^2\)
\]

\(^1\) Jin & Nida 59
\(^2\) Lattimore 49.
In an attempt to see to what extent the sense and reference are attached to different linguistic levels of the poem, the researcher chooses one of the most famous elegies in Arabic literary history to be the subject of translation and study. The poem was composed by an Arab poet, Abu Al-Ḥassan Al-Anbārī (died 328H.), as a mournful elegy for the death of Abī Ṭāhir Muḥammad Ibn Baqīyah, a pious vizier of ʿIzz Al-Dawlah Al-Bouwayhī. The causes of Ibn Baqīyah's death undergo slight differences in the narrations Arabic literary history. One of these narrations says that the vizier had been tempted to act against his superior, ʿIzz Al-Dawlah, by ʿAḍud Al-Dawlah Al-Bouwayhī before the latter was crowned a caliph. Ibn Baqīyah refused these temptations rejecting the acts of treason and disloyalty. When ʿAḍud Al-Dawlah was crowned, he sentenced the vizier to death and crucifixion after being tread by elephants. Upon the sight of his crucifix, Al-Anbārī composed this poem.

Because poems have different forms and conventions in different languages, Arabic poetry is not classified in terms of form, but in terms of themes and subjects. Most of the Classical Arabic poems, which are measured and mono-rhymed, are written in a block form. Instead of considering senses in stanza forms, Arabs include their senses in lines of two halves: the "chest" and "rump" respectively. Based on these peculiarities, appropriateness is to be highly considered in relation to rhyme and form. Features of the phonic level can be compensated for through careful vocabulary choices.

The poem is full of elegiac sentiments, and each part conveys a painful sense (cf. Appendix:A). The translator attempts, through translating the poem, to deliver an equivalent effect on the target

---

1 As cited in (Al-Kātib 163-165).
2 Dickens, Hervey and Higgins 92.
reader pointing, as a result, to the difficulties faced in attempting sense translation of poetry.

**SENSE AS A SUBJECT OF SEMANTIC STUDY**

In semantic theory, *sense* has been approached from different standpoints. Sense is related to referential elements. And distinctions have been made among *sense*, *reference* and *image*. A number of studies have been concerned with the connection between word meaning and sentence meaning and their role in constructing the total sense of discourse. Hence, a scale for sense levels is set. Therefore, the present translator finds a three-fold semantic categorization of sense levels against which she conducts the poem analysis.

The term *sense* can be contrasted with *reference* in tackling different aspects of meaning. Semantically, *reference* deals with the relationship between linguistic and non-linguistic elements — be them words, sentences, etc. — relating these linguistic elements to the non-linguistic world of experience. *Sense*, on the other hand, works only on an intralinguistic level, i.e., in the internal relationships that hold among the linguistic items of the complex language system. Sense relationships form an important part of the study of language. In this respect, Palmer refers to the use of sense relations to clarify the meanings of unknown words in dictionaries. *Sense*, therefore, is purely intralinguistic while *reference* can be related to extra-linguistic entities.

The distinction between *sense* and its *reference* has been developed by the contributions of some other scholars. Frege, for instance, distinguishes between *sense* (sinn) and *referent* (Bedeutung) suggesting that *sense* is the "cognitive significance" or "mode of representation" while *referent* is the object the expression refers to.

---

1 Palmer 29-30.
Frege relates *sense* and *referent* to their expression saying that a sign "expresses" its *sense* and "stands for" or "designates" its *referent*. He also rejects the idea that empty names – "nondenoting", "nonreferring" or "names with no existing referents" – must be meaningless. Rather, they seem to be perfectly meaningful since we can grasp *Odysseus*, a fictional character, and understand abstract names.\(^1\) In fact, we can say that a sense is created in mind with no visualization. It is something intermediary between reception and visualization. Once the mind starts to relate this concept to an experience, it creates an *image*. The three concepts can be discriminated as follows\(^2\):

- **Sense** is a mode of representation; it is what we grasp when we understand the meaning. Thus, it is not a mental image. It is can be placed in an area between subjectivity and objectivity though it is far closer to the latter; it is something logical. In declarative sentences, it can be referred to as the *thought* of the sentence, i.e. the objective content of thinking.

- **Mental image** is subjective; it is unique and changing from one person to another. It may vary in the mind of the same person. This internal image of a perceivable object is affected by memories of sense impressions, internal and external activities and feelings. Therefore, it is referred to as the *conception*.

- **Referent** or *reference* is the object that the expression refers to. References are related only to referring expressions. They are concrete and real. Sometimes, reference is contrasted with *denotation* and referential meanings.

There are three semantic series assigned for lexical items: ordinal, cardinal and logical. Newmark suggests that a translator should test

---

\(^1\) Frege 211-15.
\(^2\) Frege 211-15; Palmer 29-30. In a descriptive approach, *sense* and *reference* are probably the same as *connotation* and *denotation*. However, they are not the same in non-descriptive semantics.
the sense(s) of the word against these categories in order to establish
the sense of the word in a context (Approaches 117-18). He lists these
series as follows:\footnote{See (Newmark, Approaches, 117-18) for an elaboration of these categories.}:
1. The ordinal series: six categories of sense;
2. The qualitative series: four - extended to seven-
categories of meaning;
3. The logical series: four categories of semantic
application.

**Levels of Sense**

"Within any discourse, one is always faced with the problem of
determining the meaning of both units and arrangements of units."\footnote{Nida 88.} Nida's words point to that the total meaning of the whole discourse
undergoes a gradual process of constructing that moves from the
smaller to the larger. His reference to "the meanings of the units" and
"the ways in which they are combined" implies that there should be
some sort of a hidden relationship grants the discourse its unitary
appearance. Linguistic and paralinguistic features collaborate and
coherence is thus built. Here, a distinction should be made between
the usual meaning of a word or a sentence and its meaning within a
context\footnote{Palmer 8.}. In this concern, depending on the language unit to be translated, three levels of translating can be discriminated:

a. translating at the level of word;
b. translating at the level of sentence; and
c. conceptual translating (on the level of context).

A semantic analysis of the senses of lexical units promoted in a
particular context is not enough. The ways in which these lexical units
are arranged and collaborate to form a higher level of meaning should

---

1. See (Newmark, *Approaches*, 117-18) for an elaboration of these categories.
deliver one of the four types of combinatory meanings. "By noting carefully the meanings of individual lexical units and then their combinatory meanings, we may finally discuss much more relevantly the meaning of the total discourse".

On the level of the word, treating the word as a lexical unit entails distinguishing between the unmarked meaning of the word as a verbal symbol and its promoted sense(s) in a particular context. Such a distinction can be made on two axes: via drawing a contrast with other words based on their sense relations and examining the significance of this word within the higher constructions in which it is involved. Relations of similarity and contrast may entail that even similarity is built on contrast as long as "there are no two objects in the universe that are exactly alike". In translating texts of high expressivity, a word receives a greater importance than the line, which comes in the second grade. Behind literal meanings, there is much that can be said about culture.

Things are different at the sentence level. Frege distinguishes between sense and reference on sentence level suggesting that a sentence with sense does not necessarily have a reference. He postulates that the reference of a sentence is determined by the reference of its parts. In fact, not only differences in relationships between constituents but also cultural attitudes and structures matter a lot with constructions. Based on that, the similar surface structures do not necessarily imply similarity of meaning. Besides, the degree of structural complexity is associated with style and important associative meanings may be linked to these sentence structures as well as rhetorical devices in the text. In literary discourse, we are interested in the sense of the

1 There are five types of combinatory meaning, namely delimiting, relation-axis, co-ordinative, nuclear-satellite (case meaning) and inter-nuclear (Nida 73).
2 Nida 41.
3 Nida 46,51,110; Palmer 30-31; Newmark, Textbook, 163.
sentences rather than their reference, "for images and feelings thereby aroused". Concern with reference entails an investigation of the truth values and, hence, pleasure with aesthetics is spoiled.

Some important factors should be addressed in considering discourse: internuclear relations, rhetorical devices, and cultural context. Good employment of internuclear relationships enhances the logical development of the discourse structure. These relations supplement the development of content in a logical manner- i.e., discourse progression- and tighten the whole as it ties the parts- i.e., through aiding discourse coherence. Internuclear relations can be detected as meaningful ties between sentences or even between chapters of a book. Rhetorical devices play a significant role in the text-receptor relationship as they reinforce the impact and appeal of the discourse provided that a consistent, harmonious use of internuclear relationships is made. Culture is a crucial element in determining meaning. Assuming that stylistic features play equal functions across languages and cultures is a vital mistake in translating. Rather, in works of high expressivity, stylistic qualities play a vital role in determining the quality of translation. "Nevertheless, a translator with a sense of integrity about his work will not distort context for the sake of stylistic attractiveness." Full awareness of the functions played by formal entities and rhetorical features in different cultures is, consequently, of high importance.

TEXT ANALYSIS

Before a translation of a particular text is carried out, the translator needs to have a close reading of the text after getting its general gist. A complex set of systems- within and outside- collaborate to make the

---

1 Frege 215-16.
2 Nida 79-80; Jin 25; Frege 215-16.
3 Jin & Nida 109
text what it is. Based on that, a careful study of the intention of the
text, its style, attitude, setting, structure, coherence and progression
and other properties becomes a necessity."...The linguists' focus upon
the functions of language rather than formal features can be both
insightful and practically helpful. Furthermore, they usually suggest
the possibility of ways in which formally diverse expressions can be
functionally equivalent. This immediately opens up the possibility for
"linguistic maneuvering".\footnote{Jin & Nida 25.}

In one of the famous classical Arabic elegies, Abu Al-Ḥassān Al-
Anbārī is lamenting Ibn Baqīyah's murder. Throughout the poem, Al-
Anbārī uses highly-expressive diction addressing Ibn Baqīyah as a
person and recalling his virtuous deeds. He uses a variety of nominal
and verbal sentences in different voices for different purposes.
Generally speaking, qualities of honor are mostly expressed embedded
in noun phrases in nominal sentences of an active voice. The poet
keeps on shifting from portraying personal qualities to describing
actions and attitudes throughout the poem. This swinging mood is, in
fact, characteristic of Arabic elegies in which the poet appears so
distracted with melancholy that types and voices of sentences keep on
changing suddenly. When addressing the beloved victim, the poet uses
verbal sentences and depends on metaphors to emphasize the nobility
of his actions. Passive voice is used rarely in the poem– only when
referring to others' reactions or attitudes. The sequential logical
structure of theme-rheme of sentences is not always kept because
there are times when certain items are thematized.

The poem was, in fact, spoken, not written, in its original version. It is
a custom of the Arab poets that they speak out their feelings pouring
them spontaneously in a poetic mould. Then, poem are conveyed to
others by a special sort of conveyers called "ruwāḥ" (lit. narrators),
for they restate or narrate the poem in its original form out of

\footnote{Jin & Nida 25.}
memorization. Al-Anbārī's poem was delivered to `Aḍud Al-Dawla, the real murderer, who, in turn, wished that these lines were said upon his own death. This fact emphasizes the high quality and deep impression of the poem as an expressive text whose language is creatively exploited at all levels.

As a text, and according to Nida's classification of text types, this elegy is a descriptive poem which places emphasis on linking verbs, adjectives and adjectival nouns in a harmonious way. Following Bühler's categorization, the poem is purely expressive for it serves expressive functions. The poet's feelings are the core of the poem; which gives him, as Newmark may call it a 'sacred' authorship. The speaker pours out his sentiments in a dramatic monologue irrespective of who may receive his poem. The poetic function of language is highly employed in this text, for it, as Jakobson describes this function, serves real aesthetic values. Numerous figures of speech are used in an attempt to deliver messages in an indirect, expressive and imaginative way\(^1\).

In translating this poem, the translator has in mind that the poem is conveyed to not only a different language but also to a different receiving culture. A number of Islamic values, e.g. *tahiyyatu al-Raḥmānī*, *wājib*, *fard*, *al-iḥsān*, *ṣalāh*, and *khuṭbah*, are included in the poem and different elements are bound to the Arab traditions such as *turbatun tusqā, nahl, sa’d, nawā‘ib, jidh‘, maṣfīyah*, and *wufūdu nadā*. These elements and others make the translator consider the TL readers and, therefore, she gives scraps and elaborations within the translation to help them get an equivalent effect of the message.

As a deeply-effective elegy, the composing style is expected to be of a high quality. The words are chosen very carefully to serve the purposes they are assigned for. In fact, the manner in which the text is

---

\(^1\) Newmark, *Textbook*, 39-42.
presented is as important as the matter, for the voice of sentences, the poetic diction, the images drawn, the rhythmic pattern, and word groups and collocations collaborate to make the poem what it is. Through examination of some of the features of the poem, one can prove the equal importance of the 'what' and 'how' of the poem. The poem starts, for example, with a nominal sentence, "ulūwun fī al-ḥayātī wa fī al-mamāṭī", and closes with bi-raḥamātīn ghwādīn rāʾīḥātī. In these collocations, the poet emphasizes the nobility of life that extends to death and the continuous descent of prayers of mercy day and night; permanence of grace is, hence, highlighted. Besides, the repetitive use of some significant words actually serves to deliver additional meanings and develop extra dimensions of imagery. In, for example, "wa lam 'ara qabla jidḥ‘ika qaṭṭu jidḥ‘an" (l.11), jidh` is useds twice in two forms stressing the sense of matchlessness. Though the first jidh` is definite – in Arabic, it is made definite by addition jidh‘i-ka 'your bole'-, the second is indefinite, so this case of definiteness-indefiniteness should be rendered through anaphoric/cataphoric reference.

Because "all texts have an underlife", precedence in literary texts is given to connotations of words1. In an expressive text as such, the words chosen evolve a special kind of senses and connote different images. The poem starts with "ulūwun fī al-ḥayātī wa fī al-mamāṭī. The word ‘ulūw in this phrase merges the senses of spiritual, moral as well as physical highness, nobility of fame and deeds and grandeur of state in a single word. So it refers to a constant manner of life and death. In ka-anna al-nāṣa ... wufūḍu nadāka (1,2), the word nadā collocates with wufūd to add a secondary sense because nadā is a polysemous word for it refers to 'dew', 'generosity' and 'rain'. Therefore, the sense of generosity is effectively promoted. The man was in a position that requires him to receive legations of different sorts as part of his job. Now that the word is added to another word of

1 Newmark, Textbook, 16.
generosity, largess and giving, the image of people surrounding his corpse is resembled to that of the legations that come to receive shares of his bounty.

Contextual associates play role is adding connotative impact to senses extended creatively to serve rhetorical ends. Iḥīfā′an (l.4) with its primary and denotative senses of welcoming, celebration and hospitality is given another connotative, figurative sense in this metaphorical use. Al-sāfiyyāti (l.6) is here subject to sense extension, for the dead is now wrapped with sand in the same way the shrouds may wrap him. The bole is holding the body as if it is embracing it (l.11). This sense is given a metaphorical, connotative expansion when feelings of warmth, love, tightness, closeness and care are added by the word `ināq. The body is given a conceptual sense when it is transferred to be an embodiment of al-makrumāti, i.e. virtuous deeds and manners. Consequently, the poem is filled with imagery promoted by metaphors.

Forms of figurative language collaborate to maximize the impact and appeal of the poem. Similes and metaphors, ironies and metonymies and paradoxes and hyperboles can be found here and there. Different kinds of metaphors give the poem further horizons. Most of them are original, created by the poet himself, such as ḍāqa baṭtnu al-ardi (l.5), yaḍumma′ulāka (l.5), asa′ta ilā al-nawā′ibi (l.12) and raḥamātin ghawādīn rā′iḥāti (l.21). Other metaphors can be considered stock metaphors, such as rakibta maṭṭyatan (l.9). Some other clichés are used such as al-dumū′i al-jāriyāti (l.16). Ironies are also found in iḥīfā′an (l.4), `ināq (l.11) and baṭtnu al-ardi...yaḍumma′ulāka (l.5). Nevertheless, turbatun (l.20) and maṭṭyatan (l.9) are metonyms, for they are parts standing for wholes, i.e., soil stands for "a grave" and a mount stands for means of transportation and, therefore, denotes "a way or a path of life and destiny." Some other figures of speech will be discussed later.
SENSE RENDERING OF THE POEM

"The translator may misread his model in a number of ways: he may not see what is to be seen nor hear what is to be heard in it. But if he does see and hear clearly and fully, he will hold the original poem in a sort of colloidal suspension in his mind—I mean a fluid state in which syntax, all the rigid features of the original dissolve, and yet its movement and inner structures persist and operate. It is out of these that he must make another poem that will speak, or sing, with his own voice."¹

Attempting a clear, full reading of the poem is the key to successful rendering. For this reason, a translator, as a reader, first needs to read/translate the text in the SL before an interlingual translation of any literary text is carried out. In a following step, she "decodes" it in the TL².

In reading the present poem, the reader/translator tries to make a thematic analysis of its parts; which would allow her to sub-divide the texts into smaller sub-contexts developing special sorts of unity within the larger text. A detailed analysis of the functions of formal features and senses promoted follows in each division. Based on that, the basic barriers of transferring content would be overcome and the translating process takes a more consistent and adequate form³. The first division can be viewed as follows:

1. `Ulūwun fī al-ḥayāti wa fī al-mamāti la-ḥaqquq anta ihdā al-mu`jizāti

¹ Mathews 67.
² Bassnett 83.
³ In content transference, there exist a number of obstacles that the translator must overcome. They are 1. Orthography and phonology, 2. Lexical units (Words and idioms), 3. Syntax and 4. Rhetoric (Jin & Nida 61).
2. Ka-anna al-nâsâ ḥawla-ka ḥîna qâmû
wufûdu nadâka ayyâmâ al-ṣilâti
3. Ka-annaka qāʾîmun fî-him khaṭîban wa kullâ-humu
qiyāmûn lil-ṣalâti
4. Madaddta yadayka nahwa-humu ihtifâʾan
kamaddihimâ ilay-him bi-al-hibâti

These lines seem to be of one unity, for they describe the view of the crucified body and people standing looking at it. This image is directly compared to other images of life experienced by the victim. He a man is of dignity and nobility in life; his highness continues to characterize his death. People are gathering around him in a manner compared to that of their gatherings for receiving his bounties in his life. He is tied up to a bole, so he seems to be standing as if he is preaching and people are listening. Their manner of silence while standing is matched to their manner in the prayer.

In these four lines, words of different lexical relations and references are used. Some words are polysemic such as `ulūw and nadâ; others are culture-bound such as khaṭîb and al-ṣalâh which are Islamic and wufûdu nadâ which is a collocation related to the generosity of Arabs. Al-ḥayâh and al-mamât are antonyms while qāʾîm and qiyām and madaddta and madd are of phonological, morphological, and semantic relations. Qāʾîm and qiyām belong to one stem /q.w.m/ but the former is a participial functioning as a modifier while the latter is an adjective for the plural functioning as a modifier. Qâmû is a simple past verb-qiyrâma- attached to a nominative third-person plural pronoun. The words mean standing and rising. Madaddta and madd have the same stem /m.d.d/ but the former is a simple past form of the verb while the

1 `Ulūw: a position of honor and nobility; wufûdu nadâka: (wufûd: pl. of wâfd: a delegation) groups of people hosted by the vizier and witnessing his hospitality; nadâ is generosity; šilâ: (pl. of šila) gifts, grants and largess; qiyâmûn lil-ṣalâti: standing in whole respect and devotion waiting for the commencement of prayer after listening to the Imâm's preaching; ihtifâʾan: in the state of welcoming.
latter is a noun. Both stand for stretching or adding. In addition to their semantic significance, these pairs play roles in sound effects in the given lines in addition to the main rhythmic pattern and rhyme. A possible rendering of the sense in the previous lines can be as follows:

1.  `Ulūwun fī al-ḥayātī wa fī al-mamāti la-ḥaqqun anta ihdā al-mu‘iẓātī When highness, grandeur, nobility extend To wrap up life all through the end, Miracle verily turns it to please: Endless is the dignity of your decease.

2. Ka-anna al-nās ḥawla-ka ḥīna qāmu wuṣūdu nadāka ayyāma al-ṣilātī Rising as though for past bestowal waiting Who ’re hence around your dignity wailing Now that you rise preaching morals speech, Stood they erect in prayer as though to beseech.

3. Ka-annaka qā‘imun fī-him khaṭīban wa kullu-humu qiyāmun lil-ṣalātī

4. Madaddta yadayka nahwa-humu ihtifān kamaddihimā ilay-him bi-al-ḥibātī Your hands in celebration to them stretched To welcome a presence for largess fetched Palmy moments of bounty your hands enjoy Raise now in death a cherished joy.

The suggested translation shows adherence to sense- both word and line senses- with almost complete deviance of form. Lines 1 and 4 are translated in two complete stanzas while 2 and 3 have their senses joined in one stanza. In the first stanza, `ulūw becomes "highness, grandeur, nobility" in order to give the physical and moral highness of the word. "To wrap up" delivers the sense that these qualities are associated with and characteristic to life and death. In the second
stanza, the similes are rendered as similes – "as" is used – and the images are rendered. *Ayyāma al-ṣilāṭi* is rendered into "past bestowal" that may deliver the same sense of a habitual past brought to an end. Ḥīna qāmū is rendered into "rising" because the Arabic version denotes temporal as well as spatial elements, which can be literally translated into "when they rise"; therefore, "rising" serves a similar function. An ironical sense is implied in line 2. The dead's view stretching his hands is turned to be a view of giving instead of a view of torture. Thus, the opposite of what his murderer desires has occurred. Those who are brought to witness his crucifying are pictured as bounty seekers. *Qā'īm* and *qāma* are given two related expressions: "rising" and "stand…erect" respectively. This is done in purpose, for the former delivers a sense of rising- a spatial rising- for delivering a speech while the latter is related to prayers in which Muslims stand erect in rows listening respectfully to the recitation of Qur'ān and praying and beseeching for mercy.

The third stanza employs different strategies of sense rendering. The word *ihṭifā'ān* is referred to twice as "in celebration" and "to welcome" in an attempt to highlight the senses of celebration, welcoming and hospitality it bears. Some additions are needed to which *ilayhim* may refer-"a presence for largess fetched". Moreover, *ka-maddihim ilayhim bi-al-hibātī* refers to a manner of a past habit enjoyed by the vizier in his life. Thus, the translator proposes that the description of this habit necessitates the use of some additional elaboration to be fully comprehended.

5. Wa lammā dāqa baṭnu al-arḍi `an an yaḍumma `ulāaka min ba`di al-wafātī
6. Aṣārū al-jawwā qabraka wa asta`ādhū `ani al-akfānī thawaba al-sāfiyāṭī ¹

¹ *al-sāfiyāṭī*: sandstorms.
These two lines form another unity in the poem. They refer to how the dead man was buried after death. Instead of having his grave dug in the ground, he was kept hung on the bole. He was not shrouded with cloth; instead, on his bole, wind wraps him with sand. The poet here is deeply moved by the inhumane way of treating noble victims. Thus, he turns the situation to be that of honor; which is the contrary of what his enemies desire.

A number of metaphors and figures of speech are used in these two lines. The ground is compared with animate creatures that have wombs in one of the dead metaphors, i.e. baţnu al-arĎi. The sandy wind is compared to shrouds of death, for they cover the body with sand. This metaphor is created by the poet as an original metaphor. Aşārū al-jawwa qabraka is ironically used, for his hanging is now given a new figurative sense. Baţnu al-arĎi (lit., the underground) is contrasted with al-jaww (lit., the open air) in a paradoxical distinction between the very low with the very high. Dāqa baţnu al-arĎi `an `an yaĎumma`ulāka is an overstatement, for all noble men are buried underground.

A suggested sense translation can be as follows:

5. Wa lammā dāqa baţnu al-arĎi `an an yaĎumma `ulāka min ba´di al-wafāti
6. Aşārū al-jawwa qabraka wa asta´ādhū `ani al-akfānī thawaba al-sāfiyāti

Too narrow is the burial to be your rest
For gracious departures to demises resist
Universe in all is a sepulcher made
Sand shrouds for all cloth winds replaced.

7. Li-`umika fī-al-nufūsi tabītu tur´ā bi-ḥurrāsin wa ḥuffāin thiqāti
8. Wa tūqadu ḥawla-ka al-nīranu laylan kadhālika kunta ayyāma al-ḥayāti
The reaction of acquaintances and past fellows is described in these two lines. His body is guarded with those who look up to him as a man. His guards are extremely watchful and honest, for they still keep honesty and mutual trust he exchanged with them in life. The poet portrays a picture of loyalty: those fellows stay up at night owing him watch and custody. This was out of nothing but the greatness and love he has had in their hearts.

The poet makes a special use of words, sounds and images. First of all, he makes the cause of people's reactions precedent to his narration, i.e., his highness and gracious position in people's souls is thematicized in *li-`iamika fī-al-nufūsi*. He closes with another justification: *kadḥālika kunta ayyāma al-ḥayāti.* َّ中华人民 and *ḥuffā`a* are two forms imply an intensification as well as a sense of collectivity as both or in the form of *(fu`a'al)*. This form comes as a less-common intensive adjective or as a form of plural of abundance or multitude. Intensification is inherent in both usage. In fact, this form of plurality can be contrasted with *haras* and *ḥafaah* which are two forms of pluralizing the self-same nouns *ḥāris* and *ḥāfi*. These two words are followed by the modifier *thiqāt*, which adds another sense of trustworthiness. This intensified modification has a strong sound effect that is given a further intensification when the emphatics */θ/ and */q/ of thiqāt* follow. The man is guarded in a kingly way both in life and in death. What indicates such supposition is the words *li-`iamika* and *tāqadu ḥawla-ka al-nīranu laylan* as if the king were going on a journey.

The senses of the previous lines can be rendered as follows:

7. *Li-`iumika fī-al-nufūsi tabītu turā bi-ḥurrāsin wa ḥuffāin thiqātī*

8. *Wa tāqadu ḥawla-ka al-nīranu laylan kadḥālika kunta ayyāma al-ḥayāti*

Your highness is deeply in souls preserved
In peace you sleep, sincerely undisturbed

423
With guards, fellows keeping life's honesty
Night's fires are lit to watch your Majesty.

Compensation is a required procedure that should accompany this sense rendering. In order for the senses of honesty, loyalty and sincerity that are emphasized by intensified forms to be kept, the translator finds 'undisturbed sincerity' and 'life's honesty' performing the task. The sound effects are compensated for by others such as /f/, /l/ and /r/ in 'fellows', 'life' and 'fire', /3:/ and /d/ in 'preserved' and 'undisturbed' and /~sti/ in 'honesty' and 'majesty'.

9. Rakibta maṣfīyat an min qablu Zaidun `alāhā fī al-sinīni al-\mādiyi\ddot{ā}ti
10. Wa tilka qaḍīyatun fī-hā ta'assin tubā`idu `an-ka ta`yīra al-\`idā\ddot{ā}ti
11. Wa lam ara qabla jidh`ika qaṭṭu jidh`an tamakkana min `ināqi al-makrumāti
12. Asa'ta ilā al-nawā`ibī fa-astathārat fa-anta qatīlu tha`ri al-nā`ibāti\ddot{1}

In these four lines, the causes behind In Baqīyah's murder are revealed. He simply followed the Islamic teachings that demanded him to be fair, honest and brave and to reject temptations to deviate or betray. This might be the same cause for which Zaid, an `Alawī leader, was murdered. Such a issue of adherence to one's principles for which one might receive punishment is as old as man exists. There is no shame in that one is killed for honesty; therefore, such a sacrifice is by no means subject to mockery or criticism. The poet then shifts again to the image of crucification saying that this is the first time he comes across a bole embracing "hugging" an embodiment of morals

\ddot{1} Maṣfīyah: a mount or an animal to ride; Zaid: an `Alawī leading figure who was killed and hung as a crucifix during the Abbasid era; jidh`: the bole of a palm-tree; `ināq: the act of hugging; istathāra: asked for revenge.
and good deeds. He then returns to the causes of murder revealing that it is a demand for revenge made by disasters, among which is the temptation of high treason, against whoever betrays, fails or offends them. Therefore, the man is victimized for a mere revenge.

These four lines are vivid with connotation and polysemy collaborating with figures of speech to make a metaphorical expansion of sense. Mațīyah is a riding animal in its primary sense, but a second consideration of the word within its context reveals a sense expansion. It refers to a way, method of life and a chosen destiny taken and faced by both men- Zaid and Ibn Baqīyah. Hence, it has been given a secondary sense though it is associated with rakibta and `alāhā. These two associations within the context stand for "following a way" and "ascending the destiny of being hung as a crucifix". To imply this collectivity of senses within one word is by no means an easy task. Min qablu is given precedence over the proposition it relates to. This precedence is purposeful to imply a temporal relation between the murders of the model- Zaid- and the follower "Ibn Baqīyah". A second mentioning of the bole gives it a special importance. It is a procedure used in Arabic for adding an emphatic dimension. In English, however, repetition is redundant and referential elements are used instead. Another difficulty is the use of istathārat and tha`r and al-nawāb and al-nā`ibāt. The use of the aforementioned words adds sound effects and semantic expansions. The first pair consists of an action and a case. {Ista-} is a prefix attached to the past verb thāra to indicate a demand for revenge¹. The second pair consists of two forms of plurality for the word nā`ibah (lit. disaster).

Different metaphors are included in these lines. There are original ones created by the poet in (l.11) and (l.12). The bole is personified as hugging and the disasters are compared to a furious, wronged person

¹ In Arabic, {ista-} is a prefix attached to verbs to denote a demand or an act of asking for something (Al-Ḥamalāwī 44-45).
who calls for revenge. The way that has led to death and the crucifying to a bole are compared to a riding animal or a mount- the sense of ascending is implied in both. Moreover, in (l.9), `ināq denotes a hug although the whole body is attached to the bole not only part of it. Such representation uses metonymy as its means.

Sound effect is challenging in these lines. There is a careful selection of some emphatics and other non-emphatics in specific parts. In (l.10), all words of the rump construe emphasis, for the emphatic pharyngeal /c/ is there in the four words. (L.11) contains /ʃ/, /c/, /q/ and /k/ repeated in different distributions. /I/, /l/, /θ/ and /t/ are heavily depended on in (l.12). Such recurrent use of specific sounds gives senses of strength and emphasis to the lines.

Trying to render as closely as possible the senses presented in the text, the translator suggests the following translation trying to compensate for the formal effect:

9. Rakibta maʃiyatan min qablu Zaidun `alāhā fī al-sinīni al-mādiyāti

10. Wa tilka qaðiyatun fī-hā ta'assin tubā`iddu `an-ka ta`yra al-`iddāti
Zaid's steps 're landmarks for yours to trace
Since ages he mounted the mount you face
Principles are ever a human affair
Whole respects, no mockery, in foes stir.

11. Wa lam ara qabla jidh`ika qaṭṭu jidh`an tamakkana min `ināqi al-makrumāti

12. Asa'ta ilā al-nawā'ibi fa-astathārat fa-anta qaṭīlu tha'ri al-nā'ibāti

13. Wa kunta tujīrunā min ṣarfi dahrīn fa-`āda muṭāliban laka bi-al-tirāti
No stalk as such I ever witnessed dare
Cuddling courteous deeds in warmth and care.
A hand of peace in darkness offered
Can never by Day be cut or covered.

A tale of gratitude since ages been told
Is against you narrated as a false gold
When Time's heart by Evil is fed
And Malice and Hatred in its bounty bred.

"You are defeated.. Your door is shut.
O Kindness, forgive us; you are in debt,"
Offended Disasters upon you avenge
Your life is paid for a disastrous revenge.

The translator tries to compensate for the effect of /c/ sound in (1.10) using 'a human affair' and 'whole respect'. To add a sound effect, she uses /k/ in 'respect' and 'mockery', /s/ in 'respect' and 'stir' and /f/ in 'affair' and 'foe'. For meaning compensation, 'as such' is used on behalf of 'your stalk' and tamakkana is turned into 'dare'. Besides, the bole is not expected to be as gracious and significant as the courteous deeds embodied in the vizier. Therefore, the translator finds that substituting 'the bole' with 'the stalk' would promote such a sense. Time and Disasters demand for revenge in a personified manner. The translator, thus, expects them to have the same reference and motives, so the indirect speech mode in directly expressed.

14. Wa şayyara dahruka al-ihsāna fī-hi ilay-nā min `āīmi al-sayyi`āti
15. Wa kunta li-ma`sharin sa`dan fa-lammā maḍayta taفارraqū bi-al-munḥsāti

These two lines deal with the dilemma of good and evil. The idea of depicting good in the frame of evil is a theme that is dealt with on two
levels: moral and social. In such an age, virtue, honesty and morals are
turned to be crimes for which one deserves punishment. On the moral
scale, where measures are turned upside down, goodness in envisioned as evil, and vice versa. The other transition is on the social
scale. The vizier's people used to live a form of splendid life while he
was among them; upon his death, their welfare was turned into misery
and the united people got scattered after his death.

In these lines, some linguistic elements seem challenging to translate.
In (l.14), šayyara (lit., turned into), not ja‘ala (lit., made), is used to
stress the transition that time has caused for the image of virtue in
people's eyes. It is turned to be a crime for which punishment is
required. Fī-hi and ilā-ynā are two prepositional phrases pre-posed, so
that the listener gets prepared to receive the shock of value transition.
Furthermore, the poet depends on a cultural superstition to express the
change of his tribe state. Luck and fortune are bound to the victim's
existence or death. A suggested translation can be as follows:

14. Wa šayyara dahruka al-iḥsāna fī-hi ilay-nā min ʿaīmi al-
sayyiʿāti
15. Wa kunta li-maʾsharin saʿdan fa-lammā mādayta tafarraqū
   bi-al-munḥsāti

Nothing philanthropic can now stay,
"Evil in goodness" Time eyes portray;
Your presence a blessing within kinship lied
But, alas, they scattered; Misfortune cried.

Al-iḥsān and ʿaīm al-sayyiʿāt are polar antonyms. The former denotes
a high level of goodness, devotion and giving while the latter refers to
the extreme opposite, i.e., major sins and practices of evil. Besides,
the first half of (l.15) is contrasted with the second half: a state of
settlement in prosperity vs. a state of scattering with misery. In the
translated versions, 'evil in goodness' represents the first pair of
antonyms. Although mādayta has no explicit existence in the
translation, its meaning is deciphered in 'your presence a blessing'.
Therefore, 'misfortune' should be caused by absence. Arab's superstitions of bad luck that are associated with sounds of owls and crows are used to indicate the bad luck that 'cried' the death and, consequently, announces the arrival of 'Misfortune'.

* * *

17. Wa law ʿannī qadirtu ʿalā qiyyāmin bi-fardīka wa al-ḥuqūqi al-wājibāti
18. Malaʿtu al-arḍa min nami al-qawāfī wa nuḥtu bi-hā khilāfa al-nāʾihāti
19. Wa lakinnī ʿuṣabbixiru ʿanka nafsī makhāfata an uʿadda mina al-junāti
20. Wa mā-laka turbatun fa-aqsuʾu tusqā li-annaka naṣbu haṣli al-hāṭilāti
21. ʿAlayka taḥiyatu al-Raḥmāni tatrā bi-raḥmātin qhawādin rāʾiḥāti

These are the last six lines of the poem in which the poet jots down his own emotions of melancholy, bereavement and loss. The pain caused by this murder and the shock of seeing the man crucified move him deeply. He wishes he could speak up his sadness and mourn the death of a dear person in series of elegies. He sees these practices as an essential right for the dead, but his fear of being accused of supporting

---

1 Ghalīl: anguish caused by thirst. Arabs derived ghalla in ghalla ṣadrūhu from the same stem (gh.l.l) to refer to that one's heart is filled with hatred and malice. Taqalghala is also another derivation in the form of a perfective verb to mean 'to be completely absorbed'. Turbatun tusqā: turbah denotes a grave, and the collocation refers to a pre-Islamic custom of Arabs to pray for the graves to be showered with rain as a sign for God's mercy. Naṣb: a statue or anything constructed to be worshipped as a deity. In this context, however, the word refers to the state of the structure not to the act of worshipping it. Haṣl refers to the non-stopping showers of rain while al-hāṭilāti is a plural form referring to the clouds of continuous, heavy rain.
the man and therefore punished for guilt prevents him from doing so. Consequently, he prays for him to be in Allah's mercy.

Linguistic as well as rhetorical devices are heavily employed to creatively and effectively deliver the deep sorrow in a pictorial form. Some of his words are highly connotative. *Ghadil* (l.16) connotes different senses such as pain, thirst for revenge, hatred, anguish, malice and renewal of pain. *Bāṭin* highlights for these meanings, for it gives the senses of deep, painful, nagging, hidden, and tormenting. *Taḥiyyatu al-Raḥmānī* (l.21) is a polysemous Islamic collocation. It may denote the Islamic greeting, Allah's blessings or Allah's mercy. Nevertheless, the use of semi-synonymous words, namely, *fard, ḥuqūq* and *wājibāt*, in (l.17) is caused by the capacity of Arabic to provide specific nuances of meaning for each. They might be contrasted with rights and duties in English, which do not bear the Islamic dimension in these semi-synonyms. This case causes a problem in translating. *Turbatun...tusqā* in (l.20) is a culture-bound collocation stands for a prayer from the pre-Islamic era that asks for the grave to be showered with rain. In *nuḥtu* and *al-nāʾiḥāt* and *haṭl* and *al-hāṭilāt*, is another problematic area. The first pair belongs to the stem "n.w.ḥ" while the second belongs to "h.ṯ,l". Some issues of sound and meaning are stressed accordingly. In the collocation *ghawādin... rāʾiḥāt* (l.21), the two words are antonyms, for they denote journeys held at the beginning and end of the day.

Figurative language and sense extensions are also made use of to increase expressivity. *Ghadil* is characterized of being *bāṭin* and *al-dumūt* are *jāriyyāt*; which highlights for sense extensions as long as qualities are applied to them in a metaphorical expansion. However, they give paradoxical statements for the state of stability and flowing contradict with one another on the same line. *Malaʿtu al-arḍa* is an overstatement implied in a cliché metaphor used in Arabic. *Taḥiyyatu al-Raḥmānī* tatrā and *raḥamātīn ghawādin rāʾiḥāt* are both extended metaphors in which the speaker compares Allah's mercy to successive
showers of rain- in tatrā- and the moving mercies going and returning to showery clouds visiting the victim's bole day and night. 

The translator suggests the following translation for the senses of the previous lines:

16. Ghalīlun bāṭinun la-ka fī fuʿādī yukhaffaFu bi-al-dumāʿī al-jāriyyāti
17. Wa law ʿannī qadīrta ᵃlā qiyāmin bi-fardika wa al-ḥuqūqi al-wājibāti
18. Malaʿtu al-arda min nami al-qawāfī wa nuḥtu bi-hā khilāfa al-nāʾīhāti
19. Wa lakinnī uṣabbiru ʿanka nafsī makhāfata an uʿadda mina al-junāti

Bereaved is my heart aching with loss; 
Overflowing tears ease inner bitterness. 
Would I, a mourner, with elegies fill 
The globe, could I your value fulfill.

Lest I with guilt be accused and stamped- 
I hold a heart in pain tightly-camped, 
Wailing, mourning would be a rightful craft 
But, fear buries a roaring blast. 

20. Wa mā-laka turbatun fa-aqūlu tusqā lī-annaka naṣbu haṭṭi al-hāṭilāti

Have your tomb no resting soil to place 
My prayers of raining upon which they race, 
Thou bed for cloud-bursts is a direct goal 
The showery the carriers, the gracious your bole.

21. ʿAlayka tāḥiyatu al-Raḥmānī tatrā bi-raḥamātin qhawādin rāʾīhāti

Upon you, successive blesses may descend 
The Most Merciful's mercies to your value ascend 
Day and night may they you surround 
Our prayers call for their being around.
CONCLUSION

Through translating the poem into another poem, the translator finds that translating poetry requires a poet translator in order to recreate another poem. In fact, the translator finds it necessary to relate literary translation to semantic studies of sense, reference, denotation and connotation and lexical relations throughout the reading attempt. In order for the poem to be fully understood and its senses to be successfully deciphered, locating the text within its cultural, linguistic and literary contexts has been an indispensable part of the whole process of interpretation and translating. Moreover, the translator finds out that each line bears a different number of propositions; which can be attributed to the capacity of Arabic words to mean more than what they say. Besides, in order to convey the complete sense, some words are decomposed into their possible senses. It has become a need in different cases to render lines into stanzas. Therefore, in order to render sense at all its levels, it would evidently be impossible to practice a line-for-line translation. Besides, no determinations on line-for-line or even exact line-for-stanza renderings are possible in translating from Arabic into English. Some compensations are sometimes required to prevent meaning loss. In addition, cultural elements are challenging; however, the degree of difficulty relates to the degree of closeness between the cultural norms of the two texts. In the case of fortune and misfortune, for instance, relations can be made to some superstitions in Western cultures while the Islamic treatment of preaching, praying and life after death is totally different. Notes are sometimes needed to as a supplementary device for clarifying the significance of proper names and cultural peculiarities.

The translator finds that sense-for-sense translation is the best method through which translators can account for each and every nuance of meaning. In this concern, she recommends a reformulation of a precise, technical definition of sense-for-sense translation within the semantic and rhetorical principles. It can be said at the end that sense-
for-sense is neither a matter of complete deviation from the original text nor a close restriction to it. It is a matter of conveying not only the senses of the content but also those inspired by form to formulate another form conveying another collaboration of corresponding senses.

REFERENCES


Appendix A:
The Original Text of the Poem:

1- عِلَمَّ أَنتِ إِحْدَى المعْجَزَات
فَنَوُدُّتْ نَداً أَيْامُ الصُّلُّاتِ
وَكَلِهْمُ تَقُامُ لِلْمُسْلِمِينَ
كَمْ دَمَّ حَيْثُ أَنْبِيَتِكَ بِالمَبَاتِ

2- كَأَنَّ النَّاسَ حَوَّلَكَ حِينَ قَامَوا
وَكَأَنَّ قَائِمَ يُقِيمُنَّهُ خَطِيبًا
وَكَأَنَّكَ مِثْلَ الْمُهْدِيَّ

3- مَدَّتْ بِدْيِكَ نَحْوَهُمَّ احْفَصَهُ
بَيْضَمَ غَلَالَكَ مِنْ بَعْدِ الْوَفَاتِ

4- وَلَمَا ضَاقَ بِطِنَّ الْأَرْضِ عِنْ أَنُّ
عِنْ الأَكْفَانَ ثُوبَ السَّافِاتِ
بَحْرَّاتٍ وَخَفْفَاتٌ ثَقَاتٍ
كَذَلْكَ كَنَّ أَيَّامَ الْهَيَاةَ
عَلَاهَا فِي السَّنِينِ المَضِيَّاتِ

5- رَكِبَتْ مَطْيَةٌ مِنْ قَبْلٍ زَيْدُ
تَبَاعَدُ عَنْكَ تَعْبِرُ الْعَدَا
وَتَلَكَ قَضِيَّةُ فِيهَا أَنَّ
تَمَكَّنَ مِنْ عَنَاقِ الدِّكْرِمَاتِ
فَأَنْتَ قُبْلُ شَأْرِ النَّابِئاتِ

6- أَصَارَ اِلْجَوْ قُرْكَ وَأَتَعَاذَ
عُنْ الأَكْفَانَ ثُوبَ السَّافِاتِ
بَحْرَّاتٍ وَخَفْفَاتٌ ثَقَاتٍ
كَذَلْكَ كَنَّ أَيَّامَ الْهَيَاةَ
عَلَاهَا فِي السَّنِينِ المَضِيَّاتِ

7- لِعَظِيمٍ فِي الْنَّفَوسِ بَيْتُ تَرْغَمُ
وَتَوَقَّدَ حَوَّلَكَ النِّبِيَّانَ لَيْلاً

8- رَكِبَتْ مَطْيَةٌ مِنْ قَبْلٍ زَيْدُ
تَبَاعَدُ عَنْكَ تَعْبِرُ الْعَدَا
وَتَلَكَ قَضِيَّةُ فِيهَا أَنَّ
تَمَكَّنَ مِنْ عَنَاقِ الدِّكْرِمَاتِ
فَأَنْتَ قُبْلُ شَأْرِ النَّابِئاتِ

9- وَلَمَّا أَقَلَّ جُذِعَكُ قَطْ جَذَعًا
فَآسَتَ إِلَى الْنَّوَابِ فَأَسْتَتَرْتَ
فَعَادَةُ طَالِبَةٌ لَكَ بِالْتَّرَا
إِلَيْنَا مِنْ عَظِيمِ الْسِّيَاتِ

10- وَكَنْتَ لَمُعَشَّرٍ سَعَداً فَلَيْاً

435
١٦ - غليل باطن لك في فؤادي 
١٧ - ولدو أي قدرت على قيام
١٧ - ملأت الأرض من نظام القوافي
١٩ - ولكنني أصحب عنك نفسي
٢٠ - ومالك تربة فآقول نسقى
٢١ - عليك تحية المرحمين تترى

يفتح بالدموع الجارية
بفرضك والحقوق الواجبات
وتحتها خلايا الناتخات
مخافة أن أعود من الجنة
لأنك نصب هائل المطالبات
برحات غضواد الرائحات

٤٣٦
Appendix B:
The Attempted Translation of the Poem

When highness, grandeur, nobility extend
   To wrap up life all through the end,
      Miracle verily turns it to please:
         Endless is the dignity of your decease.

Rising as though for past bestowal waiting
   Who 're hence around your dignity wailing
Now that you rise preaching morals speech,
   Stood they erect in prayer as though to beseech.

Your hands in celebration to them stretched
   To welcome a presence for largess fetched
Palmy moments of bounty your hands enjoy
   Raise now in death a cherished joy.

    Too narrow is the burial to be your rest
For gracious departures to demises resist
   Universe in all is a sepulcher made
Sand shrouds for all cloth winds replaced.

Your highness is deeply in souls preserved
   In peace you sleep, sincerely undisturbed
   With guards, fellows keeping life's honesty
Night's fires are lit to watch your Majesty.

Zaid's steps 're landmarks for yours to trace
   Since ages he mounted the mount you face
Principles are ever a human affair
   Whole respects, no mockery, in foes stir.

No stalk as such I ever witnessed dare
   Cuddling courteous deeds in warmth and care.
A hand of peace in darkness offered
   Can never by Day be cut or covered.
A tale of gratitude since ages been told
Is against you narrated as a false gold
When Time's heart by Evil is fed
And Malice and Hatred in its bounty bred.

"You are defeated.. Your door is shut.
O Kindness, forgive us; you are in debt,"
Offended Disasters upon you avenge
Your life is paid for a disastrous revenge.

Nothing philanthropic can now stay;
"Evil in goodness" Time eyes portray.
Your presence a blessing within kinship lied;
But, alas, they scattered. Misfortune cried.

Bereaved is my heart aching with loss,
Overflowing tears ease inner bitterness.
Would I, a mourner, with elegies fill
The globe, could I your value fulfill.

Lest I with guilt be accused and stamped-
I hold a heart in pain tightly-camped,
Wailing, mourning would be a right craft
But, fear buries a roaring blast.

Have your tomb no resting soil to place
My prayers of raining upon which they race,
Thou bed for cloud-bursts is a direct goal
The showery the carriers, the gracious your bole.

Upon you… successive blesses may descend
The Most Merciful's mercies to your value ascend
Day and night may they you surround
Our prayers call for their being around

438
Appendix C:
A Transliterated Version of the Poem

1- حَقّ أَنْتُ إِحْدَى المعَجَزاتِ
   la-ḥaqun anta iḥḍā al-mu’jizāt
   Ḫulūun fī al-ḥayāt wa fī al-mamātū

2- وفُضْدَ أَيام الصلاتِ
   wufūdū nadāka ayyāma al-ṣilātī
   Kā-anna al-nāṣa ḥawlo-ka ḥīnā qāmū

3- كَأَنْكُ قائمٌ فيهم خَطِيبًا
   wa kullā-hum qiyāmū līl-ṣalātī
cūmāhuma ḥiṣāyhum bi-ḥābātī
cūmaddihimā ilay-him bi-al-hibātī
   Kā-annaka qā’īmun fī-him khaṭībān

4- "مَدَدتِ يَدِيكَ نَحَوْهُمْ احْتِفَاءًا"
   Madaddta yadayka naḥwa-hum ihtīfā’an

5- "وَلَا ضَاقَ بِطَنِّ الأَرْضِ عَنْ أَنْبَاءٍ"
   Wa lammā ḍāqa batin al-ardī ‘an an
   yāḍūmma ‘ulāaka min ba’di al-wafātī

6- "عَنِ الأَكْفَانِ شُوَّابِ الْإِسْبَافِاتِ"
   Aṣārū al-jawwa qabraka wa asta’ādhū
   ‘ānī al-akfānī thawāba al-sāfiyātī

7- لَعَظِيمَةٌ فِي النَّفَوسِ تَبْتِ تَرْعَىٰ
   Li-‘umīka fī-al-nufūsī tabītu tur’ā
   bi-ḥurrāsīn wa ḥuffāin thiqātī

---

439
68 - وتوقف حولك النيران ليلًا
kadhālika kunta ayyāma al-ḥayāti
Wa tūqadu ḥawla-ka al-nīran laylan

69 - ركبت مطبخ من قبلًا زيدًا
'ālahā fi al-sinīni al-mādiyāti
Rakibta maṭīyatan min qablu Zaidun

70 - وتعلن قضية فيها الناس
tubā'īdu 'an-ka ta'yīra al-idāti
Wa tilka qaḍiyatun fi-hā ta'assin

71 - ولم أقِل جذعك قطٌ جذعًا
tamakkana min 'ināqi al-makrumāti
Wa lam aqabla jidh'ka qaţţu jidh'an

72 - أسأت إلى النوايب فاستثارت
fa-anta qaṭīlu tha'ri al-nā'ibāti
Asa'ta ilā al-nawā'ibi fa-astathārat

73 - فعاد مطالبًا للك بالتراث
fa-‘ada muṭāliban laka bi-al-tirātī
Wa kunta tujiirūnā min ṣarfī dahrin

74 - وصبر دهوك الإحسان فيه
ilay-nā min ʿaīmi al-sayyi’āti
Wa šayyara dahruka al-lāhsāna fi-hi

75 - وكتب للمعشر سعدًا فلما
maddayta tafarrāqū bi-al-munḥsāti
Wa kunta li-ṣaḥārin sa’dan fa-

440
16 - غليل باطن لك في فؤادي

yukhaffafu bi-al-dumū'ī al-jāriyyāt

Ghalilun batīnun la-ka fī fu'ādi

17 - ولو أي قدرت على قيام

bi-fardika wa al-ḥuqūqi al-wājibāt

Wa la'ānnī qadītu 'alā ʿa'yāmīn

18 - مالك الأرض من نظام القوافي

wa nuḥtu bi-hā khilāfa al-nāʾīhātī

Mala'tu al-arḍa min nami al-qawāfī

19 - ولكنني أصيب عنك نفسي

makhāfata an u'adda mina al-junātī

Wa lakinnī usabbiru 'anka nafṣī

20 - ومالك تربة فأقول نسقني

li-annaka naṣbu hāṭli al-hāṭīlātī

Wa mā-laka turbatun fa-aqūlu tusqā

21 - عليلك نعمة الرحمن نتزّى

bi-raḥamātin qhawādin rā'īhātī

ʿAlayka taḥiyatu al-Raḥmānī tatrá
The effectiveness of Translation and Adaptation of Tools for Quality Control of Kindergartens

Abstract:
The overall aim of the study is to translate and adapt different International tools, so that they can be used as basis in designing a tool for evaluating the quality of pre-school education in Saudi Arabia (KSA). Since most methods and tools are originated and initiated in Western cultures that are based mostly on Western educational theories, the demand for a culturally relevant tool that recognises the diversity among societies is vital. The research was conducted through observing a sample of public and private pre-school centres using different evaluation tools (the Early Childhood Environmental Rating Scale-Revised (ECERS-R; Harms, Clifford & Cryer, 1998), the Early Childhood Environment Rating Scale-Extension (ECERS-E; Sylva, Siraj-Blatchford & Taggart, 2003), and the Early childhood Environment rating scale, Saudi Extension (ECERS-SA, Gahwaji, 2006) that have been used in previous studies, and to test their utility to the Saudi culture. Translating and adapting a very widely used instrument in evaluating pre-school environment, which is the ECERS-R is a very key feature of this study. Even though the ECERS-E is relatively new compared to the ECERS-R, it is also translated to Arabic and adapted for use in Saudi pre-school centres for the purpose of the study because it covers educational activities, which are rated as a very important quality indicator by most of the stakeholders such as teachers and mothers. Besides translation, these
evaluation tools help researchers and practitioners in the Arab world, particularly in the Gulf region, to use them effectively since language sometimes is a significant obstacle in conducting research and comparative studies. The study makes recommendations for policy and practice for pre-school education in KSA besides it should help teachers to become more professionally skilled and competent. The researcher recommends using the translated tool as a regulated utility to evaluate the quality of kindergarten or to establish a model that incorporates quality standards, also it can be used to develop the overall performance of kindergartens or self-assessment tool to identify strengths and weaknesses, or for scientific research purposes in addition to providing statistics on government and private kindergartens for the preparation of comparative studies of the Gulf States, the Arab world and foreign countries.

Keywords: Quality control, evaluation kindergarten, ECERS

**Research Aim, Objectives, and Questions**

The overall aim of the study is to translate and adapt different International tools, so that they can be used as basis in designing a tool for evaluating the quality of kindergartens in Saudi Arabia (KSA). Since most methods and tools are originated and initiated in Western cultures that are based mostly on Western educational theories, the demand for a culturally relevant tool that recognises the diversity among societies is vital. The research was conducted through observing a sample of public and private kindergartens using two evaluation tools (the Early Childhood Environmental Rating Scale-Revised (ECERS-R; Harms, Clifford & Cryer, 1998), and the Early Childhood Environment Rating Scale-Extension (ECERS-E; Sylva, Siraj-Blatchford & Taggart, 2003) that have been used in previous study, and to test their utility to the Saudi culture. Also the study introduced the Early childhood Environment rating scale, Saudi Extension (ECERS-SA, Gahwaji, 2006) which is a component of the new evaluation tool for quality kindergartens. Even though the ECERS-E is relatively new compared to the ECERS-R, it is also
translated to Arabic and adapted for use in Saudi kindergartens for the purpose of the study because it covers educational activities, which are rated as a very important quality indicator by most of the stakeholders such as teachers and mothers. Besides translation, these evaluation tools help researchers and practitioners in the Arab world, particularly in the Gulf region, to use them effectively since language sometimes is a significant obstacle in conducting research and comparative studies. The study makes recommendations for policy and practice for pre-school education in KSA besides it should help teachers to become more professionally skilled and competent. The researcher recommends using the translated tool as a regulated utility to evaluate the quality of kindergarten or to establish a model that incorporates quality standards, also it can be used to develop the overall performance of kindergartens or self-assessment tool to identify strengths and weaknesses, or for scientific research purposes in addition to providing statistics on government and private kindergartens for the preparation of comparative studies of the Gulf States, the Arab world and foreign countries.

The following research objectives that guided the study are as follows:

- To observe a sample of public and private kindergartens using different evaluation tools (the Early Childhood Environmental Rating Scale-Revised (ECERS-R; Harms, Clifford & Cryer, 1998), and the Early Childhood Environment Rating Scale-Extension (ECERS-E; Sylva, Siraj-Blatchford & Taggart, 2003b), that have been used in previous studies, and to test their utility to the Saudi culture,
- To translate and adapt different international evaluation tools and methods, and to use those in designing a tool for evaluating the quality of kindergartens on the national level,
- To apply the evaluation tool in a sample of kindergartens to test its reliability and validity, and
- To make recommendations for policy and practice for pre-school education in KSA.
Hence, the main question of this research is “Is translating and adapting tools for evaluating the quality of kindergartens an effective approach? Underlying this question are the following specific sub-questions:

1. What are some of the international methods and tools for evaluating and maintaining the quality of kindergartens?
2. How to develop the Early Childhood Environment Rating Scale of Saudi Arabia (ECERS-SA) to accompany existing rating scales that are widely used internationally?
3. How to test the reliability and validity of the evaluation tool?

The study is situated within an interpretive paradigm, and uses mixed methods across a three-stage, cumulative design. The following sections conceptualise the theoretical model of the study, and the methodological considerations. These qualitative research methods do have some attributes in common that result in their falling under the paradigm of Qualitative/Interpretive enquiry. However, they each have a somewhat different focus, resulting in variations in how the research question might be addressed, sample selection, data collection and analysis, and write-ups.

**Significance of the Study**

Empirical research in the area of preschool provision, and particularly in evaluating the quality of kindergartens, is lacking in KSA. This study, being the first of its kind in the country, will form a foundation on which more national research can be performed. In contrast to many Western countries, the “quality journey” is only just beginning in KSA. The results will also serve as an evidence base at a specific point in time, which will serve to inform other comparative studies, and future development in policy and practice. There are no evaluation tools or methods for evaluating quality that have been developed specifically for use in KSA. Therefore, translation and adaptation of widely known frameworks for assessing quality in the Western cultures such as the Early Childhood Environmental Rating
The Early Childhood Environment Rating Scale-Revised (ECERS-R; Harms, Clifford 1998) and the Early Childhood Environment Rating Scale-Extension (ECERS-E; Sylva, Siraj-Blatchford and Taggart, 200), will be critically evaluated, and adapted. These will provide researchers and practitioners with further opportunities to use these measurements to improve and maintain the quality of preschool education in KSA. The study also will open the door for discussions among stakeholders whose decisions are not informed by national data on provision and practice. Because most existing research findings are from the Western world, the study will present empirical evidence from a non-Western country having a diverse ethnicity, background, and values. More importantly, because this study is conducted in one of the Gulf countries, KSA, it is anticipated that its findings will be relevant to the other Gulf countries such as Kuwait and Qatar because they share the same religion and language, and a similar cultural background. Subsequently, this study has the possibility to improve the quality of kindergartens through its recommendations for changes in policy and practice.

**Literature review:**

Regulation, testing, and inspection regimes often accompany national policies in pre-school and compulsory education. Regulation and inspection should be informed by the theory and knowledge base in terms of defining quality characteristics of pre-school provision, but taking into account cultural variables. Measurement was an important issue, when considering quality of kindergartens as the nature of measurement necessarily objectified theoretical assumptions about what constitutes quality (Petrogiannis & Melhuish, 1996). Gammage (2002) perceived quality control as all the planned procedures for checking that outcomes have been achieved. To meet these outcomes, educational settings were subject to evaluation through a system of monitoring and inspection. One way of responding to quality control movement was to define and articulate clearly EC pedagogy and curriculum. This move was resulted in the development of a number
of frameworks in the international contexts including: the Early Childhood Standards (NICHD, 2001), Guidelines of Best Practice (Barblett, 2000), and Curriculum Guidance for the Foundation Stage (DfEE, 2000). The most widely acknowledged “best practice” framework was the DAP in the USA, which demonstrated the ECE discourse and became a benchmark for evaluating quality for more than a decade. During this period of self-examination in the field, the definition of programme quality embodied in the NAEYC, DAP was revised in 1997 to include a greater emphasis on cultural diversity, family concerns, and individual children’s needs (Bredekamp & Copple, 1997). As mentioned before, the quality of kindergartens was measured and evaluated in terms of two indicators: Structural quality – this comprises characteristics of pre-school environment that can be regulated by governments and inspection regimes, and Process quality- this comprises characteristics that cannot be regulated and involves activities, interactions and practices in classrooms. In addition, two different approaches to measuring quality can be differentiated; the first approach tried to evaluate overall or global quality by including measures of a range of characteristics associated with quality, while the other approach focused on specific process indicators. A large number of measures were developed to assess both structural and process quality while their focuses were either global or specific. These measures include the ECERS (Harms & Clifford, 1980), The ECERS-R (Harms et al., 1998), and the Assessment Profile (Abbott-Shim & Sibley, 1992) as measures of classroom quality. Other examples include the Family Day Care Environmental Rating Scale (FDCRS; Harms & Clifford, 1989) as a measure of the childcare home, and the Observational Record of the Childcare Environment (ORCE; NAEYC, 2003), while the CIS as a measure of the relationship between the teacher and children in any setting. The ECERS-E (Sylva et al., 2003b) is a measure of educational attainment in pre-school settings that was developed in England.

The first tool that was translated and adapted is the ECERS-R, which was been widely used in child development research studies (Abbott-
Shim et al., 2000; Al-Ameel, 2002; Burchinal & Cryer, 2003; Cryer & Burchinal, 1997; Cryer et al., 1999; Peisner-Feinberg et al., 2000; Philips et al., 2000; Sylva et al., 1999a; Wishard et al., 2003). This scale comprehensively assesses the overall day-to-day quality of care provided for children. The ECERS-R was the revised edition of the original ECERS (1980). The key purpose of revising the ECERS was to balance continuity and innovation while keeping those features that had, for over 15 years, made the ECERS a useful instrument for both research and program improvement. Numerous research projects in the USA and nationwide have used the ECERS to assess global quality and have discovered significant relationships between ECERS scores and child outcome measures, and between ECERS scores and teacher characteristics, teacher behaviours, and compensation.

The original ECERS and the ECERS-R have been used in research studies and programme improvement efforts in many countries such as Canada, Germany, Sweden, Russia, Iceland, Portugal, England, Spain, Austria, Hong Kong, Korea, and Greece. They have been proven reliable and valid in each country with relatively minor adaptations. Even though there were cultural differences among these various countries, yet each adheres to a core set of child development goals and practices common to most industrialised countries (Tietze, Cryer, Bairrioao, et al., 1996). It has been shown that in England, Greece, Germany, Portugal, Spain, and Austria, higher scores on the ECERS were related to more positive child development outcomes (European Childcare and Education Study Group, 1997; Fiene, 2003; Petrogiannis & Melhuish, 1996). This provided evidence that children from many backgrounds require similar inputs for success in developmental areas valued in western industrialised countries. Furthermore, the ECERS has been translated into a number of languages, including Italian, Swedish, German, Portuguese, Spanish, and Icelandic, and was used in an international study (Tietze et al., 1996)
The ECERS has been developed in close collaboration with realistic field-based sites. It has good inter-rater reliability and validity, thus making it suitable for research and programme evaluation, as well as programme improvement efforts. The ECERS were used in a variety of ways in programme improvement efforts in the USA and in other countries including self-assessment by center staff, preparation for accreditation, and voluntary improvement efforts by licensing or other agencies.

The second tool that is used in the study is the ECERS-E, which was developed to supplement the ECERS-R by a team of researchers at the Institute of Education, University of London. The ECERS-E reflected the English Curriculum Guidance for the Foundation Stage (DfEE, 2000) as well as the changing notions of DAP. Four new sub-scales have been devised for the ECERS-E: “Literacy”, “Mathematics”, “Science”, and “Diversity”. Items in these sub-scales assess the quality of curricular provision, including pedagogy, in these domains aimed at fostering children’s academic development (Sammons et al., 2002). To assess the predictive validity of the ECERS-E, it has been piloted extensively in a variety of British settings (Sylva, Melhuish, Sammons et al., 2001). The EPPE findings indicated that assessments of EC settings made on the ECERS-E provide a better predictor of children’s intellectual and language development than assessment made on the same settings using the ECERS-R. Both the ECERS-R and ECERS-E were used as research development tools as part of the Early Excellence Evaluations of two kindergartens over a period of two to three years (Siraj-Blatchford et al., 2002). Comprehensive in-service training was provided for the staff in both kindergartens, followed by trial sessions from the ECERS-R and ECERS-E. These were documented and discussed then actions were decided and taken, after which the outcomes were recorded and revised. This development work clearly indicated that ECERS could be used effectively as a self-assessment and improvement tool in pre-school settings (Sylva et al., 2003b).
Several research studies exposed some problems and revealed the relative strengths of these different measures. While ECERS has been widely used as a valid measure of the global quality of pre-school programmes for more than 20 years, it does not address the more academic and intellectual development that was increasingly expected of pre-school children. For instance, research evidence called for curriculum and teaching practices that support enhanced development and learning for pre-school children (Bowman et al., 2001). In addition, research evidence supported the notion that children at preschool age could benefit more from good early education than previously thought (Melhuish, 2001; Sylva et al., 1999a). In contrast, ECERS-E was developed to capture the enriched language, early literacy, mathematics, and scientific learning that can occur during the early years. One of the drawbacks of the ECERS-E is that it reflects the English Curriculum Guidance for the Foundation Stage in the UK, which may limit its utilisation in a different curriculum.

Furthermore, some research studies examined the psychometric properties of the ECERS and ECERS-R by using factor analysis techniques (Munton & Mooney, 1997; Paget, 2001; Perlman, Zellman & Le, 2004; Sylva, Melhuish, Sammons et al., 2003a). Unfortunately, the results indicated that both the ECERS and the ECERS-R did not measure seven distinct aspects of quality, as asserted by the authors of the ECERS. Instead, they measured one global aspect of quality, which suggested high redundancy among the items in the ECERS scales. In addition, not much attention has been focused on the conceptual attributions of the ECERS or the ECERS-R. Both measures clearly set out to measure multiple aspects of the EC environment. While these include both aspects of the physical environment, and more process-focused aspects of the environment such as caregiver-child interactions, they clearly focus on the former. The vast majority of the ECERS and ECERS-R items rate aspects of the physical environment and safety. Moreover, some of the more important interactive measures are self-reported, with the inherent bias that self-reports pose. For example, in assessing greeting and
departing on the ECERS-R, teachers are asked, “Can you describe what happens each day when the children and parents arrive and leave?” It would be especially useful to determine whether these self-reported items, which are more susceptible to bias but are easier to collect, operate in the same way as the observational items.

ECERS reflects a “universal” view of what constitutes appropriate provision, and what characterises quality. Because ECE is defined differently across countries, (e.g. 0-5, 0-8) it may be wise to contest some of the age-related assumptions that underpin ECERS. For example, is the Sand and Water provision equally important for 0-3, 3-5, 5-8 years old? Moreover, if so, how might that provision be adapted to support children’s skills and competences? The categories within ECERS both reflect and define quality characteristics. They do not capture all the defining characteristics (e.g. nature and quality of educative relationships; quality of play). ECERS does not focus on the capabilities and dispositions that children need for their success and achievement. On the other hand, ECERS may constrain curriculum and professional development by limiting improvement to those across identified within its framework. ECERS may be “culture specific” and unable to detect and assess indices of quality in provision in other cultures (Hadeed, 1995). For example, one needs only to contemplate the different and unique greeting, eating, sleeping and grooming customs (measured by the Personal Care sub-scale, ECERS) in Singapore, Nigeria, or places in the Middle East, to illustrate how children’s daily schedule, routines and practices take on different meanings in different cultures. Sometimes religious aspects play a principal role while in other circumstances, political or economical norms dictate a significant role in pre-school education.

The previous evaluation tools set the frame of references against which aspects of quality can be measured. However, the present study provides an example of how these evaluation tools are used in practice in KSA, how supervisors, directors, and teachers identify areas for change and development, and how change and development can be brought about.
Theoretical Model of the Study

In designing this study, several studies have been influential such as the Effective Provision of Pre-School Education Project (EPPE) (Sylva, Sammons, Melhuish et al., 1999a), and studies by Hadeed (1994), and Al-Ameel (2002). The EPPE study and this study have some similarities: both studies use different quantitative and qualitative methods to explore the quality of pre-school provision, and its impact on children's development. The EPPE team collected a wide range of information on over 3,000 children, their parents, their home environments and the pre-school settings they attend. In addition to investigating the effects of pre-school provision on young children’s development, a linked project on Effective Pedagogy in the Early Years (EPEY) explored the characteristics of effective practice (and the pedagogy which underpins them) through nine intensive case studies of pre-school settings with positive child outcomes (Siraj-Blatchford, Sylva, Muttock et al., 2002). Further evidence, which is linked to EPPE and EPEY, of Pedagogical Effectiveness in Early Learning is provided by Moyles, Adams and Musgrove (2002). These related projects demonstrate the significance of conceptualising quality and effectiveness from the perspectives of different stakeholders. Unlike the EPPE, this study sample is much smaller but is representative of effective settings within the overall study sample. Moreover, in the EPPE, the ECERS-R was supplemented by a new rating scale ECERS-E, that was devised by the EPPE team based on the Desirable Learning Outcomes for 3 and 4 year-olds, and associated pedagogical practices (Siraj-Blatchford & Wong, 1999). Because the ECERS was developed in the United States (USA) and was intended for use in Early Childhood Education (ECE) settings, the EPPE team thought it necessary to devise a second early childhood environment rating scale, which was focused on provision in the United Kingdom (UK) as well as good practice in catering for diversity (Sylva et al., 1999a). Accordingly, this study attempts to design a tool that is culturally relevant to evaluate the quality of
kindergartens in KSA. As a result, the Saudi extension, the ECERS-SA is developed throughout the study.

There have been some studies in the Middle East, which focus on the quality and effectiveness of pre-school provision. The Hadeed study in Bahrain aimed to assess the impact of different types of kindergartens: the educationally-oriented kindergartens and the care-oriented kindergartens, comparing them with the effects of home care. However, the present study investigates the quality of public and private kindergartens in KSA, as both care and education are typically offered in various ways, and does not include home care. However, both research studies are similar in terms of cultural background and data collection methods. Bahrain and KSA share the same religion, language, and cultural background. Also, the ECERS has been applied in the Hadeed study without any translation or adaptation since the researcher is bilingual. Another similarity is that KSA and Bahrain recently started to develop and provide ECE programmes for young children.

On the other hand, there are several similarities between Al-Ameel Study and this study. Both studies use the ECERS-R, and the ECERS-E. The only difference is that AL-Ameel investigated the impact of different pre-school settings that vary in their application of the Newly Developed Curriculum (NDC), on several measures of child development in Riyadh city in KSA (Al-Ameel, 2002). In contrast, this study focuses on evaluating the quality of kindergartens as a whole, including aspects related to curriculum and pedagogy. In addition, the study incorporated the use of the ECERS-R and the ECERS-E as measures for evaluating the quality of kindergartens, but did not develop a specific tool for KSA.

**Methodological Consideration**

This study is divided into three phases that require varied approaches; an interpretive methodology is adopted, with a case study design. The
case consists of multiple levels and components, and builds a holistic picture by taking into account information gained at many levels. Accordingly, different methods are required for the different elements, and those methods are guided by existing evidence and theory (De Vaus, 2001). Studies that are situated within an interpretive paradigm aim to explain how people make sense of their social worlds, including their perspectives, thoughts, beliefs attitudes, and feelings (Peshkin, 1997). People are seen as social actors who make sense within a cultural framework of meanings that are socially constructed and shared across groups. The cultural frameworks in which people live and act influence their behaviours. In turn, peoples’ behaviour also influences their social and cultural worlds, because they continually re-create those worlds as a dynamic meaning system, which changes over time. Established meanings and practices can be contested and changed through the process of negotiation with others, and through reflexive mediation.

Therefore, the task of the interpretive research is to understand the ways in which meanings are socially constructed, and how these may be open to change and adaptation. Because interpretive researchers become embedded in systems of meaning, they also need to be reflexive about their own perspectives, beliefs, and ways of making meaning from the actions and interactions of others. In the present study, there are different layers of interpretation, which are situated in the cultural context. Because the research is situated in KSA, most of data are collected in Arabic, and are translated to English. The process of translation created an additional layer of translating and creating meaning, from the individual interviews and group discussions. Thus, a dual interpretive perspective has been used here: namely interpreting the translated meanings of the key stakeholders and interpreting those meanings in the context of the research aim. D’Andrade (1992) wrote that culture is something behaviourally and cognitively shared by an identified group of people and it has “the potential of being passed on to new group members, to exist with some permanency through time
and across space” (p. 230). Thus, an interpretive paradigm is appropriate to understanding cultural and contextual perspectives.

The decision to focus this study on translating and adapting various rating scales to design a tool for evaluating the quality of kindergartens in KSA is taken for a number of reasons. The most important is the lack of any national regulatory standards or evaluation methods that are used to measure the quality of kindergartens. The policy system tends to focus mainly on evaluating teachers’ performance as the only quality indicator, rather than evaluating the quality of preschool settings as a whole. According to research evidence, other features of preschool education such as safety and health regulations, diversity, parental involvement, and program structure are also important. Through the setting of regulations for operating kindergartens, the government has implicitly set benchmarks for preschool quality. These reflect minimum criteria for initial and continued registration of only private kindergartens. Another reason is the absence of parental involvement in determining the level of quality in kindergartens because information about indicators of high quality programmes is never made available to parents or other stakeholders. The authority to determine, monitor, evaluate, and enforce standards in preschools is rested only with government auspice and there are no independent auspices that can assist to evaluate and maintain the quality of kindergartens in the country.

An interpretive and descriptive qualitative study is conducted in the study for the reason that the research objectives are to find out and understand the perspectives and worldviews of the people involved in kindergartens. Therefore, the researcher seeks out and considers in depth the values and beliefs, needs and agendas, and influence and empowerment of various “stakeholder” groups having an interest in pre-school services. Moss (1994) referred to all groups who are affected by services, and therefore can be said to have an interest in them, as “stakeholders”. In this study, the term “stakeholders” refers to parents,
teachers, directors, supervisors, experts, and children. The researcher observes interviews, discusses, and evaluates kindergartens because knowledge or evidence of the social world can be generated by observing, participating in or experiencing “natural” or “real life” settings and interactive situations (p. 61). One of the features is the holistic perspective, where the culture, group, phenomenon, or situation under study is considered in its entirety. This may result in examining a complex network of features, ideas, and even persons. While designing the evaluation tool in the study is greater than the sum of its parts, its full significance emerges by maintaining a broad encompassing perspective.

The study adopts a naturalistic orientation because the researcher conducts the research in its “natural” state, which is kindergartens in KSA, taking into account the participants’ perspectives as a value-added to the study. Such a position assumes that these kinds of settings, situations, and interactions “reveal data”, and also that it is possible for a researcher to be an interpreter, or “knower” of such data as well as an experiencer, an observer or a participant observer. In addition, it can be urged that that the researcher can be a “knower” in these circumstances precisely because of a shared “standpoint” with the researched (Mason, 1996). Consequently, by questioning parents and teachers, interviewing directors and supervisors, and by observing teachers and children in their classrooms in kindergartens, the researcher is able to describe and interpret the phenomena of preschool education in an attempt to achieve shared meaning with stakeholders. Wallcott advocated this approach: “Description is the foundation upon which qualitative research is built. Here you become the story teller, inviting the reader to see through your eyes what you have seen, and then offering your interpretation” (Walcott, 1994:28).

In this study, the case study approach is used. As Stake (2000) suggested, case study is less of methodological choice than “a choice of what is to be studied”. The “what” is a bounded system, a single entity, a unit around which there are boundaries (Smith, 1978). The process of conducting the case study begins with the selection of the
“case,” which is the In-service Training center for pre-school teachers in Jeddah city, KSA. The selection is done purposefully, not randomly; that is, a particular kindergarten is selected because it exhibits characteristics of interest to the researcher. While this kindergarten might serve as a “model” for other kindergartens, it is exceptional in that all teachers are highly qualified and under qualified supervision since they provide training for all pre-school teachers in the city. Furthermore, the NDC, which is the national curriculum in KSA, is applied in this kindergarten in an ideal way following the general guidelines of the curriculum.

The study also draws on elements of the action research cycle, including observing, planning, implementing, reflecting, sharing, and then the cycle repeats itself again. However, the study embodies some principles of action research, but does not aim explicitly to bring about changes in practice. Action research is about researching with people to create and study changes in and through the research process (MacNaughton, Rolf & Siraj-Blatchford, 2001). However, in this study, the actions are taken primarily by the researcher in translating and presenting the ECERS-R and ECERS-E in joint actions with the participant kindergarten on applying and evaluating these tools, the contexts of practice, and laying the foundations for the development of the ECERS-SA. The researcher presents the designing process of the new ECERS-SA and the translation process of both the ECERS-R, and the ECERS-E. For the duration of the trial process, the researcher supports the teachers, and engages collaboratively in the action research cycle. Then the analysis of teachers’ feedback regarding the trial process, and experts’ feedback on the questionnaires regarding the three rating scales, helps in the refining process that constructs the final form of the ECERS-SA. An important aspect of this study is that it combines an “inside-out” and “outside-in” model of action research, which draws on the professional knowledge and experiences of teachers and other stakeholders, in order to enhance the cultural relevance of the new ECERS-SA.
Again, the case study approach is used where direct observations in six kindergartens (3 public, and 3 private) are conducted by the directors of those kindergartens besides appointed supervisors from the Ministry of Education (MOE). To secure greater reliability and validity in classroom observation, the decision is made to use the strategy of the researcher sitting with both directors and supervisors in the classrooms as a non-participant observer. To clarify observations and gain the directors’ and supervisors’ perspectives, the researcher conducts semi-structured interviews following most observation periods. Demographic and background information on the six kindergartens are obtained from the directors. Using different data resources, the aim is to triangulate references and perspectives to ensure greater data reliability. The decision to use a combination of data collection methods, both quantitative and qualitative, aims to add “rigour, breadth, and depth of any investigation” (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994: 2).

Nevertheless, interpretive case study approach has its limitations. Misinterpreted data, or going beyond what is actually observed due to researcher/observer subjectivity, is one of these limitations. Interpretations of what is real are often value-laden since the interpretative researchers themselves are the primary instruments of data collection. Hence, critics noted that the researcher being the primary research tool may lead to “distorted” and “unnatural” interactions among those they research. Briefly, this poses a threat to the internal validity of the analysis. In view of this, the researcher in this study adopts a number of techniques to balance subjectivity, to safeguard validity and reliability, and to protect against bias. Among others, methodological triangulation among different sources of information is one of the main techniques used. A multiplicity of complementary methods is highly recommended for use in data collection in order that the form of methodological “triangulation” is created (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994). Triangulation can serve as a means of maintaining research findings for bias, for example, and as means
of increasing confidence that the data are sound (Siraj-Blatchford & Siraj-Blatchford, 2001).

The purpose behind using this methodology is to design a tool for evaluating the quality of kindergartens in Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (KSA). Since this tool will not be built from scratch, it depends on methodological triangulation. Methodological triangulation is achieved by applying different methods, including documentary analysis, structured discussions, in-depth interviews, questionnaires, observations, and standardised rating scales. The term triangulation is borrowed from the contexts of navigation or surveying, where two or more directional markers are used to accurately locate a single geographical feature or position. In qualitative research, to triangulate data means to confirm their validity by obtaining data from a second or third methodological resource (Goodwin & Goodwin, 1996). An observation may therefore be backed by evidence gained in an interview and/or from documentary analysis. The central aim is to provide a holistic account that captures all the beliefs, views, perspectives, intentions, and values of the subject of the study, which is the evaluation tool. In the context of quality of pre-school education, interpretive research has succeeded in getting below the surface of general evaluation characteristics identified in check-lists and rating scales (Harms et al., 1998; Sylva et al., 1999a).

Another interpretive technique used in this study, which is analysis of official documents such as the Curriculum Guidance and Teachers’ Manual of the NDC, teachers’ evaluation forms, and documents stating government’s policies and regulations for pre-school sector. Strauss and Corbin (1990) highlighted the importance of documentary analysis as supplementing the more used interviews and observations. Documents also provide “hard” or especially legitimate evidence, although a high degree of sophistication and scepticism is required in reading and interpreting them (Mason, 1996).
**Data Collection**

In this study, data collection incorporates the multi-method approach which is described below

Table 1.1 Phase 1, methods, data sources, and sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Data source</th>
<th>Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaires</td>
<td>Supervisors</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experts</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom observations</td>
<td>kindergarten</td>
<td>1 public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ECERS-R, ECERS-E,</td>
<td></td>
<td>Total = 9 classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and the new ECERS-SA*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structured discussions</td>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracking sheets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1.2 Phase 2, methods, data sources, and sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Data source</th>
<th>Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Classroom observations</td>
<td>Directors</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Evaluation Tool (ECERS-R,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECERS-E, and the new ECERS-SA*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Phase 1: The Translation Process

The researcher herself who is bilingual completes the translation process of the ECERS-R, the ECERS-E, and the ECERS-SA. The researcher contacts the original authors of both the ECERS-R and the ECERS-E to get permission for the translation process to ensure comparability. All the scales, sub-scales, and items are translated to Arabic so that teachers at the In-service Training Center administer the scales in the application process effectively. The researcher does not need to translate the ECERS-R and the ECERS-E during the preliminary work of adapting the two scales because she is bilingual. The principles and aims of each sub-scale are expressed in Arabic language but they are not an exact translation of the English version. They are negotiated early with the researcher’s supervisors and they agree on specific terms used throughout the scale. Secondly, colleagues from the Department of Early Childhood Education (ECE) at King Abdul-Aziz University (KAAU) and experts in the field of ECE are consulted on the translation and adaptation of the rating scales. The basic scales remained the same in the translations; some changes are required in a few of the indicators, and especially in the
examples for indicators, to make the various translations culturally relevant. Then the examples for the items under each sub-scale are reviewed extensively: some examples are added or dropped to fit with the guidelines of the NDC and terminology used in official documents of the MOE.

Once again, neither rating scales are an exact translation: an acceptable cross-cultural structure and the equivalent meanings are discussed, debated, and transacted to carry out the early guidance principles. Some items are eliminated as an adaptation to country specific characteristics. For example, the item, nap/rest is dropped from the ECERS-R because many kindergartens in KSA do not provide naptime. In addition, the item, music/movements is slightly altered to meet the requirements of the MOE since music activities are not allowed in public centers. The item use of TV/Video/computer is reduced to use of TV/Video only because the researcher adds a separate item in the ECERS-SA regarding use of computer because of its significance. Only items where there is overlap between the three countries UK, USA, and KSA are modified and translated to Arabic.

The researcher herself conducts the preliminary work of adapting the ECERS-R and the ECERS-E. To ensure proper evaluation of kindergartens in KSA, the two versions of the ECERS-R and the ECERS-E underwent extensive pre-tests in two kindergartens to ensure that data are collected according to a standard procedure. This resulted in a glossary containing detailed specifications of most of the terms used throughout the scale. The researcher puts emphasis on the use of some of the terms such as some, many, and few to ensure that each aspect of quality is measured properly and in a comparable manner in each kindergarten.

At the end, three of the researcher’s colleagues from the Department of ECE, the Department of Arabic Language Studies, and the Department of Educational Psychology at KAAU, check that the
content validity of the items is maintained and that the translation is accurate, and examine the translated versions separately. About 95% of the translation and meaning is accurate when compared with the original version, thus making the rating scales adequately accurate to be adopted in evaluating the quality of pre-school education. The researcher conducts a meeting with two supervisors from the ESO with the intention of ensuring that any doubt arising from the rating scales can be clarified, and to allow verbal feedback on the clarity and relevance of the sub-scales, items, and examples of the rating scales. This process also ensures that supervisors and directors use the rating scales efficiently to evaluate the quality of kindergartens when they implement the tool.

Phase 2: Implementing Phase

The directors complete evaluations of three classrooms within their own kindergartens making a total of 18 observations in all the six kindergartens of the sample. Similarly, six supervisors from the ESO complete evaluations of the same three classrooms in each kindergarten. A total of 36 observations for both directors and supervisors provide the data for the statistical analysis. Both observers use the evaluation tool which consists of 15 sub-scales; each sub-scale is composed of 4-10 items, which describe quality indicators in kindergartens, and aims to evaluate the quality of kindergartens in KSA. The first seven sub-scales are translated from the American version of the ECERS-R, followed by four sub-scales that are a translation of the British extension ECERS-E, and then the last four sub-scales are a translation of the Saudi extension ECERS-SA.

In this study, as in the Effective Provision of Pre-School Education Project (EPPE: Sylva et al., 1999a), the wording of the ECERS-R and ECERS-E are adjusted very slightly to conform to current language use in kindergartens in KSA (Sylva et al., 1999a). The evaluation tool, consisting of the ECERS-R, ECERS-E, and ECERS-SA sub-scales, is listed in table 1.3 with their titles and items.

Table 1.3 Sub-scales of the evaluation tool
The sub-scales of the adapted ECERS-R:
1. Physical Environment (Indoor-outdoor) items 1-8
2. Daily Routines- items 9-13 (excluding item 11, Nap/Rest, item “Toileting /Diapering” is changed to ‘Washing/Toileting’).
3. Learning Skills- items 14-17
4. Learning Corners- items 18-25 (excluding item 21, Music/Movement, and item 27, Use of TV, video, and /or computers).
5. Social Interactions- items 26-30
6. Programme Structure- items 31-33 (excluding item 37, Provision for children w/disabilities).
7. Family and Staff- items 34-39

The sub-scales of the adapted ECERS-E:
8. Reading and Writing skills- 1-6
9. Mathematical Skills- 11-14
11. Diversity- 20-22 (excluding item 23, Race equity)

The sub-scales of the ECERS-SA:
12. Teachers’ Interactions- 1-4
13. Management- 5-8
14. Cultural Influence- 9-13
15. Supplementary Services- 14-16

Scoring of the Sub-scales:
Total scores for the evaluation tool are then calculated by summing the mean sub-scale scores, seven sub-scales for ECERS-R, four sub-scales for ECERS-E, and four sub-scales for ECERS-SA. A score for each sub-scale is calculated for the evaluation tool using the following formula:

\[
\text{Sub-scale score} = \frac{\text{sum of scores for each item in the sub-scale}}{\text{Number of items scored}}
\]
**The Statistical Analysis**

Data is analysed statistically by using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) computer software. Basic calculations are performed on the data for means and standard deviations, that are used to discover whether there are significant differences between the directors’ evaluation and the supervisors’ evaluation and between public and private kindergartens; correlation analysis is used to reveal central tendencies in the relationship between the three rating scales (the ECERS-R, ECERS-E, and ECERS-SA); and factor analysis is done to reduce the massive amount of item scores into manageable clusters of categories. Descriptive statistical techniques are used to summarise characteristics of sample data including measures of central tendency (Mean), measures of variability (Standard Deviation), and measures of relationship (Correlation Coefficient).

**Descriptive statistics:**

Table 1.4 provides the overall descriptive results for the sub-scales of the evaluation tool by pre-school type.

Table 1.4 Descriptive results (pre-school type)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Evaluation Tool</th>
<th>Public</th>
<th>Private</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Physical environment</td>
<td>5.7517</td>
<td>.84099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Daily routines</td>
<td>6.1633</td>
<td>.66096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Learning skills</td>
<td>5.9717</td>
<td>1.26326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Learning corners</td>
<td>4.4867</td>
<td>1.40396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Social interaction</td>
<td>5.3583</td>
<td>.76523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Program structure</td>
<td>4.4467</td>
<td>1.08798</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. Family/staff  5.1800  .82811  3.7617  .73180
Total ECERS-R  5.3217  .66307  4.6050  .33255
8. Reading/writing skills  5.3650  .67784  6.0967  .58229
9. Mathematical skills  5.2083  1.32249  4.4583  .71443
10. Scientific concepts  5.7217  .56428  5.2083  .40301
11. Diversity  4.5267  2.05468  3.4267  1.40975
Total ECERS-E  5.2617  .94810  4.9667  .33327
12. Teacher interactions  4.5617  .64136  6.1667  .62583
14. Cultural influence  5.0800  1.47330  5.1500  .46797
15. Supplementary services  4.3333  1.38625  5.8500  1.10227
Total ECERS-SA  5.0283  .71513  5.2700  .53807

Note: shaded boxes= total scores of the three rating scales

Alternatively, table 1.5 provides the overall descriptive results for the sub-scales of the evaluation tool by observer type.

Table 1.5 Descriptive results (observer type)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Evaluation Tool</th>
<th>Supervisor</th>
<th>Director</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Physical environment</td>
<td>5.2333</td>
<td>.90683</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Daily routines</td>
<td>6.3667</td>
<td>.62503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Learning skills</td>
<td>6.2500</td>
<td>1.08397</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Learning corners</td>
<td>3.8500</td>
<td>1.24881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Social interaction</td>
<td>5.5833</td>
<td>.81097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Program structure</td>
<td>3.1683</td>
<td>1.47355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Family/staff</td>
<td>4.5283</td>
<td>1.05922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total ECERS-R</td>
<td>4.9467</td>
<td>.63576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Reading/writing skills</td>
<td>5.8033</td>
<td>.65323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Mathematical skills</td>
<td>4.7500</td>
<td>1.26491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Scientific concepts</td>
<td>5.5000</td>
<td>.57619</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Diversity</td>
<td>4.0000</td>
<td>1.88550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total ECERS-E</td>
<td>5.2350</td>
<td>.63466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Teacher interactions</td>
<td>5.4150</td>
<td>1.07068</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Cultural influence</td>
<td>5.1000</td>
<td>1.07145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Supplementary services</td>
<td>5.0833</td>
<td>2.65361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total ECERS-SA</td>
<td>5.0500</td>
<td>.67950</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: shaded boxes= total scores of the three rating scales

The ECERS-R total scores of both observers are normally distributed and are in line with the results from previous studies (Al-Ameel, 2002; Sylva et al., 1999b; 1999c). The distribution of the scores is normal and allows the researcher to carry out powerful statistical tests to identify significant differences among the sub-scales of the evaluation tool.

With the exception of the ECERS-E total scores, the public kindergartens in the sample tend to have slightly higher total scores than the private kindergartens. The reason for this difference is that most public kindergartens apply only the NDC, which lacks educational activities, especially Literacy and Maths. The ECERS-E highest scores are found in the private kindergartens that combine the NDC with additional educational activities. The ECERS-R scores tend towards the top of the “adequate” range and sometimes approach the
“good” range. The ECERS-E scores are more satisfactory and approach above the “good” range because there is a growing national movement towards preparing children for elementary school (Al-Sunbul, Al-Khateeb, Metwali et al., 1998).

While the ECERS-SA total scores are above the “good” range, the public kindergartens’ scores approach the “excellent” range. The reason for these high scores compared to the other scores of both the ECERS-R and ECERS-E is because public kindergartens tend to pursue firmly the NDC guidelines which conform to the ECERS-SA sub-scales. Also, for the “Management” sub-scale, the directors of the public kindergartens ensure that practices in their kindergartens are in accordance with the guidelines of the NDC and the regulations of the MOE. Although inter observer agreement is established for both observers before starting the evaluation process, the supervisors tend to rate kindergartens slightly lower than the directors in the sample do.

An Overview of the Sub-scales:
The following section presents an overview of sub-scales of the evaluation tool. For the purpose of analysing procedures the sub-scales of the ECERS-R, ECERS-E, and ECERS-SA are presented respectively. First, the ECERS-R sub-scales are presented in figure 1.1 which breaks down the ECERS-R into their sub-scales components by center type.
The highest scores for the public kindergartens are found in “Social Interaction”, and “Physical Environment” compared to slightly lower scores for the same sub-scales of the private kindergartens. Although the scores for “Program Structure”, “Learning Skills”, “Learning Corners”, and “Family/Staff” across all kindergartens approach the “good” range, the scores for private kindergartens reveal some striking differences. One of the public kindergartens in the sample is the In-service Training Center for pre-school teachers in Jeddah, which is found to be an exciting place where children are challenged and supported in their learning. The interactions between teachers and children are responsive and enabling because it is considered a high quality pre-school model for other kindergartens.

The score for “Learning Corners” is more disappointing for the private kindergartens because there are few learning corners, and these are hardly ever used. Evidence of classroom observations in Phase 1 indicates that most private kindergartens in the sample enforce direct-teaching methods, which require only chairs and a blackboard in the
classrooms. Figure 1.2 breaks down the ECERS-E into their sub-scales components by center type. Figure 1.2 Histogram of ECERS-E sub-scales

The ECERS-E scores tend towards the top of the “good” range and sometimes approach “excellent”. Naturally, the scores for the private kindergartens are slightly higher than the public kindergartens, since most private kindergartens in KSA provide educational activities in their curriculum. The lowest scores are found in “Scientific Concepts” in view of the fact that according to the NDC guidelines, all kindergartens should have a science corner and daily science activities. Based on findings of Phase 2, the problem is that most teachers in the sample lack the necessary training to stimulate children’s scientific thinking and abilities. Figure 1.3 breaks down the ECERS-SA into their sub-scales components by center type.
The highest scores are found in “Teachers’ Interactions” followed by “Cultural Influence”, while the lowest scores are seen in “Management”. There are not enough data to present the results for the “Supplementary Services” because the public kindergartens do not provide any additional services in their facilities. Obviously there is a wide variation in the mean scores for the “Management” between public and private kindergartens since the policy and regulations of administration and directing in the public sector are administered directly by the MOE.

Reflecting on the analysis of Phase 3, both supervisors and directors think that the evaluation tool seems to be time consuming, but useful as a research tool. Interviews with the teachers of the classrooms after the observations and additional evidence such as planned documents provide supplementary information. In addition, repeated observations where the observer is unsure about scoring particular items provide another layer of reassurance and validation.
Contributions, Suggestions, and Recommendations

This is an exploratory study of different perspectives on evaluating the quality of kindergartens in KSA. The most significant contribution is its originality: this is the first study to demonstrate, in depth, how quality can be conceptualised in KSA, drawing on the perspectives of key stakeholders.

Another contribution at the international or cross-cultural level is that the present study contributes to the still limited evidence about pre-school education in the developing world, particularly in the Middle East, where traditions and cultural customs, Islamic beliefs, and personal morals preside strictly over all aspects of life in the Saudi society. The findings suggest that the widely accepted perception of what constitutes quality in pre-school environments should be challenged because defining quality is culturally situated and not universal. As most theories and research studies on evaluating and maintaining quality in ECE settings originated in Western cultures, which have their own definitions and perspectives in accordance with their tradition and values, care should be taken when applying evaluation tools or instruments in Saudi pre-school settings where family values, traditions, and the influence of religion are still particularly evident.

Finally, this is the first study of its kind involving translating and adapting a very widely used instrument in evaluating pre-school environment, which is the ECERS-R. Even though the ECERS-E is relatively new compared to the ECERS-R, it is also translated to Arabic and adapted for use in Saudi kindergartens for the purpose of the study because it covers educational activities, which are rated as a very important quality indicator by most of the stakeholders in the sample. Besides translation, these evaluation tools help researchers and practitioners in the Arab world, particularly in the Gulf region, to use them effectively since language sometimes is a significant obstacle in conducting research and comparative studies.
Obtaining views from different stakeholders is a significant problem in the present study. Whose view should best inform the quality debate? The study shows that stakeholders’ perspectives show areas of agreement and disagreement. Whilst some of these perspectives have been accommodated in the evaluation tool, it is perhaps inevitable that the “professional” perspective is ultimately the strongest voice. This is because the professional community (researchers, teachers, supervisors, directors, policy makers) become the advocates and guardians of quality, because of their professional knowledge and expertise. However, an important part of this guardianship is listening and responding to stakeholders’ perspectives, particularly children, parents, and families.

The various ECERS used in this study (ECERS-R, ECERS-E, ECERS-SA) set the frame of references against which aspects of quality can be measured. However, further research would need to be conducted on how the evaluation tool is used in practice in KSA, how teachers, directors, and supervisors identify areas for change and development, and how change and development can be brought about. There is a need to evaluate the extent to which ECERS maintains a “status question” – a set of characteristics, which are set in a particular temporal, social, and political context. Alternatively, further research is needed in order to establish to what extent ECERS might contribute to increasing professionalization, improving quality, and contributing to greater autonomy and reflexivity on the part of teachers, directors, and supervisors. The evaluation tool should help ECE teachers to become more professionally skilled and competent. If the tool is adopted, future research will need to be undertaken to track and evaluate subsequent change processes, and impact factors. ECERS-SA can be used at school level, at district, and at state levels, to monitor the performance of individual kindergartens, and to monitor change and improvement of kindergartens, teachers’ competence, and children’s achievements. Thus, the findings of this study potentially mark an important point on the “quality journey” for the KSA.
The Image of an Author: Misrepresentations, Strategies and Norms

Hisham A. Jawad
English Dept, College of Arts,
Sultan Qaboos University, Oman

Abstract
The paper examines the representations of Arab writer Tāhā Hussein in English discourse by analysing patterns of lexical repetition in his autobiography al-Ayyām ‘The Days’ along with their translation equivalents. This consists in mapping TT onto ST so as to see how repetition is rendered in TT and what impact translation strategies and norms have on reshaping the author’s image. The paper sets out to classify Lexical repetition into two types: lexical-item repetition and phrase repetition. It fulfils two major functions, namely textual and rhetorical. The textual function concerns the potential of repetition for organising the text and rendering it cohesive, while the rhetorical has to do with the use of recurrence for rhetorical purposes, foregrounding a mental image or invoking emotions in emotive language. Notions of multisidedness, nothingness, and irony are only some. As to the translation strategies, the findings suggest that the translators vary the ST by using different patterns of reference. Rhetorical repetition is backgrounded by at least one translator who replaces it with pervasive variation. It is argued that the ambivalence in their approaches has the impact of misrepresenting the original text (and perhaps the author) as rather uneven. Indeed, the translation of the autobiography’s second part is characterised mainly by the absence of lexical repetition, contrary to the translations of the first and third parts. Thus, we end up with a translated autobiography that misrepresents the original author as passing through three stages of textual, stylistic development whereby he uses repetition in the first stage, averts it in the second, and re-uses it in the third. The domesticating strategy for translating...
lexical repetition highlight the translators’ individual attitudes towards the ST’s norms and their adherence to the linguistic and cultural norms prevalent in the TL environment. On the whole, there is a variation in the degree of bias towards the norms of either SL or TL. In terms of Toury’s norms model, it may be safe to claim that the general trend of translational norms seems to lean more towards the acceptability pole rather than the adequacy pole, i.e., a TL-oriented strategy is opted for.

Key words: repetition, Arabic discourse, foreignization, domestication, strategies, norms.

0. Introduction

The image of an author can be projected into the TL milieu being informed by the kind of strategy or method a translator opts for. Two major categories of translation strategy are suggested (Venuti 1995), viz. foreignization and domestication, the latter being more significant since it involves ‘an ethnocentric reduction of the foreign text to TL cultural values’ (p. 20). This implies that the target text will definitely read transparent, fluent, original-like and having a domesticated identity. On the other hand, the strategy of foreignization ‘entails choosing a foreign text and developing a translation method along lines which are excluded by the dominant cultural values in the target language’ (Venuti 1997: 242). In other words, the TT will be resistant to the ethnocentric values of the target culture, and thus, the end-product will sound ‘foreign’, ‘non-transparent’, highlighting the foreign identity of the ST and protecting it from the hegemony of TL culture.

This study attempts to see how inconsistency of general strategy in the translation of the three-volume autobiography al-Ayyām ‘The Days’ by Tāhā Hussein can compromise the image of the writer in the TL environment. Specifically, this is shown through the translation of pervasive lexical repetition in the writer’s work. As a textual and rhetorical device, repetition has broadly been studied from different
perspectives and many models and insights have been suggested in an attempt to describe and explain the manifestations and mechanisms underlying this phenomenon. Some researchers have seen repetition as a textual device functioning in a way so as to realize lexical cohesion (Halliday & Hasan 1976; Beaugrande & Dressler 1981; Hasan 1984; amongst others). Others have argued for the central role repetition plays in the overall organization of text (Hoey 1991). And, it is in poetics that repetition demonstrates still greater effect as it is employed artistically and rhetorically to foreground linguistic elements in text (Wright 1965; Leech 1969; Gutwinski 1976).

One kind of repetition is lexical repetition which is used to serve two major cohesive functions: textual and rhetorical. As for the textual function, the device is utilized in connecting various parts of a text through the unmarked recurrence of certain elements at the very surface of the text. In this, lexical repetition assumes the role of organizing and rendering the text cohesive in much the same way as connectives do. Rhetorically, lexical repetition has to do with the expressive meaning that a marked repetitive pattern evokes via a foregrounded, rhetorical image. However, it must be emphasised that the two functions occasionally shade into one another to the extent that it becomes almost impossible to determine which function is at work. The fact that lexical repetition caters for the organization of text by integrating various items into a cohesive network will necessarily entail the deployment of words which refer to closely related ideas or entities into repetitive patterns. Here, the style of the author informs the process of constructing the text and, consequently, repetition is bound to acquire some authorial, stylistic make-up. In other words, the textual and rhetorical functions of repetition may be said to overlap with some other stylistic function.

The analytical methodology of the study is eclectic. It draws on several different theories of the notion of norms that involve a component of comparison informing a mapping of the TT onto the ST. This approach will have the discovery of translation strategies as its ultimate goal. However, this work is less concerned with translation
strategies as theoretical concepts than with their practical application. I shall not, therefore, attempt to look into their theoretical status or definition. Particularly, I shall focus on the production strategies which ‘have to do with how the translator manipulates the linguistic material in order to produce an appropriate target text’ (Chesterman, 1997: 92). A strategy, then, is an action taken by the translator in a problem-solving situation. Numerous catalogues of translation strategies have been put forward (Vinay & Darbelnet 1995 [1958]; Baker 1992; Dickins et al. 2002), however, studies on strategies for translating Arabic discourse are hard to come by. Therefore, it may be necessary to identify the strategies translators frequently employ in the process of translating. One strategy of rendering Arabic lexical repetition into English is variation. This is partly motivated by the TL systemic prerequisites and the general, stylistic norms prevalent in the TL environment that inform such tendencies as the subscription to fluency, idiomaticity, or eloquence. In achieving lexical cohesion, English TL norms call for the use of ‘elegant variation’ as an alternative to repetition when the latter serves no expressive function (Leech & Short, 1981: 247). The device of variation may take a set of forms (synonymy, co-reference, etc.) depending on the kinds of shift translators trigger in the TT. This, however, does not rule out facilitating repetition in cases informed by ST norms. The decision to apply a certain TT solution to a certain ST problem is essentially dependent on how sensitive the translators are towards the ST message and the necessity to relay textual features and structures into the TT.

The notion of norms, originating in the socio-cultural studies, is so significant here as it concerns the system of values and beliefs specific to a particular culture, society and time. It has been applied to linguistics by Bartsch (1987) and to translation by Toury (1995), among others. Toury’s (1995: 55) definition of norms, however, is biased towards descriptive translation studies as it refers to “the translation of general values or ideas shared by a community – as to what is right and wrong, adequate and inadequate – into performance
instructions appropriate for and applicable to particular situations”. The norms are identified in a corpus of source and target texts, the scrutiny of which would help to uncover translation strategies that are repeatedly opted for in preference to other available strategies in a given language or culture. Thus, whilst adherence to source norms determines a translation’s adequacy as compared to the source text, subscription to norms originating in the target culture determines its acceptability. Schäffner (1999: 13) underlines the significance of the concept of norms in linguistic approaches to translation, as both linguistic and translational norms emanate from the process of mapping the TT onto the ST.

In the following sections, there will be an investigation of the types of lexical repetition as they occur in the three volumes and how they are dealt with in the English translations. The texts were selected on the basis of Tāhā Hussein’s wide reputation as a writer whose immeasurable contributions to the Arabic language and literature were set in motion through a mastery of flexible, lucid Arabic prose style. In fact, his autobiography is considered as one of the acknowledged masterpieces of contemporary Arabic literature, which signified the beginning of a new era in the history of Arabic writing in general, and the art of fiction in particular. Thus, the text is more in the genre of fiction than pure autobiography.

Tāhā Hussein (1889-1973), blind from early childhood, managed to pursue a distinguished career in Egyptian and Arab cultural life. Unofficially known as ‘Dean of Arabic Letters’, he was mostly influential through his varied and controversial writings. Pierre Cachia (p. 4), in his brief introduction to the one-volume three translations of the autobiography, refers to the generation of Arab intellectuals of which Tāhā Hussein was ‘the most representative and most immediately influential member’:

They were not cautious philosophers or meticulous scholars, but bold spirits casting their bread upon the waters… Their achievement was
that they swept away conservatism part of which at least badly needed to be swept away; they accustomed an entire generation to thinking along new lines.

He adds: ‘Of the qualities that enabled Tāhā Hussein to leave his mark on an entire nation, his sensitiveness and independence of spirit shine through every page of his autobiography’. Ultimately, the selection of the text rested upon one major objective, namely to elicit typical examples of repetition from a typical discourse of repetition. Along these lines, it may be claimed that Tāhā Hussein was a master of Arabic poetic prose and repetition. This will be shown through the ways repetition is utilised in the overall building of text. First, attention will be paid to the textual function of repetition and then to the rhetorical through discussing a number of examples in conjunction with the strategies adopted in translating them. With the textual function in mind, lexical repetition will be examined in terms of two types: lexical-item repetition and phrase repetition. Still, one further function to be discussed is the rhetorical.

1. Lexical-item Repetition

This type refers to the recurrence of one word across a stretch of text. A number of examples will be analysed from the vantage point of the strategies employed by various translators.

Translation strategies

There have been three strategies used by the translators for rendering repetition into the English TT:

Literal translation

This strategy is meant to be as close to the ST form as possible but still grammatical. Example:
He remembers the fence as though he saw it only yesterday. He remembers that the stalks of which this fence was composed were taller than he was, and it was difficult for him to get to the other side of it … (Paxton, 1997[1932]: 9)

This passage is extracted from the very beginning of Tāhā Hussein’s autobiography. It shows a small portion of a repetitive pattern set by the verb /raF/kafI/dhalF/yaI that occurs no fewer than fourteen times in the first three pages of the ST. The lexical item runs almost like a theme through the pages setting the scene for the topic of the whole text, i.e. remembering. The function of this item repetition may be seen as twofold: stylistic and text-building. In the TT, the equivalent item remember is used twelve times, while for the other two occurrences variation is opted for, e.g. recall and recollect. That is, the chain of lexical-item repetition is disrupted in the middle by two synonyms in the TT. More than that, the lexical chain is stretched out in the TT when the translator introduces remember as a substitute for the word خَيَّرَ (lit. ‘to memorise’) which occurs in the fourth page. This manipulation may be viewed from the perspective of translation norms where the choice is an outcome of a conscious translation processing of the ST. In other words, the translator has presumably been aware of the unusual recurrence of the item and its significance to the overall theme of the first chapter, which is centred on the notion of ‘remembering’. Therefore, the expansion of the chain may be informed by two factors: the excessive reiteration of the item and the theme of the first chapter.
Translation by synonymy

This strategy selects not the ‘exact’ equivalent but a synonym or near-synonym for it. Example:

(2) 
[أصوات] كانت تتبعث من زوايا الحجرة ضفيلة ، يمثّل بعضها أرزى الزجاج يغلي على النار،
ويمثّل بعضها الآخر حركة متناغم خفيف ينقل من مكان إلى مكان ، ويمثّل بعضها خفياً ينقض أو
عوداً ينحطم . (ط. حسين: 8،ج،1) 

[…] sounds which proceeded softly from the corners of the room. Some of them were like the hissing of a kettle boiling on the fire, others resembled the movement of light articles being moved from place to place, and again others sounded like the breaking of wood or the cracking of stems. (Paxton, 1997[1932]: 11)

Here, the verb يمثّل is repeated no fewer that three times as highlighted. The translator opts for the corresponding items were like, resembled and sounded like. The recurrence of each of these could qualify as a possible alternative in the TT, although the choices are somehow constrained by the collocation preferences in the context in which they occur. To take one example, the word resemble is often used with reference to visual appearances or properties. In terms of cohesive ties, the ST favours identical repetition for linking the three clauses starting with يمثّل . The item creates a cohesive chain coupled by another one which is formed by the neighbouring word بعضها . In the TT, however, the strategy is to establish different cohesive ties by linking the last choice sounded like with the other preceding items in two ways: by repetition in like/like, and by synonymy in sounded like/resembled. That is, while the ST sets the repetitive pattern in a way so as to stretch out like a thread across the passage, the translation
strategy cuts it in the middle (by resembled) and replaces it with two links interfaced by sounded like.

Another point has to do with the notion of textual continuity in terms of the average distance between one occurrence and another of the same item. The above example displays a variation between the ST and TT systems of norms in the sense that the tendency to set a cohesive linkage by short-range repetition in the ST is contrasted with a TT tendency for long-range repetition. It has been suggested that Arabic and English differ in the level of tolerance towards lexical repetition (Baker, 1992: 210). Normally, Arabic tolerates higher degree of lexical repetition than English. However, this is only partially true, given the fact that the frequency of recurrence is ultimately constrained by the parameter of textual distance, i.e. the average range of distance between one occurrence and another of the same item at the surface of the text. Thus, while Arabic allows recurrence to take place at a variety of ranges, including the short-range, English seems to prefer recurrence at a long distance but employs co-reference or pronominalization in short-range linking. This norm operates in the next example.

**Translation by hyponymy**

The translator replaces a ST lexical repetitive set with another set based on a hyponymic association. Example:

(3)

و كانت أم الفتى راضية عما أتيح لابنها من النجح، ولكن رضاها كان مراً تقيلاً. كانت تفكر في حال ابنتها وقبيل سباعر له من الخطوب في بلاد العريقة و فيما سيتكلف من الجهود و يجعل من المشقة، و كانت كلما رأى ابتهاغه وابتهاج أبيه تلَّل عليها هذا التفكير، و ربا استخفت بدموعها حتى لا تنخص على الأسرة هذا الابتهاج. (طه حسين: ٣٧٠٨)
My mother [the mother of the boy], too, was pleased with her son’s measure of success. But her satisfaction was clouded with heavy apprehensions, thinking of my [his] blind state and all the vicissitudes awaiting me [him] in a strange land, the exertions necessary and the hardships I [he] would undergo. These thoughts would come weighing on her at every sight of my [his] happy anticipation and my [his] father’s satisfaction. Oftentimes she checked her tears in order not to mar the family joy.

(Cragg, 1997[1976]: 312)

In the ST passage, there are two kinds of lexical repetition: root repetition as in رضا - راضية and repetition of the lexical item انتهاج. Whilst the lexical set with root repetition is rendered synonymous in the TT, i.e. pleased and satisfaction, the second set involving lexical-item repetition undergoes another strategy. The three occurrences of انتهاج are replaced with anticipation, satisfaction and joy. These items constitute a lexical set belonging to the semantic field of EMOTION, but they are assigned different values on the scale of generality. Specifically, satisfaction denotes the feeling one gets after achieving something or when a wish is fulfilled; anticipation is a feeling of excitement (which collocates with the added word happy); and joy is a feeling of great happiness, delight (Oxford Dictionary). This shows that anticipation and joy are more specific in their meaning than satisfaction and that they stand as synonyms or near-synonyms for انتهاج. Satisfaction, on the other hand, cannot qualify as a (near) synonym for انتهاج. In fact, it is more general in its meaning which denotes the sense of رضا. Similarly, a relationship of hyponymy exists between satisfaction as a superordinate and anticipation and joy as co-hyponyms. The ST hyponymic relationship attributes the superordinate element رضا to the ‘mother’ and the hyponym انتهاج to the rest of the family including the ‘father’ and ‘son’. What the
translator does is deconstruct this equation by shifting the semantic pattern to cover both parents on the one hand and the rest of the family on the other, i.e. assigning ‘satisfaction’ to the parents, ‘anticipation’ to the son and ‘joy’ to other family members. Put another way, the superordinate linguistic element is allocated to superordinate family members, while hyponyms relate to lower family members. This semantic interpretation of the ST can hardly be justified given the fact that the values attributed to the feelings of each individual in the ST are conspicuous.

2. Phrase Repetition

Lexical cohesion is also sustainable by repeating the same phrase across a stretch of text. This takes the form of explicit recurrence of a phrase, or even a clause, that has the function of connecting a number of sentences. It is also possible to find larger chunks of text being interlinked by this kind of repetition. Generally, the translators have employed a strategy whereby the ST cohesion by phrase repetition is shifted into a pattern of cohesion based on variation. Example:

(4)

كان مظلمّا إلى أن الدنيا تنتهي عن يمينه بهذه القنّة التي لم يكن بينه وبينها إلا خطوات معدودة ....

ولم لا و هو لم يكن برى عرض هذه القنّة، ولم يكن يُقدر أن هذا العرض ضئيل بحيث يستطيع الشباب الشنيط أن يبّث من إحدى الحافيين تيتُب الأخرى. ولم يكن يُقدر أن حياة الناس والحيوان والنباتات تصل من وراء هذه القنّة على نحو ما هي من دونها. ولم يكن يُقدر أن الرجل يستطيع أن يعبر هذه القنّة متمّلة دون أن يبلغ الماء إيطيّه. ولم يكن يُقدر أن الماء يقطع من حين إلى حين عن هذه القنّة، [... لم يكن يُقدر هذا كله [...]

(طه حسين: 12، ج)
He was convinced that the world ended to the right of him with the canal, which was only a few paces away from where he stood … and why not? For he could not appreciate the width of this canal, nor could he reckon that this expanse was so narrow that any active youth could jump from one bank to the other. Nor could he imagine that there was human, animal and vegetable life on the other side of the canal just as much as there was on his side; nor could he calculate that a grown man could wade across this canal in flood without the water reaching up to his armpits; nor did he conjecture that from time to time there was no water in it […]

None of these things did he ponder […] (Paxton, 1997[1932]: 12-3)

The ST includes the anaphoric repetition of the phrase لم يكن يتَدَرَّر at the beginning of successive sentences. This instance of repetition is not only intended to fulfil a cross-referencing function between a series of sentences, but also to build up textual cohesion at inter-paragraph level. Moreover, the tendency for creating cohesion by phrase repetition in the ST is countered by a predilection for variation in terms of synonymy in the TT. Therefore, the phrase is replaced by synonyms or near-synonyms all the way through: nor could he reckon, Nor could he imagine, nor could he calculate, nor did he conjecture, and None of these things did he ponder. It is conspicuous that the pressure of the context for realising appropriate collocative relationships has constituted another factor in determining the lexical choices in the TT. To take one example, the translation item reckon means ‘to calculate or determine by reference to a fixed point or basis’, i.e. it has to do with dimensions. This sense is retrieved from the very context of the text as in the underlined phrase: لم يكن يتَدَرَّر أن هذا المَعْرِض ضِيِّق ‘…nor could he reckon that this expanse was so narrow’.

The excerpt is the opening paragraph of the second chapter of Tāhā Hussein’s autobiography (Part 1). By introducing the repetition, the
author may have had the intention of harking back to the repetition of
the item /ٍذكر/ in the first chapter, as if he wanted to emphasise that he
remembers but could not reckon things properly (see Example 1). It
may be argued here that these two instances of repetition (opening
Chapters 1 and 2) are associated by collocation and thus serve an
inter-chapter cohesive function.

3. Rhetorical Repetition

The rhetorical function of repetition is concerned with the meaning
that formal repetition invokes in the mind of the reader. By the
recurrence of certain lexical items in a short piece of text, a
foregrounded image is projected on the surface of the text signalling a
semantic weight that goes beyond the mere senses of the repeated
utterances. Thus, rhetorical repetition can be considered an extra
structure, extra layer or extra regularity aimed at triggering extra
meanings as well as organizing the overall composition of discourse.
Although rhetorical repetition in literature has been extensively
studied, little attention has been paid to this phenomenon in literary
translation studies (Hatim & Mason, 1997; Abdulla, 2001). In general,
translation theorists consider repetition as a motivated feature that
should be retained in the TT:

[Re]iteration of text items is always motivated. This form of passive
intertextuality has to be considered by the translator in terms of its
overall function within the text. Opting for a synonym or a paraphrase
when what is required is verbatim reiteration can mar the
communicative effect intended. (Hatim & Mason, 1990: 124)

As regards instances of rhetorical repetition in this study, it is found
that repetition has been approached by a number of translation
strategies ranging between literal translation, variation and reduction.
This is manifested in tendencies by the translators to favour one
technique over another. For instance, Wayment seems to completely
ignore repetition opting instead for variation and thus compromising the rhetorical function of the ST. Only the complete transfer of the repetition into the TT could relay the rhetorical message of the ST. Other translators, in general, have shown a preference for keeping the repetition device in the TT.

In the following examples, heed will be paid to rhetorical repetition as a foregrounding device and its ramifications for literary translation. More specifically, the focus will be on the relationship of a single rhetorical form in the ST to its meaning and how that meaning is mediated through the process of translation.

But here in this room the boy loathed hearing the call to prayer, for he could not join in it and did not even know where it came from. He had never once been in the Mosque of Baibars […] Of all this he knew nothing, and there was no way of learning it, only this waiting, this eternal immobility. Ah, what agonies one can be condemned to by a passion for learning!

This interminable blankness was nothing if not exhausting. (Wayment, 1997[1943]: 128-29)

There are two instances of repetition in the extract: the first is the repetition of the word 

وكان هذا السكون بطول على الصبي في الجهده. (طه حسين: 367:2)

لا يعرف شيئاً. As far as the first recurrence
is concerned, the translator opts for variation, e.g. waiting, immobility and blankness, replacing the ST general term with near synonyms. This is quite oblivious to the fact that the author intends the notion of nothingness (or blankness) which is potently relayed by this repetition and the context wherein it occurs. The key word for the theme of nothingness is repeated three times. Another set of terms that reinforces the rhetorical meaning in the passage is: لا يعرف شيئاً - لا يعرف - لا سبيل إلى أن يعرف. In the TT, the following items refer to the same notion: did not even know – knew nothing – no way of learning, while the word nothing is repeated twice. In short, the meaning is lexicalised in both the ST and TT.

In the next excerpt, rhetorical repetition serves a complex and multifaceted purpose that would relate a variety of things into one unity:

There was in fact a remarkable variety of sounds. Voices of women raised in dispute, {Ø} of men shouting in anger or peaceably talking together; the noise of loads being set down or picked up; the song of the water-carrier crying his wares; the curse of a carter to his horse or mule or donkey; the grating sound of cart-wheels; and from time to time this confused whirl of sounds was torn by the braying of a donkey or the whinnying of a horse. (Wayment, 1997[1943]: 106)

The passage is a picture of a street scene where the foregrounded paradigm is the vocabulary for أصوات, i.e. 'sounds' in its neutral
sense. The item صوت أصوات and its singular form صوت are repeated no fewer than eight times in this short utterance. Apparently, the author uses the term to interrelate an assortment of things into a text world wherein various agents or objects participate: النساء (women), الرجال (men), الأخلف (loads), السقاء (the water-carrier), الخنث (a carter), حمار (a donkey), and فرس (a horse). The translator has simply split the ST paradigm into two: one representing a repetitive lexical set as in sounds, sound, and sounds and another denoting the hyponymic set sound, voices, and noise, where sound is a superordinate for the other two co-hyponyms. This intervention has resulted in watering down the ST rhetorical aspect and the author’s point of view.

Wayment’s bias for variation is evident in the above translation. However, it may be argued that such variations in terms of near synonyms or other sub-categories are not merely substitutes in their own right, but are rather intended to mime explicitly the way the ST pattern functions. The pattern is set in a way so as to draw attention now to this and then to that aspect of meaning and so build up a multi-sided picture of the whole situation. Thus, the sounds are seen at one point in relation to human beings (voices, song, curse), at another in relation to inanimate objects (noise, (the grating) sound), and still at another in relation to animals (sounds (torn by the braying … and whinnying)). These perspectives are rather complementary and, by specificity, the relation between them is shifted into an explicit one in the TT. In the ST, though, the notion of ‘multi-sidedness’ is expressed by formal repetition and thus remains implicit as to evaluation, which underlies the author’s aversion for explicit meaning and his interest (as a sightless person) in sounds in general.

The notion of multi-sidedness is also expressed in the next example where different concepts are interlinked by repetition. Example:
All these memories kept crowding in on the boy’s brain as he lay there in utter immobility. His dreams were cut short for a moment by the call of the muezzin to afternoon prayer from the Mosque of Baibars. The man’s voice was utterly hateful to the boy. (Wayment, 1997[1943]: 128-9)

The repetition of أشد incorporates root repetition of other lexemes as highlighted above. Having the highest degree of intensification and flanked by root recurrence, the item is seen as cohesive throughout the passage. In the TT, the word is replaced by zero occurrence, utter, and utterly. In the case of zero occurrence, the translator condenses the semantic load of the ST phrase into a compressed one as in crowding in. In the first two clauses, the phrases أشد الاضطراب بعدها and أشد الاضطراب ... أشد الاضطراب are linked by two devices: lexical-item repetition and antonymy. The translation strategy, however, is to tone down the level of cohesion by untying the repetition while preserving the antonymous tie. This translation solution misses one important function of the reiteration across the passage, viz. the linking up of diverse concepts or meanings that would seem otherwise unrelated. The repeated item أشد اشتكى underlines a preoccupation on the part of the writer with the whole situation. By conferring on the senses of the three lexemes, the repetition projects an implicit image wherein the writer hates not only the man’s voice but also the crowding in and immobility. This is hardly captured in the
TT. The patterning of root-echoing extended along a stretch of text may be considered an effective device in linking up various parts into a whole unit. Apart from its adverbial function, the cognate accusative structure can be exploited in text-building by creating a cohesive chain.

In the next pair of examples, a strategy of pervasive variation leads to the obliterating of the recurrence and detracting from equivalence of text focus.

(8)

كان صاحب لذة بل صاحب إغرام في اللذة وفهانك عليها. وكان يجب الحديث عن لذاته، ويستمع بفحسيل هذا الحديث كيا يستمع بذاته نفسها. وكانت اللذات التي يسمع فيها ويتحدث عنها يربى إن شئت. وألما إن شئت أيضاً. كان يذكر لذاته إذا خلا إلى أمه ويفضل ذلك تفصيلاً مكراً بقطعه بضحكه الغريب. وكان يذكر لذاته إذا جلس إلى طعامه الندم في القرية [...] (Wayment, 1997[1943]: 142).

He was a sensualist, a man passionately addicted to pleasure. He loved talking about his orgies and derived as much if not more enjoyment from a detailed description of them than he did from the experiences themselves. The pleasures he thought and talked about so much might be considered vicious or venial according to the way you looked at them. He used to describe his intimate relations with his wife, with a wealth of unpleasant details, which he punctured from time to time with that incredible laugh. Or he would recall the delights of the rich greasy food he ate in the country [...] (Wayment, 1997[1943]: 142).

In the ST, the term لذة (pleasure) (and its plural form لذات ) recurs seven times. The complexity of the repetition foregrounds the device, which signals to the reader/translator to be alert for implied
significance. Pleasure assumes great prominence in the life of the character and this is why the repetitive device carries a marked rhetorical weight. The translator opts for variation with the result that the element of pleasure becomes insignificant and the rhetorical momentum of the ST being damaged. What happens is that the neutral, general term لذة is rendered by a set of replacements in the TT that turn the ST implicit associations into explicit ones: sensualist, pleasure, orgies, experiences, pleasures, intimate relations, and delights. Whilst sensualist is lowest on the scale of generality, experiences assumes a highest point. One may also speculate that the author’s stylistic choices could be justified on the grounds of his reluctance to use explicitly ‘pejorative’ or offensive expressions. That is, for a man of letters like him assuming a prestigious status in a conservative society, it must be inappropriate to articulate meticulous details concerning intimate relations among people. This line of reasoning is well supported by the observation that the author does not take up sensitive issues in any explicit detail in his autobiography. In terms of the norms of the ST culture, the writer never violates the rules of decency and politeness in his community and therein the ST is seen to appeal to the expectations of the ST native readers at a certain period of time.
This individual paid visits but never received any. He never came alone, but always \{Ø\} with some other visitor. He never appeared in the daytime or in the first part of the night or \{Ø\} in the early morning. He came only in the dead of night, at the time of the deepest sleep. (Wayment, 1997[1943]: 167).

Here, the theme of ‘visiting’ is highlighted by the heavy use of repetition. The active verb بزور ‘to visit’ (and passive form زور) is repeated seven times, apparently underlying the author’s intention to emphasise his ironic stance towards a specific situation. The translation strategy, however, has been to dismantle the repetition chain and establish cross-reference by variation and ellipsis, as illustrated in the above translation. This led to demolishing the rhetorical building block of the ST and depriving the TT readership from access to both the message and content of the ST. A possible rendering which will maintain the form and meaning of the ST is something like the following:

This individual paid visits but never received any visitor. He never visited alone, but always visited accompanied by some other visitor. He never visited in the daytime or in the first part of the night; he never visited in the early morning, but visited only in the dead of night, at the time of the deepest sleep.

By using the base form of the verb ‘visit’ along with the derived form ‘visitor’, such a translation is likely to convey the rhetorical meaning implied by the ST.

In short, the omission of repetition in the above examples is likely to have compromised the rhetorical purpose of the text and rendered it rather loose. This is generally the case with the translator (Wayment) of the autobiography’s second part. However, the translators of the
first and third parts have shown relatively sensitive approaches to dealing with rhetorical repetition. This has culminated with a strategy characterised with meticulous observance of the ST repetitive patterns and thus retaining the rhetorical function of repetition intact. The strategy also entails accessibility and recoverability of both the meaning and content of the ST.

4. Conclusion

It has been argued that the style of the text under consideration has as its main feature the utilization of repetitive patterns for textual and rhetorical ends. The marked role of repetition is to foreground a mental image or invoke emotions in emotive language. Notions of multisidedness, nothingness, and irony are only some. Meaning externalised by foregrounding is almost neutralized in translation by backgrouding, hence replacing rhetorical repetition with pervasive variation. This may be the case with the translation of the autobiography’s second part. Apparently, Wayment (the translator of the second part) was conscious of acting contrary to the textual norms of the ST and in preference for the TL norms, otherwise she would not have felt the need to justify her translation in a preface: Taha Hussein’s style has become a byword for charm and grace, and it is indeed rash to attempt to render its qualities in English. I have tried to avoid literal translation, which only results in a sort of spurious local colour such as hinders genuine comprehension. The graceful assonances and repetitions of the original have also disappeared, though I can only hope that some of its charm remains. [italics mine] (Wayment, 1992[1943]: 102-03).

By avoiding literal translation, the translator makes her initial decision, in the light of the initial norm (Toury 1995), as to how the translation should look like. And by ignoring repetition, she produces a domesticated TT that falls short of relaying one important stylistic aspect of the ST. Indeed, the translation of the second part of the autobiography is characterised mainly by the absence of lexical
repetition, contrary to the translations of the first and third parts. Thus, we end up with a translated autobiography that misrepresents the original author as passing through three stages of linguistic, stylistic development whereby he uses repetition in the first stage, averts it in the second, and re-uses it in the third. This gives rise to the question of how to come to translate a text that consists of several parts by several translators.

In general, the translational norms seem to lean more towards the acceptability pole than the adequacy pole. The strategies for translating lexical repetition highlighted the translators’ individual attitudes towards the ST’s norms and their adherence to the linguistic and cultural norms prevalent in the TL environment.

REFERENCES


Amsterdam, John Benjamins Publishing.


Translation as Process Writing

Dr Zaidan Ali Jassem
Department of English Language and Translation
Qassim University, KSA

0. Introduction

Translation is a very long, tedious and complex process into which many factors are brought into play: psychological, sociological, biological, linguistic, cultural and chronological. The psychological concerns the mental, emotional and attitudinal environment of the translator and his audience; the sociological refers to the social conditions that impact the translation process such as similarities and differences in gender, age, class and ethnicity; the biological deals with the physical aspects such as the translator’s strength, stamina and tiredness in executing his work; the linguistic relates to the different ways in which language can be used in communicating the import and meaning of the text to the target audience; the cultural is an envelope which is about the society’s values, customs and norms or morality system; the chronological concerns time and the time it takes to produce a final translation.

In translating, translators build upon and utilize this framework of different factors variably. There may be emphasis on one or two such factors more than others. Thus some translators may focus on and highlight the linguistic above all else although this may lead to negative response from the target audience. It would be safer to take into consideration as many of these factors as possible, therefore. (For a fuller view, see Baker 2009(a-b); Baker and Saldanha 2008; Bassnett 2002; Hatim 2005; Munday 2008; Venuti 2004).
1. Translation: Process Writing and Writing Process

Process writing is the dominant approach to writing as a skill, including its learning and teaching and curriculum design. Process writing can be defined as a cyclical approach, not a single-shot approach. That is, “… student writers engage in their writing tasks through a cyclical approach rather than through a single-shot approach. They are not expected to produce and submit complete and polished responses to their writing assignments without going through stages of drafting and receiving feedback on their drafts, be it from peers and/or the teacher, followed by revision of their evolving texts. This is what is truly meant by the “process” approach. (Kroll 2001:220-221)

As can be seen in Kroll’s definition, process writing means that writing anything, whether a paragraph, an essay, a term paper, an article, or a poem, goes through several stages such as first draft, second revised draft, third revised draft, fourth revised draft, final polished and complete draft.

As to the writing process, this refers to the act of writing itself. To write, you need a pen, a paper, an idea, a desk and so on. Every stage of writing is a writing process. In this sense, it is not an approach to writing; it is simply writing.

Process writing is a well-known phenomenon in Arabic literary heritage. In classical Arabic literature, for example, there was a trend amongst certain poets such as Zuhair bin Abi Salma and An-Nabigha who kept their poems for a whole year before publishing and releasing them to the public. During this period, many revisions or drafts of these poems were made until the authors were satisfied that their works were ok for release. Such poems were called “annuals” (الشريالات). This movement is well documented in classical Arabic literature history textbooks (e.g., Daif ضيف 2005; Farrookh نروخ 2006).
2. The Present Study: Background Information

The present study concerns translating the author’s PhD thesis entitled Phonological Variation and Change in Immigrant Speech: A Sociolinguistic Study of a 1967 Arab-Israeli War Immigrant Speech Community in Damascus, Syria. This work was completed in 1987 under the supervision of Professor Charles Jones, then Head of the Department of English Language and Medieval Literature at Durham University, England. The external examiner was Professor James Milroy, then Head of the Department of Linguistics at Sheffield University, and the internal examiner was Mr. Arthur Brookes of the Department of English Language and Medieval Literature at Durham University. Although a contract was initially signed with Kegan Paul International to publish it, it was published under a new title in Malaysia in 1993(a) by a new publisher, called Pustaka Antara. The new title is Impact of the Arab-Israeli Wars on Language and Social Change in the Arab World: The Case of Syrian Arabic. The latter title is a slightly revised version of the 10-chapter original in which Chapter Six was published separately as Volume 2 of Lectures in English and Arabic Sociolinguistics (Jassem 1994).

The Arabic translation was published in full in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia in 1993(b); it was based on the unadulterated original PhD thesis, entitled دراسة في علم اللغة الاجتماعي: بحث صوتي لغوي اجتماعي في اللهجات العربية الشامية السورية مقارنة مع اللغة الإنجليزية وغيرها. كوالا لمبر: بوستاك أنتراس.

The translation consists of the 10 original PhD thesis chapters in about 430 pages, without any modification. The main thesis of the work is about language differences (i.e., technically called inherent variability or variation and change) as a result of one’s educational background, sex, age, area, linguistic context and style. All these are investigated within the essentially American Labovian framework of language variation and change as applied to American English, British English
and many other languages around the world including Arabic dialects, Portuguese, Persian and so on.

3. Research Methodology

3.1 The Sample

The sample of this paper is derived from the text of the Arabic version as has already been identified. As for type, it is a judgment sample. That is, certain illustrative examples have been chosen by the author to elucidate the thesis of the study: i.e., translation as process writing.

3.2 The Reviewers

The reviewers of the translation should be both peer reviewers and non-peer reviewers who should ensure that both the linguistic and stylistic aspects of the text are acceptable, clear and familiar. The original author is the principal reviewer, who will be responsible for polishing and completing the final revision.

The total number of reviewers was four: three peer and one non-peer reviewers. The former included two Egyptian PhD holders: one in TESOL and one in English Literature, and a Saudi teaching assistant, all of whom work as full-time professors in the Department of English Language and Literature at Qassim University. All are native speakers of Arabic and have excellent command of English, moreover.

The latter is an ordinary person with pre-university education, with a good sense and knowledge of Arabic and elementary English. The inclusion of the non-peer reviewer was to make sure the text is easily understood not only by the academic but also the general public.

It has to be noted that knowledge of English is not important for reviewing the translation as the main task of the reviewers is to examine and comment on the Arabic version only. All the reviewers were asked to evaluate the original and revised versions of the Arabic
translation. Thus no English version was given to them because it is not the subject of analysis here.

### 3.3 Revision Criteria

The criteria of revision are two types: one for the author and one for reviewers. As to the author, the main criteria were:

A. factual accuracy. The translation should be true, correct and accurate as far as ideas, concepts, content and information are concerned. Factual accuracy is not problematic because it concerns conveying and transferring the ideas and facts of the original text to the target one or the Arabic version;

B. lexical familiarity. The words and expressions of the translation should be familiar to the reader, common and frequently used in everyday and academic life as much as possible. Reader familiarity is very important as the reader likes to read a text whose words and expressions are familiar and common, not strange or exotic, to him. However, this does not mean that informal and sloppy word style will be used. Never. So they should be familiar and formal but not sloppy and informal;

C. stylistic clarity. Readers look for a text which they can understand in a straightforward manner, without any ambiguities. The text should be straight to the point; and

D. equivalence. Wherever possible, words, expressions, sentences and paragraphs should be equal in both the original (English) version and the translation. However, if one of the above conditions is violated, this criterion does not apply.

All these criteria, as has been stated earlier, are essentially the responsibility of the main writer or translator. They are based in varying degrees on the findings of translation studies in general (e.g., Baker and Saldanha 2008; Hatim 2005; Munday 2008).

With regard to the reviewers, it was up to them to decide how to evaluate the revised translation. No questionnaires or written
comments were required from them. However, they have been simply asked to orally say which of the two (old/original and new/revised) versions of the Arabic text are clearer and more readily understood in their view. More precisely, when they were given the Arabic texts, they were asked: “Which one would you like or prefer? Thus, it seems that clarity and comprehensibility were perhaps their main criteria.

4. The Translation as Process Writing

As has been stated earlier, process writing involves the written work going through several stages of drafting and revising: first and nth draft until the complete version is accomplished. The present work can be said to involve two stages: prepublication and post-publication.

4.1 The Prepublication Stage

The prepublication stage had already been investigated in another paper entitled “The author-cum-translator experience: A case study”, presented in 1993(c) at the 4th International Conference on Translation, which was held in Kuala Lumpur by Institut Teknologi Mara, Malaysian Translator’s Association & Dewan Bahasa dan Pustaka. This stage comprised at least 6 sub-stages before the actual product came to light (for a fuller picture, see Jassem 1993c: 53-60). It has to be noted that all of the revisions were done by the author himself. Although the publisher commented on the strangeness of the title, which was later revised, it can be safely said that no other editors were practically involved, which is a drawback, unfortunately.

4.2 The Post-publication Stage

Despite the fact that the work had already been published and distributed worldwide, it is currently felt that there are still many things that could be done to improve the quality of the text in both form and content. Since form is purely technical and publisher-related
as it concerns the actual shape and look of the book, this will not be considered here although it is very important, indeed.

As to the content of the text, process writing can be seen in the revisions and improvements that can be incorporated into the text. Amongst these, one can mention:

A. the title,
B. technical terms,
C. abbreviations,
D. text and style, and
E. misprints and typographical matters.

These are all taken up one by one below.

4.2.1 The Title

The title of the original translation is rather long with some repetition. Therefore, it should be reworded so that it is shorter, clearer and more appealing and attractive provided it is faithful to and in consonance with or equivalent to the original title. A number of revisions were made, which were:

- الاختلاف الصوتي واللغوي الاجتماعي في اللهجات العربية الشامية المهجرة;
- الاختلاف اللغوي الاجتماعي في لهجات مهجري الجولان ومدینة;
- الاختلاف والتيغير اللغوي الاجتماعي في لهجات مهجري الجولان ومدینة;
- الاختلاف والتيغير في في لهجات الجولان دمشق الشمالية المهجرة;
- علم اللغة الاجتماعي: دراسة مقارنة في لهجات مهجري الجولان ومدینة واللغة الانكليزية وغيرها

All the titles are based to varying degrees on the original title of the PhD thesis; however, the first four are closer and have more lexical and structural “equivalence”. Hence, they are more specific, more equivalent. As to the last option, it is a freer rearrangement and
rewording of the original title, all of whose words are taken from it as well. In its present form, it is directly based on the original translation with some modifications (e.g., deleting repetitions) which make it shorter and clearer.

When one of the peer reviewers was asked to comment on the different titles, he immediately went for the last one, saying it is “excellent”. It is the shortest, clearest and most intelligible, perhaps. Another reviewer strongly opted for it as it has no repetition. The non-peer reviewer went for the first and the last, but found the last the best. So there is agreement between all reviewers on the new choice although it is not drastically different from the original Arabic title.

4.2.2 Technical Terms

Translating technical and scientific terms is not without its problems (Jassem 1997). Technical terms in this work include “vowels, consonants, phonemes, allophones, variables and variants, etc”. They should be revised in Arabic so as to make more sense, to be better and more readily understood. For example, the terms “variable” and “variant”, fundamental to the Labovian theoretical framework and frequently used here as well, were translated as متغير ومستغير respectively to show their relatedness in derivation and meaning: i.e., lexical equivalence. However, the latter term “variant” translated as متغير is strange and unfamiliar to the Arabic ear, and may be difficult to understand; therefore, it should be retranslated more clearly and comprehensibly such as “بديل” or “تابع”. This new and revised term is not only clearer but also more direct and, thus better and more readily understood, than the former. It is also in harmony with “alternant”, an alternative for “variant” in the Labovian framework.

Hypercorrection, which means the use of correct language by lower groups more than higher ones, has been translated as استصحاب which has been revised as فرط (المغالاة) الفصحى. As can be seen, the latter is
The opposite technical term is undercorrection which should be revised on the same lines as the previous one.

All the reviewers unanimously agreed that the new revised terms or versions are better, clearer and more readily comprehensible, without doubt.

4.2.3 Abbreviations

Arabic, unlike English, is not friendly to abbreviations, which the Arabic reader may not understand at first. Academic works are full of such abbreviations and it is cumbersome and uneconomical to mention the full name every time it occurs in the text. This study is no exception. For example, there are four stylistic terms which are abbreviated as follows:

a. immigrant to immigrant style (IIS)

b. immigrant to local style (ILS)

c. word list style (WLS)

d. Quranic recitation style (QRS)

These were translated in full first, but later on abbreviated throughout the translation. Therefore, the full name of the terms should be stated wherever and whenever it occurs for the sake of clarity.

One of the peer reviewers said abbreviations are possible provided they have been mentioned in full first. Later recurrences are acceptable in short forms. The non-peer reviewer preferred them mentioned in full everywhere in the text for reasons of clarity.

4.2.4 Text and Style

There are certain words, phrases, expressions, sentences, paragraphs or texts in the translation that can be reworded or revised. Such revision will make them not only in harmony with the above-
mentioned criteria of familiarity, clarity, intelligibility and beauty but also with Modern literary and standard Arabic practice and writing. For example, consider the following two paragraphs: the first is from the original translation whereas the second is revised:

الفصل الثامن

الاستخطاء والاستصواب

8.1 استهلال


(See Appendix for the original English text.)

The underlined expressions have been highlighted here for the reader, but not for the reviewers, for ease of comparison. The text has been revised as follows:
The main task of the reviewers was to consider which of the two texts above is clearer and more acceptable to them. All the peer and non-peer reviewers concurred in their views that the second text is definitely better in every respect. They all went for it instantly and without any hesitation. They said that the first text has strange and technical words, and thus more difficult. The second is clearer, more familiar and more beautiful as well. However, one PhD reviewer said that both texts are intelligible but the second is definitely better or clearer.

4.2.5 Misprints and Typographical Matters

There are several misprints in the translation in which certain letters have been dropped or added. For example, المملكة المتحدة should be المملكة المتحدة. All the text should be checked for this.
Another problem is typographical and concerns font size, especially in numerical figures in the tables. Some such figures are hardly visible, perhaps font size 8 or even less. All font sizes should be standardized.

5. Discussion and Conclusions

In the course of this paper, it has been pointed out that translation is a complex and long process, involving many tedious stages. This perhaps makes it novel, creative and comparable to the original in many respects. The present study has shown that feedback on the translation in the form of peer and non-peer reviews is important if one strives to make a good and acceptable translation. If ones is aiming at a wider audience than his immediate narrow one, probably non-peer reviewers have a very important role to play, especially in the simplification and directness of expression and style. But if this is not the case, then this may not be important at all.

An important finding in this research is the agreement in opinion between peer and non-peer reviewers despite the formal education gap between the two. This shows the importance of one’s intuitions or self-judgments about what is acceptable and what is not in one’s language.

It has been found that the author’s impressions and consequent revision of the translation were in full agreement with his reviewers’. As has been shown above, what has been revised is mostly the vocabulary or lexis of the text. The reason for this is when the author first translated the text, he was more concerned with especially lexical equivalence (e.g., Kenny 2008; Hatim 2005; Munday 2008) than with other criteria such familiarity and clarity. It would be excellent, of course, to translate equivalently between texts: i.e., using equivalent phonemes, morphemes, words, expressions and grammatical structures. For instance, “hypercorrection” is lexical equivalence. But this may result in unusual structures and words to the Arabic ear, which must, therefore, be replaced by a more familiar
expression, though longer as in الترجمة في الفصاحة. Thus the new meaning is clearer and more beautiful; the former is strange and difficult. It has to be noted that the translation was first made in Cambridge, England in 1990 and published in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia in 1993. The current revision is made at Qassim University, in KSA in 2009. So the cultural differences and social milieus might have had an impact on the author in different ways. Perhaps living in an Arabic country results in using more familiar and clearer language; the contrary is true, of course.

To succeed, a good translation should abide by and follow certain conditions and principles, which can be summarized as follows.

a) Equivalence: This is one of the most prominent principles in translation studies (e.g., Baker 2009(a-b); Baker and Saldanha 2008; Hatim 2008; Kenny 2008). The original text and the translated text should be equal to each other in all respects: linguistic, stylistic and discoursal. The equivalence does not mean, however, that the translated text should slavishly ape its original. On the contrary, it has to be equal when equivalence is possible; if not, one should follow the rules of the language of the translation.

b) There are certain rules and principles which override and take priority over equivalence. Such principles may involve (i) familiarity of expression, (ii) clarity of language, (c) intelligibility and (d) aestheticity or beauty. In other words, common and frequently used words are to be preferred to rare, new and exotic ones; clarity is better than ambiguity of all types; a word, an expression or a text which is more readily understood is far much better than a difficult one; beauty is a direct result of all the above. Thus, the clarity of words or language, the manner of expression, and their instant comprehensibility are of paramount importance in any text. If all this happens, the translation will be beautiful or aesthetic in the end.
Applying the above principles has resulted, as can be seen, in a revised version which is clearer, more familiar, more straightforward, and more readily intelligible. As a consequence, it is better and more aesthetic.

As a matter of fact, it goes without saying that the above rules and principles are not final and exclusive; one the contrary, they can be further refined in future research, especially by feedback from other scholars and readers.

6. Recommendations

To enrich the linguistic and scientific heritage of the Arabic language and literature in all fields of human enquiry, the following steps are recommended:

a. The whole text of the translation should be revised from beginning to end. All the text should be read thoroughly and revised or edited if necessary. The revised version should be mainly stylistic and linguistic.

b. If there is need to update the text so that new information, which has definitely cropped up since its approval 25 years ago, this should be kept separately, maybe in the form of an appendix or a foreword provided it is kept to a minimum with a good bibliography, though.

c. The revised product and process writing are linked in a way which shows that translation is a creative process. Future research can examine this further.

d. All PhD theses written in English and any other (non) European language should be translated into Arabic to enrich the linguistic and scientific heritage of the Arabic language. Syrian Arab universities require this as a condition for staff promotion and confirmation at work.
e. Research funding must be given to author-translators or translator-authors to encourage them to translate their own works which will be for the public good of the whole society and country.

f. Translated PhDs must be very highly and preferentially considered for promotion and staff development.

h. Translation centres must allocate part of their translation duties and assignments to PhD theses in all fields of human enquiry.

i. Resolving equivalence and its relation to principles of familiarity, clarity, intelligibility and beauty need further refinement.

Acknowledgements

I wish to thank Dr Mousa Arafat, Dr Rajab S. Abdu Rabbih, and Mr Muhammad Al-Atrash of the Department of English Language and Translation of Qassim University for peer reviewing the Arabic versions of the translation. Thanks are also due to my wife for evaluating the translation from the perspective of the wider public.

Bibliography


• Farrookh, Omar. 2006. تاریخ الأدب العربی (تاریخ الأدب العربی) (4 vols.). Beirut: Dar Al-Ilm Lilmalayeen.


• _______. 1993b: دراسة في علم اللغة الاجتماعي: بحث صوتي لغوي اجتماعي في اللهجات العربية الشامية السورية مقارنة مع اللغة الإنجليزية وغيرها. كوالا لمبور: بوستاك أنتارا.


Appendix

(In this appendix, the English passage of the Arabic translation is given for guidance and comparison for the interested reader. This passage was not given to reviewers, however.)

CHAPTER 8
LANGUAGE CORRUPTION AND CORRECTION

8.0 Overview

We will be concerned in this chapter with a sociolinguistic investigation of three variables—namely (k), (-k) and (D). These three variables all have corrupt, non-correct, non-standard pronunciations in IGFA but correct standard ones in DA. Hence the title of the chapter. Thus the influence on divergent IGFA to standardize comes from two convergent directions: one from the local vernacular and one from the standard variety. The extent of this influence and the resultant language variation will be examined through the medium of the same social and stylistic parameters of the previous chapter: i.e., education, age, sex, style, and area. (Jassem 1993: 193) Key: IGFA: Immigrant Golan Fadl Arabic; DA: Damascus Arabic.